

THEORY AND PRACTICE OF DANCE IN EDUCATION

FROM A GENDER VIEWPOINT

SUSANNE INAEBNIT

In partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree  
of Doctor of Philosophy, London University, Institute of  
Education, April 1988

## ABSTRACT

This thesis examines, from a gender viewpoint, issues of theory and practice of dance in education in England. The emancipation, demarginalisation and integration of dance as a female and socio-cultural activity in education is a central concern of the research.

The introduction to Part I describes the autobiographical context of the research which provides the basis for the discussion of theories in a multi-disciplinary approach. Theories of anthropology, history, sociology and aesthetics relevant to dance and ideologies of education relevant to dance in education are discussed.

Part II presents an overview of qualitative research methodologies.

After an account of applied methodologies, Part III presents empirical evidence in the form of case studies. Chapter Seven investigates the history of dance in British education from the 1950s to the 1980s. Chapters Eight to Twelve concentrate on a PGCE dance course, with three in-depth case-studies and attempt to illuminate issues of gender, of theory and practice, and of performance, competence and authority in dance in education from a gender viewpoint.

The last part, Part IV, discusses implications of the findings from the empirical evidence for the future of dance in education from a gender/female viewpoint. The thesis concludes with future possible directions of dance in education.

## Table of Contents

Chapter 1 <u>INTRODUCTION</u>	1
1.1. Undertaking Research from Personal Experience	2
1.2. Research as Process: The Process of My Research	4
1.3. Stating Conflicts	6
1.4. Structure of My Thesis	8
1.5. Presentation	10
 <u>PART I IN SEARCH OF THEORY: SOCIO-CULTURAL PERSPECTIVE</u> <u>ON DANCE IN EDUCATION - THE STATE OF THE DEBATE</u>	 11
 Chapter 2 <u>GRAPPLING WITH DANCE AS A SOCIO-CULTURAL</u> <u>ACTIVITY</u>	 12
2.1. INTRODUCTION	12
2.1.1. What is Dance?– Some Instances from Personal Experience	13
2.1.2. Making Sense of Personal Experience	18
2.1.3. Which Culture?	19
 2.2. GRAPPLING WITH DANCE: LEARNING FROM ANTHROPOLOGY	22
2.2.1. Anthropology of the Body: Douglas' View	22
2.2.2. Dance Anthropology	24
2.2.2.1. Dance as Practice and as Fact	25
2.2.2.2. Anthropological Typologies of Dance	26
2.2.2.3. The Problem of Perception	29
2.2.2.4. Blacking's Dance Anthropological Concept	30
 2.3. GRAPPLING WITH DANCE: LEARNING FROM HISTORY	36
2.3.1. Dance as a Leisure Activity in the 1980s	39

2.3.2. Men and Dance	40
2.3.3. Women and Dance	41
2.3.4 Dance Institutions: Private and Maintained Sector	44
2.3.5. Summary and Conclusion	45
2.4. GRAPPLING WITH DANCE: LEARNING FROM SOCIOLOGY	46
2.4.1. Introduction	46
2.4.2. The Marginal Status of Dance: Learning from Sociology	47
2.4.2.1. Dance in Education: Low Status Because Female?	49
2.4.2.2. The Majoritarian Minority: Women in Sociology	50
2.4.2.3. The Problem: The Body	52
2.4.3. Conclusion	55
2.5. GRAPPLING WITH DANCE: LEARNING FROM AESTHETICS	57
2.5.1. The Elitist Concept of Dance as Art	58
2.5.1.1. Aspin's Essentialist Concept of Art	58
2.5.1.2. Theatrical Dance: Classical Ballet	59
2.5.1.3. Theatrical Dance: Modern Dance	62
2.5.1.4. Theatrical Dance: Discussion	63
2.5.1.5. Dance Notation	64
2.5.1.6. The Essentialist Concept of Dance: Conclusion	65
2.5.2. The Populist Concept of Art/Dance	65
2.5.2.1. Ross' Populist Concept of the Expressive Arts	66
2.5.2.2. Swanwick's Art/Mind Concept	67
2.5.2.3. Discussion	68
2.5.3. Discussion and Conclusion: Learning from Aesthetics: Still Grappling with Dance...	69
2.5.3.1. Towards a Re-Definition of Aesthetics?	73
2.6. GRAPPLING WITH DANCE: CONCLUSION	76
Chapter 3 <u>GRAPPLING WITH EDUCATION: EDUCATIONAL THEORIES AND IDEOLOGIES RELEVANT TO DANCE IN SCHOOLS</u>	79
3.1. INTRODUCTION	79
3.1.1. The New Sociology of Education	83
3.1.2. The Presentation	84



3.2. THE CLASSICAL-HUMANIST IDEOLOGY OF EDUCATION	86
3.2.1. Hirst's Forms of Knowledge	88
3.2.2. Bantock's "Apartheid"	88
3.2.3. Summary and Discussion	89
3.3. THE PROGRESSIVE IDEOLOGY OF EDUCATION	92
3.3.1. Bantock's View on the Progressive Ideology of Education	92
3.3.2. 'Progressive' Labels	92
3.3.3. Lawton's View	93
3.3.4. Skilbeck's View	93
3.3.5. Psychological Justifications	94
3.3.6. Bernstein's Terminology	95
3.3.7. Summary and Discussion	96
3.3.7.1. Progressive Ideology of Education for Girls	97
3.4. THE RECONSTRUCTIONIST IDEOLOGY OF EDUCATION	99
3.4.1. Freire's 'Cultural Action'	100
3.4.2. Discussion	101
3.4.3. Reconstituting as the Mixing of Categories	102
3.4.3.1. Hargreaves and the Fallacy of Individualism	103
3.4.3.2. Skilbeck's 'Education as a Critically Reflexive Community'	105
3.4.3.3. Reconstituting: Summary	106
3.5. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION	107
Chapter 4 <u>CONCLUSIONS FROM DANCE AND EDUCATION FOR DANCE IN EDUCATION</u>	110
<u>PART II: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY</u>	114
Chapter 5 <u>RESEARCH METHODOLOGY</u>	115
5.1. QUALITATIVE RESEARCH METHODOLOGIES	116
5.1.1. Case-Studies	117
5.1.2. Illuminative Evaluation	119

5.1.3. Feminist Methodology	120
5.1.4. Art-Based Research Methodology	122
5.1.5. Summary	122
5.2. RESEARCH STRATEGY: ETHNOGRAPHY	124
5.3. ETHNOGRAPHIC TECHNIQUES	126
5.3.1. Observation: Participant and Non-Participant	126
5.3.2. Interviews	126
5.3.3. Group Discussions	128
5.3.4. Questionnaires	128
5.3.5. Documents, Video, Material	128
5.3.6. Summary	128
 <u>PART III EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATIONS AND CASE-STUDIES</u>	 130
 CHAPTER 6 <u>INTRODUCTION TO PART III: METHODOLOGY</u> <u>APPLIED</u>	  131
6.1. RATIONALE, CONCEPT AND PURPOSE OF PART III	131
6.2. RESEARCH METHODOLOGIES, STRATEGIES AND TECHNIQUES APPLIED	 137
6.2.1. Note on Data Collection	138
6.2.2. Limitations	139
 Chapter 7 <u>EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATIONS OF THE HISTORY OF</u> <u>DANCE IN BRITISH EDUCATION FROM THE 1950s</u> <u>TO THE 1980s</u>	   142
7.1. NOTES ON METHOD	144
7.2. LABAN'S MODERN EDUCATIONAL DANCE	148
7.2.1. Background	148
7.2.1.1. Synthesis - Poetry	148
7.2.1.2. Analysis - Technique	149
7.2.1.3. Summary	150

7.2.2. Laban's Dance in Schools: Modern Educational Dance	150
7.3. DANCE AS ART	156
7.4. DANCE AS A DISTINCT ACADEMIC DISCIPLINE	160
7.5. DANCE IN EDUCATION IN THE 1980s	163
7.5.1. The Place of Dance at Secondary Level	164
7.5.2. The Place of Dance at Tertiary Level	167
7.6. THE ISSUE OF EXAMINATIONS	170
7.6.1. Discussion	174
7.7. HISTORY OF DANCE IN BRITISH EDUCATION: DISCUSSION	178
7.7.1. Reflections on Modern Educational Dance	183
7.7.2. Reflections on Dance-as-Art	188
7.7.2.1. The Cul-de-Sac of Dance-as-Art: Art as Male Art	189
7.7.2.2. The Cul-de-Sac of Dance-as-Art: Gender	191
7.7.2.3. The Cul-de-Sac of Dance-as-Art: Objectivity	191
7.7.2.4. Concluding Summary	192
7.7.3. Reflections on Dance as a Distinct, Academic Discipline	192
7.7.4. Beyond the 1980s: Towards New Theories?	194
Chapter 8 <u>THE POSTGRADUATE CERTIFICATE OF EDUCATION</u> <u>COURSE: BACKGROUND TO THE CASE-STUDIES</u>	199
8.1. NOTES ON METHOD	201
8.1.1. Rapport	201
8.1.2. Collected Material	201
8.2. THE POSTGRADUATE CERTIFICATE OF EDUCATION COURSE: BACKGROUND TO THE CASE-STUDIES	203
8.2.1. The Programme	203
8.2.2. My Role as a Researcher on the PGCE Course	204
8.2.3. The Setting	206
8.3. THE RESEARCH PARTICIPANTS	208
8.3.1. The Tutors	208
8.3.1.1. Daisy, the Course Tutor	208



8.3.1.2. Rose, the Dance Tutor	209
8.3.1.3. Lily, the Modern Dance Lecturer	214
8.3.1.4. The Researcher as the Lecturer: Modern Jazz Technique	215
8.3.2. The Students	216
8.3.2.1. Issues of Case-Study 1	216
8.3.2.2. Issues of Case-Study 2	217
8.3.2.3. Issues of Case-Study 3	219

## Chapter 9 PGCE CASE-STUDY 1: ROBERTA AND THE ISSUE OF GENDER 220

9.1. ROBERTA'S BACKGROUND	220
9.2. ROBERTA'S TEACHING PRACTICE: THE ISSUE OF GENDER	224
9.2.1. Lesson Example: Don't Do a Game, Miss!	224
9.2.2. Discussion: Games! – Games? – No!	226
9.2.3. Boys' Gender Identity or the Hidden Curriculum	229
9.2.4. Girls' Gender Identity or the Hidden Curriculum	236
9.2.5. Conclusions from Observed Mixed Dance Classes	241
9.3. A DANCE SYLLABUS FOR THE FUTURE?	248
9.4. END-OF-PGCE INTERVIEW WITH ROBERTA	251
9.4.1. Concluding Summary	258

## Chapter 10 PGCE CASE-STUDY 2: GILLIAN – PRACTICE FROM THEORY? 259

10.1. GILLIAN'S BACKGROUND	259
10.2. GILLIAN'S TEACHING PRACTICE: THEORY AND PRACTICE	264
10.2.1. Lesson Example: "Ritual Dance?" – "Snaky!"	264
10.2.2. Discussion: Snaky – Yes! Ritual – No!	265
10.2.3. Gillian's Dance Technical Competence	275
10.2.4. Dance as Practice: Showing and Watching	279
10.2.5. Girls in a Single-Sex Comprehensive	280
10.2.6. Mock Exams: Mocking Whom?	282
10.2.6.1. Mock Exams: Background Information	282



10.2.6.2. Mock Exams	283
10.3. CONCLUSION: THEORY AND PRACTICE	293
Chapter 11 <u>PGCE CASE-STUDY 3: CELINE - PROBLEMS OF COMPETENCE, PERFORMANCE AND AUTHORITY</u>	294
11.1. CELINE'S BACKGROUND	294
11.2. CELINE'S TEACHING PRACTICE - PERFORMANCE, COMPETENCE AND AUTHORITY	300
11.2.1. Celine's Teaching Practice School	300
11.2.2. First Lesson Example: "Roll - Skip - Sway..."	302
11.2.3. Discussion: Incongruities or Mixing Categories?	304
11.2.3.1. Competence and Performance	306
11.2.3.2. Celins's View of Competence and Performance	307
11.2.4. Second Lesson Example: James Bond! or: Which Cultural Reproduction?	309
11.2.5. The Problem of Boredom: Personal Growth for Student Teachers?	315
11.2.6. Conclusions	317
Chapter 12 <u>PART III: SUMMARY FROM THE EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATIONS AND CASE-STUDIES</u>	319
12.1. AIMS: ANY FINDINGS?	320
12.2. EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATIONS AND CASE-STUDIES IN RELATION TO EACH OTHER	322
12.2.1. Roberta	324
12.2.2. Gillian	325
12.2.3. Celine	327
12.2.4. The Researcher	328
<u>PART IV: BEYOND: DANCE IN EDUCATION FROM A GENDER VIEWPOINT</u>	331

Chapter 13 <u>FROM THEORY TO PRACTICE TO THEORIES:</u>	
<u>IMPLICATIONS FOR THE FUTURE OF DANCE</u>	
<u>IN EDUCATION FROM A GENDER VIEWPOINT</u>	332
13.1. INTRODUCTION	332
13.2. BEYOND: WHAT ARE THE OPTIONS?	336
13.2.1. Stating the Invisible	336
13.2.2. Ethical Dimensions	338
13.2.3. Towards an Ethic of Dance in Education	340
13.2.4. Orientations for Dance as a Female Activity in Education	340
13.2.5. Beyond: Research and Dance	342
APPENDIX A: INTEVIEWS	344
A.1. PGCE – Background Interview Grid	344
A.2. PGCE – Interview 2, Grid	346
A.3. First Interview with Roberta	347
A.4. Second Interview with Roberta	354
A.5. Interview with Gillian	366
A.6. First Interview with Celine	376
A.7. Second Interview with Celine	384
APPENDIX B: METHODOLOGY APPLIED	389
B.1. Applied Research Techniques	389
B.2. Collected Data	394
APPENDIX C: BIBLIOGRAPHY	399

## INTRODUCTION

## Chapter 1

### INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1 Undertaking Research from Personal Experience

The starting point of this thesis has been my interest to learn from dance in British education in order to gain insights and justifications for introducing dance into the Swiss curriculum of the maintained sector schools. My thesis concentrates exclusively on dance in British – or more specifically in English – education of the maintained sector.

The impetus for this research was my dissatisfaction with my position as a dance practitioner compared to the one I occupied as a lecturer of French<sup>1</sup>.

Since my childhood I had been practising dance. I had been a professional dancer, and I had taught dance for some years when I decided to look a bit more closely at why I experienced and lived the positions of dance practitioner and of lecturer so sharply and painfully as a dichotomy. In my socio-cultural context, in my family, at school, at university, in the professional and academic world I found a near-total lack of interest, ignorance and exclusion of dance, of something I valued and something that had contributed to my identity and cultural experience, whereas everybody was knowledgeable in and about literature and language. I expressed myself fluently in French, and was understood; yet I was not

-----

1. Teaching and lecturing have a considerably higher status in Switzerland than in Great Britain



understood or was misunderstood as to when, what, how and why I danced.<sup>2</sup> Clearly, this lack of understanding or communication through dance had to do with the place dance occupied – or did not occupy – in Swiss society. Was dance a cultural activity that was obsolete in Swiss industrialized society where culture figured just as mere service part of the economy?<sup>3</sup> Why was it that an activity that was so rich, pleasurable and important to me should be manipulated and treated in such a derogatory and unserious way? Why should it be invisible, hidden? And why did other cultural activities like music thrive and people were knowledgeable in and about music? One obvious answer was that music was taught in school. I figured that if dance were taught in school people might in fact experience dance and become dance practitioners.

The wish to have dance on the school curriculum was fuelled by another reason. Since dance did not exist on the curriculum, it was relegated to the side-lines, the periphery of the private sector, be it ball-room dancing or classical ballet. I found that a lot of private dance studios existed where people (nearly exclusively women) came to learn to dance, but the quality of which these people/women could not evaluate since they did not have the necessary evaluative criteria. I therefore wished to introduce dance on the school curriculum as a kind of consumers' guide.

In my career as a dance practitioner I had experienced dance as a female activity. There were hardly any men in dance classes, hardly any men in dance performances (as spectators and as dancers) and an acute shortage of men in the ball-room dance courses. – As a girl I had also experienced that my dancing was considered irrelevant or trivial in comparison to boys' leisure activities like football or the Scouts and that it did not free me from

-----

2. I describe some of my dance experiences in more detail in 1.2.1

3. On culture cf 1.2.1.1

e.g. domestic chores, whereas the boys' leisure activities were accepted as an excuse and freed them from housework.

My personal experience in relation to dance has been that dance is a marginal, cultural activity mainly practised by women and that female dance practitioners are easily stereotyped into the dichotomy of the saint and the whore.<sup>4</sup>

My major focus as emerging from personal experience is dance as a female, cultural activity and its place – or lack of place and absence – in education and society. My main concern is to analyze and find out about the place dance occupies in education and society. My main aim is towards change: to improve the place of dance and the position of dance practitioners and make dance more accessible qua education. My perspective is that of a woman dance practitioner. My interest in this research is emancipatory.<sup>5</sup>

## 1.2 Research as Process: The Process of My Research

When I decided to set out to research dance in education in Britain I had thirty years of dancing behind me and before me the hope of possibly making sense of my dance experience and of the irrelevant, marginal position of dance as a cultural activity in Swiss/European society and in education. I intended to research dance in British education in the belief that since dance was on the curriculum (in some schools and higher education) there were justifications I might be able to 'borrow' – learn from – for the implementation of dance in my country.

-----

4. cf 1.2.1.; cf de Beauvoir, 1949

5. cf Froehlich, 1980



I was familiar with the Swiss and the French university system. The first step now was to familiarise myself with the British university system, the current relevant literature and to establish first personal contacts with the dance in education world. I wrote a first case-study on adolescent girls based on observation in a big girls' comprehensive. I was dissatisfied with the theoretical apparatus I had used. Trying to grasp adolescent girls' dance with notions from developmental psychology<sup>6</sup> fell short of satisfactory answers for me. I obviously wanted and needed a different theoretical framework for my questions. I turned to more sociologically oriented literature of education as a tool to understand the development of dance in education history and its various justifications. Concurrently I started collecting data in institutions of higher and tertiary education, first in a fairly untheorized way, then, working through methodological literature to underpin and orient my methodology, in a more theorized way.

The process of gestation and digestion - the material to digest was enormous - has been considerably lengthened by a long and debilitating illness. Various accents and shifts have come up, have been thought through to be rejected until the gender aspect emerged more prominently and provided the major leverage to make sense of my experience and to answer many of my questions.

This thesis then has been for me an on-going process of coming to know. I feel that much of my research has taken the sense of research in science expounded by Laing<sup>7</sup>

"...to bear attention, to observe, to be curious, to be interested..., to attempt coherent understanding: with compassion"

-----

6. based on e.g. Erikson and Maslow

7. Dartington, 16/5/1982

because it started from my life experience. Stating my experience and thus declaring my bias I make myself vulnerable but this is the only way I can see to make the research true to myself.

Occupying myself with the subject, its content and my relationship with that content has changed continuously. The continuous change has led me to new insights and perspectives - and to re-writing, re-organizing, re-structuring, revising. I am convinced that this process does not end with the completion of the manuscript. I am aware that various passages might need re-writing. But neither in science and research or in the person of the researcher will contradictions never cease to exist. Nevertheless, this thesis has not been written at random. The present structure, the problems and issues raised and discussed are the result of very careful thought and consideration. But I wish to acknowledge that the thesis also contains spontaneous and subjective elements, e.g. the spontaneous choice of a specific book at a specific moment of research that then informs the work process further. I now wish to list major conflicts or contradictions I have experienced doing this research.

### 1.3 Stating Conflicts

I find myself in the conflicting situation of writing a thesis conforming to academic requirements about dance, a practical, non-verbal activity. I do not share Blacking's view that<sup>8</sup>

"Making sense of dance is as much part of dance as performing its movements...and the interpretation of dance experience is what ultimately makes dance interesting and effective in life."

-----

8. Blacking, 1982a:5



One may ask: Interesting and effective for whom?— For me, dance has been a solution and dance is interesting and effective in itself. Dance does not need interpretation and after-thought to be effective.<sup>9</sup> To me, actual dancing is fully lived, intensely lived present. But I need to make sense of my place as a dance practitioner and of the marginal place of dance in my socio-cultural context. Thus, although I live dance I struggle to research it, to make sense of it with the tools of second-hand, academic knowledge.

Another absurd conflict is the one between dance being a visual/visible medium and yet in need of verbal/abstract language to become 'visible' and more central: Dance as a marginal activity is —although visual — not 'visible' e.g. in education<sup>10</sup>.

A third conflict I find myself in is the situation of the researcher in the academic tradition. I subject myself to academic hierarchies and comply to academic, individualized, solitary work methods and requirements to debate dance as a co-operative, cultural activity within a non-affirmative<sup>11</sup> and democratic perspective of culture.

And fourth, most importantly, the double conflict of writing in a cultural order governed and defined by men about a female activity the identity of which is constituted via the mirror of images defined by men.<sup>12</sup> As a woman I am part of this male order and I must

-----

9. This quotation may be interpreted as yet another example of hegemonic theory over practice and may re-awake distrust of theory because of power and control implications

10. cf Spender, on making women's experience visible, 1982

11. cf 1.2.1.

12. cf de Beauvoir 1949; cf Weigel, in StephanWeigel, 1983

necessarily use the norms and standards available. I am a participant in the male order but at the same time, as a woman, I am excluded, I am the negative<sup>13</sup> of the male norm. I find myself in the double but conflicting role of the woman dance practitioner/woman researcher in the model of the dominating images and of the woman anticipating emancipation.

Inspired by Weigel's metaphor of "der schielende Blick"<sup>14</sup> I use the metaphor of 'attitude' borrowed from classical ballet to refer to this double existence and double perspective. I use this metaphor to emphasize the fact that these conflicts cannot be harmonized at present, that they are inherent in the socio-cultural situation. I choose the 'attitude' for the double-meaning of a) mode of thinking and feeling and of b) the symbolic value of the gesture: the supporting leg is rooted firmly in the ground, knows the reality of the ground, the norms, and the other leg is in the air, exploring and conquering space and innumerable possibilities of movement towards autonomy and emancipation. The 'attitude' is thus to visualize the contradicting conflicts. It is essential to see them in order to grasp and understand them. It is essential to grasp them in order to live and acknowledge them.

#### 1.4 Structure of My Thesis

The thesis takes the form or posture of 'attitude' in that it is composed of two parts.

Part I is concerned with theory relevant to dance, education, and fieldwork. It is in a traditional, itemizing or departmentalizing, official, distant mode,

-----

13. cf Spender, 1982; cf de Beauvoir, 1949

14. Weigel, in Stephan/Weigel, 1983:108ff; literally translated as the ogling glance/gaze/eyes



from the outside, and would be symbolized by the supporting leg of 'attitude'. A multi-disciplinary approach has been chosen for the grappling with dance. 'Official' educational ideologies are 'traversed'<sup>15</sup> i.e. examined and in part de-constructed and/or rejected in regard to gender or to dance. A theoretical framework of alternative, qualitative methodology is presented in Part II.-

Part III investigates dance education history and practice of dance practitioners in the form of case-studies. It is in an alternative, qualitative mode with a closeness to material, from within and would symbolize the leg in attitude of 'attitude'. It starts from practice. I try to explore, to look at 'attitude' from the side, from the back, from below, indirectly... 'Hidden' theories (as personal constructions) of practice and experience of dance practitioners are researched in order to illuminate conflicts, needs, issues, problems both to record and substantiate dance practitioners' reality and hopefully to find material<sup>16</sup> towards the creation of theories related to women dance practitioners' autonomous practice. The case-studies are not intended simply to exemplify the theory set out in Part I.

The difference between Part I and Part III may be considered as an inconsistency or weakness. But it can also be argued that this difference clearly reflects female experience and women's conflicting present situation described above. I feel that trying to be true to myself and my understanding of research as emerging from personal experience I must make the conflict visible. It reflects my reality.

Part IV looks back at what has been found, what I have learnt, and attempts to discuss the implications looking

-----

15. Irigaray's term, cit in Bowles/Duelli-Klein, 1981

16. cf II.5.2.

towards the future as fulfilled at present for dance practitioners and for dance in (Swiss) education.

### 1.5 Presentation

Writing necessarily implies a linear, two-dimensional mode of presentation. This does not reflect my work pattern and research process. The work pattern has been cyclical. The research process has been the weaving of a pattern than linear, steady progression. The necessary linear presentation even falsifies in some cases the work pattern. But it has been more important to me to lead the reader through the text in a fairly structured way than to reproduce exactly my work pattern.

My thesis is based upon my interest in dance practitioners' reality and experience and in the future of dance in education from a woman's perspective.



PART I: IN SEARCH OF THEORY

SOCIO-CULTURAL  
PERSPECTIVE ON DANCE IN EDUCATION: THE STATE OF THE  
DEBATE

## Chapter 2

GRAPPLING WITH DANCE AS A SOCIO-CULTURAL ACTIVITYA Multi-Disciplinary Approach2.1 INTRODUCTION

"What is dance?" asked the philosopher Selma J. Cohen rhetorically at the 1st British Dance Scholars Conference<sup>1</sup>. Philosophical investigations seldom lead to straight answers but more often to more questions. - This introduction, instead of attempting to give straight answers - because there are no straight answers - starts from my personal dance experience.

In the Introduction<sup>2</sup> I have used the expression 'to make sense of my experience'. 'To make sense' has to do with classifying, ordering, organizing human experience. To make sense means to form organizing forms or principles, forms or principles of premises which allow to take in information and to digest, or assimilate, or process, on a conscious level, experience. Sense allows one to grasp, and reduce, high complexity, on a conscious level.<sup>3</sup>

My personal experience of dance may illustrate dance,

-----

1. Cohen, S. J., London, 4/4/82:3

2. I.1.

3. cf Glaser/Stahl, 1983:105

some of its forms and places, practised in Switzerland and Europe over a period of thirty years. The period in question coincides more or less with the period examined in the empirical historical investigation of Dance Education in Britain from the 1950s to the 1980s.<sup>4</sup> There may be similarities and differences between personal experience and public education in two different European countries. It may be that the personal is political and reflects the social body.<sup>5</sup>

In a paper which focuses on the views and experiences of dance practitioners<sup>6</sup> it would be a false pretence of 'neutrality' or 'objectivity' if I did not acknowledge my own dance background, since it was precisely this dance experience, or rather my dissatisfaction with the place my experience occupied in the socio-cultural context, that has motivated me to investigate. Every scientific finding depends, ultimately, on the subjective interest of the researching subject.<sup>7</sup> - I therefore wish to portray instances of my subjective dance experience which I believe have shaped my interest,<sup>8</sup> They are portrayed in the past tense to underline the historical aspect of the individual case.

#### 2.1.1 'What Is Dance?' - Some Instances from Personal Experience

My first remembered introduction to dance was at my godfather's wedding, a very special occasion for me. As a brides-maid I was wearing a new frilly white dress and

-----

4. cf III.7.

5. cf I.2.2.

6. The term 'practitioner' describes those dancing: students, teachers, professional dancers, those practising dance as a leisure activity, and is used in this study throughout, cf Duelli-Klein, 1980

7. cf Froehlich, A, based on the Frankfurt School, 1980:32

8. cf Research methodology, II.5.



new red shoes. I was about four years old. After the meal, the bridegroom led the bride to their first dance, the dance floor was left to the couple, everybody watched, the wedding ceremony was being publicly and physically confirmed - it was like a ritual. Little by little uncles and husbands invited aunts and wives to dance. Men chose their dance partners. Women could not choose nor were they allowed to dance on their own whereas we girls were allowed to whirl around at the side but not on the proper dance floor - we might be in the way. These unspoken rules relaxed only towards the end of the wedding; wine had been plentiful.- Dance then seemed to me to be a quasi-ritual, a very special social activity for very special occasions, and reserved to the initiated adults. You could only dance when you got married. And you could only dance in couples.

That maybe was why my mother waltzing through the kitchen on a few Sundays after dinner to Johann Strauss on the radio while washing up filled me with awe. My father would sit in his armchair reading. The message was that dance was not for him, that 'proper' men did not dance in the kitchen after dinner. Probably due to the "enduring intoxication of a ballroom waltz"<sup>9</sup> the memory of my mother's dancing bouts left impressions of dance as a joyful, invigorating activity which might occur in an apron, in slippers.

These two experiences of dance, so far, were for me already contradictory. One message was that you had to dance in pairs, the man leading. The other message was that as a woman you could dance on your own, if privately.- Music was essential.

When I started school at the age of seven, my best friend went to ballet classes. During the breaks she would show off with some - to me then - spectacular posture. It was obvious to me that I wanted ballet

-----

9. Cohen,S,J,ibid:1



classes as well, to compete with her. I did not have a clue of what ballet really was. I just wanted to be like her. So I nagged my parents, stubbornly, and successfully. although my father was against it. He feared I might get silly or even frivolous ideas.- We were only three girls in the whole school to go to ballet classes - very elitist and exclusive, indeed. Our Austrian ballet mistress became my idol. To please her one had to work hard at the barre. If you were good, you got a better part in the end of year performance. To be good meant to be disciplined, to accept the standards and to do better than your neighbour. I remember performing in Mozart's "Les Petits Riens". Four of us, among the smallest girls, were to proffer presents to the king (?). The walk in diagonal towards the throne with the compulsory curtsy had to be rehearsed again and again because we did not manage to confer the necessary dignity and style to the presentation of these presents. Nor had we any conception of curtseying. But we tried very hard to please the teacher. What she called dance was dance to us.- Be it the Chinese in Bayer's "Puppenfee" or a child in Schumann's "Kinderlieder" or an abstract dance to Grieg's "Aus Holberg's Zeiten", we imitated the taught movements blindly. Never were we asked to improvise or invent our own movements. The school had a good reputation. My ballet teacher suggested professional training for me but my father said no.<sup>10</sup> Nagging was useless this time. I was to go to university to study something proper.

Up to Maturity I was always the only pupil of my class to do Classical Ballet (other forms of dance were unknown). Our German teacher once asked me to demonstrate a Tarantella in connection with a literary

-----

10. Agnes de Mille writes about her father: "My father, like all educated men, considered dancing at best exhibitionistic acrobatics... In setting his heart against dancing, my father was only following the pattern of all thoughtful and fastidious men for the past two thousand years.", 1951/1952:59f

text. But it was so out of the normal, so completely away from the norms and values of this humanistic and classically oriented Gymnasium to 'show' yourself in that context that I refused. To perform a piece of music or read your essay in class or even perform in the annual serious theatre production was acceptable. But to perform a dance in front of your colleagues was weird. To dance in front of my peers meant to make myself vulnerable: it was exotic and ridiculous to them to perform 'strange movements'.

Another dance form though became obligatory for acceptance by peers: the ballroom dance course. I had reached the age when initiation into that long ago observed adult couple dancing ritual was thought appropriate. But what agony to wait to be picked by some youth for the next dance! Most of them were much clumsier than I was but had to play the male role of leading us through the English waltz and Cha-Cha-Cha. I learned the steps and the fact that it is more important to be sexy than to be a good dancer to be picked first. To look sexy was acceptable but to dance sexually or erotically was taboo. Ballroom dancing was more a regimentation of bodies, learning a body code for control rather than contact. Sex-stereotypes were being re-enforced.

During my schooling, the sparse occasions of watching dance performances were the additional 'numbers' of the ballet in operas and operettas of the theatre of the town where female dancers embodied muses in thin veils, so that I was embarrassed for them and embarrassed to see that my father's opinion of dance might in part be justified. The dance available in my town in the fifties and early sixties could do nothing to induce my father and the public at large to change their views on dance or, for most of them, even to bother to have a view on dance.

In Paris during my university years I got bored very quickly with the literary courses at the Sorbonne and



intensified my dancing instead. Modern dance classes were a revelation to me in their different use of movement, of space, of quality, from what I knew from ballet. The lessons I took were in the German expressionist tradition and not yet codified in a set vocabulary. - The manifold dance performances in the capital Paris differed a great deal from that sclerotic and outdated provincial stuff I knew from my home town - I started to feel much happier about dance and dancing. But the marginality of dance had not much changed. In the students' hall I was still the only (female) person to do dance. Apart from a handful of American female students there was hardly anybody to talk to about dance: knowledge of and about dance still was not part of average student literacy.<sup>11</sup> To dance 'seriously' struck people still as something quite exotic.

Later, after professional training, I worked in various fields of the professional dance world, in TV studios, in art exhibitions, in street theatre, in musicals. Competition was fierce, money little (less than unqualified stage workers) and prestige lowest. To be a dancer and female meant to be lowest in the hierarchy of values, power, gender, art, intelligence etc. Male TV workers would try out their dirty jokes on female dancers before trying them out on the canteen staff, also female. - When a colleague teacher and film-maker told me that he had watched our street performance and had felt a voyeur throughout (it was some African Dance) I knew that my feeling of unease during public performances had not just to do with me, but with dance, with its place in our society, with men not dancing. Dance proved to be problematic. My dissatisfaction with my situation and position as a female dance practitioner grew. I started asking questions.

Why was dance such a marginal art form? Why was I so often misunderstood, misinterpreted or even dismissed as

-----

11. cf Eisner, E, W, 11-14/9/1979

a dancer by the same people who appreciated me intellectually? Why did people know so little about dance? Why was our dance heritage so meagre?<sup>12</sup> Why were there so many commercial dance studios but so little of it visible, public? Why did men not dance? Why did women go to dance classes? Why were romantic ballets so successful although the plots were often idiotic and the gestures incomprehensible? Why was my work as a dancer not appreciated? Why so badly paid? Why could I not study dance at school, at university? Why could I not secure a scholarship for research on dance? Why was there such a frenzy about bodywork and fitness, but hardly any dance? Why was Swiss folk dancing dead but Swiss folk musik thriving? Why did Break dancing appeal to (male) youngsters, but not ballet? Why were there so many female dancers but almost always male choreographers? - So many questions to answer!

#### 2.1.2 Making Sense of Personal Experience

To return to Cohen's question: "What is dance" to me, then? - Dance to me has been all those various experiences involving training, performing, teaching and appreciating dance, and many more. 'Dance' as emerging from my experience has been something I have been living fully, something I have been doing, in which I have been involved. I am unable to give one precise, concise and correct answer. Cohen's philosophical question suggests that there is one correct answer, that dance can be defined. But, as Best points out, it is impossible to produce definitions of most words and that there exists confusion of definition with meaning.<sup>13</sup> He shows that to define may be to distort and oversimplify.<sup>14</sup> Following Best, the notion of meaning, even in one's own case,

-----

12. cf Laban, III.7.

13. Best, D, 1978:90

14. cf Best, D, 1978:19



necessarily depends upon a public, objective language with implicit rules.<sup>15</sup> Personal meaning is related to public meaning, or to society at large. There is an interreaction or interdependence between the personal and the social, or the political.

In order to find answers to my many questions – which are also political and/or social questions – I must refer to the social, public meaning of dance. I need to turn to theories and fields of knowledge that may be able to throw light on this phenomenon of dance, its place, function and meaning in its various forms and aspects in our society. Compared to the fifties interest in and knowledge of dance have grown in the eighties. There are more dance companies, more classes, more magazines. But the interest seems without guidance<sup>16</sup>. Dance is inadequately theorized<sup>17</sup>. I turn to anthropology, history, sociology and aesthetics for illumination on dance: a multi-disciplinary approach. Knowledge on dance, choreology can only emerge from results obtained in various areas of study.<sup>18</sup>

Before turning to anthropology I wish to state my orientations or my understanding of culture.

### 2.1.3 Which Culture?

My understanding of culture is based on the distinction between "affirmative" culture and "non-affirmative" culture<sup>19</sup>. Although I am aware of the resonance of the word 'non-affirmative', I use it because similar available terms like 'non-normative', 'pluralistic',

-----

15. cf Best, 1978:131

16. cf Ralph, R, Paper delivered at the 1st British Dance Scholars' Conference, 2-4/4/82:5

17. cf Lyons, S, 1985

18. cf Lange, R, 1983, 1/1:108

19. cf Marcuse, cit passim in Glaser/Stahl, 1983:36

"essentially utilitarian"<sup>20</sup> are not satisfactory to me in that they do not reveal to the same degree the link between culture and its underlying value assumptions.- Affirmative culture affirms the dominant ideology, the dominant value assumptions. I take affirmative culture as basically idealistic in that it is divorced from the civilisation and the social context by which it is produced<sup>21</sup>. It means an abstraction of artifacts, a selective tradition deployed as the ideal and dominant order which measures, subordinate, and marginalizes, but incorporates alternatives. The good, the beautiful, the true become a myth, they substitute reality, they are the illusion of a better world. Affirmative or 'high' culture is class-related: it is accessible to those beyond every-day needs, to the minority of those who have time to dedicate themselves to the beautiful, the good, the true. The 'Humanities' are an expression of affirmative culture.<sup>22</sup>

Non-affirmative culture is 'anthropological' culture in that it is about cultural practices on the level of every-day life. It takes culture from its idealistic heights to the materialistic every-day and it takes into account socio-historical settings.<sup>23</sup> Non-affirmative culture does not reflect practices but is meaningful or "signifying practice"<sup>24</sup>. Non-affirmative culture implies democratic or democratizing culture. - A normative model of democracy implies equality, participation, self-determination and emancipation. Democratic culture in cultural democracy based on universal rational communication would be the cultural utopia of

-----

20. Simpson, A, in Ross, M, ed, 1985:189

21. cf Bourdieu, in MacDonald, Open University 1977:39ff

22. cf Glaser/Stahl, 1983:36ff; cf Hall, in Hall et al, 1981:27

23. cf Foucault's notion that one ought to treat art as a document, not as a monument, cit. A.Beattie, 26/2/1988

24. Hall, in Hall et al. 1981:30

non-affirmative culture.<sup>25</sup> Non-affirmative culture can be termed interpretative: making sense of...<sup>26</sup>

As I am trying to make sense of my experience as a dance practitioner, i.e. of my experience in a social context, I need a concept of culture that accounts for the social context. I need a broad concept of culture encompassing endeavours to nurture human development and maturity and to strengthen individual practice for the construction of a community with others.<sup>27</sup> My understanding of culture then is informed by and based on a non-affirmative or anthropological concept of culture. I am interested in dance as cultural practice, or activity, not in dance as an arranged artifact.

The following chapter 2 examines the context and framework within which dance is organized in society in order to understand its place in a multi-disciplinary approach. - I first turn to anthropology.

---

25. cf Glaser/Stahl, 1983:90/116

26. cf Lawton in Skilbeck, 1984b:275

27. cf Zuercher, Z, 1981:92



## 2.2 GRAPPLING WITH DANCE: LEARNING FROM ANTHROPOLOGY

Anthropology looks at foundations, forms, functions of cultures, societies or groups.

The cultural activity of dance has a place in all societies.<sup>1</sup> But different cultures have different forms, have a cosmology of their own. The medium of dance being the body and bodily activity, social anthropology with its accent on social action<sup>2</sup> may provide some answers to the questions of the Introduction to Part I.- The work of the social anthropologist Mary Douglas seems of particular interest to make sense of dance.

### 2.2.1 Antropology of the Body: Douglas'View

Douglas' social anthropological work relates the human body to the social body, i.e. to society. Her central thesis is that the human body is always treated as an image of society, that it functions analogous to the social system, that it serves as a metaphor or symbol of society.<sup>3</sup> Following Douglas, any society depends on the use of symbols to communicate.<sup>4</sup> There can be no organization without symbolic expression.<sup>5</sup> Most symbolic behaviour works through the body. The body is the symbolic medium which is used to express particular

-----  
1. cf Spencer,P,ed:1985, back cover

2. Social anthropology stems largely from the sociology ofDurkheim;it is narrower than cultural anthropology with its accent on culture as a whole,cf Kaeppler,A,passim,in Spencer,P,1985:ix

3. cf Polhemus,T,1978:296

4. cf Douglas,M,1970

5. cf Douglas cit in Blacking,J, 1977:14

patterns of social relations. Douglas contends<sup>6</sup>:

"...since the body is mediating the relevant social structure, it does the work of communicating by becoming, (a) an image of the total social situation as perceived, (b) the acceptable tender in the exchanges which constitute it."

This most certainly applies to dance as a non-verbal, bodily mode of communication and expression. The body mediates the social situation in at least three ways. It is not a static "signal box". First, the body represents the field in which a feedback interaction takes place. Secondly, it can be given as the proper tender for some of the exchanges which constitute the social situation. And thirdly, it mediates the social structure by becoming its image.<sup>7</sup> The symbols of a body dancing can or must therefore be related to the symbols of the social body.<sup>8</sup>

Douglas' typology of cosmologies<sup>9</sup> is a formula of classifying relations between the personal body and the social body. Douglas uses two categories, group and grid in a quadrant.<sup>10</sup> Where group is strong and grid weak, the "inside is good", the "outside evil": external boundaries are strong, internal structures are diminished. Where group is weak and grid strong the human body is less cogent as a symbol of society.<sup>11</sup> The body reflects and

-----

6. Douglas, M, in Polhemus, 1978:300

7. cf Douglas, in Polhemus, T, 1978:296

8. The problem of the body, i.e. social aspects of the body within Western culture and society will be discussed in I.2.4.

9. The concept of cosmology is based on Levi-Strauss' technique of structural analysis and Mauss' emphasis on the culturally learnt control of the body, cf Douglas, M, 1970:105/65ff

10. For Douglas' categories of grid and group and of mixing categories, cf Douglas 1966

11. Douglas, 1970:preface



responds to variations in the degree of control present in the social level of experience. In a society where people set high value on social constraints, high value will also be set on symbols of bodily control.<sup>12</sup>

From concerns of the anthropology of the body now to the more specific concerns of the anthropology of dance.

### 2.2.2 Dance Anthropology

Dance has been established by Sachs as a cultural activity in his *World History of the Dance*.<sup>13</sup> Following Sachs, Blacking<sup>14</sup> contends:

"The universality and survival of "dance" suggest that it cannot be abandoned without danger to the human species; that it must be practised by all; and that its evolutionary value lies in its effectiveness as a mode of non-verbal communication."

Lange<sup>15</sup> describes the objective of dance anthropology as follows:

"The objective of dance anthropology is to disclose the role of dance both in the life of man [sic] as an individual and as a member of a group. It encompasses the function of dance in human society, and finally, concentrates on the nature of dance itself."

Lange's quoted objective of dance anthropology, Hanna's conceptualisation refers to objects of study, it takes the observer's point of view. It is from the outside. It must therefore fall short of answering the questions

-----

12. cf Douglas, M, 1970:64

13. Sachs, C, *Weltgeschichte des Tanzes*, 1933; English version 1937

14. in *Dance Research*, Spring 1983, 1/1:89

15. in *Dance Research*, Spring 1983, 1/1:113



arising from my personal experiences asked in the introduction.

#### 2.2.2.1 Dance as Practice and as Fact

This subtitle echoes the notions of 'curriculum as practice' and 'curriculum as fact' discussed in I.3.4. on educational ideologies.

Dridd William's question: "What are people doing when they dance?"<sup>16</sup> addresses itself to the dance practitioner. A possible answer is provided by Hanna<sup>17</sup> whose anthropological conceptualization of dance is

"human behaviour(1) composed, from the dancer's perspective, of (2) purposeful, (3) intentionally rhythmical, and (4) culturally patterned sequences of (5a) non-verbal body movement and gesture which are (5b) not ordinary motor activities, (5c) the motion having inherent and 'aesthetic' value."

This cross-cultural conceptualization defines dance as a human, non-verbal mode of behaviour, a communication and expressive form from the dance practitioner's point of view, or rather experience.

One of the reasons for survival of dance<sup>18</sup> lies, according to Hanna, in its power and its cognitive, sensori-motor and aesthetic capability to create moods and a sense of situation for both performer and spectator.<sup>19</sup> She takes up the manifold mediating faculty of dance described by Douglas when she<sup>20</sup> states:

-----

16. in Momentum, 1976, 1/2:1-9

17. Hanna, J, L, in Blacking 1977:212

18. cf Blacking, in Dance Research, 1983, 1/1:89

19. cf Hanna in Blacking 1977:216

20. Hanna ibid:217

"Dance may mirror or refract social and political structures and techno-environmental factors, but may also be a generative force, a processual agent.."

Hanna incorporates both Douglas' view of the body as a social symbol and the phenomenological view<sup>21</sup> of the human body actively creating symbols.

#### 2.2.2.2 Anthropological Typologies of Dance

Dance anthropology has come up with typologies of dance. I wish to present two of them briefly.-

Hanna's six modes of signification are informed by psycholinguistics, are based on communication theory:

- \* - A concrete representation
- \* - An icon (a danced deity as a revered deity)
- \* - A stylization (heart - gesture of love)
- \* - A metonym(dance of birth for ship launching)
- \* - A metaphor
- \* - An actuality (Louis XIV dancing as a king)

Hanna contends that effective communication of signification depends on shared knowledge and interplay between expression and perception of dance.<sup>22</sup>

Spencer's typology is based on recurrent themes in dance anthropological literature and is intended as basic models presented in a logical sequence:

- \* - Dance as a safety valve: the cathartic theory.<sup>23</sup>  
Therapeutic value, emotional release and sublimation  
Spencer notes the psychological nature of this theme,

-----

21. for phenomenology cf Poole,R,in Benthall,Polhemus,eds,1975; for phenomenology of dance cf Sheets,M,1979; Mansfield,1976b

22. in Blacking 1977:227

23. example: the dance craze in Britain during and after World War I



but remarks that this explanation does not account for the formal element in dancing nor that it omits the fact that dance can also build up tension instead of releasing

- \* - Dance as an organ of social control: functionalist theories
  - # - The educational role of dance and transmission of sentiments<sup>24</sup>  
Spencer stresses the danger of this explanation akin to a stimulus-response theory.
  - # - Interaction within the dance and the maintenance of sentiments: transmission of culturally desirable sentiments generating social solidarity. Thoughts and sentiments are regulated through the regulation of the body becoming absorbed in the unified community: dance as a governor, a constraining mechanism.  
Spencer qualifies this second functionalist theme as a sociological stereotype of dance.
- \* - Dance as a cumulative process: the theory of self-generation. Dance as a governor stimulating positive build-up<sup>25</sup>, climax, ecstasy, shifting boundaries, inviting transformation. Release from ordinary life.<sup>26</sup> This sort of dance is the more memorable because it contains an element of uncertainty.
- \* - The element of competition in dance: theories of boundary display. Competitive dancing as an idiom of confrontation, indicating strength and power to intimidate the opponent: competition between people. Spencer distinguishes between display of protest toward implementing change (lower end of scale of privileges: social, racial, generation, gender gap) and display of unattainability as a means of preserving the status quo.
- \* - Dance as ritual drama: the theory of communitas and anti-structure. The role of dancing in the resolution of inherent contradictions within society. By its very marginality and anomaly, its contrast with every day life and structured routine, dance can invoke a realm of timeless charm, stretching to associations with

-----

24. example: the minuet as an epitomy of etiquette and values maintaining the power position of the elite.

25. for ceremonies

26. Example: millenarian movements



higher beings<sup>27</sup> and as expression of the paranormal<sup>28</sup>.

The logical sequence of the themes stretches and englobes, in a growing tendency, from daily ritual to myth: the two poles of anthropological interest. Spencer<sup>29</sup> sums up:

"There is...a shift from structure as applied to the power relations of everyday life, to *communitas* at times when normal life is suspended, and here structure in Levi-Strauss's alternative sense becomes more pertinent, referring to the underlying logic of symbolism in ritual and myth, and revealing the basic dilemmas of social existence...Through dancing, the individual is caught up in a very dynamic way in the powerful forces underlying community life."

#### Discussion

Spencer attempts to establish a balance between form and function of dance.<sup>30</sup> Spencer's structural typology is a useful tool. Boys breakdancing in Harlem or the Willis entering on stage in arabesque penchee start making sense in the context of their particular social settings. Yet Spencer warns of one-sided, structuralist axiomatic assumptions that inner subliminal meaning becomes paramount in the analysis of dance instead of the choreographic pattern with its self-explanatory structural entity.<sup>31</sup>

---

27. example: Western romantic ballet with its emotive themes and ethereal niche in popular cosmology

28. e.g. the dance of the Reaper

29. Spencer *ibid*:34f

30. cf also the work of Kaeppler, A, e.g: *Dance Ethnology: Linguistic Analogies in the Study of Dance*, 1984

31. Spencer, 1985:38

### 2.2.2.3 The Problem of Perception

A structural distinction between function and form necessarily expresses the perspective of the observer, is a perspective from the outside. Perception, however, depends on the general concepts the perceivers have integrated and on their interpretation of what is being perceived.<sup>32</sup> - The perceivers are subject to their cosmology. Analysis of dance function and form then cannot be 'the truth' and is but an interpretation by its observers. The nonverbal dance fact has to be analyzed in the verbal medium. Strathern<sup>33</sup> holds that:

"...statements about dance, political structure, and the like are overlapping abstractions that 'fundamentally lack precision'"

Because of value hierarchies<sup>34</sup> the secondary analysis tends to be more prestigious than the primary practical activity of dance as practice. The relationship of observer and observed becomes hierarchical.<sup>35</sup> Worse, since the observers seem to know even better than the dance practitioners what the dance and dancing is about, the relationship between observer/researcher and dancer/researched becomes hierarchical. Once more, secondary theoretical analysis takes precedence over primary practical activity. -

-----

32. cf Arnheim, R, in *Towards a Psychology of Art* about the elementary processes of perception: "...far from being mere passive registration, are creative acts of grasping structure...Perceiving is abstracting in that it represents individual cases through configurations of general categories." 1967:33

33. in Spencer, P, ed, 1985:136

34. cf I, 3.1,

35. Strathern, in Spencer, ed, 1985:136

If dance is to be taken seriously as a phenomenon of human culture, an anthropological approach to dance is needed that can bridge this hierarchical gap and make sense of personal experience as well as social function and meaning. A social anthropological approach that attempts this is John Blacking's.

#### 2.2.2.4 Blacking's Dance Anthropological Concept

John Blacking's approach attempts this in combining social anthropological theories (based on structuralism and Durkheimian sociology) with phenomenological notions, extending Hanna's.<sup>36</sup> The following quotation illustrates Blacking's<sup>37</sup> conviction that

"...a valid theory of human social behaviour must be able to account for the varieties of individual decisions and shared perceptions and interpretations of the world, as well as the continuity of institutions and the recurrence of familiar social and cultural patterns."

#### Blacking's Anthropological Perspective of Dance

Blacking refutes the conventional division of function and form. Instead, he takes up Sachs' division, i.e. the division of verbal and nonverbal modes of discourse or cultural forms.

Dance is non-verbal. Rational understanding functions via language.<sup>38</sup> The difficulty that arises from this difference poses methodological problems. Blacking<sup>39</sup> contends:

---

36. cf Hanna, in Blacking 1977:216, cit. above

37. Blacking, J, in Spencer 1985:64

38. cf Ornstein, R, 1976

39. in Spencer, P, ed, 1985:65



"There is a methodological problem that cannot be avoided: aspects of dance and musical communication cannot be translated into other modes without distortion of meaning. Discourse about dance, as about any nonverbal communication, really belongs to metaphysics, because it is, strictly speaking, an unknowable truth. Without verbal language we cannot transmit a truth."

Verbalisation has been very efficient in coding human experience for cultural adaptation and allows universal access to human experience.<sup>40</sup> Addressing the problem of translation from nonverbal to verbal, Blacking suggests that subjectivity be built into anthropological investigation in an indirect approach to "unknowable truth". In Blacking's view, anthropological study of dance is about subjective action and conscious human intentions, not only about observed behaviour.<sup>41</sup> Subjective verbal accounts of dance practitioners become a means of researching what people believe to be dance. From these subjective accounts and personal statements, patterns of coherence may emerge towards understanding of dance. The relationship between observers/researchers and dancers/researched is potentially democratic or egalitarian in this approach. Blacking is interested in dance as a mode of human communication that can express ideas belonging to different spheres of human activity (social, political, economic, religious, and so on).<sup>42</sup> Communication requires the use of symbol.<sup>43</sup> The symbols of dance are expressed through and felt in the body of the dance practitioner. Blacking<sup>44</sup> is convinced of the

---

40. cf Paschen in Furth, H, G, 1972:17

41. cf Blacking in Spencer, P, 1985:66

42. cf ibid:64-5

43. cf Douglas, M, above

44. in Spencer 1985:65

"'effectiveness of the symbols'...their sensuous meaning to the human bodies that become involved in their sequences of nonverbal action"

and suggests that there are coherent, structural languages of dance which the dance practitioners choose for effective communication. But his model does not separate the cognitive from the affective, but establishes feeling as a rational function avoiding thus the opposition and conflict of feeling versus form.<sup>45</sup> By the same token, he avoids the problem of hierarchy between the values 'feeling'/'emotions' and 'rationality',<sup>46</sup>:

"..we should recognise that...the transfer of decision making from verbal to nonverbal discourse constitutes the core of the dance experience. It is not that people abandon reason for emotion when they dance, but that they often introduce another kind of reasoning, whose grammar and content are most effectively, though not exclusively, expressed in nonverbal language."

### Summary and Discussion

Is this integrative re-definition of emotion as 'another kind of reasoning' a conjuring trick that does away with the low prestige of dance as a practical, nonverbal activity? Could it be that easy? - Blacking's argument is theoretical and one has to be careful not to equate theory with reality: redefining values qua theory might just be theoretical sophism. Blacking concedes that at present, dance (still) needs words and research in order to be understood. He holds that, ideally, interpretation of dance should be possible without words.<sup>47</sup> But, using the argument to his advantage, he

-----

45. cf Blacking, J in Dance Research, Spring 1983, 1/1:95

46. ibid:67

47. in Dance Research, 1983, 1/1:90



concludes<sup>48</sup> that:

"...if words have been used to create and reinforce attitudes that close people's minds to the possibility of developing skills and experience in non-verbal communication, words may also be most effective in helping re-open those minds by contesting the verbal arguments and false interpretations of experience that closed them."

Verbal language thus becomes the 'saviour' of an activity that needs 'salvation' from the hegemony of verbal language itself. The proclaimed need for verbal analysis and interpretation of dance reflects another essential problem, that of gender hierarchies, and is but the tip of the iceberg. Psychoanalytical insights come to aid (or assist in melting the iceberg) in the hierarchical conflict between verbal and nonverbal communication systems.<sup>49</sup> Psycho-analytically, non-verbal communication is tightly linked to the pre-verbal, pre-Oedipal relationship of the child with the mother. The child lives in a duad where communication is authentic, not symbolic and nonverbal. This relation is total for the child, her/his survival depends on the omni-potent mother. In the next stage of development, the child discovers the father: she/he lives now in a triad where communication is symbolic (verbal) and where the child enters the social world. Because of the nature of symbolic communication the relationship with the father as the representative of the outer world is far less total, therefore less threatening. Learning the language, the law is necessarily linked with the repression of the mother and the pre-verbal stage. Non-verbal communication therefore is very often associated negatively because of its link with subjection to the omni-potent mother. It is clear from this that to

---

48. ibid

49. cf Mitscherlich, M, 1985



just advocate non-verbal communication as valuable and valid does not take into account psychic realities. This is to show how complex the problem of the status of dance as a nonverbal cultural activity is and how difficult it therefore must be to demarginalize it. It also shows why dance is considered a female activity, at least in Western industrialized and logocentric society where the concept of femininity is bound up with irrationality, the non-logos.<sup>50</sup>

In summary, Blacking's concept of dance as a topic of social anthropological study brings to the fore the perspective of the actors involved, and the communication of non-verbal symbols. It is based on the understanding of dance as subjective human action and conscious human intentions, embedded in and arising from a specific social context. In other words, the attempted synthesis or reconstitution<sup>51</sup> of dance as cultural practice and cultural fact.<sup>52</sup>

The concept of dance as practice and fact and non-verbal communication based on shared symbols allows to make sense of cultural forms of dance<sup>53</sup>. Where the symbols are not shared (as in the example of a girl doing classical ballet in a uninterested environment) or misinterpreted (as in the example of male voyeurism in a women's street performance)<sup>54</sup> further explanations concerning gender are needed.

One explanation may provide the insight into the sexual division of the body. Another explanation may have to do

-----

50. cf Walkerdine, 1985, on logos and irrationality; cf Klein, R, D, 1986, on androcentricity

51. cf I.3.4: reconstituting

52. cf Piaget's terminology: cultural assimilation and accommodation, in Peiser, S, 1976:69)

53. cf examples of Introduction, chapt.1

54. cf 1. Introduction

with male hegemony in the creation of culture and symbols which have been explored by feminists. Kate Millet<sup>55</sup> states:

"Under patriarchy the female did not herself develop the symbols by which she is described. As both the primitive and the civilized worlds are male worlds, the ideas which shaped culture in regard to the female were also of male design."

Is it that women dance practitioners try to use symbols that are not really their own, that they speak a foreign language so to speak? Blacking's social anthropological concept of dance will have to be extended by the dimension of gender and by the problematic and complexity of non-verbal communication as brought to the fore by psychoanalyses. Such an extended concept might be able to answer the question why men (mainly white middle-class men) do not dance. Walkerdine already provides a possible explanation<sup>56</sup>:

"...the fraudulence of the Logos is that it holds masculinity not in an assurance of control but in desperate terror of its loss."

This de-construction of the need (and desperate hegemony) of the verbal might also apply to social anthropological constructs.

The problem of value hierarchies will be examined and discussed in section I.2.4: learning from sociology in grappling with dance. But before, in section I.2.3. I wish to present a short survey of Western dance history.

---

55. Millet, K, 1971:73

56. Walkerdine, in Steedman et al, 1985:236

### 2.3. GRAPPLING WITH DANCE: LEARNING FROM HISTORY

#### The Place of Dance in Western, European Culture and Society

I assume that dance, like any other socio-cultural phenomenon, is historical, is the complex construction of historical factors.<sup>1</sup>

What can I learn from history about dance?

According to Lange<sup>2</sup> the Greeks influenced the European concept of dance in two ways: Plato's distinction between 'noble' dancing pertaining to art and re-enacting an emotion, and dancing of a lascivious, ugly kind<sup>3</sup> set the ground for the split into high and popular dancing. Aristotle's concept of dance as pertaining to the imitative arts<sup>4</sup> and therefore secondary to real life, emotions and passions, made dance an artificial, cultivated activity. With the decline of Greek culture dance lost its status. In Rome dancing was left to be performed by slaves<sup>5</sup>. Lucian's defence of dance is evidence of the need for justification of dance. He justifies dance in terms of values of the ruling hegemonic class. Thus Lucian stated that the highest ambition of the dancer must be "to know what is fit"<sup>6</sup>, in other words dance had to be justified in terms of high culture and moral values and, by the same token, was

---

1. cf Wolff, J, 1981

2. The Nature of Dance, 1975

3. Lange, R, 1975:3

4. ibid

5. ibid:4

6. ibid:2



denigrated as "violent and fatiguing leaps"<sup>7</sup> of country people.- The old pagan dance culture where dance was so much an integral part of life also came under attack by the Christian church which continued Aristotle's concept by preaching against 'heathen' dances, but for the 'heavenly joy' of dancing angels<sup>8</sup>. The body as the site of lust and fleshly sin, of rebellion<sup>9</sup> became the negative in Christian dualism of good and evil. Dance as a bodily medium of expression was blacklisted for humans, not for angels, though.

The Renaissance with its revival of classical traditions and values brought a revival of 'noble dancing', epitomized in the court dances which reflected the social order of a highly formal society with its highly hierarchic structure and formalized style.<sup>10</sup> Due to division of labour and specialization, dance was taken over by professionals. This was the beginning of the European tradition of the theatrical dance form called ballet and the entrenchment of dance as a (high) art form.

Romanticism brought back into fashion folk dances and a re-evaluation of nature, although in a very idealized form. - With the advent of nationalism in Europe, national folk dancing was called upon to reinforce national values<sup>11</sup>; hence the revival of national folk dancing which by the same token provided the link of

-----

7. ibid

8. ibid:6

9. cf Mazrui, A in Polhemus, T., 1978:208

10. cf Lange, 1975:6

11. This phenomenon recalls Spencer's theme 4: communion, social harmony or celebrational climaxes: positive feedback. Cf Spencer, in I.2.2.

urbanized industrial society with their rural roots.<sup>12,13</sup>  
 - At the threshold to this century, the definition of dance in the *Encyclopaedia Britannica* (1902-3) mirrored the centuries-long denigration of dance and its relegation to base instincts unworthy of rational, developed humans<sup>14</sup>:

"...the universal human expression, by movements of the limbs and body, of a sense of rhythm which is implanted among primitive instincts of the animal world."

This concept of dance was the result of moral and religious traditions of censure, qualified by Ralph<sup>15</sup> as ancient, patristic, scholastic and puritan.

Social dancing at the beginning of this century became accessible to all classes. But the process of democratisation of course implied a devaluation, a loss of prestige of social dancing<sup>16</sup> because it was now accessible to all.

Given the power position, the hegemony, of the various censorial agencies in the logos-dominated European society the place of dance at the beginning of the twentieth century could be but marginal.-

What about the place of dance towards the end of this twentieth century? - The next section looks at this period.

-----

12. cf Lange, 1975:13

13. For a discussion of social dancing in England, cf Rust, F, 1969

14. cit in Lange, 1975:17

15. Ralph, in Dance Research, Spring 1983:25

16. cf Rust, F, 1969:128

### 2.3.1 Dance as a Leisure Activity in the 1980s

Ballroom dancing has become a competitive sport of the working classes. Dance seems to have become a vital feature of leisure culture, entertainment and sexuality often linked to consumerism and advertising<sup>17</sup>. Rust calls it "socially licensed sublimated promiscuity".<sup>18</sup> Uninhibited individual dancing at the disco<sup>19</sup> has become acceptable for both females and males although women going to a disco on their own is still considered deviant.<sup>20</sup> - Black and white working class populations seem to have adopted dance (among other leisure activities) as what McRobbie terms "a utopian space"<sup>21</sup>. According to McRobbie<sup>22</sup>, dance has provided these social groups with

"...this utopian space, carved out between, against, and amidst stronger forces of domination and control. Such gestures do not exist outside dominant cultural forms. They are rather locked into a slow-moving love-hate relationship with them. Presented back as packaged and polished cultural products..."

All these forms of social dancing, though different in style and form, mirror the structure of social stratification and function as means of "pattern maintenance" or "safety valves", and integrative forces within Western, European society. The individual dances

-----

17. cf McRobbie, in Carter et al, 1984:130ff

18. Rust, F, 1969:125

19. as a reflection of personalized and individualized organic solidarity in Bernstein's terminology

20. cf McRobbie, in Carter, E, et al, 1984:143

21. This term is equivalent to the theme of ritual drama and anti-structure in Spencer; cf I.2.2.

22. McRobbie in Carter et al. 1984:136



and dance styles reflect the social body.<sup>23</sup> As to Rust's notion that social dance has<sup>24</sup>

"a direct socializing function in that it helps adjustment to normal social life, particularly between the sexes"

one can only wonder if the exclusion of women (e.g. in break dance) and the domination of women (e.g. in ballroom dancing<sup>25</sup>) are ironically considered helpful in the adjustment to the norms by Rust.

### 2.3.2 Men and Dance

Up to the late 19th century, according to Rust, the accomplished English gentleman dances well. After this period, the accomplished English gentleman dances badly.<sup>26</sup> In the England of 'Two Nations' ballroom dancing becomes a popular working class leisure activity. (Middle-class) men may have seen social dancing, as<sup>27</sup>

"unfortunate prerequisite to courtship".

Because dance, especially the fragile, aerial style of romantic ballets, has been inextricably linked with femininity, men have found it difficult to show an even fleeting interest in dance. In de Mille's words<sup>28</sup>:

"A man's business is not constantly floating away from the earth."

-----

23. cf Rust, F, 1969:130

24. Rust, F, 1969:130

25. cf wedding dance in 1.2.1.

26. cf Rust, 1969:77ff

27. McRobbie, in Carter, E, et al, 1984:143

28. de Mille, 1951:59

Nowadays, popular dance forms, e.g. the mainly black male dance forms of body-popping, break and funk with their required skill, virtuosity, stamina and risk of the early eighties, have contributed to making dance more acceptable, especially to male peers. These dance forms are demonstrated with expertise and pleasure. They can be interpreted as a display of boundary, race, class<sup>29</sup>, and sex<sup>30</sup>. Dance towards the end of this century has become more popular among men, its connotations of femininity, cissiness, silliness and unmanliness seem to be softening.<sup>31</sup> In gymnastics or ice skating, the influence of dance also for the male competitors has become eminent.

From a female viewpoint, there is the danger of dance being usurped by becoming a means to male material hegemony and control (of the dance space, peers and females) in addition to male idealistic hegemony and control (of distance, values, gaze and otherness) of earlier attitudes towards dance, as described above.

### 2.3.3 Women and Dance

There seems to be very little written material on dance as a social experience, and as a social experience of women in particular. The following is mainly based on *Dance and Social Fantasy* by McRobbie<sup>32</sup>. She quotes a study<sup>33</sup> which suggests that women dancing in mass dancehalls must be "surely", "careless" or even "inane".

-----

29. cf Spencer, cit above

30. cf Tolley, J, Burt, R in *New Dance* No 26, Autumn 1983:8-9

31. cf McRobbie, in Carter, E, et al, 1984:143

32. in Carter, E, et al, 1984:130ff

33. Hoggart, 1957

Another analysis<sup>34</sup> concerning the disco boom of the eighties and the work-out obsessions of women and girls (aerobics etc) stresses the element of narcissism inherent in these hidden-away work-outs. This sort of narcissism is interpreted as a sign of a culture that has lost its roots and has no positive focus onto the future. McRobbie's analysis is more positive. She sees dance as a channel, an outlet for women for bodily self-expression and control, as a source of pleasure and sensuality<sup>35</sup>:

"For women and girls, dance has always offered a channel, albeit a limited one, for bodily self-expression and control: it has also been a source of pleasure and sensuality. Even though it has often been directed towards men, the spectacle of women dancing has been linked unambiguously with female pleasure..."

This channel of limited control and the source of pleasure have been heightened by the possibility of success. Dance has been presented to girls and women with a notion of career, of a vocation, a combination of job satisfaction and rewards. This provides powerful fantasies. - It could be argued that women have been allowed to achieve a higher degree of visibility by showing themselves, by dancing, in order to become more visible as objects for the male gaze. Their visibility means an acting out of emotions and irrationalities suppressed by males.<sup>36</sup> It reinforces thereby the male order of rationality and objectivity thus maintaining the equilibrium of the status quo of power and social order. McRobbie speaks of "a great irony" that those fields (like dance) which are held out to women as promising the greatest rewards socially and financially are the ones that have constantly depended on the exploitation of "the

-----

34. Lasch, 1981

35. McRobbie, in Carter, et al, 1984:133

36. cf I.2.4



most traditional sexual qualities", i.e. focused on the female body<sup>37</sup>, for the male gaze.

For McRobbie, dance is linked with fantasy because it projects both internally towards the self and outwardly to the other. It is dual in that it connects the self with the desire for the other. For adolescent girls this means that dancing can articulate femininity and female sexuality by and through the body. She contends that<sup>38</sup>

"it (dance as a leisure activity) is the one pleasurable arena where women have some control and know what is going on in relation to physical sensuality and to their own bodies. Continually bombarded with images and information about how they should be and how they should feel, dance offers an escape, a positive and vibrant sexual expressiveness and a point of connection with other pleasures of femininity..."

Dance for women seems to fulfill various functions. It is a combination of control over their bodies, of becoming visible (for the male gaze and for women), of fantasies of success and rewards, of pleasure and sensuality, of sexual fantasies, of escape. In McRobbie's words<sup>39</sup>:

"The last dance, the waltz, dance as memory, dance as sexual expression. Like all fantasies dance signifies in these contexts as something to be lingered on, referred back to repetitively and imagined as future pleasure."

Dance then also takes on the function of safety valve in that by fantasizing the harsh reality becomes

-----

37. cf section concerning the body, below

38. McRobbie, in Carter, et al, 1984:145

39. McRobbie, in Carter et al, 1984:145

bearable.<sup>40</sup>

This section has dealt with dance as a leisure activity for women and men in the eighties. The next section looks at dance in institutions of the private and maintained sector.

#### 2.3.4 Dance Institutions: Private and Maintained Sector

Concerning dance institutions the C.Gulbenkian Foundation Report *Dance Education and Training in Britain* notes growth and expansion of dance in institutions of the private sector<sup>41</sup> but congruently, low status and low salaries of fees of private dance teaching<sup>42</sup>.

As to the maintained sector, the report notes a great demand for dance clubs in secondary schools where dance is taught, mainly to girls<sup>43</sup> by - a speculation - female teachers.<sup>44</sup> - Interestingly, the report makes a great plea for positive discrimination for boys in dance.<sup>45</sup>

At tertiary level, dance studies have expanded whilst student numbers have changed little.<sup>46</sup> Where dance occurs in tertiary education, it is "in no viable sense an equivalent in stature, literature, complexity or standard

-----

40. For dance as consolidating the social order cf I.2.4., The problem: the body

41. 1980:104

42. *ibid*:122;125

43. *ibid*:55

44. This speculation is also based on personal experience of a national seminar on teaching strategies for dance by the Inner London Dance Teacher Association, 7-8/11/81, which assembled a group of approximately forty teachers, thereof one male, an invited speaker.

45. *ibid*:63

46. *ibid*:71

to music or other arts subjects".<sup>47</sup>

#### 2.3.5 Summary and Conclusion

Towards the end of the twentieth century dance is still a - although slightly less - marginal, low status, low salary activity of females and young, black and/or working class males.<sup>48</sup> Dance institutions (private and maintained) stress its high art aspect, whereas as a social and leisure activity dance embodies entertainment, vitality, pleasure and sexuality. For women and girls dance can be a limited channel for physical self-expression, an absorbing, pleasurable activity in its own right as well as an opportunity for control, fantasy and success.

Dance is not adequately theorized either in comparison with other arts (and in arts in education) or in social studies or sociology. Again, the comparative lack of theory of dance, i.e. its invisibility in public discourse reflects the low prestige and marginal place of dance.

The fact that dance is so inadequately theorized is significant and deserves attention. The following section then studies sociological notions that may account for the lack or inadequacy of dance theory and the marginal status of dance.

-----

47. Adshead, J, 1981:40

48. cf Noble, T, MA 1984, Abstract



## 2.4 GRAPPLING WITH DANCE: LEARNING FROM SOCIOLOGY

### 2.4.1 Introduction

In the previous chapter, dance as a cultural phenomenon has been studied horizontally, across various cultures, i.e. anthropologically. This chapter purposes to study dance as a cultural phenomenon vertically, within a specific society, i.e. sociologically, sociology being the study of society<sup>1</sup>. - I limit my study to sociological notions and findings relevant to the study of dance as a cultural phenomenon.<sup>2</sup> Notions of the three founding fathers of sociology Marx, Durkheim and Weber<sup>3</sup> are relevant and useful notions for the understanding of dance as a cultural and social phenomenon.

Marx's theory of historical determinism allows to place dance in a specific historical and social context and to understand dance or forms of dance in relation to and as an expression of their specific historical context. The notion of hegemony seems useful to explain the place of dance in a specific society at a specific historical moment. -

Durkheim's paradigm of the collective nature of human experience<sup>4</sup>, already introduced in the previous anthropological chapter, is paramount for the understanding of the connection of the personal and the social body, in a social anthropology of the body. Durkheim's theory of the division of labour comes to bear on several aspects concerning dance: on the the position

-----

1. cf Wolff, 1981:6

2. For a discussion of sociological theories and concepts cf e.g. Young, M, F, D, 1971

3. cf Young, M, F, D, 1971:19

4. cf Polhemus, T, 1978:27

of the arts in Western, European twentieth century society and on the gender division of labour as well as the social creation of the personal body.<sup>5</sup>

Weber's main interest in comparative religion enters upon values and ethics, i.e. values that dance embodies in a particular society.

#### 2.4.2 The Marginal Status of Dance: Learning from Sociology

To make sense of the position of dance in European society problems of class, ideology, power structure and function<sup>6</sup> of dance in this industrial society have to be dealt with.

Brinson stated 1982 in his talk at the first conference of British dance scholars that the sociology of dance "is a relatively new discipline"<sup>7</sup> which must be guided by the "practical circumstances of dance in society today."<sup>8</sup> He postulated dance as "as social fact" and its various manifestations as "a social response to current circumstances"<sup>9</sup>.— But what is our European society today? What are the circumstances?

I borrow the theoretical answer to this question from Bernstein. According to Bernstein, organic solidarity corresponds to the differentiated society, with specializations of social roles. The loss of a particular group of specialists may seriously impair the

-----

5. Durkheim's emphasis on collectivity and the corollary morals of social solidarity are reflected in educational concepts, e.g. Hargreaves, D, H, 1982:100f. For a discussion of Hargreaves, D, cf I.3

6. cf Brinson, P, in Dance Research, autumn 1983, 1/2:65

7. cf Brinson, P, 2-4/4/82:1

8. Brinson, ibid:4

9. cf Brinson, ibid:



society.<sup>10</sup> He contends<sup>11</sup>:

"Organic solidarity refers to social integration at the level of individualized, specialized, interdependent social roles, whereas mechanical solidarity refers to social integration at the level of shared beliefs."

We live in a differentiated society with organic solidarity. Individualized social roles, specialized forms of communication and control over specialized physical resources (also the human body) as well as control over dominant and specialized forms of communication are its features. These features can be exemplified by the case of dance.<sup>12</sup> The key notions for dance as a low status activity are -individualized, -specialized, -interdependent social roles ...for dance practitioners.

In order to understand the link between the social role of dance practitioners and the low status of dance another sociological notion is needed. I refer to what Gramsci calls 'cultural hegemony'. Knowledge or common sense knowledge becomes academic/educational and formally recognized depending on access to certain institutional contexts by pressure groups<sup>13</sup>. Through the process of transmission of culture in schools, thought categories are developed and reinforced by the legitimacy of a hierarchy of 'study objects'.<sup>14</sup> Dance suffers a low status because it does not have powerful pressure groups, because its categories are not developed and reinforced

-----

10. cf Bernstein, 1975:68

11. Bernstein, B 1975:68

12. For the distinction between individualized organic solidarity and personalized organic solidarity cf Bernstein, 1975:18f

13. cf Young, M, F, D, 1971:28

14. cf for cultural reproduction and symbolic power cf Bourdieu, Outline of a theory of practice, 1977/1981



in schools, because dance as a practical physical activity has never really been considered worth 'studying'. It is either because people with access/belonging to the cultural hegemony group do not value dance<sup>15</sup> or people interested in dance are not part of the cultural hegemony group<sup>16</sup> Both possibilities seem to apply. Dance then seems to have the function to serve as an element in the hegemony of one class or group over another and be part of the struggle of hegemonies.<sup>17</sup> Its situation in European society corresponds to the dance anthropological theme of boundary display<sup>18</sup> in an awkwardly inversed sense: The hegemonic boundary is the exclusion of dance and its marginalization by the dominant class/group.

#### 2.4.2.1 Dance in Education: Low Status Because Female?

The people interested in dance, i.e. dance practitioners (but excluded from cultural hegemony power) in the maintained sector schooling are nearly exclusively female: In the case of dance, low-status and female activity are inextricably linked. The CGF report states<sup>19</sup>:

"...our statistics and all other evidence demonstrate the traditional view that dance is taught by women and it is for girls. It is thus a single sex, female activity. The prejudice is profound and automatic."

Although it admittedly is a prejudice, dance then is a female activity, of low status, and marginal.

-----

15. cf PGCE case-study 1

16. e.g. women in arts, cf Wolff, J, 1981; e.g. women in education cf Spender, D, 1980, 1982

17. cf Brinson, P, 2-4/4/82:10

18. cf Spencer, in chapt. on anthropology

19. C. Gulbenkian Foundation Report, 1980:63

Why is this so? Although dance is often claimed to pertain to the (high) ennobling arts, the fact remains that it is hard physical work. Dance needs the physical medium of the body, dance is per definition physical. Physical work is one of the characteristics of low-status activities. Millet contends<sup>20</sup>:

"...physical exertion is very generally a class factor, those at the bottom performing the most strenuous tasks, whether they be strong or not."

Those working physically do not have the control over dominant forms of communication, their physical visibility is made invisible in the dominant discourse and the dominant forms of communication which are logos-centred.- Mary Douglas' analysis of this century's lack of commitment to common symbols (symbols of genuine conformity) is typical of an organic society described by Bernstein<sup>21</sup>. Body symbols are marginalized in the dominant verbal/logical/rational discourse because they are physical. They are relegated by the gatekeepers to subcultures of e.g. the black, the working class, the young, and the female ones.

#### 2.4.2.2 The Majoritarian Minority: Women in Sociology

At the conference mentioned above, Brinson<sup>22</sup> outlined the tasks of a sociology of dance. One of the tasks would be to understand the situations which created and needed dance. He stated<sup>23</sup>:

"These situations are usually born out of collective experience..."

---

20. Millett, K, 1971:48

21. cf I.3

22. Brinson, 2-4/4/82

23. Brinson, in JS DR, I/2, 1983:62



A sociology of dance should above all concern itself with the collective experiences arising from situations that needed and created dance. The collective experiences he named were those of the young and the black. Women were not mentioned by him. Yet to inform sociology on the situations of underprivileged groups he suggested drawing on "the feminist argument", "another social influence" worldwide. He put forward the question<sup>24</sup>:

"Could not a sociology of dance be relevant to this argument because women play so equal a role in dance, emphasising the equality of the sexes?"

What does Brinson, the chairman of the CGF report on dance education and training in Britain, mean by "so equal a role in dance" when the CGF report underscores the "social fact" that dance in the maintained sector is an exclusively female activity? If a vast female majority in the sociology of dance means "equality", then indeed sociology of dance might be relevant to dance – as a further example of sexism in sociology. Wolff's appreciation that sociology is permeated with sexism<sup>25</sup> is corroborated here and also revealed by the wording "emphasizing equality". Equality only needs emphasizing when it does not exist. Brinson's statement about equality of the sexes in dance is a mystification of the fact that dance is a female activity and also considered as such. Dance as a social fact in European society<sup>26</sup> is 'integrated' by means of individualization, specialization and interdependence. The individualization concerns women.<sup>27</sup> The specialization

---

24. *ibid*:63

25. Wolff, J, 1981:8

26. cf Bernstein above on organic solidarity

27. cf hidden-away dance-studios, I.2.1.; I.2.4.2.3.



concerns minority groups, the interdependence concerns the system and contributes to its stability.-

Keeping in mind the little girl dancing or the mother waltzing through the dining room<sup>28</sup> the question arises as to why a well-intended male sociologist of dance whose concern is the underprivileged takes such a biased view in regard to gender? The answer must be that the founding fathers have not taken account of women; the sexual division of dance has not been adequately mapped out. What applies to cultural studies seems also to hold true for dance and a sociology of dance<sup>29</sup>:

"...patriarchical relations are not amenable to simple extensions, marginal qualifications...The problematics of these theories have had to be profoundly recast, their premises brought into radical question, because of the absence, in their very theoretical structure, of the question of sexual difference...feminism has sent certainties and orthodoxies back to the drawing-board."

The one major sexual difference in the dance context that needs addressing is the human body. Its social and individual perception depends on gender.- The next section poses the body as problematic.

#### 2.4.2.3 The Problem: the Body

Social anthropologists claim that the human body has the unique position of common ground between, and a crucial means of relating, individual<sup>30</sup> and collective

---

28. cf Introduction

29. Hall et al, eds, 1980/1981:39

30. the phenomenology of Schultz emphasizes individualistic, even isolationistic aspects of human existence. cf Polhemus, 1978:27

levels of experience.<sup>31</sup> This overlap of collective-social and individual-psychological is interesting but also problematic. In a society biased towards written and verbal knowledge, with "violence symbolique"<sup>32</sup>, the body as the non-mind, the non-verbal, the non-male symbol becomes problematic for society and men. Men are defined by their mind/logos, women by their bodies/eros.<sup>33</sup> To a logos/mind/male dominated society with specialized social roles<sup>34</sup> the body is eros, the female body "the other" (Simone de Beauvoir), the "shadow" (C.G.Jung), symbolizing "uncontrollable nature" (as opposed to controllable technology), rebellion and subversion<sup>35</sup>, in short, the negative. As a solution, the body is marginalized<sup>36</sup>. Consequently, men in Western European culture and society negate the body. This colludes with Douglas' contention that where group is weak, as is the case in a pluralistic society like the Western one, and grid strong, the body is less cogent as a symbol of society<sup>37</sup> and can more easily be neglected. In *Social Aspects of the Human Body* Fisher<sup>38</sup> contends:

"...in Western culture men are supposed to transcend their bodies and to turn their energies toward the world. Women, on the other hand, are given approval for continuing and even increasing their investments in their bodies."

---

31. cf Polhemus, T, 1978:29

32. cf Bourdieu, 1982:190ff

33. cf Neusuess, Chr, 1985:78; cf also Walkerdine, in Steedman et al, 1985

34. cf Bernstein, I.2.4.2.

35. cf Mazrui, in Polhemus, ed, 1978

36. cf Noble, T, MA 1984:21

37. cf I.2.2.

38. Fisher, S, in Polhemus, T, ed, 1978:120



Women are defined by their body. Since to produce the perfect body must be the aim of women<sup>39</sup> in order to gain acceptance and status in a male dominated society, the dissatisfaction with their real bodies is unavoidable. Worse, it is a *conditio sine qua non*. But, states Fisher<sup>40</sup>,

"...dissatisfaction with one's body is accompanied by generalized feelings of insecurity and diminished self-confidence."

The connection between the definition of women by their bodies and the obligatory obsession with the shape of the body provides an explanation of the success of private dance studios hidden away from the public, different - though maybe complementary - from the one offered by Lasch<sup>41</sup>: narcissist pleasurable preoccupation with one's body easily turns sour resulting in compulsion and social necessity.-

Bernstein's argument<sup>42</sup> that the loss of a particular group of specialists may seriously impair society is highly interesting and relevant in this context: The part of human psyche and emotions that concerns the body is transferred by men to women/the female body (socio-psychological transferral). If the transferral did not take place this society might indeed be seriously impaired. The role of the (female) dancing body seems to be able to resolve inherent contradictions within the society<sup>43</sup>. At a fundamental symbolic level, it is this gender division that allows the mind/male hegemony to

-----

39. cf section on Women and dance and body technology, above

40. Fisher, S, *ibid*:119

41. cf section on Women and dance, above

42. cf I.2.4.2

43. cf Spencer, theme 5, I.2.2.



survive. To keep the hegemony of the logos/male up, the body and dance, (and therefore females) must be marginalized, the body has been made an embarrassment by 'respectable culture'<sup>44</sup>. In this context, the association of dancing with "exhibitionistic acrobatics" and even prostitution<sup>45</sup> must be mentioned.

To de-marginalize the body and dance, the value of the non-verbal ought to be reasserted<sup>46</sup>. But the resistance of the dominant order would be likely to be very fierce. Yet it might be, as Blacking strategically (or subversively?) suggests<sup>47</sup> that the reassertion could and should take place via the verbal, becoming 'visible' via the verbal. But for dance to exert the cultural influence claimed by Brinson and Blacking it would need to be "communally conceived"<sup>48</sup>. This would imply more theoretical and concrete analysis of dance from a women's point of view, or: "for the female gaze". But it would also imply a change of structure of the dominant order.

### 2.4.3 Conclusion

The discussion of anthropological and sociological perspectives of dance has shed some light on the problems and issues raised in the introduction. But these disciplines are not sufficient to account for the function and place of dance in our society because they have so far neglected and/or omitted gender, a category that has been crucial for the understanding of the place of dance in our society. Feminist theories have been able to bridge this gap.

-----

44. cf Brinson, 2-4/4/82:11

45. de Mille, A, 1951:59f

46. cf Brinson, 1/2, 1983:59

47. cf 1.2.2.

48. H'Doubler passim, in Blacking, DR, 1983, 1/1:98

The next chapter attempts to learn from aesthetics in grappling with dance as a socio-cultural phenomenon and activity.

## 2.5 GRAPPLING WITH DANCE: LEARNING FROM AESTHETICS

Dance as pertaining to the arts is one of the most current concepts of dance in education<sup>1</sup> and also in society and needs therefore addressing.- Dance as pertaining to the arts then must look at the philosophical discipline of aesthetics: Learning from Aesthetics.

Historically, the term aesthetics was applied to the theory of liberal arts or the science of perceptible beauty. But the term aesthetics also became associated negatively with affected dandyism and with exaggerated notions of art as self-sufficient and autonomous. Aesthetic criteria were divorced from moral goodness, utility, and pleasure.<sup>2</sup>

Today, the term aesthetics still has the two historical meanings as Aspin<sup>3</sup> explains:

"... 'aesthetics' having to do with standards of excellence in the fine arts and the notion to call something aesthetic... is to stamp it with commendatory evaluation... 'aesthetic' is also a term that always has considerable pejorative overtones... you will meet many teachers to whom the idea of anything to do with aesthetics is considerably to be anathematized for it has considerable tones of femininity. I once heard a Physical Education teacher describe ballet as a species of 'Poof's Football.'"

The concept of the aesthetic as expressed in this quotation pertains to the affirmative concept of culture and exemplifies wonderfully the status of dance as high

-----

1. cf Adshead, J, 1981; 18/9/1981

2. cf Oxford Companion to Art, Osborne, H, ed, 1970

3. Aspin, D, in Aesthetic Education, Conference Report, 1978:16



art within the concept of affirmative culture not only because it mentions commendatory evaluation but because it throws into light the problem of gender of this concept, with the accompanying denigration of women and and male fear of effemination.

#### 2.5.1 The Elitist Concept of Dance as Art

In need of justifications for dance in education, philosophical conceptual analyses and definitions of dance have been attempted. Many British conceptual investigations<sup>4</sup> into the nature of dance assume or conclude to be aesthetic.<sup>5</sup> Thus aesthetics are used to justify art, art is used to justify dance...with the aim of separating the virtual from actual and of emphasizing what is unique and valuable in dance/art/aesthetics.

The concept of art as high culture, i.e. the essentialist<sup>6</sup> concept, is exemplified in the work of Aspin.

##### 2.5.1.1 Aspin's Essentialist Concept of Art

The role of the arts is seen as a kind of wisdom communicated to society by the artist/prophet who transmits according to Aspin<sup>7</sup> a

"sense of glory and grandeur, beauty and sublimity with which mankind (sic) broadens its horizons and elevates its vision beyond a concern for the trivial and commonplace".

Hard work, time and effort are required for artistic creation and aesthetic evaluation of 'high art'; the

-----

4. e.g. Reid, Aspin, Curl, Redfern, Best, Layson, Hirst

5. cf Mansfield, 1976b:3

6. cf Mansfield, R, 1976a:50

7. Aspin, D, in J.Ae.E., Spring 1982:51

rewards are width, diversity, but above all individual autonomy. The artist is idealized as a genius, an unattached, autonomous, autotelic individual, not integrated in society any more, in other words marginalized,<sup>8</sup> but in an elite. But although the artist is autonomous this does not lead to a subjectivist position of the artist because the medium through which s/he expresses herself/himself is defined as objective, public. Aspin<sup>9</sup> holds

"...aesthetics and artistic creativity as having a decidedly objective status: that is to say, they have all the objectivity of a term in the public language, with a public form of discourse behind them."

The subjective feeling of the artist/dance practitioner is objectified in the form, in the formed work of art/dance. The artist/dancer conveys symbols of perceived emotion and thus creates a virtual world through contrived gestures.<sup>10,11</sup> This view is a dichotomic view of the subjective inner feeling and the objectified outer symbolic form.<sup>12</sup>

The essentialist concept of art is exemplified in dance as high art within the theatre.

#### 2.5.1.2 Theatrical Dance: Classical Ballet

The claims for standards/excellence, for public language, for the autonomy/genius of the choreographer,

-----

8. cf Wolff, J, 1981:19

9. Aspin, in Simpson, ed, 1978:22

10. cf Spencer, on Langer, 1985:7

11. cf I.2.3. Greek idealist view of dance

12. Exponents of this view of 'arts objectifying subjective reality' are Langer, Reid, cf Mansfield, R, 1976b:2ff; cf also Best, D, in Simpson, ed, Aesthetic Education, Conf. report 11-14/9/79:60

for uniqueness, for elevation beyond every-day 'triviality' are fully satisfied in classical dance (ballet). Ballet is 'high art' in that its academized movement vocabulary, meaning of the gestures, elaborate technique, emotions expressed only make sense to the initiated, the knowing few. The transmitted values are the values of Ballet's origins: European courts of absolutist monarchs. Ballet is pervaded by ideals of purity, chastity, elegance and virtuosity and of a hierarchical order. It tries to escape or deny gravity and the "encumbrance of the body"<sup>13</sup> by mastering/dominating the body in the "uptightness" typical of "tight-assed Western culture"<sup>14</sup>.

Ballet celebrates control. This control can be taken<sup>15</sup> as

"characteristic of male-dominated, authoritarian cultures which are increasing man's manipulative control over the environment".

In ballet's virtuoso technique with its 'glory' the choreographer controls the bodies of the dancers. The body is in constant danger of becoming a mere technical instrument, hence Benthall's phrase of 'the Romance of technology'<sup>16</sup>. The ballerina's body especially symbolizes the idealized male notion of women as virginal, elusive, fragile, graceful<sup>17</sup>. Be it Odette (La Sainte) or Odile (La Pute), the ballerina is supposed to be flat-chested and stream-lined so that the prince/man can lift and whirl her around easily: the female body

-----  
13. cf Benthall, J. 1976:110

14. ibid, cit A. Beattie

15. Lomax, A, cit. passim in Benthall, J, 1976:109

16. ibid:64ff

17. cf Noble, T, 1984:33



becomes the "football" of the "poof"<sup>18</sup>, the controlled object defined by the mostly male, (often gay) choreographers<sup>19</sup> manipulated by the male dancers and appreciated as the non-threatening, fairy-like, idealist, asexual female by the audience. To quote the Head of a dance college who loves ballet<sup>20</sup>

"Technique can go to extremes..I don't know how their mothers know which one to take home...they are all so alike, they are physically alike, their faces are alike, made to think alike - that just gives you an idea of knocking the individuality out with this over-emphasis on the perfect lines."

One of the attractions of classical ballet to women/women dancers may lie in its direct but impersonal, non-individual, hence safe, sexuality. Sexuality in its brutal or troubling materialism is transcended, becomes a "spiritual perfume".<sup>21</sup> De Mille qualifies the female classical dancer as "this great impersonal lover" whose privacy cannot be usurped, but whose control of "these great unions" between herself and the audience costs her dearly: the price is "unflagging lifelong effort" and "incomplete sexual life".<sup>22</sup> Dedicating her life to her own body, the female classical dancer can be considered the epitome of the division of labour and gender. The question as to whether art, in this case dance, embodies the highest values of society<sup>23</sup> as claimed by the essentialist, 'high' concept of art seems ironical in this light.

---

18. Aspin, cit above

19. cf Wolff, J, in Ross, 1985:222

20. Interview 9/6/1982; anonymization, cf II.5.1.1.

21. de Mille, A, 1951:56

22. de Mille, A, 1951:56ff

23. cf Meeson, in Ross, ed, 1985:79

The hierarchy of ballet is reflected spatially and financially: the principals are centre-stage and at the top of the pay scale of the ballet. But the physical 'hard work' pays extremely little, dance being the most disadvantaged art as to funds<sup>24</sup>. The division of labour results in low pay and prestige for physical work such as applied dance, dancing, and even lower pay for female physical work: the twenty-four swans will never get fat.<sup>25</sup> For ballet then the theory applies that the existing social and gender relations are affirmed by their transposition onto the aesthetic level. In this light, the values transmitted by these 'finest works' is at best questionable. Female dancers are trained to express the romantically pure or the wildly sensuous woman (for the man) and to give the female audience the ideal to which to aspire. In this sense, Ballet explicitly deals with sexual politics by reinforcing gender stereotypes.

In conclusion, ballet as a high art theatrical form of dance, does not seem to contribute to the de-marginalisation of dance in society, nor of the body, nor of the female body. It appears to be an elitist ghetto of male subjects and female objects. It reinforces boundaries<sup>26</sup> although it claims objectivity and public standards.

#### 2.5.1.3 Theatrical Dance: Modern Dance

Modern dance has been concerned with new subject matter and new body techniques.<sup>27</sup> Grappling with and yielding to

-----

24. Brinson, 3rd Study of dance Conf., 9/4/84

25. although Ballet companies are better off than other e.g. modern dance companies: it is the reward for celebrating the values of those in power, cf Lomax's quotation above

26. cf Spencer's typology of dance, I.2.2. Learning from anthropology

27. Humphrey, D, 1959/1980:26ff



gravity, using sinuous curves and in-gathering movements to express these, modern dance shows some characteristics of non-authoritarian cultural forms<sup>28</sup> and a greater complementarity between the sexes. The originators of modern dance such as Isadora Duncan and Doris Humphrey tried to shape the spirit of democratic forms of dance into a manner of artistic performance suitable to the cultural traditions of the twentieth century.<sup>29</sup>

Nevertheless, modern dance suffers a fringe status in contemporary society. Beattie talks of its "impotence, irrelevance and triviality in the face of our current cultural concerns" and accuses modern dance of following the same socio-economic pattern as sports or show-business<sup>30</sup>:

"...wherein a select and remote corps of skilled, highly paid professionals perform to a passive and paying audience".

New subject matter, new body techniques do not seem to be sufficient to even de-marginalize Western theatrical dance within the concept of high art.

#### 2.5.1.4 Theatrical Dance: Discussion

Cope<sup>31</sup> sums up the situation of dance as a theatre art as follows:

"...dance has become peripheral to western(sic) society's main concerns, a diversion if offered in the theatre...One form of diversionary dance, the ballet, has sufficient status from its aristocratic antecedents...to survive as a prestigious cult. Modern dance, however, is a curiously deviant activity, participants

---

28. cf Lomax, cit above

29. cf Wartenberg, Th, E, 1981:121

30. cit passim in Benthall, J, 1976:112

31. 1976:124



whether performers or audience constituting a tiny minority...Modern dance in general, by taking cognisance of this movement ('the non-verbal rhetoric' of political dissidents') and by becoming self-consciously aware of this counter-culture, could conceivably enable dance to be once again linked more centrally to society's needs and concerns."

Her suggestion of modern dance providing resolutions for a counter-culture that would make dance more central recalls the anthropological theme of dance as anti-structure.<sup>32</sup> As yet modern dance has not been able to realize this suggested potential.<sup>33</sup> Modern dance as a high art form has remained marginal and seems to have missed the opportunity to become a centre of counter-culture.<sup>34</sup>

The claim for public language and 'objectivity' of the essentialist concept of dance also finds expression in the need for notation.

#### 2.5.1.5 Dance Notation

Dance notation as a means of handing down choreographies, analogical to written music and written books becomes imperative to this essentialist concept of dance/art. Transmission of "the finest creations of the mind and hand of man(sic)...of enduring value"<sup>35</sup> is essential.<sup>36</sup> Striving for authenticity of the works of the choreographer-genius the dance as high art concept needs a well-established dance notation as a reliable form of "objective, public language". Crisp for instance

-----

32. cf Spencer's typology, I.2.2.

33. Modern dance audiences are decreasing (1987) and funding for modern dance is about 10 percent of ballet.cf New Dance, April-June 1987:3

34. cf Beattie,A,I.C.A., 1972

35. Aspin,ibid:47

36. for Educational transmission cf I.3.

deplores the inexact documentation of 19th century ballets, which is "almost spectral in lack of substance"<sup>37</sup> The performance of the choreography does not seem safe enough for transmission because the material or tool of dance, the human body, is not 'objective': no two performances are alike – the objective, public form of the choreography might be therefore jeopardized, public objectivity not maintained, a problem for a concept of dance/art that puts great emphasis on the product, and the form.<sup>38</sup> The written dance notation is the only reliable, objective and public form of transmission. Formalist charts and analyses of dances (dance appreciation)<sup>39</sup> arise from the same need for analysis, appreciation and transmission knowledge.

#### 2.5.1.6 The Essentialist Concept of Dance: Conclusion

The academized theatrical dance forms seem to reinforce current and traditional inequalities and hegemonies. 'Dance as art' within aesthetics is a monolithic, closed concept and a barrier for a more central place for dance in Western society and for demarginalization and emancipation of those for whom dance might provide a resolution. The essentialist concept of dance as 'high art' alienates large parts of society. It leads to a double marginalisation, that of dance as elitist art and that of women as dance practitioners.

The elitist, essentialist concept of art/dance contrasts with the populist concept of art/dance.

#### 2.5.2 The Populist Concept of Art/Dance

A populist or democratic concept of art/dance is expressed by Wartenberg. Although Wartenberg is

-----

37. Crisp, Cl, D.R.1/1, spring 1983:5

38. cf Cohen, S, J, in Dance research, 1/1, spring 1983:16

39. cf Adshead et al, Fall 1982



American, I quote the following passage because it sums up the democratic concept of art/dance<sup>40</sup>:

"I want to be able to speak of democratic, non-elitist art in the sense of an art which confirms the greatness of the human spirit in the face of all attempts to demean that spirit, to make people accept a diminished sense of their own worth, by the use of hierarchical dichotomies...it is an art designed to further the cause of human emancipation... Democratic dance, on the contrary, will be supportive of each individual human being's sense of himself or herself and not set up any fundamental dichotomy of human worth."

This quotation evokes the individualistic if not to say subjectivist tendency of a British exponent of this concept: Ross.

#### 2.5.2.1 Ross' Populist Concept of the Expressive Arts

Inspired by Witkin's work<sup>41</sup> Ross<sup>42</sup> appreciates the arts in education as an

"essential and unique way of knowing"

through which children can express themselves. Subjective knowing, representation of personal experience and the creative process are key issues of this concept. Self-expression or "subject-reflexive action" is seen to be self-specific, i.e. private; the only communication is essentially self-communication<sup>43</sup> Subjective knowing, 'knowing in our bones', is<sup>44</sup>

---

40. 1981:117/119

41. cf *The Intelligence of Feeling*, 1974

42. Ross, M, 1978:XIII

43. Ross, 1978:46

44. Ross, 1978:42



"..a physical, sensuous experience of ease or dis-ease in the here and now, the operation of this feeling intelligence at the cutting-edge of experience itself."

Ross rejects the notions of the arts as a purely civilizing influence and of education as purely fostering conceptual intelligence<sup>45</sup>. He holds that the prime concern should be emotional development.<sup>46</sup> Ross does not attempt to rest his case on purely affective and perceptual development. He takes this development as a means towards a "revolutionary vision of a better life."<sup>47</sup>

A functionalist view of dance/art as fostering physical and psychological/intellectual growth rejected by Ross is supported by Swanwick.

#### 2.5.2.2 Swanwick's Art/Mind Concept

Starting from the assumption that education is about developing the mind, Swanwick rests his case for the arts on Piagetian psychology and play. Like Ross, he sees the arts as a way of knowing<sup>48</sup> Mind and intellect are extended to forms of articulation other than verbal<sup>49</sup>:

"..the arts can exert as much intellectual force as any other symbol-making activity."

To foster real development Swanwick emphasizes the need for an equilibrium between assimilation and accommodation, or between imaginative play and imitation. His case for the arts rests on their

---

45. Ross, 1978:39

46. Ross, Working Paper 54:56

47. Ross, 1981:6

48. Swanwick 1983:18

49. Swanwick, 1983:19

sustaining the growth of the mind.

### 2.5.2.3 Discussion

Both populist concepts emphasize growth, either emotional or cognitive growth, of the individual. Both underline the importance of the arts and their accessibility for all, not just for an elite. Swanwick's concept is more moderate. It contains elements, e.g. of mastery, close to the essentialist model. Swanwick argues similarly to Eisner who sees mind as cultural achievement and who takes the arts and expressive objectives of the arts as fostering divergent thinking and extending literacy to various forms of representation.<sup>50</sup>

These concepts are closer to what can bring dance as a female marginal activity towards a more central place, if only that they are more democratic. Ross's concept does not account for the group aspect. Swanwick and Eisner emphasize mind, which is a male-defined concept, so much that their concepts must be cautiously 'handled'. If mind is extended so much – what does it encompass? does it not become so wide as not to mean anything? Is it not a conjuring trick, similar to the supposed one of Blacking<sup>51</sup>? Instead of using art/dance as a tool to development/mental growth would it not be better and more modest to accept a more open concept, or a non-monolithic concept? Mansfield suggests<sup>52</sup>:

"Knowing what dance is, is not knowing some true definition or theory, but being able to recognize dance."

Mansfield's answer is to draw on phenomenology and

-----

50. cf Eisner, 1979; in Stenhouse 1975

51. cf 1.2.2.

52. 1976b:5

Sartrean existentialism to make the case for the validity of the personal, subjective experience of the dancer/doer, of the perspective of "attending from" (Polanyi)<sup>53</sup> on the grounds that the objective world can only be perceived through the subjective experience.<sup>54</sup> Mansfield thus combines the subjective with the objective, practice with fact. His suggested concept can be seen as a synthesis of the various discussed concepts.

### 2.5.3 Discussion and Conclusion: Learning from Aesthetics: Still Grappling with Dance...

In the light of the professed preference for a non-affirmative concept of culture the discussion of the affirmative essentialist concept has obviously been biased. Must the essentialist concept of dance really be rejected fully?— I wish to quote an unsuspecting defender of the high arts: D. Hargreaves. Hargreaves<sup>55</sup> wishes to undermine Bourdieu's thesis of cultural reproduction and cultural capital by making this cultural capital available to everyone:

"...educational institutions...can actively disseminate to working-class pupils the cultural capital they cannot obtain from home...the way to undermine Bourdieu's thesis is to make 'high art' and its associated cultural capital more available to everyone...the vast majority of people can have their lives enhanced by their initiation into at least some of the 'high arts'"

---

53. Mansfield, 1976b:14ff

54. for a discussion of the phenomenology of dance based on Husserl, Sartre and Merleau-Ponty: cf Sheets, M, Phenomenology of Dance, 1979

55. Hargreaves, D, in Hammersley/Hargreaves, A, eds, 1983:128f



This view is very tempting and seems reasonable. Who would not want to enhance their lives? Yet the question of identity still remains. Can 'high art' be assimilated by oppressed, marginalized groups? Is not the very definition of high art linked with exclusivity, prerogative, demarcation, boundaries? Or would and could Hargreave's suggestion subvert the dominant order? What about the resistance of the dominant order?<sup>56</sup> Would the subversion lie in making high arts available to all or in the re-definition of high art and their concomitant values? Or is art not rather a middle-class idealistic concept to which all other classes must aspire and by aspiring to it all the other classes are subordinated to it, i.e. have to acknowledge its hegemony? Following Shetsova, for working-class people art is useless. What is useless is art, what is useful is not. Everybody's culture being pleasure, joy, thirst, food<sup>57</sup>:

"...when you show us Mozart, which bores us, you are telling us that you are privileged'. Given this, I can't say to them 'Now, look here, make an effort so that you can enjoy x as I do'."

To bring about significant changes in evaluation might have to be linked with achieving substantial redefinition of high art/affirmative culture.<sup>58</sup> Availability would not necessarily entail re-definition.

What does all this mean for dance as a high art concept from a women's perspective? Swan Lake at Covent Garden attracts female audiences. Swan Lake providing an escapist realm of timelessness<sup>59</sup> can explain in part

-----  
56. cf Young, 1971

57. Lang; Abirached cit passim in Shetsova 1982/7:7;31

58. cf Eggleston on re-definition of high status knowledge, 1977:40

59. cf Spencer's typology: dance as communitas and anti-structure, I.2.2.

their going there. Yet it does not explain the object-subject relationship. How do women look at women performing? Is there identification? What does it mean to them? Can Swan Lake be redefined, resolved from reproducing cultural capital and stereotypes? Arnold contends<sup>60</sup>:

"Despite its being a recognized artistic enterprise and capable of being discussed in 'artistic' terms Swan Lake at Covent Garden can result in being aesthetically meaningless for both dancers and audience."

It can, but it may not – from the point of view of women, the process of looking at women performing needs more analysis. This analysis would not be based on 'objectivity', nor on the myth of the perfect form, nor on standards, but would entail<sup>61</sup>

"...an interrogation of the forms and nature of both the pleasure and pain which this involves."

– pleasure, joy, pain as criteria for working-class people/women.

Notation as the instrument of high art dance fixed the ephemeral dance, makes dance transmittable written knowledge, makes it visible for following generations so that it cannot be forgotten. Visibility is an important claim of feminism. The hierarchy of the written/verbal and the concrete/non-verbal and the hegemony of the male, visible, written, historical over the female, invisible, forgotten are in conflict. I cannot but state this contradiction. What is certain is that purely formalist considerations of high art dance deny value to dance practices. They may foster rational understanding,

-----

60. 1979:136

61. McRobbie 1984:139



but, again, phenomenologically, dance as a created form is not analyzable.<sup>62</sup>

This leads me to the populist concepts of art/dance. Both Ross and Swanwick want to foster development. Ross's development of the subject must create identification difficulties for women, who are defined as the other, the object. But my main interest for discussion concerns Swanwick's development of mind. He does not describe or modify what he understands as mind. Talking about education he enumerates<sup>63</sup>

"...understanding, insightfulness; qualities of mind."

Has education to do with qualities of mind separately from understanding? or are understanding, insightfulness qualities of mind? - Checking the Oxford Dictionary of English etymology to make sure, I find under 'mind':

- \* - memory
- \* - thought, purpose, intention
- \* - mental faculty

from Germanic roots of \*mun, -\*men, \*man. Mind then is etymologically linked to man, to thought; memory, thought, mind are linked and associated with male modes of discourse. I conclude from this that Swanwick's concept means that those realms that are traditionally not associated with mind (i.e. art/dance) are to be incorporated into (and concomitantly subordinated to) the hegemony of mind/the abstract/, into the male order of logos.<sup>64</sup> The question here is not to deny women any mind, on the contrary. The question here is the question of power and hegemony: in order to bring about change,

---

62. cf Sheets, M, in Brooke/Whiting 1973

63. Swanwick, 1983:9

64. cf Walkerdine, in Steedman et al, 1985



subversion must imply a re-definition of high art, high status knowledge. A re-definition that occurs via the very means that constitute the marginalisation of dance is at least very unattractive, if not counterproductive, for dance as a marginal female activity. Swanwick's educational axiom of the development of mind goes hand in hand with his contempt for experience, i.e. practice<sup>65</sup>:

"...education is surely more than 'having experiences'.."

and reveals thereby his concept to be hierarchical. Marginal forms such as dance cannot be incorporated on equal terms given the historical development of our cultural heritage.<sup>66</sup> Because of socio-historical processes the very concept of art and the art production are male-dominated and male realms.<sup>67</sup> Concepts of dance as art are closed, male concepts.

An open concept of dance, or rather, concepts of dance are needed that do not alienate by integration and subordination under the male order. Is that possible?

#### 2.5.3.1 Towards a Re-Definition of Aesthetics?

A re-definition of aesthetics might be a way forward<sup>68</sup> towards change: the regaining of the aesthetic as the regaining of sensitivity towards the environment, of sensitivity towards nature, human beings, things, which is only possible with the passion of the category of the "sentimental". Aesthetics not any more as the theory of liberal arts or the science of perceptible beauty, but as

---

65. Swanwick, 1983:9

66. cf Wolff, in Ross, 1985:214

67. cf Wolff, in Ross, 1985:221

68. Glaser/Stahl, 1983:137: "Die Wiedergewinnung des Aesthetischen als Wiedergewinnung von umweltbezogener Sensibilitaet"

senses and sensitivity linked to the surroundings, to the context, contextual sensitivity: a text or texture, interlinked webs and threads<sup>69</sup>. Dance could find a place within such an open context and could contribute to a coding of knowledge within such a framework. This view of dance and aesthetics resembles what I have described as the ogling glaze, or, in dance terms, the 'attitude': one leg firmly on the ground of reality, the other extended into the air exploring what might be. Still, dance is marginal. A re-definition of the kind mentioned here can orient further study. But the notion of re-definition is linked to the power to do so and to implement it. A re-definition of aesthetics would be only be possible in a paradigm shift. Dance as a female marginal socio-cultural phenomenon and activity may use such a re-definition in its orientation, but this is only possible in the form of sub-culture.

Brinson's conviction that art as part of culture contributes to the development of society<sup>70</sup> may be correct. But for dance the question must be what kind of contribution, and to what kind of society, and for whom? Glaser/Stahl's re-definition provides a possible answer. So does the concept of aesthetics as the capacity to integrate human strivings (physical, intellectual, psychical) in a harmonious, meaningful and humane way.<sup>71</sup> This concept as well as that of Wartenberg mentioned above go back to the origins and roots of art/aesthetic as being integrated in everyday social and cultural life. The essentialist or 'high art' concept of developing knowledge of art as defined by history and theory and the populist concept sympathetic to developing personal awareness ought to be re-constructed with a more substantial ground of meaning in relation to the real

-----  
69. cf Gregory, E, 1983: Summoning the familiar

70. Brinson, P, Dance Research, 1/2 Autumn 1983: 64

71. Goettner-Abendroth, Nov. 1984: 3

world.<sup>72</sup>

Yet since the questions of power, cultural hegemony, violence symbolique and the resistance of the dominant order are far from being solved, grappling with dance continues. At present my one scale of values is realized in my interest in dance and in dance practitioners.

Still, I believe that to place dance within non-affirmative culture, i.e. to state dance as a socio-cultural activity, or to state dance within aesthetics re-defined could make sense of, orient and take into account its practical, non-verbal, sensual, female activity aspects and might resist to claims of co-option from the dominant order. The search for theory might fruitfully explore this perspective.

It will be the purpose of the case-studies to highlight dance-practitioners' views and perspectives of 'attending from' and 'looking at'<sup>73</sup> and to examine if futures/utopias of aesthetics shortly discussed here could be of importance and guidance to them.

---

72. cf Meeson, in Ross, ed, 1985:57ff

73. cf Polaniy, Mansfield 1976b



## 2.6 GRAPPLING WITH DANCE: CONCLUSION

Notions from the three disciplines anthropology, sociology and aesthetics have been discussed and examined and a short historical survey of dance has been presented in order to learn about and illuminate dance and its socio-cultural context, in particular the Western/British context within which it is organized.

Useful findings from anthropology have been:

-The anthropological notion of the dialectical (or cyclical?) relation between the personal and the social body, the typologies of dance for classification and orientation: 'making sense'; the notion of dance as a non-verbal system of communication and symbols; the social-anthropological notion of performance as meaning, or, performance as practice and active assimilation (as different from fact and passive accommodation) which allows to interpret dance and dancing as an important form of cultural activity.

- Useful findings from the historical survey have been: the position of dance and the body in the Hellenist/Christian tradition; the dichotomy body/soul.

- Useful findings from sociology have been: the notions of value hierarchies, the hierarchy of periphery(marginality) and centrality; the hierarchy of the verbal and the nonverbal associated with the hierarchy of male and female (informed by socio-psychoanalytical notions); notions of hegemony, power and control; the division of labour and of gender; the distinction between practice and fact.

- Useful findings from aesthetics have been: the uselessness of the notion of essentialist/elitist concepts of dance/art; the danger of justifications of dance as development of the mind as co-options.

Problems that have arisen from the examination of these disciplines as to their relevance to dance as a marginal, female activity in British society are:

- the problem of the body, in particular the female body
- the problem of interpreting dance as communication, in the light of the fact that non-verbal communication is psycho-analytically linked to the 'duad' relation with the mother anterior to verbal communication with the father and which is associated negatively;
- the hegemony of male values and definitions, i.e. the hegemony of written, abstract, second-hand knowledge over nonverbal, first-hand, practical knowledge and experience;
- the subject - object dichotomy with its 'distanced knowledge' of 'looking at' as opposed to 'attending from'.

Although there have been a great deal of useful findings in this search through theory, none of the three examined disciplines has been able to account fully for dance being a marginal female low status socio-cultural phenomenon and activity. The 'state of the debate' of the various disciplines has had to be extended by feminist theory to make sense of personal experience. Turning to the various fields of knowledge to learn from I have found that they have not (yet?) sufficiently taken into account the crucial category of gender. In search of theory the state of the debate has confirmed male bias in concepts, interests, perspectives and language.

Keeping in mind the necessary and inevitable double existence in 'attitude' essential for women's dignity, self-determination, identity and mental health mentioned in the Introduction<sup>1</sup>, I once more refer to the metaphor

-----

1. chapter 1.



of 'attitude': The supporting leg has 'traversed' theories and concepts, has looked at the state of the debate. But it is important also to look at the explorations of the leg in attitude(s) the task or perspective of which is to find out, to develop towards emancipation and autonomy, towards articulating the world and being articulated upon it<sup>2</sup> of women dance practitioners, exploring possibilities and substantiating materials towards theory formulating close to women dance practitioners' practice. Theories based on psychoanalysis, populist concepts of art and non-affirmative concepts of aesthetics have been useful materials - but still a little bit 'in the air'.

I have learnt from the disciplines of anthropology, history, sociology and aesthetics that the peripheral situation of dance in Western society, at a close look, is even more entrenched and tightly linked to the dominant social order than anticipated and that the struggle to work towards emancipation and change serving women dance practitioners will be very difficult indeed. The search for theory has revealed harsh findings.

After 'learning from' various disciplines relevant to dance I turn to another area of knowledge, to education. I shall look at several ideologies of education concerning their relevance to past and future dance in education.

---

2. cf Hall, 1981, in III.7.



## Chapter 3

GRAPPLING WITH EDUCATION: EDUCATIONAL THEORIES AND  
IDEOLOGIES RELEVANT TO DANCE IN SCHOOLS

"...the truth of a theory  
 is not dependent  
 on the application of certain  
 methodological principles and rules,  
 but on its potential to orient the  
 processes of praxis towards  
 progressive emancipation and  
 humanization."

M.Mies<sup>1</sup>

### 3.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter deals with educational ideologies and theories. The term 'ideology' is used to allude to its connotation of unpractical, or rather non-practical, theorizing and to allude to its concern with the nature of ideas. Skilbeck<sup>2</sup> describes the two uses as follows:

"A system of ideas concerning the events and institutions of social and cultural life and the manner of thinking characteristic of a social class, or group, having some special interest in these phenomena."

But ideology can also allude to power implications.

---

1. in Bowles/Duelli, 1981, II:31

2. Skilbeck, in Skilbeck, M, Harris, A, Open University, 1976, 3:21

Skilbeck states<sup>3</sup>:

"the beliefs, including myths, of ascendant social groups who impute special powers to ideas and seek to use them for sustaining their position and prestige in society..."

The term theory is used here to mean the exposition of the general principles of a particular theory of education. For reasons of convenience the term ideology will be used in the wider meaning of theorized general principles and ideas, similar to the one used by Meighan.<sup>4</sup>

Etymologically, the term education stems from Latin educere, meaning to lead, to guide away from, or to lead forth<sup>5</sup>. The etymology implies that the person being educated is lead away<sup>6</sup> from ignorance, is lead forth on the path to knowledge and culture. Education is the act of 'leading forth': the perspective can be interpreted as the one of the teacher as the agent, and the one of the pupil being educated or being acted upon. Education can be interpreted as a process towards the control of one's life<sup>7</sup>, as intent socialisation<sup>8</sup>, as induction into culture<sup>9</sup> as social reproduction<sup>10</sup> etc., according to implicit value preferences and judgements inherent to the

-----  
3. ibid:22

4. Meighan, in Barton, Meighan, eds, 1978:107:A "broad but interlinked set of ideas and beliefs about the world held by a group of people that they demonstrate..."

5. cf German 'Erziehung': to pull forth, towards

6. It is interesting to speculate what the 'education' leads away from really: innocence? Fetal harmony with the mother? cf Irigaray, 1987

7. cf Gintis et al, in Barton 1980:63

8. cf Easthope, ibid:154

9. cf Bantock, I.3.2.

10. cf Bourdieu 1977/1982

philosophical, cultural, political theory in question.-  
If the aim of education is the autonomous,  
self-determined, competent and knowledgeable adult person  
able to live in the community, nature and universe then  
it also implies emancipation in terms of equality of  
race, class and gender.

In the Introduction<sup>11</sup> to this thesis I have stated that  
the purpose of the research has been towards change and  
that the perspective and the purpose have been  
emancipatory.- In this chapter dealing with ideologies of  
education then I not only wish to discuss ideologies of  
education useful for analysing dance concepts in the  
history of dance in education but also as a means of  
emancipation, as a means of cultural change, education  
'leading forth' towards emancipation. The perspective of  
emancipation is the one of the actor/actress, the agent.  
This chapter focuses on ideologies relevant to and  
underlying dance curricula and syllabi and on their  
usefulness towards emancipation. The concept is not to  
be original but to present or 'traverse'<sup>12</sup> ideologies  
that seem useful for making sense of dance as a  
socio-cultural phenomenon in the context of schools and  
towards change. My emancipatory interest is at the root  
of my critical orientation in regard to educational  
ideologies.<sup>13</sup>

This chapter is not intended to be 'objective' and  
value-neutral. There is no pretence of philosophical  
expertise, merely a bringing together of ideas,  
ideologies and principles that may highlight and inform  
the theory and practice of dance in education. Neither  
do I pretend to, nor attempt, a complete broad  
presentation and debate of educational ideologies. I  
declare being selective, choosing contributions to

-----  
11. chapt.1

12. cf Irigary, in chapt.1

13. cf Froehlich 1980:32ff



support my case.

History (i.e. of educational ideologies in schools) and future (i.e. educational ideologies towards change) are complementary in constituting the present<sup>14</sup> to live fully in the present. To make such a utopian present<sup>15</sup> possible, the actual present and the past must be re-interpreted and re-constructed.<sup>16</sup>

From the historical development of British education<sup>17</sup> the following characteristics can be summarized:

- \* - differentiation into high-status (academic/theoretical/abstract) and low-status (vocational/practical/concrete) knowledge
- \* - Academic knowledge as the defining norm
- \* - Academic curricula for the able
- \* - Psychological legitimation for the differentiated distribution of knowledge into elite and mass curricula
- \* - Maintenance of subjects and differentiation
- \* - Stratification of knowledge
- \* - Persistence of public examinations
- \* - Trend towards central control

These characteristics reflect the collapse of the idea of parity of prestige<sup>18</sup>. The stated characteristics are based on the new sociology of education. Since the discussion of ideologies of education below is informed by notions of the new sociology of education, a short

---

14. cf Slaughter, in Skilbeck 1984b:296

15. cf Introduction, chapt.1, Weigel

16. cf Esland, in Young, M, 1971:77

17. cf Eggleston, J, 1977; Lawton, D, 1979; Lawton, 1984; Skilbeck, M, 1984a; Hargreaves, D, 1982

18. cf Banks, in Lawton et al, 1987:37, cit. passim

note and some notions are inserted here.

### 3.1.1 The New Sociology of Education

The New Sociology of Education sets out to critically examine – or de-construct – how knowledge is selected, organized and assessed in educational institutions<sup>19</sup> and offers thus strategies of resistance. It is often marxist-oriented in its critique of orthodox theories of knowledge. Knowledge is taken as problematic, not given as a socio-historical construct. The definition of what counts as knowledge is made by those in power to do so. Hegemonic groups define their knowledge as 'knowledge' which then becomes highly-valued knowledge.> Young contends<sup>20</sup>:

"Thus highly-valued knowledge becomes enshrined in the academy or school and provides a standard against which all else that is known is compared."

Access to knowledge is paralleled by stratification and increasing differentiation.<sup>21</sup> Power in defining values and what counts as knowledge is relevant for the new sociology of education.

The social construction of knowledge thesis of the New Sociology of Knowledge is seen as a liberating potential because objectivity and truth come to be understood as human products and socio-historical constructs, not as absolutes<sup>22</sup>. People become world producers as well as social products in a dialectical, interactionist

---

19. cf Young,M,1971:19;27ff

20. Young,1971:33

21. cf Young,in Open University,14-15,1977:85f

22. cf Whitty,Op.Univ.14-15/1977:58

process.<sup>23</sup> Human learning is seen to be derived from a dialectical relationship between consciousness and socially approved and socially distributed knowledge.

The new sociology of education has been criticized for its very relativist position 're' construction of reality and for its inclination towards theory and the academic to the detriment of practice.<sup>24</sup> Another criticism has concerned its rejection of highly-valued knowledge on the grounds that any knowledge is power, and that to have knowledge is good, even if it is high-value knowledge.<sup>25</sup>

Dance as a mainly practical activity and first-hand experience pertains to low-status knowledge and is a low-status subject.<sup>26</sup> - Is it good to have dance knowledge? How helpful are the notions and the analysis of the new sociology of education for dance? These questions will be addressed in the following section on ideologies of education.

### 3.1.2 The Presentation

What are the ideologies that underlie this British education? What are their controversies? What their dilemmas in relation to dance? - I have subdivided the presentation and discussion of the various ideologies into sections, each dealing with a specific ideology, and its relevance to dance in school in a perspective of potential change. The key concepts inherent to the various ideologies I am interested in are those of culture, knowledge and curricula. Related to these key concepts are notions of values and hierarchies which come to bear on e.g. dance syllabi and examinations, gender, and teaching styles.

---

23. cf Esland, in Young, 1971:79f

24. cf Reid, in Barton/Meighan, 1978:26

25. cf Davies, B, 1976:175

26. cf III.7.



Following Skilbeck<sup>27</sup> I wish to discuss three ideologies concurrent in the British educational system, the classical humanist ideology, the progressive ideology and the reconstructionist ideology of education.

---

27. Skilbeck, M, 1982

### 3.2 THE CLASSICAL-HUMANIST IDEOLOGY OF EDUCATION

The following characterization of the classical humanist ideology of education is informed mainly by new sociology of education literature.

This ideology, because of its long historical tradition, has established its cultural legitimacy within education and in the wider society.<sup>1</sup> Vaughan and Archer therefore use the term "dominant perspective"<sup>2</sup> Its justification is philosophical and in a certain sense a-historical in that it is validated by universal reason. Socio-cultural influences are transcended, objectivity achieved.<sup>3</sup> Skilbeck<sup>4</sup> stresses the separation between subjects, the defence of traditional values and standards as typical of this ideology. The separation of knowledge into subjects corresponds in Bernstein's terms to a collection type curriculum with strong classification and strong framing of educational knowledge.<sup>5</sup> Control pertains to the instrumental order<sup>6</sup>. Control is explicit e.g. in the examination of factual knowledge and skills.

According to Lawton, the classical humanist ideology centres around the key-notions of - subjects, -skills, -instruction, -obedience, -conformity, and -discipline.<sup>7</sup>

-----  
1. Whitty, 1985:140

2. in Eggleston, 1977:52

3. cf Esland, in Young, ed, 1971:76

4. Skilbeck 1984a:21

5. For collection type curricula, classification, framing, cf Bernstein, B, 1973:231;249f

6. On instrumental and expressive order cf Bernstein, 1977:37-51

7. Lawton, 1973:21f

The role of the teacher is the one of agent<sup>8</sup>, transmittor and instructor. Teachers may have visible power in the class-room, but in the school they are "privatized actors"<sup>9</sup> within their classrooms. This explains and highlights Eggleston's term of "received perspective": the perspective being accepted by teachers and pupils as part of a given order.<sup>10</sup> The role of the pupils is a passive one that they they are led initiated into the given culture, order and public thought forms.<sup>11</sup>

Knowledge is prescriptive, non-negotiable, non-dialectical and consensual<sup>12</sup> and defined, often called "worthwhile"<sup>13</sup>. The pupils are led on a continuum from concrete to abstract knowledge. To hand down or transmit knowledge, it must be 'parceled up' and processed into programmes with specific aims and objectives.<sup>14</sup> The pupils and public knowledge become reified, they become a commodity. The resulting curriculum can be called "curriculum as fact".<sup>15</sup> Because of the continuum from concrete to abstract knowledge, abstract knowledge is high-status knowledge. Curricula become academic with an emphasis on the written, second-hand knowledge which is un-related to every-day life.<sup>16</sup>

Two exponents of this ideology are Hirst and Bantock.

-----

8. cf educator/education, I.3.A.

9. MacDonald, Open University, 1977:25

10. cf Eggleston, 1977:53

11. cf Esland's term of the child as a "deficit-system", in Young, ed, 1971:89

12. cf Eggleston, 1977:52

13. cf Esland, in Young, ed, 1971:89

14. cf Tyler's rationale, in Skilbeck, 1984a:41ff

15. Young, in Davies, B, 1976:106

16. cf Young, 1971:38



Hirst is chosen to be discussed here because of his influence on dance in education, in particular dance academization. Bantock's ideology of education is relevant in relation to dance because of his defence of segregated curricula.

### 3.2.1 Hirst's Forms of Knowledge

Hirst distinguishes seven forms of knowledge.<sup>17</sup> For Hirst, the primary function of education is cognitive: the growth of the mind. The mind is seen as a tool to understand the nature of knowledge; it is seen not to be involved in the creation of knowledge.<sup>18</sup> Knowledge structures are defined into central concepts. Curricula then can be defined in terms of cognitive objectives leading to specifiable and specified outcomes.<sup>19,20</sup> Hirst's forms of knowledge neglect context and socio-historical factors

### 3.2.2 Bantock's "Apartheid" within Classical Humanist Ideology

I have borrowed the expression of "apartheid" from

-----

17. For Hirst's seven forms of knowledge cf Pring, in Lawton et al, 1978:140; Skilbeck 1984a:31ff; Eggleston 1977:58

18. cf Eggleston, 1977:59

19. cf Skilbeck, 1984a

20. Lawton's 'cultural map' of eight categories of cultural systems resembles Hirst's categorizing concept, but is anthropologically inspired, cf Lawton, D, in Skilbeck, ed, 1984b:275ff. - Yet Bourdieu shows that the metaphor 'cultural map' is used as an outsider's analogy, cf Bourdieu, 1982:2. Lawton's metaphor can be misleading in that it recalls classical-humanist ideology with its 'objective knowledge' and its classification into forms of knowledge/subjects. Lawton's orientation is towards democratic education and can thus be placed within a reconstructionist ideology, of reformist rather than radical tendency.

Hargreaves.<sup>21</sup>— The following is mainly based on Bantock's article *Quality and Equality in Curricular Provision*<sup>22</sup>.— Bantock's seeming nostalgia for a 'Golden Age' produces a view of education as conservation and transmission of "valued or sacred texts". Even problem solving must be based on "prior assimilation of relevant material". Since the "sophisticated understandings, feelings and skills" are not equally accessible to all in terms of intelligence, Bantock advocates segregated or "differentiated" curricula, i.e. an curriculum of the "higher achievements", of high culture for an elite (with corresponding high standards), and a mass or low-achievers' curriculum fostering "emotional development".<sup>23</sup> A "watered-down version of high culture" for the masses would be a sacrilege: therefore educational apartheid.<sup>24</sup> The child-centred approach is reduced to a method, to a mere strategy for achieving cultural conservation.

### 3.2.3 Summary and Discussion

Skilbeck sums up the classical humanist ideology of education as follows<sup>25</sup>:

"...classical humanism has been associated with clear and firm discipline, high attainment in examinations, continuity between the past and the present,...with predefined views about what it is fitting to do, feel, think, and with standards of performance in all spheres. Education may be active but is always primarily an assimilative process: induction into institutions; acceptance of defined values and standards; initiation into clearly

-----  
21. Hargreaves, D, 1982:121

22. in Skilbeck, Harris, Appendix Open Univ, 1976:88ff

23. Movement activities are seen to foster emotional development...

24. cf Hargreaves, above

25. Skilbeck, in Skilbeck, Harris, 1976:28



articulated modes of thought and action."

The 'purity of categories'<sup>26</sup> of the classical humanist ideology of education<sup>27</sup> makes knowledge safe and protects the vital principles of social order<sup>28,29</sup> The classical humanist ideology of education has been discussed for its relevance to the history of dance in education.- This ideology is blatantly unsuitable for dance. Dance is by its very nature and above all a practical activity. By stressing the value of abstract stratified knowledge this ideology places dance within the low-status knowledge just about good enough for the emotional development of low-achievers.- Hirst's stress on the prime importance of mind relegates dance as a physical activity to the side-line. Bantock's enthusiasm for high culture might include classical ballet for the elite. I may be one of the "pampered heirs of a great tradition of civilisation"<sup>30</sup> who does not wish to limit dance to e.g. 'Giselle' with all the (mainly female) fairies of classical ballet. But as far as I can make out, Giselle, Odile, Odette are not known for their emancipatory potential for women. It might be that "the great tradition" of classical ballet is not so "great" for women in this respect at least and that therefore an ideology of education that above all wants to conserve and transmit this "great tradition" does not serve dance in its manifold aspects and possibilities. On the other hand, a dance curriculum for emotional development of the deprived masses of the academically less able groups (as

-----  
26. Douglas,M,1966

27. Classical humanist ideology of education finds a neo-conservative adept in Baker in the mid-eighties, cf Baker's 1987 Education Bill

28. Bernstein,1977:74

29. for purity of categories of pedagogy,teacher role,curriculum and pupils cf Bernstein,1977:53

30. Bantock, in Skilbeck,Harris,1976:89



advocated by Bantock) acribes to dance once more a subservient 'charitable' place in the maintaining of the hegemony of the theoretical, abstract, verbal over the practical, concrete, non-verbal.

The classical humanist ideology of education may be applied in a useful way in fields of dance where steps, skills and techniques are to be learnt, where transmission of e.g. choreographies or traditional folk dances are the aim. But as an overall ideology of dance in education the classical humanist ideology stifles dance. To attempt to fit dance into this ideology is to alienate it from its practical, body-centred, concrete, and group activity aspects.

### 3.3 THE PROGRESSIVE IDEOLOGY OF EDUCATION

For reasons of balance and to maintain the structure of the previous section I let an opponent of the progressive ideology of education introduce it.

#### 3.3.1 Bantock's view on the Progressive Ideology of Education

Bantock<sup>1</sup> contends:

"...when the knowledge explosion has created a fuller...need for rational understanding and emotional discipline, the progressives advocate a more indulgent methodology and a curriculum geared to the immediate and the ephemeral...I...point to the haphazardness and subjectivity that marks much progressive following-up of interests...the emphasis on motivation and endogenous development too easily degenerates into a magpie curriculum of bits and pieces, unrelated and ephemeral. In the interest of a temporary relevance a more permanent and deeper comprehension is often sacrificed."

The "alarming anti-cultural aspects"<sup>2</sup> of the progressive ideology then seem to be subjectivity, endogenous development, self-expression of the individual, relativity and motivation.

#### 3.3.2 'Progressive' labels

These characteristics provoke labels such as

---

1. in Skilbeck, Harris, 1976:91

2. Bantock in Skilbeck/Harris 1976:89

'process-oriented'<sup>3</sup>. 'open-ended'<sup>4</sup>  
 'interpretive'<sup>5</sup>, 'integrated'<sup>6</sup>, 'subject-reflexive'<sup>7</sup>,  
 'constructive'<sup>8</sup>, 'pastoral'<sup>9</sup>.

### 3.3.3 Lawton's view

Lawton gives to the progressive ideology of education the name of its historical source: romantic<sup>10</sup>. He typifies the progressive ideology with the key words -child-centered, -creativity, -experience, -discovery, -awareness, -originality, -freedom, -innate goodness, -natural growth, -process<sup>11</sup>

### 3.3.4 Skilbeck's view

Skilbeck sees romanticism with its emphasis on private subjective meaning<sup>12</sup> as a challenge to the confidence in rationality, objectivity, universalism, causality, abstract analysis and urbanity<sup>13</sup>. The progressives' stress on the individual has repercussions for dance in education in its justification of dance as art. Skilbeck

---

3. Eggleston, 1977

4. Eisner, in Stenhouse 1975:78f

5. Lawton, 1978

6. Bernstein, 1977

7. Ross, Schools Council W.P.Nr 54:56

8. Wall, 1977

9. Bantock, in Skilbeck, Harris, 1976

10. cf Rousseau, Emile, 1762

11. Lawton, 1973:21ff

12. For fears of lunatic, incoherent subjectivism, loss of 'meaning' cf Best, D, 1978, on Argyle, M. and Metheny, E; Best, 1979; 1980; 1984; and of chaos cf Lawton et al., 1978:53, 278

13. Skilbeck/Harris, 1976:29



contends<sup>14</sup>:

"Art is authentic inasmuch as it expresses the passions and deepest experience of the individual artist; art is communication between persons and groups within a culture and in historical time. But art is not undisciplined; the task is 'to keep one's head in the course of the storm and to direct one's troops'."

Yet , due to the influence of nineteenth-century socialism, the progressive ideology of education has come to be communal as well as individualistic, accepting the fact of the social nature of the human being.<sup>15</sup>

### 3.3.5 Psychological Justification

If the classical humanist ideology is justified philosophically, the progressive ideology of education is justified psychologically, drawing on Piaget's precondition of experience/movement for formalizing operations.<sup>16</sup> First-hand experience and involvement are major motivators. The learner is the experiencing subject. Knowledge is negotiable. The role of the teacher is to cultivate each child's abilities and aptitudes. Since individual experience is primordial and every experience has a face-value of its own, progressivist ideology has a strong egalitarian ethos. Parity of esteem between different curricular performances is considered essential. Expressive objectives of creative responses of the individual become important.<sup>17</sup> Curricula are open-ended.<sup>18</sup>

-----

14. Skilbeck, 1976:30

15. cf Skilbeck, 1976:32

16. Piaget, 1972

17. cf Eisner: instrumental objectives and expressive objectives, in Stenhouse, 1975

18. cf Eisner, E, Mind as cultural achievement, in Simpson, A, ed, 1979

### 3.3.6 Bernstein's Terminology

In Bernstein's educational transmission codes, the progressivist ideology of education corresponds to the integrated code. Classification and framing are weak, boundaries blurred. The pedagogy of the integrated code emphasizes 'ways of knowing' and problem setting. This child-centred pedagogy is invisible. Invisible pedagogy has an implicit hierarchy, implicit sequencing rules and implicit criteria<sup>19</sup>.

If control, in the visible pedagogy of the classical-humanist ideology, pertains more to the instrumental order, it pertains more to the expressive order in the invisible pedagogy of the progressivist romanticist ideology of education. Bernstein on control<sup>20</sup>:

"...control is vested in the process of interpersonal communication. A particular function of language is of special significance, and its realization is of an elaborated form...the form of transmission of an invisible pedagogy encourages more of the child to be made public and so more of the child is available for direct and indirect surveillance and control."

Indirect control in the invisible pedagogy: Progressive ideology of education had its origins in the middle-classes. It presupposes a middle-class conception of educational time, an elaborated code of communication, a middle-class mother (as the agent of cultural reproduction) and a small class of pupils.<sup>21</sup>

As to the transition of the invisible pedagogy into

-----

19. Bernstein 1977:53/120)

20. Bernstein, 1977:135

21. Bernstein in Dockrell, Hamilton eds, 1980:121f



schools, Bernstein quotes five conditions which must be fulfilled if the openness of learning is not to create an environment in which neither staff nor pupils have a sense of place, time or purpose. The five conditions are<sup>22</sup>:

- \* - There must be some consensus about the integrating idea if it is to work at all.
- \* - The idea must be made explicit.
- \* - The nature of the linkage between the idea and the several contents must be systematically and coherently worked out.
- \* - A committee system of staff and pupils has to be set up in order to develop a sensitive control on the whole endeavour.
- \* - Very clear criteria of evaluation must be worked out.

### 3.3.7 Summary and Discussion

The progressive ideology of education starts from the assumption of the innate good-ness of the child and is based on values of individuality and subjectivity, self-expression, negotiable knowledge. Control and hierarchy are implicit, pedagogy invisible. But it takes into account that the human individual is not an isolated but fundamentally a social being.

This ideology of education can contribute to the emancipation of dance and pupils in that value is placed on first-hand experience and knowledge. Its emphasis on individual experience may have a certain attraction for dance because it allows dance practitioners to feel important, to become the subject. But there lies the danger of meritocracy<sup>23</sup> which is contrary to the collective or social activity and experience of dancing.

-----

22. Bernstein, 1977:84

23. cf Hargreaves, 1982:85 on the meritocratic conception of the progressive child-centered ideology of education



Yet another problem arises for dance as a female activity and for dance for girls in schools. This problem can be related to Rousseau's Emile: Emile the boy is encouraged to discover the world, to be the acting subject. But his "compagne" Sophie is not supposed to discover, she just is virtuous, natural, not educated. She is nature. Discovering is reserved to the male gender stereotype.

### 3.3.7.1 Progressive Ideology of Education for Girls

The progressive ideology of education aims to produce active, discovering, autonomous learners. Girls are still socialized into silence, docility and passivity.<sup>24</sup> The difference to the aims stated above becomes pathologized<sup>25</sup> Girls might be denied the status of 'active learners', or their status of 'active learners' might be in conflict with their gender identity of docility. If girls assume the role of male defined active learners, then, contends Walkerdine<sup>26</sup>

"..the fear of the power, of taking the position of the Other through narcissistic identification, carries this threat of annihilating or being annihilated....Passivity and silence never bring that threat to the surface. The good girl never has to face an overt attack on the Other. Given the pejorative as well as the positive evaluation of 'good' and 'hard-working' within the practices, such a girl will never be positioned as 'brilliant'..."

Thus the progressive ideology of education presents contradictory advantages for dance and female dance-practitioners. These conflicts are

-----

24. cf Spender,D,1980

25. cf Walkerdine,V, in Steedman,Urwin,Walkerdine,eds,1985:229

26. 1985:231

system-inherent. They must be acknowledged and made visible.

### 3.4 THE RECONSTRUCTIONIST IDEOLOGY OF EDUCATION

Whereas the etymology of 'progressive' (latin progredi) points, seemingly aimlessly, towards the future, the word re-construct refers metaphorically to the present, the dissatisfaction with it and the creation of a better future. Pupils are not to 'progress' aimlessly into the future but to get there in a planned, 're-constructed' way.

The reconstructionist ideology of education wants education to be one of the major forces of planned social change and of the creation of a new 'human person'. This is a utopian (and thereby generalizing) stance. Skilbeck characterizes this ideology of education thus<sup>1</sup>:

"From an educational standpoint what is important is...the deliberate cultivation of rationality, of problem-solving procedures, adaptability and flexibility and a generalized capacity to face up to the problems of practical life."

The values of this ideology are rationalistic, democratic and communitarian.<sup>2</sup> The subject-matter arises from contemporary cultural problems and issues. The acquisition of knowledge is seen as a social, active process. The reflective or problem-solving process helps prepare pupils as social critics and agents of change<sup>3</sup>. Education becomes a preparation for participatory roles in social change.

The role of the teacher is that of "the chief agent and

-----

1. Skilbeck, 1976:37

2. Skilbeck, 1976:34f

3. Skilbeck 1976:20



engineer of planned educational change"<sup>4</sup> gaining in importance from the role of guide in the progressive ideology of education.

The orientation of this ideology of education is sociological.

In Bernstein's terminology, classification in the reconstructionalist ideology of education is weak, framing can be weak or strong, control lies with the participants, authority and control are horizontal and may pertain to the instrumental or expressive order.

### 3.4.1 Freire's 'Cultural Action'

I have borrowed the expression of 'cultural action' from Skilbeck.<sup>5</sup>

Paulo Freire's work with Brazilian peasants on literacy as a tool for cultural action can be placed within the reconstructionalist ideology of education. Teaching and learning are built around every-day issues and situations and serve as a starting point for discussions and analysis hopefully leading to critical thinking and political/cultural action. The process Freire tries to trigger off by generative words from every-day life like food is conscientization. The change is not prescribed but the learners are induced to think for themselves. Teaching technique ceases to be a mere tool. It is transformed into a creative and critical process of cultural reflection and renewal. Knowledge and action are interrelated. Knowledge is mediating experience and is mediated by action. Evaluation occurs by the people involved and is continual.<sup>6</sup>

---

4. Skilbeck, 1976:40

5. cf Skilbeck, 1976:16ff; MacDonald, M, Open Univ, 1977:77

6. cf Froehlich, 1980

### 3.4.2 Discussion

The reconstructionist ideology of education is based on rational analysis of the present to orient towards the future. It has a generalizing, utopian stance and is democratic in its creed. Education is seen as a tool for change. The participatory role of the pupils is stressed. Its relevance to dance could lie in its orientation towards change. Especially Freire's model of cultural action seems to allow to contain strategies for change for marginals and oppressed groups, i.e. farmers, women. The problem for dance might reside in its non-verbal character. Rationality, a central aspect of the reconstructionalist ideology of education, is based on the verbal, the logos. Dance as a female activity uses the female body, the symbolization of nature as opposed to logos<sup>7</sup>. Walkerdine holds<sup>8</sup>:

"The Logos provided a mastery over, the regulation of, natural forces...Its very production and reproduction depends upon a denial of desire and a displacement of the irrational on to women."

Women as the facilitators of rationality in others, men<sup>9</sup>. Therefore Walkerdine advises women not to be caught in the attempt to master the Logos, and not to<sup>10</sup>

"take it as our guarantee and arbiter of truth, and of the possibility of change and transformation."

What makes dance so attractive to many women might be

-----

7. cf 1.2.3. The body

8. Walkerdine, in Steedman et al, 1985:236

9. Walkerdine bases her argument on Lacan

10. ibid



lost in the attempt to analyze rationally, to reduce to logos a cultural activity that is by its very nature non-logos. Can a useful orientation towards change, towards a more central place of dance be the result of the hegemonic means, i.e. rational, abstract, verbal) that relegates dance to its low status of irrational. concrete, non-verbal? If the answer is no - are there other means of achieving change? - Nothing can be taken for granted in a woman's perspective<sup>11</sup>. Things seem to be extremely complicated, complex and intermingled. I state contradictions which necessarily arise from the dichotomy between mind and body, between rationality and irrationality in this society. A way forward may be to use, help oneself to the tool of rationality without making it the only, absolute arbiter of what dance represents as a female experience. The reconstructionist ideology of education, in particular Freire's model of cultural action may then be seen as a useful though not sufficient tool to serve the needs of dance as a cultural activity. Because of the emphasis on rationality it must be 'handled' with care.

I therefore look further. Keeping in mind Mies' dictum of not pouring new wine into old vessels, I leave the 'old' monolithic ideologies with their 'purity' of categories and look to concepts or theories that 'mix' categories. I shortly 'traverse' two concepts of education that 'mix categories', i.e. non-monolithic concepts of education. The two concepts are those of Hargreaves and Skilbeck.

### 3.4.3 Reconstituting as the Mixing of Categories

-----  
 11. cf the concept of 'Heimatlosigkeit', Thuermer-Rohr, 1987, being without a homeland, symbolically speaking, of having to reject what has been taken for granted so far



### 3.4.3.1 Hargreaves and the Fallacy of Individualism

In *The Challenge for the Comprehensive School - Culture, Curriculum and Community* Hargreaves posits a "counterculture of dignity sustained by a collective strength of the oppositionals"<sup>12</sup> to a school that undermines pupils', in particular low-achievers' dignity, that advocates the hegemony of the cognitive-intellectual curriculum of the grammar school at the expense and to the exclusion of everyday knowledge and experience<sup>13</sup>. Collective strength and restoration of dignity combined provide aims for secondary education: the promotion of dignity<sup>14</sup>.

Hargreaves warns of the fallacy of individualism of the romanticists/progressivists. Dignity arises from collectivity<sup>15</sup>:

"...to acquire dignity a person must achieve a sense of competence, of making a contribution to, and of being valued by, the groups to which he or she belongs."

Solidarity combined with morals brings forth "enlightened allegiance"<sup>16</sup>, enlightened because rational analyzing helps understand moral demands. Hargreaves advocates a community-centred curriculum which would set the cognitive-intellectual into a new balance with "other forms of knowledge and skills"<sup>17</sup> so that<sup>18</sup>:

---

12. Hargreaves, 1982:28

13. *ibid*:52;74;58

14. *ibid*:82

15. *ibid*:100

16. *ibid*:108

17. *ibid*:136

18. *ibid*:137

"...a much wider range of human talent can come to be recognized, and thus prestige and praise can be distributed more widely to more children."

Unlike the reconstructivists, Hargreaves realizes that the school has only a relative role to play towards social change as only one agent of socialisation. He nevertheless assigns the school the task to teach individuals solidarity for the lack of other agencies able to do it. Yet he takes into account social conflicts of hegemonies or power. He attributes an important part of the core curriculum to community studies and the expressive arts because he believes that<sup>19</sup>:

"one of the primary functions of some aspects of the expressive arts is the creation of solidarity within the community".

### Discussion

Hargreaves' non-monolithic concept combines conservative (eg the concept of honour, loyalty) and radical elements (reconstructivist/progressivist elements like the moralist-utopian and rationalist ones). It is a combination that reconstitutes values of two extremes, change and conservation. Hargreaves states<sup>20</sup>:

"I want to combine into a constructive whole elements taken from extreme positions which are generally taken to be incompatible. Our crude dichotomy of 'radical' or 'conservative' is dangerous because it over-simplifies and polarizes, as if the complexity of ideas involved in any discussion of education and society can be neatly subdivided into cowboys and Indians...most of us want to play cops or robbers."

---

19. *ibid.*156

20. *ibid.*:167-8

His non-monolithic concept allows real open-endedness. As to its relevance to dance, Hargreave's concept combines various important aspects of dance: its collective aspect, its non-academic aspect, the aspect of its only relative power as a marginal subject, its need for dignity and acknowledgement. His concept might provide demarginalization for marginalized groups of society (e.g. women, young, working class, black) for whom dance can be a meaningful opportunity and a viability, a solution.

#### 3.4.3.2 Skilbeck's 'Education as a Critically Reflexive Community'

The following is based on Skilbeck 1984a and 1984c.

Starting from practical-political realities, Skilbeck sets out to develop ideas and plans for a school-based curriculum. He insists on linking his theory of action to the "arenas" of practice, of teaching and learning. School is seen in a wider social and cultural setting in constant change, which makes Skilbeck repeatedly insist on the need for dynamic, non-linear, interactive, open and loose patterns of curriculum<sup>21</sup> or for curriculum as transactional<sup>22</sup>.

For Skilbeck, pupils' development is neither a natural unfolding nor externally directed but interactive .<sup>23</sup>

Skilbeck suggests nine areas of knowledge and experience for the development – or construction – of the core, not unlike Lawton's cultural mapping. He combines objectives and process, two aspects that are often polarized in curriculum.

---

21. cf 1984a:26

22. 1984a:45

23. Development is a normative concept for Skilbeck, cf 1984a:72



Skilbeck's curriculum development model is<sup>24</sup>

"...reflexive and developmental in that, by its continuous application, progressive modifications can be made to the curriculum by all the partners and in the light of experience."

Skilbeck's model is cyclical in that practice informs theory that again informs practice. Like Hargreaves, he combines concepts and reconstitutes values of different ideologies. His emphasis on participation and the community or school is more pragmatic, less utopian than Hargreaves'.

#### Discussion

Skilbeck's concept might be relevant to dance in that it starts from practice, it is pragmatic. Dance is practice/praxis, dance educational theories or concepts must start at the practical level. It might be hard but salutary and beneficial to look at the practice of dance and formulate theories from there. This recalls the metaphor of 'attitude' or double existence/perspective.<sup>25</sup> Skilbeck's concept provides a useful strategy, but his emphasis on a core curriculum might be to the detriment of a marginal activity such as dance.

#### 3.4.3.3 Reconstituting: Summary

The three models of reconstitutionists discussed have in common a strong democratic creed. Potentially, they orient the "processes of praxis" towards democratisation. None of the concepts is sufficient in itself for dance in education but contains aspects that might be useful.

-----

24. 1984a:240

25. cf 1./Introduction

### 3.5 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

For a summary of the three discussed ideologies of education I follow Beattie's structural map of education, knowledge and curriculum based on Douglas and Bernstein<sup>1</sup>. The classical humanist ideology corresponds to Beattie's grid. The classification I use is the following:

- 1 curriculum
- 2 definition of knowledge
- 3 justification of learning
- 4 core characteristics
- 5 Focus of attention
- 6 validating criterion
- 7 typical procedures

#### Classical Humanist/Instruction Model

- 1 schedule of basic skills
- 2 authoritative, 'closed'
- 3 'extrinsic', social
- 4 didactic instruction, appealing to rational intellect
- 5 impersonal knowledge, facts, principles
- 6 cognitive mastery, understanding
- 7 firm knowledge transmitted and selected by teacher

#### Progressive/Interpretation Model

- 1 portfolio of meaningful experiences
- 2 conditional, reflexive, 'open'
- 3 'intrinsic', individual
- 4 personal growth, ego strengthening
- 5 personal
- 6 decision making, 'coping'
- 7 non-directive, experiential, emphatic

#### Reconstructivist/Reconstruction Model

- 1 agenda of important cultural issues
- 2 conditional, reflexive, 'open'
- 3 'extrinsic', social
- 4 development of peer-group associations,  
promoting moral commitment  
working and expressing solidarity  
encouraging concerted activism
- 5 collective/social issues

-----

1. cf Beattie, A, March 1980:6ff; Hide cit. Beattie, in Allan, Jolley, eds, 1987:36



- 6 co-operative problem solving
- 7 negotiation, group control, group action<sup>2</sup>

The three presented ideologies provide a grid and a structure within which concepts of dance can be located and analyzed. Each presented ideology of education contains elements that might be useful, others that are hostile to the formulation of new theories for dance as a female socio-cultural activity on the curriculum. These elements must be analyzed and, above all, they must be made visible in order for them to be used in a constructive way towards change. Further research and analysis are necessary.

The permeated ideals are those of the rational, educated person, of the person achieving personal growth (Emile), and of the peer in the group achieving power through social action. These permeated ideals reflect male stereotypes and have been found to contrast sharply with male ideals and stereotypes of the female and with female socialisation. Female stereotypes still seem to be those of the irrational/emotional person, the 'being' as opposed to the 'becoming' or 'growing' person, (Sophie), of the passive, docile individual who may follow male group action but not stipulate this right for herself and who is caught between aspiring to the (male) educational ideals and conforming to female social stereotypes.

The omission or exclusion or invisibility of gender in the examined ideologies of education, in the light of the 'cultural reproduction' thesis, is illuminating. If it is accepted that education plays an important part in social and cultural reproduction as an agency of socialisation, then education plays an important part in the reproduction of sexual division of labour. The suspicion that women's subordinate social and economic

-----

2. This grid does not mention the rational focus of the reconstructivist ideology and the reconstituting concepts.



position is not a mere accident but is also fostered by education arises. The fact that the parallel between cultural reproduction and gender reproduction has been (made) invisible for a long time can be interpreted as just another facet of the dominant male academic perspective.<sup>3</sup>

The dominant (male) academic perspective has excluded and/or subordinated (female) practical perspective and experience. Even within the sociology of education the relationship between academic and practical has been problematic and to the detriment of the latter<sup>4</sup>:

"The reconciliation of practice and knowledge, or the real applications of knowledge has always been tricky...within the sociology of education, the resolution of the conflict between academic and practical has had a clear tendency to favour the former, the academic because of the struggle for respectability within educational institutions."

Since

"Schools cannot teach what society does not know"

the reproduction of male knowledge and male experience or knowledge of the world are also reflected in educational ideologies and systems<sup>5</sup> in the bias towards the verbal, non-material, academic, abstract. The implications of this for dance as a female activity in education are discussed in the following chapter.

---

3. cf Acker, 1981:2

4. Reid, in Barton/Meighan 1980:25

5. cf Spender, D, 1982, ch.1

## Chapter 4

### CONCLUSIONS FROM DANCE AND EDUCATION FOR DANCE IN EDUCATION<sup>1</sup>

In the two previous chapters I have presented and discussed concepts of dance and ideologies of education. Not a particular form of dance or education has been at stake but the context or framework within which dance is organised in society – and thereby also in education. I have 'traversed' them in search of theories that have oriented dance in education and that might orient dance in education towards autonomy and emancipation, in other words towards change, which implies not merely an extension of the present, but more significantly, a qualitative transformation of the present.<sup>1</sup>

The discussion of theories and concepts of dance in chapter 2 has helped to shed light on questions brought up by instances of my personal experience in chapter 1/Introduction. But it has also revealed shortcomings and inadequacies in the light of the category of gender and in the light of the potential of these theories and concepts towards change.

The inadequacy and shortcomings in regard to the category of gender has also been found in chapter 3. concerned with ideologies of education. But 'traversing' educational ideologies has allowed to discover and uncover the concepts and structures within which dance in education has been organized.

Both chapters provide examples of the dominance or

-----

1. cf Duelli-Klein, cit Westkott passim, in Bowles/Duelli-Klein, 1980:49

hegemony of male culture within the academic and university world. This has also been found in the language used by the various exponents. Whether this has to be called academic sexism, "machism" and "homosociability"<sup>2</sup> I leave open to debate.

A theory of culture and education that omits gender as a category has to be sent "back to the drawing board"<sup>3</sup> because the focus on boys and men has led and must lead to a serious distortion of the understanding of educational processes<sup>4</sup> since it leaves out the experience and reality and needs of more than half the population, girls and women.

What does this imply for dance in education? In educational and socio-cultural terms theories, ideologies, concepts are needed that are not based on half the population (male) for the whole (female and male) population. A female perspective must be included.

Concerning dance in education, to include women (as the holders of male delegated 'irrationality') in the educational discourse, it might be that the "logos" itself must be deconstructed<sup>5</sup>. From the deconstruction might arise a new reading towards orientation for transformation and work<sup>6</sup>:

"Current accounts of the family and schooling...serve to help keep us locked inside a powerful fiction of autonomy and possibility, which is not to be countered by a total pessimism but rather a working with and through exploration of both our own formation

---

2. cf Morgan,D.H.J., in Roberts,H,ed,1981:100ff

3. cf Hall,in Hall et al,1981:39

4. cf Acker,1981

5. cf Walkerdine in Steedman et al,1985

6. Walkerdine in Steedman et al, 1985:238f



in all its historical specificity and the formation of other possibilities of practices, as well as locations from which to struggle within existing ones. Thus, a working within those apparatuses of our present means not only our attempts at deconstruction but the possibilities for explorations which do not seek a knowledge which claims itself as true for all people, places, times."

For dance and dance in education in particular this will also mean not to reduce them to simple, logical rational coherence and/or to resist such a reduction. The wisdom of a culture must surely lie in giving significance and dignity to all its members. Significance and dignity do not solely pertain to the rational and the logical. 'Sense life', feelings, emotions, and/or the 'irrational' must be integrated in a culture that aspires to wisdom. This is not a plea for dance as the sole expression of the 'irrational', rather the statement that dance has been pushed into the ghetto of the 'irrational'. To reduce dance to purely rational coherence so as to fit it more easily into the rational mode of education is throwing the baby out with the bath water. Wisdom would attempt to integrate the dichotomies of rational-irrational, female-male, verbal-nonverbal, practical-theoretical. Since wisdom has not been achieved yet, women dance practitioners have to practice their 'attitudes'.

Part III of this thesis will look at and explore these practices - whether they are in 'attitude' will be one of the examined issues. Part III will not attempt to come up with monolithic 'true' knowledge but will rather attempt to find out what kind of 'knowledge is good to have and what kind of knowledge is troublesome to be lacking'<sup>7</sup> for a particular dance practitioner in her specific situation. It is hoped that these percepts will

-----

7. cf Davies,B,1976:66

lead to "formations of other practices"<sup>8</sup> and theories and show how theory and practice can work together to show profitable ways forward, or, more humbly, how they can "struggle to work for transformation"<sup>9</sup> of dance in education.

But before I turn to dance in education practice I wish to outline in Part II the framework of qualitative research methodology as a 'prelude' to the empirical investigations of Part III.

---

8. cf quotation above

9. Walkerdine, in Steedman et al, 1985:238

## PART II : RESEARCH METHODOLOGY



## Chapter 5

### RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

In the introduction to this thesis I have stated that the impulse for this research came from the need to understand my personal, everyday experience as a dance practitioner. I have attempted, throughout my thesis, to make explicit my interest, my orientations and my bias. I wish to emphasize again that I take research as a process of coming to understand, of making sense, of personal experience. My concern then is everyday, personal experience of dance practitioners. I share with Reinharz the view that experience is<sup>1</sup>:

"..interesting (not arbitrary), effective (in the sense that our ideas shape the world and are not simply shaped by it), uniquely human, and contextual."

My interest in the quality of personal everyday experience of dance practitioners and relation of this experience to the social macrocosm has led me to regard small scale qualitative methods as the appropriate methods for my interest and research.

---

1. Reinharz, in Bowles/Duelli-Klein, eds, 1981:72

### 5.1 QUALITATIVE RESEARCH METHODOLOGIES

The questions of choice of a certain method are not simply technical issues but are "profound socio-historical disciplinary concerns"<sup>2</sup>. Traditional methods of enquiry are adequate for studies where formalised criteria, statistical comparisons etc can serve as tools for the evaluation of a stated quantifiable issue. In order to learn from the experience of British dance practitioners and to bring into focus issues and problems of dance in education, a method of enquiry is needed which is not pre-ordinate nor designed in advance, but which is exploratory in nature.

In the last decades, a number of alternative paradigms for educational research have emerged. These alternative or new paradigms are characterized by a shift towards description of processes at micro-level, ie. the minutiae of the classroom. Common to these new research methodologies is their perspective: the perspective of the actors involved. This is an essential orientation for empirical investigations concerned with the experience of those involved. What is needed is a method or methods genuinely adapted to the study of human meanings.<sup>3</sup>

This chapter is a selective fragmented review of research methodologies. The selection of research methodologies has emerged from a cyclical process of data collection, studying theories of research methodologies, and trying to make sense of the collected data. The search for theories of methodologies and data collecting started simultaneously, but this chapter has been written

---

2. Reinharz, in Bowles/Duelli-Klein, eds, 1981:68

3. cf Willis, in Hall et al, 1981:88

up after the completion of fieldwork.

I wish to review the methodologies of case-study, Illuminative Evaluation, and feminist methodology.

#### 5.1.1 Case-Studies

The umbrella term of case-study encompasses a family of eclectic research methods of the social sciences including (participant) observation, interview, field-notes, document collecting, and group discussions<sup>4</sup> and can be described as<sup>5</sup>:

"...the examination of an instance in action. The study of particular incidents and events, and the selective collection of information ...allows the case-study worker to capture and portray those elements of a situation that give it meaning."

The selective collection of information serves as a means to gain, process and present knowledge in such a way that it can be practically useful and thus as a means to increase the pragmatic value of knowledge.<sup>6</sup> Experience and knowledge can become acceptable in their non-monolithic truth or reality and can be interpreted. It does not pretend to be unbiased, objective. Triangulation can be used to allow presentation of multiple perspectives present in a social situation. Case-study needs and intends to represent these differing (or conflicting) views, taking readings from particular viewpoints. Triangulation may be interpreted as a methodological device against the "fear of naked subjectivism"<sup>7</sup> devised to work towards objectivity but it

---

4. Adelman et al, in Simons,ed,1980:48f

5. Walker,in Dockrell, Hamilton eds,1980:33

6. cf Safari,1974:41

7. cf Willis, in Hall et al, 1981:90



can stress, bringing to the fore, multiple perspectives.

Case studies are attractive to educational researchers in that:

- \* - Case study data are strong in reality.
- \* - Case-studies allow generalisations either about an instance or from an instance to a class; they are about moving between the general and the particular.
- \* - Case-studies recognize the complexity and 'embeddedness' of social truths.
- \* - Case-studies are a 'step to action'. They begin in a world of action and contribute to it.
- \* - Case-studies may contribute towards 'democratisation'<sup>8</sup>, also because they present research in an accessible, non-esoteric form.

Problems of case-study research can be conducted in the field, with confidentiality, publication and control over the use of data and long-term study. Although needed in terms of data reliability and significance of the area of research, long-term study can have "the incidental effect that personal relationships are established with those being studied".<sup>9,10</sup>

The ethics of case-study is in essence democratic in that the readers can make up their own minds, and in that access to and release of sensitive data should be negotiated between the researched and researcher. Case-studies are public documents about individuals and events. Negotiations between researcher and researched about what counts as private and what as public are important. A device to handle the problems of confidentiality and publication is anonymisation of the

-----

8. cf *ibid*:59f

9. cf Walker, in Dockrell, Hamilton, eds, 1980:30

10. On personal relationships cf feminist methodology, below

reports.<sup>11</sup>

### 5.1.2 Illuminative Evaluation

Illuminative Evaluation (I.E.) emphasizes the exploratory nature of research and attempts to identify problems by intensive familiarisation.

Its design is heuristic or time-conceptual in that I.E. evolves as the study gets under way using various appropriate methods. The metaphor of "distillation" describes the dialectical process between conceptualisation and the phenomena observed: progressive focusing is at the heart of I.E. As Parlett puts it<sup>12</sup>:

"..hitting the high point, leaving out the stodge.."

I.E. emphasizes discovering what people view as the defining qualities of their setting, discovering their experiential ideologies. Theories of practice (what people say) and theories in use (what people in fact do) are illuminated. Since I.E. focuses on the practice and theory of the people studied and respects their views, multiple perspectives are possible and made visible. No absolute reality, no objective truth are sought in I.E. Its stance is similar to psychotherapy.

The aim of I.E. is to contribute to decision-making and review of policy.<sup>13</sup>

The role of the researcher/evaluator is investigative. She/he orchestrates opinions, arranges data, summarises, collects suggestions for change, sharpens policy

-----

11. on anonymisation, cf SAFARI, 1974; Adelman et al, in Simons, 1980:57

12. Parlett, 1982b

13. cf Parlett, 1982a:5

alternatives<sup>14</sup> and if necessary, plays dumb<sup>15</sup>.

Playing dumb contrasts with the authentic relationship between researcher and researched.<sup>16,17</sup>

### 5.1.3 Feminist Methodology

Feminist research wishes to produce knowledge, that, put into practice, can induce change and contribute to women's emancipation and autonomy.<sup>18</sup> Feminist methodology therefore rejects uninvolved 'spectator' knowledge. The dialectics of doing and knowing are hoped to lead to better practice and to better, more realistic theories<sup>19</sup>:

"...the object of research is not something static and homogenous but an historical, dynamic and contradictory entity. Research, therefore, will have to follow closely the dynamics of this process."

Feminist methodology is problem-formulating. It assumes the individual problematic as an expression or manifestation of social relations. But it does not merely reflect the macro level since processes of 'conscientization' are to induce processes of change and action. It starts at the personal level, but stressing the similarities between women's experiences allows it to link these experiences into categories of similarities and to avoid mere subjectivism<sup>20</sup>:

---

14. cf Parlett, 1982a:11

15. 1982b

16. cf Feminist methodology, below

17. For a critique of I.E. cf Adelman, 19/5/1982; cf Delamont, S, in Barton/Meighan, 1978:64ff

18. cf Duelli-Klein, in Bowles/Duelli-Klein, eds, 1980:52

19. cf Mies, 1978:8

20. Duelli-Klein, in Bowles/Duelli-Klein, eds, 1980:54



"...to recognize an individual woman's  
 "personal" problem as similar to many women's  
 "personal" problems--unveiling it as  
 "political"..."

The role of the researcher is not necessarily detached. The researcher is not presumed to be totally objective or value-free. Conscious partiality achieved through partial identification with the research participants is postulated<sup>21</sup> as distinct from mere empathy. This limited identification is seen to create a critical and dialectical distance between researcher and researched. The perspective of the researcher becomes horizontal, i.e. 'from within'. The relationship between researcher and researched changes, attempts to be democratic. Research, from an instrument of dominance and legitimation of power gets to serve the interests of the dominated groups. This perspective from within allows intersubjective relationships which will lead to a truer understanding of the physical and the psychic needs of the participants. Part of such an understanding entails acknowledgment of 'relative truths', faking and other strategies of survival by the researched. The researcher is called upon also to use resources such as intuition, emotions, feeling. Such interaction of facts and feelings are thought to encompass the complexities of reality better than fragmented approaches.<sup>22</sup>

The research ethics of feminist methodology is that of privacy, confidentiality and participation. The relationship between researcher and 'researched' is intended to be non-hierarchical, genuine, authentic<sup>23</sup> and honest.<sup>24</sup>

---

21. cf Mies, 1978:8ff

22. cf Duelli-Klein, in Bowles/Duelli-Klein, 1980:58

23. ibid:90

24. Duelli-Klein, in Bowles, Duelli-Klein, eds, 1980:57

#### 5.1.4 Art-Based Research Methodology

An exponent of this methodology is Ross. His "smock-coated researcher" engages in artistic or arts-related activities as ways of knowing and as investigative methods.<sup>25</sup> According to Ross, open-ended art-based research conducted by a group can provide an educational methodology. The group becomes the research outcome. Such research is formative rather than informative in that it only survives in the lives of those who have participated in it. In this methodology, research is analogous to art. The researcher delivers a creative product which is validated by the audience<sup>26</sup>. Ross believes that such an art approach in combination with the 'normal' scientific approach might add up to a more balanced account of the world<sup>27</sup>,<sup>28</sup>

#### 5.1.5 Summary

I wish to underscore the key aspects of the reviewed qualitative research methodologies relevant for my empirical investigations of the study of dance in education:

- \* - Small scale case-studies as the means to study particular incidents and events
- \* - Problem-formulating method
- \* - Selective collection of data

---

25. Ross, M, in Ross, ed, 1985:167

26. cf Ross, ibid:182

27. ibid:180

28. This arts-related methodology with its group aspect might be worth examining as to its relevance for dance practitioners to validate their own experience and set their own standards, cf III.7., Dance Education History:Conclusions

- \* - Negotiation
- \* - Anonymisation
- \* - Multiple perspectives from triangulation
- \* - Realities as opposed to reality
- \* - Research located within personal experience
- \* - Limited identification and conscious partiality
- \* - Perspective from within

This list shows that my approach is eclectic and consonant with case-study-eclecticism. These selected key aspects do not promise to produce coherent, generally valid theories but show that my approach to research is a relative and partial account of British dance in education. The approach is open-ended, the notion of conclusion or emerging coherent, monolithic theory becomes redundant. This does not mean to say that my research is purely naturalistic and descriptive. Theory is drawn on to make sense, to interpret in order to gain orientations towards emancipation since the aim is to produce knowledge which can induce processes of change and action when put into practice. The following sections discuss strategies and techniques for the outlined eclectic case-study methodology.



## 5.2 RESEARCH STRATEGY:ETHNOGRAPHY

Ethnographic research<sup>29</sup> attempts to combine personal experience with professional (public) insight and to construe meaning by means of multiple methods of investigations within a case-study. The ethnographic or descriptive observational tradition<sup>30</sup> focuses on the actors and actresses in that it attempts to expose the nature, content, structure and dynamics of the complex common-sense knowledge and to render articulate the ineffable<sup>31</sup>. This is of particular relevance to research into dance as a non-verbal medium<sup>32</sup>:

"..since an unknowable truth can only be approached obliquely or indirectly, the subjective verbal accounts of individuals have a special status as data in the search for meaning in what people believe to be dance."

Concepts and hypotheses are allowed to emerge, while the emerging theory is grounded in the research situation rather than imposed upon it.<sup>33</sup>

Ethnography looks at common knowledge and everyday experience. It believes that it is necessary to<sup>34</sup>:

---

29. cf Hammersley/Atkinson, 1983

30. For historical outline of ethnography cf Grimshaw et al in Hall et al,1981:74

31. cf Hargreaves,in Barton,Meighan,eds,1978:19

32. Blacking, in Spencer,1985:66

33. on grounded theory and fieldwork cf Schatzman,Strauss, 1973

34. Grimshaw et al,in Hall et al,eds,1981:75

"...return to experience and the subjective plane both to record and to substantiate this reality as a firm critique of available theory and to find materials towards the preliminary construction of alternative and more adequate theories."

The importance of personal experience may even be extended to the researcher<sup>35</sup> in that it is suggested that research should start from the experience of the researcher as a person in a particular context and social setting. This entails the researcher making herself/himself vulnerable by showing herself/himself. The advantage of this making oneself vulnerable as a researcher lies in the 'balance of power' between researcher and researched.

---

35. cf Stanley/Wise, in Bowles, Duelli-Klein, 1981:113

### 5.3 ETHNOGRAPHIC TECHNIQUES

The multi-modal form of ethnographic research includes techniques like (participant) observation, interviews, group discussions, questionnaires and background information or documents.

#### 5.3.1 Observation: Participant and Non-Participant

In participant observation (P.O.) data-collection, coding and analysis as well as design are interconnected or "interpenetrative"<sup>36</sup> P.O. within sociological enquiries has shifted to a more phenomenological register<sup>37</sup> and to more familiar ground so as to gain an understanding from within.<sup>38,39</sup> The observant participator reflects and comments on the 'field' observed and thus gets to know the informal as well as the formal culture of the field/classroom and the process by which it is formed. P.O. is open-ended and takes an emphatic and humanistic stance.

#### 5.3.2 Interviews

Interviews are a more "penetrating device" than observation and require therefore greater protection for the participants.<sup>40</sup> In the interview situation, the

-----

36. Butters, in Hall, Jefferson, 1975:263

37. Butters, ibid:255

38. Roberts, in Hall/Jefferson, 1975:243

39. For rules of method of P.O. cf Butters, in Hall/Jefferson, 1975:258f

40. For the practice of interviewing, cf Simons, H, in Adelman, 1978:114ff; on interviews, cf Walker, in Safari, 1974;



interviewer's values show. Views as to the desirability of this differ. Demands for objectivity combined with respect for the participants tend to advocate a low profile of the interviewer<sup>41</sup> whereas others advocate non-hierarchical interviewing with the interviewer investing her/his own identity in the relationship.<sup>42</sup> and to allow intimacy and reciprocity. A feminist approach to interviewing pleads for a new awareness of the interviewer as a tool in making women's experiences visible and providing<sup>43</sup>:

"the articulated and recorded commentary of women on the very personal business of being female in a patriarchal capitalist society"

<sup>44</sup> Oakley contends that<sup>45</sup>:

"Where both (interviewer and interviewee) share the same gender socialisation and critical life-experience, social distance can be minimal. Where both interviewer and interviewee share membership of the same minority group, the basis for equality may impress itself even more urgently on the interviewer's consciousness."

This view interprets interviewing as<sup>46</sup>

"recording of meaning as it is constructed in the dialogue"

rather than just gathering information.

-----

41. cf Simons on respect, on rapport, in Adelman, 1978

42. cf Oakley, in Roberts, ed, 1981:33

43. Oakley, in Roberts, 1981:49

44. Oakley, A, Interviewing women: a contradiction in terms, in Roberts, ed, 1981

45. Oakley, in Roberts, 1981:55

46. Reinharz, in Bowles/Duelli-Klein, 1981:85

### 5.3.3 Group Discussions

Group discussions can be combined with other techniques such as video, or questionnaires, and can be recorded. Interpretations gained from combined techniques are richer in comparison with analysis of questionnaires.<sup>47</sup>

### 5.3.4 Questionnaires

Questionnaires are seen as a useful auxiliary technique to cover salient points identified through previous observation. Questionnaires can provide breadth of information "with some economy in time"<sup>48</sup> but they lose the variation and nuance of conversation.

### 5.3.5 Documents, Video, Material

Any type of archival material, minutes of meetings, syllabi, examples of pupils' work (written and practical) can provide background information supporting or contradicting data otherwise obtained. Appearance, clothes, physical traits, expression can be relevant especially in the observation of dance as a non-verbal activity.

### 5.3.6 Summary

The various techniques discussed are in accordance with the requirements of the qualitative ethnographic research methodologies.

The empirical investigations in forms of case-studies in Part III will make eclectic use of the techniques of qualitative, interpretative research methodologies

-----

47. cf Willis, in Hall et al, 1981:94f; cf Jenks, J., M.Sc. 1978:167

48. Schatzman/Strauss, 1973:45

reviewed in this chapter. The case-studies research dance in education. However, they are not limited to research on dance, they purpose to research for dance and dance practitioners in education. The case-studies are designed to substantiate and reflect dance practitioners' experience and provide material towards change.



PART III: EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATIONS

DANCE IN EDUCATION: THEORIES FROM PRACTICE

## Chapter 6

INTRODUCTION TO PART III: METHODOLOGY APPLIED

Whilst I have chosen to organize Parts I and II in what may be called a 'male', distanced mode and to 'traverse'<sup>1</sup> theories, concepts, ideologies, and methodologies, Part III has been organized in what may be called 'female' mode<sup>2</sup>, from within.<sup>3</sup>

6.1 RATIONALE, CONCEPT AND PURPOSE OF PART III

The rationale of this research has emerged from my own experience as a girl and woman dance practitioner.<sup>4</sup> My experience of and my relationship to dance has made me research dance in an interventionist way, i.e. trying to 'intervene' in the low status quo of dance by means of research. My interest has been emancipatory.- The research has been a process, emerging from those involved, dance practitioners, in this case from both the researcher and the researched.

Part III mainly deals with the practice of those involved in dance in schools and higher education: dance practitioners in education.

-----

1. L.Irigaray's term used by Weigel, S, 1983:107ff

2. cf Introduction, chapter 1.

3. cf research methodology, II.5.

4. cf Stanley/Wise in Bowles, Duelli-Klein, eds., 1981:98ff

The purpose of Part III is

- \* - to gain insights into the experience of those involved in dance in English education of the maintained sector
- \* - to explore dance in education in England in order to grasp and
- \* - to come to an understanding of the problems and difficulties of dance as a cultural phenomenon and thereby also
- \* - to explore the possible introduction of dance into the Swiss educational system based on theories informed by and gained from practice and experience of dance practitioners in the British maintained sector education.

My personal interest and needs are my bias<sup>5</sup> which is also nourished by the present deeply unsatisfactory place dance finds itself in. I wish to contribute to working towards a more central place for dance in society and as a socio-cultural activity and phenomenon. My working contributions are observations conducted in numbers of schools and institutions of higher education, of instances occurring during dance lessons and learning from them by means of discussing, analyzing, and/or de-constructing. The aim is to make sense of the actual marginal or peripheral place of dance and dance in education, and to understand and discover the underlying problems in order to orient towards change.- Trying to understand does not only involve theory but also practice. From British dance educational practice I hope to learn what dilemmas, what problems there are in dance in education and to hopefully come forward with findings that might prove useful.

As stated in the Introduction to this thesis, my dance practice has encompassed teaching and performing, but my particular interest has been the practice of dance practitioners (teachers and students) of tertiary

-----

5. cf II.5.



training institutions and colleges because that was where I felt personal shortcomings. I had not had a 'proper' dance educational training since dance and dance education degrees do not exist in Switzerland. This goes to explain why I wanted my empirical research to be embedded in dance in education (i.e. being involved in, part of) rather than on dance in education (i.e. from the point of view of the outsider). I therefore chose to assemble and present case study material where I had been involved, which was available and which looked promising to give me more insight into the issues raised by my personal interest.

As already mentioned in the Introduction, my initial concept had been to seek justifications of dance in education in Britain. I had assumed that there had to be justifications of dance prior to the implementation of dance in education and that to find the right justification was to make the case for the inclusion of dance in Swiss curricula. But in the process of my research I have gradually become aware that things are far more complex than supposed once one starts looking into the matter. I have also become aware of the many underlying problems and questions and their complexity. As a result, my interest and the emphasis of my work have shifted to more detailed questions in relation to dance in education like:

- \* - What do dance practitioners actually do?  
What do they feel they know?
- \* - What sorts of theory may be useful to the practice/praxis of dance practitioners?
- \* - What counts as subject-matter?
- \* - What constitutes knowledge to practitioners?
- \* - Do they perceive dance as a valuable educational experience within their frame of reference, their 'cosmology', and if so, which do they perceive as important components?
- \* - What are the kinds of issues they bump up against?

- \* - What does their practice/praxis suggest may be useful lines of theoretical studies relevant to dance?
- \* - What kind of theoretical issues are raised and encountered in their practice/praxis?
- \* - What are their motivations?
- \* - What is their understanding of dance?
- \* - What do they think of dance in education? What are the problems to them?
- \* - What hidden problems, issues are there?
- \* - What do they perceive as the most important issues of theory and practice and how far are these currently incorporated into theoretical and practical studies?

...the list seems extensive and could be endless - it shows that the relationship and 'cross-fertilization' or 'cross-annihilation' of theory and practice are at the centre of my interest and my work.

Yet the concept of the empirical investigations has not been to illustrate the theory established in Part I by practical evidence and thus use the micro level of class-room practice as simple reflection or reproduction of the macro-level<sup>6</sup>. - I think that the relationship between theory and practice is a crucial one. Ideally, theory and practice should be intertwined, interwoven as they are in every day life. I also believe that the relationship between theory and practice should be egalitarian, not hierarchical as is the case in our Western societies. This belief is also in part the reason why I chose to have two 'halves', one of theory (Part I, Part II) and one of practice (Part III, Part IV), which I have justified in the metaphor of 'the attitude'.<sup>7</sup>

The concept has been to look at dance in education

---

6. cf Banks, O, in Barton, Meighan, 1978:44

7. cf Introduction, chapter 1



practice, to look at dance practitioners' experience and practice in order to establish 'reality' which articulates the world and is articulated upon it<sup>8</sup>. This reality can be drawn upon to learn from in order to orient further practice and theories towards change, i.e. a more central place for dance and dance practitioners in education. The case-study material *may* be put to use to illustrate the theory of Part I. But on the other hand, the data collected may provide evidence of the inadequacies of the theories and ideologies 'traversed' in Part I. In this sense, the investigated practices may initiate change, of theory as well as of practice.

The collected research material was very ample, complex, ambivalent and extremely diverse, containing repetitions but also contradictions. How to deal with it? I have strategically selected from the ample material a comparatively small part on which to concentrate in order to avoid superficial study in breadth. The selected data were collected at a Postgraduate Certificate of Education (PGCE) dance course at a higher education institution of a large English city. I have decided to concentrate on this course because it was on maintained sector dance education, because I had been a participant observer and could look at it from within, and because the one-year course seemed attractive as a possible solution for Switzerland because of its limited duration. It had been my intention to research, in a further case-study, dance as a leisure activity for women and/or adolescents. Unfortunately this issue has proved too vast in combination with dance in education for this thesis and might therefore be a topic for further study.

Since I wish to acknowledge all sources of information and inspiration and because I may draw on some of the material occasionally the following section will also

-----

8. cf Hall, et al, 1981



include a listing of material collected but not written up in this thesis.

I have used a variety of methods in line with the eclectic case-study approach outlined in Part I and I have tried to adapt them to my purposes. Reading and re-reading the data I have let the material 'speak to me' and allow important issues to emerge. I have in part proceeded by association and have allowed myself to sometimes follow my intuition. That explains in part why the presented case-studies are not unlike a 'woven pattern', a 'text' in its original meaning.<sup>9</sup> In that respect the written-up case-studies do not quite reflect the researching process.<sup>10</sup>

I hope that the empirical investigations and case-studies will illuminate some crucial problems and issues in the debate of dance as a socio-cultural activity and phenomenon in general and its position in education in particular and thus provide useful material towards re-orientation and change.

The next section is the account of my methodological practice, my choice of methods and case studies.

-----  
9. cf Gregory,E, 1983:10ff

10. cf Introduction, chapter 1

## 6.2 RESEARCH METHODOLOGIES, STRATEGIES AND TECHNIQUES APPLIED

The theoretical framework for the chosen case-study approach with its congruent techniques and research style has been outlined in II.5. - The research style has involved the experience of both researcher and research participants. The data collection and the building of my theoretical methodological framework were concurrent and interrelated. Theory and practice have informed each other though the writing of the theoretical framework of research methodology has been prior to writing up the case-studies. Whereas I had a clear view of the theoretical parameters writing up the case-studies was very different. It was a more intuitive or creative or 'artistic' manner of procedure which involved exploring key words and often allowing myself to be led by the material. Writing up the case-studies has proceeded in an open-ended manner.

I have decided against large scale surveys based on quantitative research methods like statistics etc, because they did not seem to lend themselves to the purpose of my research since my interest was qualitative and emancipatory. I have decided to present small scale case-studies in a qualitative research style for in-depth study in the hope of unravelling some of the difficulties, problems, dilemmas and issues of dance in a particular educational set-up.

This decision to concentrate on one course only has been made after long and careful viewing and re-reading of all the collected data. In the attempt to avoid "the stodge"<sup>1</sup> for easier reading I have decided to place the description of the general research techniques and of the

-----

1. cf II.5.

manifold, but discarded, collected data in Appendix 8 and 9. In order to provide an insight into the range of data from which I have chosen one course I include here a short note on data and the process of collection.

#### 6.2.1 Note on Data Collection

My main focus was tertiary courses leading to a diploma or, as in one case, awaiting upgrading to a diploma course. Secondary school dance classes figured only indirectly in my collecting data. Adult evening courses were another field of data collecting. - My data collecting lasted from November 1980 to summer 1983. I observed dance courses and classes as a participant and non-participant observer. The duration of observation lasted between one single lesson and two terms.<sup>2</sup> In respect of teacher training I have collected data in two B.A./B.Ed. awarding colleges, in one B.A./B.Ed. polytechnic, in two PGCE university courses.- In respect of dance as a leisure activity I have collected data in an adult evening course awaiting upgrading to diploma status, in various adult evening dance classes for adults, in a Manpower Service Commission Scheme and in various performances for the young.

Establishing contacts with British dance education practitioners as a way of getting into the field was primordial since as an overseas student I was an outsider of the British dance education world. I gained access by informal contacts, mostly directly and personally, sometimes over the telephone. This procedure resulted in my fieldwork containing data from institutions and persons sympathetic to my work and to me as a person. No contacts were established via official university channels.

Essential research elements and procedures such as

-----

2. The specific duration of observation will be indicated in each case-study and in the appendices.



participant and non-participant observation, interviews, group discussions, questionnaires, documents, videos, background information are described in Appendix 8. Interviews of the chosen PGCE course for case-studies are contained in the Appendices 3-7.

Research elements and procedures relevant to the specific case-studies of the PGCE course will be described in chapter 8.

Before embarking on my empirical investigations and case-studies I wish to indicate some limitations.

#### 6.2.2 Limitations

My fieldwork has concentrated firstly on institutions of Higher Education offering dance as an option for teaching qualifications and secondly on dance as a leisure activity for adults. My main focus has been the experience of the students training as future teachers of dance, and of their concurrent experience as students and student teachers.

I have relied more on personal involvement than purely written material. My central concern with practice and experience of dance practitioners in education may be interpreted as a limitation. But I wish to justify this 'limitation' (if it is one) by my interest in the nature and quality of the experience by means of participating, asking questions, observing, i.e. by learning from those involved in dance in education.

The collection of data has been limited geographically to the Southern part of England although I have been able to establish a few contacts with dance teachers or future dance teachers from the whole of Great Britain at dance conferences. Unfortunately these contacts have been of only limited importance since for reasons of transport and accessibility I have not been able to follow them up.

A further criticism might concern the size of the samples as too limited.- As explained above, I have adopted a qualitative approach, where small size sampling has the advantage of higher familiarization and greater depth.-

Another criticism might concern the varied and diverse sampling. The use of diverse sources and materials is characteristic of the eclectic, non-monolithic case-study approach<sup>3</sup>. The criticism of too great a variety should not weigh too heavily since the actually used material is fairly concentrated.

Another limitation pertains to gender. All lecturers except one and all students in higher education sharing their practice and experience with me happened to be female. The absence of male dance practitioners in education has not been a voluntary exclusion but reflects the situation of dance in education as an almost exclusively female activity. The absence of male dance practitioners in the collected data is a severe - and deplorable - limitation if only because gender is a highly relevant socializing factor. This absence has encouraged me to concentrate on dance in education as female practice and has thus contributed to women's perspective in this thesis.

A last limitation must be mentioned which is inherent in research of this kind. In order to write up the case-studies from the transcribed interviews, written notes and other written sources I had to interpret retrospectively these written sources and their intended meaning. I am aware that the choice and presentation of material is coloured by or invested with my own personal perception and, conclusively, with my personal interpretation<sup>4</sup> which are rooted in my private

-----

3. cf II.5., research methodology

4. For the problem of perception in research of social interaction cf Stubbs, in Adelman 1978:229ff



understanding and making sense of the world. In this sense the choice of the presented data is subjective and also in a way self-conscious. Yet my "naked fear of subjectivism"<sup>5</sup> is definitely smaller than the one of 'scientific objectivism'.

In summary, this second empirical part of my research has been conducted in a qualitative research methodology appropriate for illuminating problems, questions and issues of dance in British education mentioned in the Introduction to this thesis and in the introduction to part III. - The diversity and variety of the collected data are the expression of my attempt to assemble as broad a collection and 'feel' of dance practitioners' (students' and teachers') concepts and experience before concentrating on one specific course for in-depth study.-

Fundamental to my research design has been my wish to learn from the practice and experience of dance practitioners in education by means of observation and participation. Their concepts and construction of dance contributed to and/or challenged me to re-construct, reject, re-constitute - or insist on - mine. I am keen to express here my gratitude for their help, interest, challenge, trust and support.

---

5. cf Willis,P, in II.5.



## Chapter 7

EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATIONS OF THE HISTORY OF DANCE IN  
BRITISH  
EDUCATION FROM THE 1950s TO THE 1980s

MAGICAL WAND, MIXED  
PEDIGREE OR MELTING POT?

Macdonald<sup>1</sup> states that

[The business of schools] "is to establish that the world is an intractable reality, not something we create...Conversely, education's hostility to imagination, creativity, humour and sensuality is not simply a capricious rejection of what is delightful in life. It is a very sensible assertion of power...The transforming arts have no place at the centre of a curriculum devoted to measuring and describing...reality. Clearly, in education's view, the arts and other playful enterprises should be reduced to factlike bodies of knowledge or treated as diversions. Schools do both."

Applying this quotation to dance in schools, the marginal place of dance in schools reported by the Gulbenkian Foundation<sup>2</sup> may pertain either to it being assigned to the transforming arts or to playful enterprises. Has dance, 'in education's view', already been reduced to a factlike body of knowledge? Can

---

1. Macdonald, G, cit. in Macdonald, I, Open University, 14-15, 1977:45

2. Gulbenkian Foundation Report on Dance Education and Training in Britain, 1980

concepts advanced for the justification of dance in British schools be seen as successive ways of cultural borrowing? Have various cultural dance forms left their marks? - These kinds of questions are addressed in this chapter which deals with the justifications, establishment and developments of dance in schools of the maintained sector in the form of a historical chronological presentation of concepts of the 1950s to the 1980s.-

The period from the 1950s to the 1980s has been selected because it was only then (1950s) that one particular form of dance was structured enough to be included in the curriculum. - Before 1900 dance steps and set dances were thought to be a necessary social accomplishment for all educated boys and girls.<sup>3</sup> As from the turn of the century various forms of natural movement and dance enjoyed some popularity in education, e.g. Natural Movement, Margaret Morris Movement, Eurythmics, Expression Gymnastics, revived Greek Dance, but their justification of expressing 'feeling through bodily movement' was not seen as pertinent enough for them to find their way into the curriculum.<sup>4</sup> The presentation of justifications and concepts advanced for the justification of dance in schools from the 1950s to the 1980s will be chronological but does not necessarily reflect reality because concepts and justifications overlap, they may have developed from earlier concepts dialectically or may have re-adopted earlier ones. A discussion of the concepts will follow at the end of investigation.

But before delving into the empirical investigation and getting into the field, a short note on methods of historical investigation.

---

3. DES 1983:1

4. cf Adshead, 1981:22f; cf Foster, 1977:78ff

### 7.1. NOTES ON METHOD

In this investigation I have decided to separate narration and analysis<sup>1</sup> as a device to present material while simultaneously imposing some sort of analytic and thematic order upon the material. After presenting the material in a linear, fairly chronological way I shall embark on a discussion of the various justifications advanced for dance in education.

Although I present in this empirical investigation historiographic 'facts' of dance education in British schools from the 1950s to the 1980s I am aware that I do not just present a collection of facts and show how 'it really was'. Fact collection and accumulation can not happen in a vacuum. The very selection of facts is already an expression of underlying convictions, theories, views, biases<sup>2</sup>:

"...any selection of facts obeys an implicit evaluative criterion. 'Facts' are thus inseparable from 'interpretations', which in turn are determined by 'values'."

My conviction or bias at the root of this investigation is that the marginal place of dance and its mere 'invisibility' in terms of importance and power of coding knowledge attributed to dance on the curriculum are not accidental. The question arises as to whose interest the low status and the sheer invisibility of dance -this visual phenomenon - serves and who/what regulates dance. Thus the empirical investigation is at the same time an

---

1. cf Hammersley/Atkinson, 1983:221

2. cf Stedman Jones, in Blackburn 1972:113



investigation of interested parties, of power, of pressure groups and gate-keepers: grappling with the gate-keepers in the attempt to find the magic wand or the golden key to the promised land of status and power.

I wish to state my genuine interest and 'bias' in the availability, implementation or improvement of dance and its experience in education and schools, both for teachers and students/pupils. My interest is towards change and emancipation of dance within education, and of (female) dance practitioners towards expansion.

My evaluative criteria have emerged during/after an early case-study on gender which raised the issue of 'self-actualisation'. I felt that this concept was unsatisfactory because it could not answer the problem of context. I needed a structure, a concept within which to place such experiences to make sense. One of these concepts was historical: to see if I could place the emergence of 'self-actualization' at a specific time in the development of dance education which was an attempt at finding a chronological structure<sup>3</sup>:

"..chronology only attains meaning as a method of formulating the historical character of structures...history's only distinctive possession is a heterogeneous collection of chronological codes."

Texts and documents have been used for finding or establishing justifications of dance in education in the very basic chronological way. I have attempted to present the various justifications as they emerged 'historically'. But I wish to warn against expectations of strictly 'historical' or historiographic or

---

3. Stedman Jones, cit Levi-Strauss passim, in Blackburn 1972:115

structuralist or functionalist investigations. The examination will not adhere to one specific 'objective' scientific model. Instead, presented instances will be examined as to their usefulness to making dance more central and to inform dance practitioners' practice and theory.

At the root of this empirical investigation lies a practical interest, that of learning from British experience of dance in schools.<sup>4</sup> Since 'learning from' implies an emancipatory interest and perspective I wish to state my interest as the interest to learn from the justifications, establishment and developments of dance in British schools of the maintained sector from the 1950s to the 1980s in order to emancipate and advance dance in Swiss schools.

Therefore, the presentation of four major instances in the history of dance in British schools in a chronological order will also be critical so as to satisfy my emancipatory interest.<sup>5</sup> The four instances will be examined as to their underlying concepts, their characteristics, their matches or mismatches with the ideologies of education outlined in I.3.

The material used for the empirical investigation was in large parts based on written official dance education documents, on source books, reports, magazine and newspaper articles, because they were available. But I also took into account, where judged necessary or appropriate, personal opinions expressed orally, e.g. at dance conferences. Texts then were only taken as one kind of evidence, among others.<sup>6</sup>

---

4. Froehlich, 1980:32ff on Habermas' dialectical theory of science

5. cf Wolff, 1981:104

6. cf Hall, in Hall et al, 1981:27

This investigation does not claim to overcome fundamental problems of historical analysis but it does attempt to be methodologically coherent.



## 7.2 LABAN'S MODERN EDUCATIONAL DANCE

### 7.2.1 Background

Laban, Hungarian by birth and a refugee from Nazi Germany to Britain was moulded by the prevailing European culture of his time<sup>1</sup>. Laban started as a dance practitioner, as an artist, trying to follow through the innovative dancing of Isadora Duncan in Europe in the 1920s and 1930s.<sup>2</sup> His concept set out from the assumption that movement was universal<sup>3</sup>. His approach to dance was socio-cultural: "modern man" had to "create his own art of movement"<sup>4</sup> firstly because the dance heritage was "meagre" and secondly because the 20th century with its industrial world had to find its own dance expression. Laban's dance concept is dualistic. I shall call the two components synthesis/poetry and analysis/technique.

#### 7.2.1.1 Synthesis - Poetry

Laban was influenced by the symbolic and mystic trends of his time. Duncan especially reawakened for him "the sense of poetry of movement in modern man"<sup>5</sup>. Laban understood movement as the expression of inner feelings and discoveries. Through the medium of movement and dance an inner living energy was made visible, dance was symbolic action. This holistic view of movement and dance or dance as the medium of a mystical search of the

-----

1. cf Foster, 1977:39ff; cf Brooke/Whiting, 1973:15

2. cf Lange, 1975:21

3. cf Pythagorean philosophy

4. Laban, 1975:2

5. Laban, 1975:4

Path can be seen in his statement<sup>6</sup>:

"...dance understood as a total immersion in the flow of movement, brings us thus into a more intensive contact with the medium that carries and permeates all our activities."

The "art of movement" then was to assist modern man's (sic) harmonization by giving him insights and a heightened perception of consciousness into his physical, intellectual, emotional and spiritual relationships and inter-dependencies.<sup>7</sup> It served as a means of self-expression and self-discovery. Human movement became an integral part of what all humans do, human movement became the common denominator of all human actions, for all age groups. Laban wrote of the flow of movement used in human life as universal.<sup>8</sup> Values cherished by Laban were flow, innovation, originality, flexibility which indicated his interest in processes, change and growth: the art of movement or "modern dance" had for him<sup>9</sup>:

"...an independant power creating states of mind stronger than man's will."

#### 7.2.1.2 Analysis - Technique

Laban was fascinated with science and technology. His work could be linked to the artistic movements of the Bauhaus, the Cubists, Futurists etc. His theory of movement, based on his empirical work, attempted to identify any human movement in space<sup>10</sup> Laban's

---

6. Laban, 1975:97

7. cf Foster, 1977:41

8. Laban, 1975:97

9. 1975:6

10. cf Lange 1975:22

classification of 16 movement themes was centered around the notions of the body, of time, space and effort. The human form thus became for him "a means of both building a structure and de-constructing geometrical forms"<sup>11</sup>. The 16 movement themes allowed generalization and systematization. Lange in his appreciation of Laban's movement analysis contends<sup>12</sup>:

"It is the *technology* of dance that Laban has established, as opposed to *technique*. We are now able accurately to name the observable manifestations in dance. Through Laban, we have obtained a vocabulary for the study of movement."

#### 7.2.1.3 Summary

Laban's concept of dance is dualistic, with an idealistic side of poetry and synthesis, and a utilitarian/functionalist one of analysis and technique. The concept as a whole can be said to be idealistic, utopian, egalitarian, democratic, psychologically justified and holistic. It is systemic and generalistic/universalistic. It emphasizes practice over fact<sup>13</sup> even concerning the artefact, the dance: the dance is seen as an act of doing rather than a finished product, or a fact<sup>14</sup>. It is process-oriented.

#### 7.2.2 Laban's Dance in Schools: Modern Educational Dance

Laban's belief in dance as an essential activity for people of all ages expressed in his book *Modern Educational Dance*<sup>15</sup> was in the German expressionist art

---

11. Doitch, K, in *New Dance*, no 32:23

12. Lange, 1975:23

13. cf I.3.

14. cf Foster, 1977:28

15. published 1948, 3rd ed. 1975



and theatre tradition. It advocated individualistic development at a time when the psychology of individualism was very fashionable (after the second world war).<sup>16</sup> Several strands of then current trends joined forces to make the success of this dance concept (self-expression, dance as a creative outlet for non-academic pupils, individualism) to provide modern educational dance access into education. It was aided by progressive education centres such as Dartington Hall where Laban played the inspiring, admired guru-figure who relied on the help and educational knowledge of ex-pupils for the formulation of his dance concept for the educational context.<sup>17,18</sup> Women's PE colleges with a tradition of movement as part of PE also played an important role<sup>19</sup>. The centre of the teaching of modern educational dance was Manchester Art of Movement Studio where Lisa Ullmann applied Laban's work to education by means of workable classifications.<sup>20</sup> The propagation and establishment in schools was horizontal, i.e. coming from the periphery, from individuals.<sup>21</sup>

The field of knowledge of modern educational dance according to Laban was<sup>22</sup>

"...all that has been discovered and felt concerning this art by its most prominent pioneers"

-----

16. cf Hargreaves,D, 1982:87

17. cf Foster, 1977:28ff

18. Preston-Dunlop emphasizes the fact that Laban himself did not enter the educational field, in Dance Research Journal,13/1, Fall 1980

19. cf Foster,1977:77; Gulbenkian Foundation Report,1980:196f

20. Foster,1977:74

21. For details of Laban's influence and Laban courses cf Gulbenkian Foundation Report,1980:196f

22. Laban, 1975:8

The sixteen movement themes are called the "principles of the new dance technique".<sup>23</sup> The aims were to "integrate intellectual knowledge with creative ability"<sup>24</sup> and it was justified by understanding of movement, joy and beneficial effects.<sup>25</sup>

Laban was not a trained scholar. His conflicting use of terminology<sup>26</sup> led to misunderstandings and contradictory interpretations.<sup>27</sup> His 16 basic movement themes came to be taken as the method. Modern educational dance in schools used the analytical movement themes as starting points for teaching. The 'input' was verbal/analytical and the pupils expected to re-discover through the execution of these verbal/analytical 'inputs' what "the pioneers" had felt...

Two different methods developed early, that of teaching technical skills leading to free expression, and the reversed method. This situation seemed indicative of the innovative potential of the shared concept and was possible at a time (1950s) when teachers were given complete freedom "to embark upon any kind of secondary curriculum they chose"<sup>28</sup> and enjoyed the Golden Age of teacher control of the curriculum.

The expansion of modern educational dance brought with it rigidity, because the established formula was copied again and again. In the early sixties, the applied formula of modern educational dance aroused criticism for its lack of defined objectives, specified learning

---

23. Laban, 1975:13

24. Laban, 1975:13

25. Laban, 1975:12

26. cf technique, above

27. cf Curl, in LAMG, 1966-74; Meakin/Sanderson, 1983

28. Lawton 1979:12f



experiences and forms of evaluation. The problem modern educational dance posed for the maintained sector was to describe and analyze what exactly it was that had been introduced to British schools under the label of modern educational dance.<sup>29</sup> The broad generalisations and cliché terms, the justification of modern educational dance as education through dance did not satisfy any longer. The claims of modern educational dance were summarized by Layson as follows<sup>30</sup>

- \* - Movement forms are universal
- \* - Children have an innate urge to move
- \* - Children benefit from experiencing a wide range of movement qualities
- \* - Modern educational dance is unique in offering many opportunities for small group interaction
- \* - Modern educational dance (under its various names) is essentially an aesthetic experience

Such claims can be seen in statements such as<sup>31</sup>:

"...help people to tackle their fears and gain confidence to communicate freely, sensitively and imaginatively; if we have enabled them to become ...aware of their own potential and that of others then we will have achieved a good measure of success. Such success is the justification of education through dance."

or<sup>32</sup>

"I think that...the discovery of uniqueness is an important feature, and it is one that can, perhaps, be more readily achieved in dance than in most other areas."

---

29. cf Gulbenkian Foundation Report, 1980:197

30. cit by Adshead, 1981:25f

31. Ullmann, in Laban, 1975:133

32. Foster, R, 1978:18f



or<sup>33</sup>

"...through dancing a frame of mind can be attained which is favourable to heightened awareness and understanding of self and the world. When a person's inner impulse (effort) is stimulated, the quality of his experience is enriched and consciousness deepened."

The goals were "whole-heartedly experiential".<sup>34</sup> The claims summarized by Layson were also reflected in school examination syllabi from 1966 onwards, emphasizing process, creativity, awareness, personality development, mind-body interaction and self-actualization.<sup>35</sup>

Frustration about the slow progress of modern educational dance within education brought forward analyses of the situation such as lack of understanding from heads, difficulties of evaluation, the exploratory nature of the work, the non-productive nature of movement and the failure of recognizing children's changing interest.<sup>36</sup> As early as 1960 the systematic case for the inclusion of movement on the curriculum, for its place in arts or PE, for aims and values, for examinations was made.<sup>37</sup> The need to justify exploratory work, to convince heads, to present evaluation, to produce and be able to show results led to search for help from philosophers<sup>38</sup> to define the area of work, movement, as a means to sound justifications. To counteract reproaches of woolliness and overgeneralizations, precise and measurable

---

33. Ullmann, 1979:28

34. Preston-Dunlop, 1980:V

35. cf White, J, Study of dance Conference, Leeds, 1981

36. cf Foster, 1977:98

37. cf Laban Art of Movement Guild magazine, 1960

38. cf I.2.5

objectives were sought.

The call for measurable aims and objectives of a behavioural tradition close to Bloomian taxonomy was hoped to provide guidance for teachers who felt their work to be too aimless.<sup>39</sup> The combination of behaviouristic models and philosophical discourse influenced the justification of movement in the direction of dance as pertaining to the arts. The argument that the primary experience of movement/dance sparking off intellectual development (according to Piaget) and thus providing direct knowledge of meaning and personal growth led to justifications such as fostering "kinaesthetic intelligence".<sup>40</sup>

The arid theorizing and 'slang' of modern educational dance and human movement studies led to work such as<sup>41</sup>:

"Did John/Jane fulfil the movement task on the floor? What was his/her answer to the problem? Has he/she learnt to control his/her body-weight coming down to the floor? Where and how did he/she work during the climax of the lesson on apparatus?"

In the modern educational dance practice, the logocentricity may even have led to a neglect of the body in its habitual and functional use. - The clash between the stated theoretical claims<sup>42</sup> and the practical outcomes has made modern educational dance vulnerable to attacks.

---

39. cf Foster, 1977:118

40. cf Best, 1978:59

41. cit in Foster, 1977:124

42. cf Best, D, 1978, 'proves' how unsound theoretically the claims of modern educational dance are

### 7.3 DANCE AS ART

A shift to modern dance as an art form took place<sup>1</sup> which avoided the all-embracing claims of modern educational dance and 'feeling' and 'self-expression' of modern educational dance. The shift was brought about by changes in the structure of higher education and probably also by the impact of modern Graham-derived dance. This shift shows clearly in Preston-Dunlop's introduction to the second edition of her book. Whereas her first edition 1963 was entitled *Modern Educational Dance*, the second edition 1980 was called *A Handbook for Dance in Education* where she stated in the preface<sup>2</sup>:

"This approach (modern educational dance) has been clearly shown to have its strengths, and also its shortcomings, which are: the lack of evaluative possibility through the private nature of experience, the lack of link with dance as a theatre art, the concentration on personal development, and the minimal stress on the acquisition of skill and on coming to appreciate, and to know, dance works through both feeling and cognition."

It was a real swing of the pendulum from private to public, from practice to fact, from coming to know to propositional knowledge. This shift in the justification and placing of movement/dance to the realms of the arts where the values of dominant philosophical and educational discourse were sensory perception and experience, creativity, personal growth and originality<sup>3</sup> was on the grounds of public accountability and evaluation possibilities. The emerging elitist

---

1. Adshead, 1981:27

2. Preston-Dunlop, 1980:V

3. e.g. Langer, S, cf I.2.5.



justification of dance<sup>4</sup> in the early 1970s must be directly linked to Hirst's educational theories<sup>5</sup>: the claim of public 'language' and objectivity of the essentialist concept of art link up with the claim of objective criteria of the classical humanist ideology of education.<sup>6</sup> Redfern advocated initiation to the arts and understanding of the arts. In her view, understanding of the language of dance' included watching performances, practising set sequences, and composing dances.<sup>7,8</sup> For Redfern, claims for the educational value of dance were to rest on achievements to which public standards could apply.<sup>9</sup> She supported Hirst's propositional view of the arts. Her concern was with the artefact for public inspection. She made a categorical distinction between "socio-festive dancing" and "dance as art".<sup>10</sup> She questioned the educational value of the former because she felt it was more conducive to socialization than education. The value of dance in interpersonal understanding was considered merely a latent objective.<sup>11</sup> The link with the theatre implied two things. Firstly, to record dance performances, notation became

-----  
4. cf essentialist concept, I.2.5

5. cf Hirst's fields of knowledge in I.3.; cf Mansfield, 1976b:4

6. cf e.g. Redfern, Concepts in Modern Educational Dance, 1973

7. cf Mansfield, 1976:39

8. Redfern's three elements of watching, performing and composing provided the categories for Adshead's concept of dance as a distinct academic discipline, PhD, 1980, cf below

9. cf Mansfield, 1976a:30

10. cf Mansfield, 1976a:55

11. Another defendant of objectivity of the arts was Best, cf Best, D, The arts, objectivity and education, Sept. 1979

necessary<sup>12</sup>. Dance notation was seen as useful in that children ought to be acquainted early with notation symbols for the sake of learning to handle symbols<sup>13</sup>. Secondly, the importance of technique increased. Technical skills and abilities were necessary for the artefact and could be assessed according to standards.

The splitting of dance into socio-festive dancing unworthy of inclusion on the curriculum and into dance as high art/essentialist concept under the aesthetic discipline view point<sup>14</sup> was seen as a decisive step towards widening the field, that is towards greater power. Strategically, to place dance under the auspices aesthetics allowed the definition of dance as a "subject"<sup>15</sup>:

"...in its concern with the nature of knowledge it [philosophy] is pertinent to the questions of curriculum construction and to the business of providing arguments and justifications for the inclusion of particular subjects."

Concurrent with the essentialist art concept of dance as intrinsically worthwhile and as a defined subject there was also the countervailing populist "contextualist paradigm"<sup>16</sup> of art as a worthwhile activity on the curriculum, which could be placed within the progressive ideology of education.<sup>17</sup>

But the reduction of student places and the

-----

12. for a discussion of dance notation, cf I.2.5.

13. cf Foster, 1977:83, cit Hutchinson passim

14. cf essentialist concept of art, I.2.5

15. Redfern, 1973:IX

16. Mansfield, cit. Russell passim, 1976a:50

17. cf I.3.

re-structuring of teacher training and the B.Ed.degree<sup>18</sup> among other factors, put pressure on dance to justify itself according to dominant educational models, e.g.Hirst's, which made the balance shift towards 'objective' justifications of the essentialist concept. The new B.Ed. courses had to demonstrate the existence of a coherent body of knowledge<sup>19</sup> which could be examined in the traditional academic form of written examinations. The ground was prepared for the next step, that of the academization of dance.

---

18. cf Adshead 1981:24;34ff

19. cf Adshead1981:28



#### 7.4 DANCE AS A DISTINCT ACADEMIC DISCIPLINE

It has been claimed that steps towards establishing dance as a distinct academic discipline were necessary as a consequence from the 4th year of the B.Ed. degree and that embryonic structures for dance studies were already in existence in the early 1970s.<sup>1</sup> The academization of dance was not really a new concept. It was rather the extension of the justifications of public knowledge and accountability, values typical of the classical humanist ideology of education.<sup>2</sup> The case for dance as a purely academic field of study was argued by Adshead in 1980<sup>3</sup> on the grounds of the threefold, central concepts of choreography, performing and appreciation which had been outlined by Redfern in 1973<sup>4</sup>. Adshead rested her case upon the Aristotelian three-fold concept of a discipline, namely theoretical/fixed knowledge, practical/changeable knowledge/action and productive/appreciative knowledge and combined it with Hirst's concept of education as development of mind.<sup>5</sup> The theoretical framework for dance as a discipline consists, according to Adshead, of - central organizing concepts, - principles of procedures, - criteria of success, - problems and interests. Adshead holds that<sup>6</sup>

"...it is possible and reasonable to conceive of a course in dance which involved the student in no practical dancing and which consisted of a theoretical study of dance..."

-----  
1. cf Adshead, 1981:34

2. cf Ideologies of education, I.3.

3. Adshead, J, Dance as a Discipline, PhD, 1980

4. cf I.2.5; III.7.2.

5. cf Ideologies of education, I.3.

6. Adshead, 1981:110

In other words, the study of dance completed the shift from practical/non-verbal/ first-hand knowledge and experience to theoretical/verbal second-hand knowledge: 'knowing about dance' instead of dancing. To establish the place of dance among the other academic disciplines the study of dance had to borrow from other disciplines to achieve this step to academic respectability. Lyons contends<sup>7</sup>

"The dance-as-a-discipline lobby have attempted to conspire for academic space with established disciplines. 'Academic' dance texts utilise epistemological approaches generated by research from other fields of knowledge."

The early 1980s were marked by an academization of dance, a trend advocated and sponsored by Adshead and Layson and also furthered by the creation of the *British Society for Dance Research*. The Gulbenkian Foundation Report on dance education and training stated 1980 that dance, as an academic subject in its own right, had not yet gained widespread acceptance.<sup>8</sup> But it placed the value of dance as a subject on a par with other traditional academic subjects<sup>9</sup>:

"as a means of acquiring a trained intellect at tertiary level."

Adshead's threefold concept was extended to a fivefold one in the GFR, with notation and interdisciplinary study, e.g. in combination with history, sociology, anthropology, in addition. This fivefold concept opened up vast fields of study for dance and liberated it from the closed confines of the arts. Adshead admitted that

-----  
7. PhD, 3.1.3., 1985

8. GFR1980:71, 1140

9. GFR, 1980:69, 1137

the study of dance as pertaining to the arts was too limited a concept and not sufficient to account for dance<sup>10</sup>:

"...the change towards an art orientation is not sufficient in itself for a coherent statement of the totality of dance study since it fails to take account of...examples which are not art based."

It seemed that once the case for dance as a distinct academic discipline had been argued, it became possible for the dance-as-a-discipline lobby to acknowledge other forms of dance again and that making the case for dance as an art form was a strategy to gain access to academic status. Widening or opening up the field of study of dance to other disciplines at the same time increased the possibilities and thus power/control of dance as a distinct academic discipline and its academization. The introduction of the multi-cultural aspect of the British society today into the study of dance is one example thereof.<sup>11</sup>

---

10. Adshead, 1981:74

11. cf 3rd Study of Dance Conference, University of Surrey, April, 1984: Dance: A Multicultural Perspective



## 7.5 DANCE IN EDUCATION IN THE 1980s

The justification of dance in a "multi-cultural" perspective<sup>1</sup> in the early eighties can be seen as the attempt to lead dance away from the marginalized place art occupies in industrialized Western society to a more central place like the one it occupies in cultures 'available' from e.g. former colonies like India, African countries, the Caribbean. But it can also be seen as a diversion. The problem with inserting dance into a multi-cultural framework is twofold. Firstly, if these dance forms are considered as art then the problem of appreciation arises. Art forms are deeply set in the cultural background. In order to take into account what the dancer intended, the observer must know the dance form and the whole cultural setting. In order to really grasp the context and the criteria of the dance one must have been brought up in that society.<sup>2</sup> To appreciate dance forms of other cultures within an artistic context knowledge of one's art forms and culture are necessary. This knowledge may not have been acquired by pupils, the values of those dance forms are therefore not understood. - The second problem relates to the aesthetic: aesthetic concepts can be learnt independant from the context<sup>3</sup>; dance from other cultures then can be looked at (or practised) autonomously from the context. But since the meaning of most of these dances is inseparable from the cultural context (eg Indian dances related to religion) autonomous, Eurocentric appreciation is superficial and consumeristic, in other words non-educational. Therefore, the multi-cultural perspective may be in danger of becoming just another

-----  
1. cf Maree, 9/4/1984

2. cf Best, 9/4/84

3. cf Best, ibid

form of cultural exploitation and the value for education at least questionable.

#### 7.5.1 The Place of Dance at Secondary Level

This section is largely based on the HMI report *Dance in Secondary Schools*<sup>4</sup> and on the enquiry of the Gulbenkian Foundation (GFR) entitled *Dance Education and Training in Britain*<sup>5</sup>. Both reports are pro-dance oriented.

Maree contended in 1981 that dance was then engaged in a struggle for examination status, for high-culture art-form definition, and for re-emphasis on the acquisition of technical ability, as opposed to a stress on creativity and therapy.<sup>6</sup> According to her, a multi-cultural perspective offered a challenge to stereotypes in the dance world and in the community providing opportunities for questioning generalisations.<sup>7</sup>

Meakin and Sanderson<sup>8</sup>, in their report on dance in English secondary schools, noted four main dance activities:

- \* - emotionally charged movement
- \* - aesthetically satisfying movement
- \* - teacher-guided choreography
- \* - teacher-directed choreography

This list shows that dance taught in schools is in great part linked to the art and aesthetic concepts, that

-----

4. DES 1983

5. 1980

6. cf Maree, Noc.1981

7. Maree, ibid

8. 1983:72ff

values of the modern educational dance concept as well as values of the dance as art concept overlap.

The HMI reported that the unsatisfactory place of dance was partly attributed to teachers' lack of information and orientation<sup>9</sup>:

"...our impression that few of the teachers we met had addressed themselves fully to the question of the aims and objectives that they should be pursuing, the type of content that they should select for each session, and the teaching methods that they should employ."

But not just planning and orientation were insufficient. Training was another point HMI found insufficient in that the report noted a<sup>10</sup>

"shortage of teachers with the confidence to teach the subject"

at the level of fourth years and above. quite likely due to dance being mostly within PE and PE specialists teaching dance.<sup>11</sup> Notwithstanding the increasing emphasis on dance as an art form<sup>12</sup>, more than 90% of dance courses in schools in 1983 were the responsibility of PE departments.<sup>13</sup> Many dance teachers in the HMI report attributed the low status of dance in part to its being under the auspices of PE.- Dance O- and A- levels have been introduced, a sign and symbol of the academic values filtering down to secondary education. Yet, examination courses were available as an option in some

-----  
9. Meakin/Sanderson, 1983:82

10. DES, 1983:13

11. Dance at tertiary level, cf III.7.5.2.

12. cf Adshead, 1981:67

13. cf DES:4



10% of schools<sup>14</sup> , to a minority of children.

Although the number of pupils in dance has greatly increased<sup>15</sup> , although dance has boomed<sup>16</sup> , dance teachers still feel very disenchanted with the status of their subject<sup>17</sup> :

"...their subject is not generally accorded the respect and status that they rightly believe it deserves and that they need to convince colleagues and superiors of its values as a curriculum activity."

Dance still receives a "less than ample share" of financial and other resources, "less than adequate amount of timetable space"<sup>18</sup> . The GFR concludes<sup>19</sup> :

[The studies] "suggest a rather patchy picture lacking any progressive, overall scheme. The achievements, welcome as they are, should not be allowed to obscure reality. This is that dance is taught in a relatively few British schools..."

and taught nearly exclusively to girls of the first three years of secondary schooling.<sup>20</sup> Questions arising from these findings for the GFR are<sup>21</sup> , among others:

---

14. DES, 1983:4

15. cf Gulbenkian Foundation Report, 1980:J77

16. cf GLC Festival Dance 1985, cf Break dance, aerobics, TV commercials, TV programmes, cf 'Disco dancer' rose No 77, Regent's Park 1985...

17. Meakin/Sanderson, 1983:69

18. Meakin/Sanderson, 1983:69; cf GFR 1980:54, J108

19. GFR.1980:57, J114

20. cf GFR 1980:54, J108; DES, 1983:4

21. 1980:57, J115

- \* - how to overcome the low status of dance
- \* - how to improve the teaching quality
- \* - how to involve more boys

Although the number of boys dancing was found fairly low<sup>22</sup> stimuli such as words, stories and dramatic ideas were used in dance mixed groups or boys' classes whereas music dominated in most girls' dance classes<sup>23</sup> As to pupil response the view of 4th, 5th and 6th years might be interesting in the context of academization of dance, namely that they welcomed dance as a contrast to their academic work, as an " emotional release from the pressure of academic work" and that they commented on the importance of dance as the only non-competitive physical activity offered to them<sup>24</sup>. Yet they also felt that dance examinations had value.

The HMI report concluded, like the GFR did three years earlier<sup>25</sup> that the place of dance in the secondary curriculum was "meagre and confused" but "neither dead nor dying"<sup>26</sup>. But Maree's statement that dance teachers are not united about the emphasis they want to and her suggestion that dance teachers need to come together if they want to strengthen their position in the 'core curriculum' debate, if followed, might contribute to dance not only 'not dying' but living and thriving.

#### 7.5.2 The Place of Dance at Tertiary Level

This section is largely based on Adshead, 1981, and on the C. Gulbenkian Foundation report on dance education

---

22. DES, 1983:4; GFR 1980:54, ] 108

23. DES, 1983:10

24. DES, 1983:10

25. 1980:54, ]109

26. DES, 1983:15

and training, 1980.

According to the GFR dance has moved towards the non-university sector of higher education, the real pace for change having been set by the polytechnics and former colleges of education merging with polytechnics as well as by colleges of higher education seeking to diversify from a predominantly teacher training role<sup>27</sup> The report underlines the importance of the - relatively few - institutions where dance research can take place. The GFR's justification for dance in higher education institutions rests upon their role as<sup>28</sup>

"a forum for specialised work leading to research, performance and publication."

It is less categorical than Adshead<sup>29</sup> and includes practice/performance as part of academic work.

Adshead is convinced that the re-structuring of higher education and teachers' training into units of study allows greater student choice so that a student wishing to do dance can increase the amount of units in dance. This might raise dance standards of dance teachers, deplored as insufficient by the HMI.<sup>30,31</sup>

A great variety of dance courses in tertiary education are on offer.<sup>32</sup> A National Resource Centre for Dance has been established at the University of Surrey, degree

---

27. GFR, 1980:71, 1141

28. GFR 1980:75, 1147

29. cf academisation, above

30. cf above

31. The time allocated to dance on the 3 year certificate of education course 1973 averaged 20 hours and involved learning about the activity in addition to learning how to teach it. cf Adshead, 1981:43f

32. cf Adshead, J, 18/9/1981, Study of Dance Conference



courses (postgraduate and undergraduate) have been set up at Surrey University.<sup>33</sup>.

Before discussing the presented justifications, establishment and developments of dance in education as emerged from the data I first turn to the issue of dance examinations.

---

33. Mainly through the efforts of Layson and Adshead

## 7.6 THE ISSUE OF EXAMINATIONS

This section deals with secondary school dance examinations exclusively which are thought to highlight a crucial point of development of dance in education.<sup>1</sup>

The first CSE mode 3 came about in 1965<sup>2</sup> In the mid-sixties the Laban Art of Movement Guild published the debate on the desirability of dance examinations. Chapman argued in favour of examinations as a means to free dance out of the ghetto. Dance should stand up to the same rigours as other subjects. Jordan was against examinations on the grounds that dance should provide the medium for human virtues such as imagination, creativity and social awareness. Examinations would trim pupils to mere acquisition of skills and knowledge and become<sup>3</sup>

"both a narrow gateway and a status symbol...dance could become either a test of physical exercise or an academic study or both"

and thereby fall short of dance's main asset, creative vitality. Nevertheless, CSE mode 3 dance examinations developed. They were largely based on Laban and process-oriented.<sup>4</sup> The general swing of the pendulum against progressive education and CSE mode 3<sup>5</sup> during the

-----  
1. The first GCE submitted 1951 and 1966 approved was in ballet for Royal Academy of Dancing, the second GCE approved 1979 was intended for Royal Ballet School; neither are taken into account here

2. White, in The British Journal of Physical Education, 16/5, Sept/Oct.1985

3. LAMG 1966:7

4. cf White,1977a:47

5. cf Howarth: "We cannot afford to become a CSE mode 3 nation", cit in Whitty,1976:137

second half of the 1970s<sup>6</sup> is characterized by the term accountability. This swing is also reflected in dance where White, in her MA thesis *Dance as an Examination Subject*<sup>7</sup> advocates externally assessed examinations as advantageous because they promise to<sup>8</sup>

"curb some of the wilder extravagances of educational experimenters"

and to provide uniformity of practice. She overtly advocates curbing teacher autonomy by emphasizing accountability and standards.<sup>9</sup> In her view, CSE mode 3 dance examinations do not guarantee sufficient curriculum control, since CSE function mainly as social control within the school and are teacher-based.<sup>10</sup> Her argument is that dance examinations would be in the interest of candidates with ability, an argument advanced by those who<sup>11</sup>

"in the name of preserving 'our cultural heritage' and providing opportunities for the most able to excel, ...seek to conserve the institutional support for the educational tradition they believe in...it is the legitimacy of university control, rather than teacher autonomy that is upheld."

White, upholding external assessment and university control, concluded that as a result of introducing examination standards within schools might improve because aims and objectives would have to be specified,

---

6. cf Lawton, 1979:14f

7. Leeds, 1977a

8. White, 1977a:16

9. cf Whitty, in Barton/Meighan, 1978:129ff

10. cf MacDonald, I, Op.Univ. 1977:72

11. Young, Appendix, Op.Univ.14-15, ed.Macdonald, 1977:79



teaching methods adopted and lessons planned<sup>12</sup>: Teacher control seemed to be an important element in the justification of externally assessed examinations. The dance examination-lobby had the first dance O-level mode 2 syllabus accepted by the London schools examination board. The specimen examination paper stated the following aims<sup>13</sup>:

- \* - to promote an understanding of dance as an art form
- \* - to develop expertise in dance performance and composition
- \* - to extend knowledge in dance through a study of its history in a cultural context

The stated aims<sup>14</sup> recall Adshead's threefold concept. The syllabus contains key elements like notation<sup>15</sup>, dance technique, appreciation. The technical study can be in modern dance or ballet. The historical study allows a choice of various forms of Western theatre dance (ballet, modern, fringe). The syllabus is set clearly within the dance-as-art justification. - The percentage of written work is greater than the percentage suggested by the GFR, with the intention to give "the vital entree to tertiary education".<sup>16</sup> Within the dance-as-art justification the requirements are coherent since they stress public knowledge and standards and give predominance to the

-----

12. 1977a:66

13. Specimen O-level mode 2 dance paper, Sept, 1980

14. These aims are repeated in the 1983 O-level dance syllabus, SED 83/398 1050 University of London

15. Notation figures as one question out of nine from which four have to be answered; the technical study is sent notated to the schools for preparation. At a preliminary meeting in London 1980, the concerned dance teachers had interpreted the notation quite differently!

16. White, in Impulse, summer 1980:11

written/theoretical<sup>17</sup>. The need for externally assessed examinations is also coherent with claims for public accountability. Public accountability is an important element of the academic tradition. Introducing externally assessed examinations in dance was a necessary step in the logics of the dance-as-art justification and typical of the evolution of status model.<sup>18</sup>

As mentioned above, HMI reported that some 10% of schools offered examinations in 1983<sup>19</sup>. Even if examinations are increasing the number of dance O-levels must be minute, since they provide for the top 20% of the school population.

The new A-level syllabus in dance<sup>20</sup> to be examined for the first time in June 1986 states that 'dance' means the art form of dance, both classical and modern. Modern dance subsumes

"those styles of dance which have emerged in the twentieth century, and have been used by choreographers in established dance theatre companies."

Pupils can avoid notation in the O-level syllabus. But the A-level syllabus states notation, Benesch of Labanotation, as one of the objectives, besides choreography, performance, appreciation, technique and knowledge of the cultural context of dances.

In summary, there were examinations in dance at GCE O- and A-levels, at CSE and CEE in 1985.<sup>21</sup> But the GCE

-----

17. cf I.3. Ideologies of education: the classical humanist ideology of education

18. cf Goodson 1983, below

19. DES, 1983:4

20. March 1984, GC 84/6168, 1984 University of London

21. White, cit. above, 1985:178



O-level and CSE were to be abolished in favour of the national and common system of examining at 16+. The 16+ examination was expected to be implemented by the late 1980s<sup>22</sup>. According to White<sup>23</sup> teachers received the syllabus with enthusiasm. Candidates for dance of the ULSEB GCE O-level first examined in 1983 doubled in 1984 and doubled again in 1985. She concluded that the examinations made standards rise, knowledge of dance increase, both good augurs for future curriculum developments in the subject.<sup>24</sup>

#### 7.6.1 Discussion

White's rejoicing may not have been shared by all. The GFR had stated as early as 1980 that<sup>25</sup>

"...some of us feel that formal dance examinations are inadequate..."

and reasoned that formal examinations benefited the academically minded pupils, and that they introduced competition and stress contrary to the spirit of dance which required co-operation rather than selection.

Has dance then become a 'fact-like body of knowledge' of the epigraph, contrary to the convictions and hopes of many dance teachers, some of them even members on the CGF enquiry board? Fears that 'knowledge about dance' may increase but 'dance' itself get lost in the process were also expressed by dance teachers I talked to at the 1981

-----

22. cf Letch, on central government control of 16+ and 17+ examinations, in Skilbeck, ed, 1984b:36f; cf Whitty, in Barton/Meighan, eds, 1978:129ff

23. in 1985 a senior lecturer in dance and moderator for dance at the University of London school examination board and London regional examining board

24. White, *ibid*:179

25. GFR, 1980:99, 1200



Study of dance conference at Leeds.

The dance examination advocates' perception of dance as objectifiable knowledge illustrates the 'victory' of the two rival justifications of dance of two rival ideologies of education. The factual, objective, instrumental, knowledge expressed verbally of dance-as-art seems to impose itself and assume hegemony over the experiential, subjective, practical knowledge expressed nonverbally of modern educational dance - the division of labour has taken place in dance in British schools.<sup>26</sup>

The historical development of dance examinations illustrates that the perception of the dance examination advocates of dance as factual, objective, theoretical knowledge wins over the modern education dance advocates. I suggest that this is because of the political and educational swing of the pendulum mentioned by Lawton<sup>27</sup> and because the dance examination lobby is backed by powerful academic tradition<sup>28</sup>. Skilbeck reports Becher's findings that between 1960-1975, the quality of the educational process was the subject of professional analysis and evaluation whereas from 1975 onwards the focus shifted to educational products and outcomes in which the public and the politicians took a strong interest.<sup>29</sup> The dance examinations illustrate fairly closely this educational development. The external dance examinations may indeed have changed the position of dance in schools as Edwards claims<sup>30</sup> - but at what price? Is it that the dance examination advocates have spent an enormous amount of attention and time measuring output at the expense of questioning the

-----

26. cf Blacking, I.2.2

27. cit above

28. cf Goodson, below

29. Skilbeck, 1984c:11

30. Edwards, passim, in Lyons, S, 1985:3.1.4.6.

quality of the input?<sup>31</sup> Is the nature and experience of dance reflected in these examinations or have they been lost, has the baby been thrown out with the bath water?<sup>32</sup>

What is the value of these examinations in relation to gender? Boys are more likely to take three A-levels and to go to university than girls.<sup>33</sup> Does the A-level dance provide and increase the real opportunity to gain access to university for girls then? Although it may provide an opportunity, it is extremely likely to be a minute one. Dance examinations are a "minor footnote to the major curriculum subjects"<sup>34</sup>. In addition to that, the first A-level seems - to me - extremely demanding<sup>35</sup>. The contribution of dance examinations to girls' chance to enter university might therefore be only minimally increased. This minimal chance must be weighed against the bearing of examinations on the curriculum<sup>36</sup>:

"...the limitations imposed on the curriculum by examinations affect all pupils whatever their ability."

To the effects of examinations on the curriculum, the additional created competition and stress must be added to the ensuing alienation and marginalisation of non-examination groups.- It can be argued that the dance examinations contribute to the reproduction of inequalities. And in the light of the new vocational trend of the 1980s the question must be asked if the

---

31. cf Lawton, in Skilbeck, ed, 1984c:15

32. More research into these questions is suggested.

33. cf Acker, 1982:3

34. Marland, cit passim in Smith, S, 1985, 3.1.4.6

35. cf White, Impulse, summer 1980: "we do not want allowances...for our subject"

36. Mortimore/Mortimore, 1986:70



dance examinations do not also strengthen labour hierarchies.- The pupils quoted in the HMI report valued dance also for its non-competitiveness and its emotional release from academic pressures. I submit that especially academically minded girls might profit from non-examinational dance.<sup>37</sup> - It may be argued that teachers and pupils are free to engage in dance as an examination subject. But the values of especially external dance examinations and their underlying ideology permeate and filter down<sup>38</sup> and determine the curriculum. The argument of dance examinations providing a chance for the ablest seems to be a weak justification, especially since examinations are strongly sex-stereotyped<sup>39</sup>. From a gender point of view it is not enough just to broaden the provision of examinations and curricula. From a gender point of view the content, the quality and the implementation must be scrutinized.

As stated above, more energy and time has been devoted to setting up dance examinations than to examining the dance input. This lack is regrettable, especially from a gender point of view.

In conclusion it seems that the introduction of externally assessed examinations has been mainly in the pursuit of higher status. This must be viewed in the context of school, society and politics. The search for status qua examinations has been informed by pragmatism taking into account the powers that be.

-----

37. cf III.10., PGCE case-study 2

38. cf Lawton, on the close connection between curriculum und examination syllabi, 1979:19

39. cf Mahony, 1985:15ff



## 7.7 HISTORY OF DANCE IN BRITISH EDUCATION: DISCUSSION

Trying to summarize dance in British schools from the fifties to the eighties and its development as a subject in its own right, I note the following key points:

- \* - Dance (in particular Laban's modern educational dance) has been introduced from the periphery by mainly women PE teachers in the tradition of natural movement
- \* - Dance (Laban-inspired) is rooted within an expressionist European theatre tradition, is idealistic/holistic and utilitarian/analytical and psychologically justified, can educationally be placed within the progressive ideology of education
- \* - Dance as art is philosophically justified, defends objectivity and public standards; it can educationally be placed within the classical-humanist ideology of education (essentialist concept) or the progressive ideology of education (contextualist concept)
- \* - The academization of dance is a continuation and specialisation within the 'dance as art' concept
- \* - The multi-cultural perspective of dance is anthropologically justified. Depending on interpretations of culture (affirmative/non-affirmative culture) and art (high art/populist art) it can educationally be placed either within the classical-humanist or progressive or the reconstructivist ideology of education
- \* - The status of dance has hardly improved. Dance suffers low status, insufficient resources and time allocation
- \* - The academization and the introduction of dance examinations have not (yet) improved the status of dance.
- \* - Dance is nearly exclusively taught by women<sup>1</sup> and within PE
- \* - Dance is nearly exclusively taught to girls
- \* - Few teachers are competent, many or most teachers lack

---

1. cf Gulbenkian Foundation Report, cit. 1.2.2

orientation or are unclear about their own intentions

\* - Pupils' and students' numbers have increased

Expansion can mean coming of age as an autonomous field of its own; it can mean expansion of values; it can also mean institutionalisation, rigidity. The expansion of dance noted above has not brought about autonomy. The justifications and values have changed, but it has not been possible to bring them to bear on 'superiors and colleagues': the restricting re-definition of dance as art and as a distinct academic discipline and its corresponding justification have not changed considerably the place and status of dance in relation to those in power. Instead, the current, dominant discourses have been adopted to make the case for dance in education.

The historical investigation of justifications, establishment and developments of dance in education has brought to light the fact that dance practitioners and teachers have had to act and react: Acting as dancers and teachers, reacting as innovators in the sense of having to explain, justify and defend their work and their existence to those in power within male dominated education.<sup>2</sup>

It seems to emerge from the list above that little in terms of debates, dilemmas and concepts has changed since the introduction of Laban's modern educational dance: the concepts advanced for dance in schools have been contained, in embryonic state though, in early modern educational dance teaching methods (skills versus free expression as starting point). The dance as art concept can be seen as a continuation of Laban's expressionist theatre tradition. The academization can be seen as a continuation of Laban's theoretical classifications and schematizations (movement analysis). Any single concept has not been able to demarginalize dance or dance

-----

2. For male dominated educational ideologies cf I.3.; for male concepts of dance, communication and the body cf I.2



practitioners. The dilemma over examinations persists.

Justifications of dance for education have been marked by a shift from egalitarian, process/practice-oriented generalistic justifications and aims to elitist, product/fact-oriented specific justifications and aims. This shift in dance education reflects the shift that has taken place in education generally. Skilbeck contends<sup>3</sup>:

"Since the early 1960s, a succession of reports...from central government have helped to bring to the fore, first, a broadly based liberal philosophy of education and, in recent years, more utilitarian or at any rate more socially functional views of what the curriculum of the school should comprise."

Dance has followed and adopted the dominant contemporary discourses to make its own case.- Before discussing some issues of the presented justifications, their strengths and weaknesses, I wish to place the justifications, establishment and development of dance in education in the perspective of general successive stages of a school subject. I make use of a model elaborated by Goodson.<sup>4</sup>

In the first stage<sup>5</sup> of dance in education of the described period, modern educational dance intrudes and stakes a place on the timetable. Its justifications are on grounds of utility and pertinence. Dominant criterion is the relevance to the needs of the pupils. The teachers are not trained specialists but enthusiastic and missionary pioneers.

In the second stage of dance in education a tradition of scholarly work emerges. Trained dance specialists can

---

3. Skilbeck, ed, 1984b:8; cf also Skilbeck, 1984c:11

4. based on Layton's model, Goodson, 1983

5. as identified by Goodson, 1983:10ff



be recruited from non-university higher education<sup>6</sup>, i.e. specialist colleges. The internal logic and discipline of the subject influences the selection and organization of subject matter, as exemplified in the dance as art justification, with defined objectives and the formulation of examination syllabi, e.g. CSEs. The subject grows in respect to academic reputation and can attract in turn academic/tertiary students. The re-structuring of the B.Ed. has had this effect for dance.

In a third stage, the selection of subject matter is determined largely by the judgment and the practices of specialist scholars who lead inquiries in the field. In the case of dance, the leading dance scholars were among others, Layson and Adshead, first at Leeds, then at Surrey university. Establishing dance as an academic discipline was the precondition for creating the degree courses at Surrey, which in turn started the process of initiating students into the tradition<sup>7</sup> of the "new orthodoxy".<sup>8</sup>

Goodson emphasizes the power of the academic tradition<sup>9</sup>:

"The most powerful of these agencies are those school subject groups promoting the academic tradition...The 'academic tradition' sub-group act in this way because of the legacy of curricula, financial and resource structures inherited from the early twentieth century...Because of this legacy able pupils and academic examinations are linked and consequently resources, graded posts and career prospects are maximised for those who can claim academic status for their subject."

---

6. cf tertiary education, III.7.5.2.

7. this effect is also valid for O- and A-levels

8. Lyons, S, 1985:3.1.2.

9. Goodson, 1983:198

The history of dance in British schools is not unlike what has been described as "status escalation" or "evolution" of a school subject.<sup>10</sup> Except that, although the "status escalation" model has been followed fairly closely, status has not improved accordingly as yet.<sup>11</sup>

In terms of ideologies of education, the three stages of status escalation of dance in education are characterized by a shift from progressive to classical/humanist ideals of education.<sup>12</sup> The shift is from curriculum as practice to curriculum as fact, from intrinsic to extrinsic justification, from teacher guidance to teacher control of content, from pupil-centredness to teacher-centredness.

The advanced justification of dance on the curriculum and as a worthwhile activity have been reproduced from the dominant educational theories. The development of dance in education can be seen as a process of cultural reproduction. Groups have sought support from the dominant theories with the necessary political leverage. Hammersley and Hargreaves contend<sup>13</sup>:

"The point is that such attempts at integration provide living examples of the continuing conflicts between different groups to establish their own definitions of what counts as valid and worthwhile knowledge."

Both modern educational dance and dance as art (with its specialization and academization) justify valid knowledge in terms of the individual, i.e. personal

-----

10. Layton cit passim, Goodson, 1983

11. One of the reasons might be the time factor: more time might be needed for academization to make its mark in terms of status and prestige.

12. cf I.3.5. Conclusions /Ideologies of education

13. 1983:5



growth and personal success of the pupil. They both neglect, or are even in conflict with, aspects of solidarity and peer group associations which could promote solidarity. Decision making and cognitive mastery are the procedures to come to solutions. Co-operative problem solving, negotiation, group action are neglected, more so by the classical-humanists. Modern educational dance does advocate group work and co-operation, but not necessarily in the sense of 'cultural action'<sup>14</sup> None of the justifications mention values of dance as to gender or sexuality or sensuality and as to their "delight". These seem to be values ignored by justifiers of dance – have they yielded to the "sensible assertion of power" of the measurers and gate-keepers of the epigraph?

In the following I wish to highlight several features and issues of the different justifications of dance in education, first modern educational dance.

#### 7.7.1 Reflections on Modern Educational Dance

The success of Laban's *Modern Educational Dance* is explained by Foster by its being published at the right moment in history. This may have been so but does not explain fully the success of a book that falls short of a worked-out dance theory.<sup>15</sup> Laban certainly was an innovator, his theories were certainly highly relevant to the study of dance, but so had been women before him, Duncan, Atkinson, Watts and Morris etc<sup>16</sup>. Morris had produced an embryonic system of notation as early as 1928. Jordan had published on dance as an art form in 1938. So, why Laban's success?

I submit that Laban's success was the success of a man

-----

14. cf Freire, I.3.4.

15. Adshead, 1981:24

16. cf Foster, 1977:77f



in a women's world. Women PE colleges had taught natural movement as a contrast to the mechanics of PE. Laban put into words, worked, preached what they aspired to. He gave the male sanction, he gave status to what they had tried to practice<sup>17</sup>:

"To defer to male authority is behaving in a logical manner when it is believed that such male authority is justified."

Male authority may not be justified, but it acts as the norm<sup>18</sup> Laban spoke what the white middle class gentlewomen<sup>19</sup> dance practitioners and PE teachers knew and felt and wished served as justifications for their feelings and convictions and attributed thus more power and status to their practice in the educational world. The values Laban advocated, like flow, subjective feeling, harmonization, inner living energy, flexibility, holistic movement and life view were values of theirs. Self-expression, subjective feeling are defined as female.<sup>20</sup> Laban validated these spheres. By doing this he solved the contradiction between female private space and the public arena. Personal, subjective movements were being legitimized, could now be made visible, and more importantly, could also be discussed in the male hierarchy. Women PE specialists knew that their view did not count as much as a man's.<sup>21</sup> The defence or justification was the more important for a form of dance that did not clearly serve to make women more attractive to men, i.e. serve primarily the interest of men. Laban's work was a contribution towards the solution of the problem of the gender hierarchy. Female values were

-----

17. Spender, 1982:66

18. cf I.2.4

19. cf Cope, 1976:125

20. cf I.2.4.; I.3.5.

21. cf Spender, 1982:18

made acceptable by a male to males in control of education. But at the same time this contribution introduced the sexual division of labour in dance education: the women did the physical work, the teaching and dancing, he contributed mental work, establishing the system of classification and arguing the case for the value of dance in modern culture and society.

Preston-Dunlop has elaborated his classification system, Hutchinson-Guest his notation, Ullmann has spread the gospel educationally, North his ideas of personal development through dance. Ironically, Laban, the male guru among women, advocated a form of dance that educationally can be placed within the progressive ideology of education fathered by Rousseau, the "champion of liberty", who created Sophie in subjection to Emile<sup>22</sup> and thereby happily accepted the enslavement of half the human race.<sup>23</sup> The confinement of women to private space<sup>24</sup> found a quasi revalorisation in the justifications of existence of e.g. women PE-cum-dance teachers outside the performance of set rules, in the justification of personal elaborated 'speech'/dance codes in Laban's progressive modern educational dance.<sup>25</sup> It is important to understand modern educational dance set within the progressive ideology of education in the light of this dilemma: on one hand modern educational dance contributed to the revalorisation of the private, personal experience and space.<sup>26</sup> But on the other hand this very revalorisation constituted its being confined - by its own definition - within that personal, private

---

22. cf I.3.5

23. cf Spender, 1982:21

24. cf history of women's exclusion from universities, from politics etc

25. cf Douglas, 1970:36

26. in line with psychological claims of the 1950s and 1960s, cf I.3; cf above



experience.<sup>27</sup> Nevertheless, modern educational dance has provided alternative experiences and values advocated by a man to carry sufficient weight. These experiences must have been "playful" and "delightful" for those involved; otherwise the Manchester modern education dance courses would not have had the impact they had and spread from the periphery, horizontally to stake a place on the curriculum.

In summary the initial introduction of modern educational dance can be seen in the perspective of the sexual division of labour.- After Laban, his theories, views, concepts have been expanded. There is ample evidence of modern educational literature. One example of theorizing that stressed, like so many, the "somewhat precious form of self-expression encapsulated safely within the educational system", making use of scientific evidence to justify modern educational dance is the following quotation, a synopsis of a presentation at the Laban Centenary Symposium<sup>28</sup>:

"An argument that through mastering actions the child formulates images and concepts (note Hosper's distinction) and, in turn, symbols and generalisations. The relevance of holistic theories of motor learning, of Piaget's content of intelligence as observable behaviours and of Weimar's motor theory of mind to Arnheim's intelligent perception. The importance of kinaesthetic imagery in dance and the need to promote understanding of the fabric of dance itself, stressing 'impressive knowledge' not merely 'expressive skill' (Broudy's distinction) "

This kind of theorizing, although congruent with Laban's modern education dance concept and justification

-----

27. This dilemma carries also conflicting or even contradictory messages for girls, cf the pathologization of girls in an 'active learner/conquering public space' ideology of education, I.3.3.

28. Slater, ed, 1979:88f



in relation to holistic child development based on motor learning etc, did not correspond to the dominant educational discourse of 1979<sup>29</sup>. Although all the claims of this synopsis may be scientific, correct and profoundly true, it was not the kind of theory that would convince and be acceptable to the dominant discourse then. But neither did it offer a solution for those who saw modern educational dance as an alternative. The quoted synopsis serves as an example of 'expansion' of modern educational dance faithful to Laban's self-expressive legacy in the academic field. This faithfulness, this docility was a lack to re-construct or reconstitute<sup>30</sup> Laban's theories as a means to emancipation and autonomy. It might be that<sup>31</sup>

"In a school system which reflects the current values of society in its emphasis on competition, on the cognitive, on language...modern educational dance is a subversive activity, a deliberate offering of alternative experiences and values...subversion needs to acquire robust sources of nourishment from society at large if it is to flourish."

Modern educational dance following docilely the psychological trends in education and missed its revolutionary potential and the opportunity to become the counter-culture of the body's expressive and symbolic resources, the counter-culture and means of political and cultural statement to the dominance of logos.<sup>32</sup> Modern educational dance advocates went to lengths to justify dance as useful, stressing its psychological, physical, mental, benefits and therapeutic effect and utility. Their justifications can be seen as a mechanistic,

-----

29. cf Skilbeck, 1984b, 1984c, above

30. cf I.3.4. Ideologies of education

31. Cope, 1976:124f

32. cf Walkerdine, I.2.4.; cf Benthall  
cit. Beattie, 1976:112

means-end model.<sup>33</sup> Because of the bias towards self-expression and personal growth influenced by the 'big guns' of science, modern educational dance prompted the reaction and shift towards the dance-as-art concept. What remained was the adherence to the dominant discourses of education and other disciplines. The bias and the dilemma may have contributed to the advent of the justification of dance-as-art.

#### 7.7.2 Reflections on Dance-as-Art

Dance-as-Art was not the anti-thesis to modern educational dance: Laban had already justified dance as art in his 'art of movement' and his tradition of theatre dance. Redfern regretted the overstress of justifications like the 'beneficial effect of the creative activity of dancing upon the personality of the pupil'<sup>34</sup> and the neglect of Laban statements about complex forms of dancing of created and performed works of art. The justifications put forward for dance-as-art can be said to have been antithetical to those of modern educational dance. The shift of justification towards dance-as-art can be interpreted in the light of a search for respectability<sup>35</sup> and 'proper' justifications, unlike those of modern educational dance shining with "slipperiness" and "emptiness of concepts" in the view of Redfern.<sup>36</sup> The touchstone of the dance-as-art argument was evaluation and assessment: the learner's experience had to be externalized so it could be evaluated. Claims for the educational value of dance must rest on achievements to which public standards apply. The definitions of clear criteria of art were thought to be

-----

33. cf Simpson,A, in Ross,ed, 1985:198

34. Laban 1963, cit passim in Mansfield,1976a:23

35. cf Jordan,1966, re examinations

36. Redfern on modern educational dance concepts like 'balance', 'harmony' and 'integration',1973:47



less difficult and troublesome to establish than those of the aesthetic<sup>37</sup>, and allowed evaluation of the product, the fact.

Dance-as-art can be seen as the attempt to enter and conquer the public arena while at the same time attempting to leave behind the low prestige of what is defined as female: private space, self-expression and subjectivity<sup>38</sup>. The dance-as-art is seen as the step into male dominated space leading out of the female ghetto. Attempting this step, women dance practitioners met structures which they had partially to subject themselves to if they wanted to achieve something. Adaption, co-optation or refusal are the bitter alternatives.<sup>39</sup> A true solution would only be possible on the basis of changed public space which would correspond to female experience.

I submit that the dance-as-art justifications with their search for objective criteria are a cul-de-sac for three reasons. It is not likely to raise the status of dance; nor is it likely to raise the issue of the female/the body; nor is it easy to rest the case of dance on the concept of art since clear criteria in the arts are not the most eminent features of art meaning, understanding or appreciation. The three following passages attempt to discuss these three points briefly.

#### 7.7.2.1 The Cul-De-Sac of Dance-As-Art: Art as Male Art

To attempt to make the case for dance in the arts is to ignore that art basically means 'male art'. Wolff<sup>40</sup>

---

37. cf Arnold, 1979:136: "In the end, aesthetic meaning is that which is constituted as such by the individual with or without the aid of conventional context or objective criteria."; cf also I.2.5.

38. cf Spender, 1982:32

39. cf Weigel, in Stephan /Weigel, 1983:104

40. in Ross, ed, 1985:221ff



contends:

"Since the overall social processes have preserved 'art' as 'male art', those arts in which women have predominated and into which they were often pushed...have been marginalized and denoted as 'lesser arts'".

Women have been pushed, attracted to dance.<sup>41</sup> Dance is one of the lesser arts because it has been a predominantly female activity (under male control, e.g. male choreographers, cf I.2.5). Once these 'lesser forms of art' have been defined as marginal by the historical development and present nature of the educational system and the cultural heritage, they cannot all of a sudden be incorporated on equal terms. To justify dance as art in view of higher status through more objective evaluation criteria and standards does not seem a very efficient strategy, besides the fact that art and art teaching are not as unproblematic as they are often presented. Although dance-as-art<sup>42</sup> is more remote from the everyday world and from 'relevant' or utilitarian knowledge and thus closer to high status abstract theoretical knowledge of the secondary curriculum it is still trapped in the low status echelons of art because it is considered and therefore is a *female art*. Dance-as-art, like modern educational dance, fails to achieve any substantial re-definition of high-status knowledge. Even as an art subject dance remains on the concrete-practical continuum of the high status/abstract/psychometric theory of knowledge.<sup>43</sup>

---

41. cf McRobbie, 1984, I.2.4.

42. cf I.2.5.1.

43. cf Esland, in Young, ed, 1971:96

## 7.7.2.2 The Cul-de-Sac of Dance-as-Art: Gender

Another reason why I submit that dance-as-art is a cul-de-sac is the issue of gender. The dance-as-art concept and justification with their emphasis on 'objectivity' assume a subject-object relation. In the light of sexism this comes to see the female dancer's body, the aesthetic functioning of the feminine, and concretized patterns of femininity as the objects of art and the male observer, appreciator as the subject. This is a way of 'mastering' or domestication of subjective, irrational female dance art.<sup>44</sup>

## 7.7.2.3 The Cul-de-Sac of Dance-as-Art: Objectivity

'Objective' assessment and public knowledge in the arts is problematic as to one function of art at least. The function of art as a form of communication with shared symbols is considered as outdated by some.<sup>45</sup> One of the important functions of art is the mixing of categories, the de-construction and re-definition of values, the transcending of boundaries into new territory<sup>46</sup>, the nurturing of the revolutionary.<sup>47</sup> To stress the public character of art is to neglect its subversive, innovative one.<sup>48</sup>

-----

44. cf Walkerdine, 1985; cf Weigel, 1983

45. cf Benthall, 1975:7

46. cf Muschg, 31/1984

47. cf Marcuse, the Aesthetic Dimension, 1979, cit passim in Ross, 1981:6

48. For art between the inapprehensible and the stagnantly traditional, cf Harris, A, in Dyson, 1983:27; cf Bourdieu, 1973, on cultural reproduction and on the creative project as a meeting point and an adjustment between determinism and determination, cit passim in Wolff, 1981:137

#### 7.7.2.4 Concluding Summary

The status anxiety experienced by dance teachers of especially the dance-as-art justification has made them opt for the pragmatic solution: to search support and recognition from the most powerful group, the academic one. Firstly, the recognition is sought by the introduction of externally assessed examinations. Dance-as-art as a subject within the academic curriculum<sup>49</sup> contributes to working smoothly to

"educate a meritocratic minority although  
meanwhile disenchanting the majority."

Secondly, the recognition is sought by the academization of dance.

#### 7.7.3 Reflections on Dance as a Distinct, Academic Discipline

Legitimation of the superiority of a subject is sought and status reached by increasing differentiation.<sup>50</sup> The stratification of dance knowledge is arrived at by the trinity.<sup>51</sup> The status anxiety felt by dance teachers mentioned above had made them seek accreditation before the 1980s.<sup>52</sup> As one head mentioned to me<sup>53</sup> the dance profession in Great Britain had had a reputation for being able to dance but not able to think. With Leeds<sup>54</sup>, she thought, the pendulum had swung too much to the other

-----

49. Goodson, 1983:203

50. cf Young, 1971:33ff

51. cf Adshead, 1981

52. cf Foste, 1977; Curl, 1980, Redfern, 1973

53. Interview 9/6/1982; anonymization cf II.5.

54. formerly Layson's, Adshead's, White's university base



side. The threefold, stratified dance knowlege reflects the departmentalisation of knowledge of the academic, collection code typical of 19th century understanding of science. The value of dance as an academic discipline is stated by the GFR<sup>55</sup> as follows<sup>56</sup>:

"...the educational value of dance as a subject on a par with many other subjects traditionally regarded as a means of acquiring a trained intellect at tertiary level."

Dance then has had to become a fact-like body of knowledge to be accepted on a par with other subjects by the academic gate-keepers. As quoted earlier, the GFR admitted in 1980 that dance as an academic subject was not wide-spread yet. Does this hint at the problematic raised by Wolff above? Is it that dance, defined as a marginal subject by the historical development and the present nature of both the educational system and the cultural heritage, cannot be incorporated on a par, and that it remains, although tolerated, marginal even within academia? Dance-as-art as a distinct academic discipline seems to be a co-optation, seems to be merely confirmatory. The subversive potential, suggested by Cope quoted above, is not brought to blossom, is wasted. The aim of training the intellect qua dance seems to me not sufficiently attractive for reducing dance to a factlike body of knowledge. Justifications of the arts as developing the mind<sup>57</sup> and of dance as training the intellect play down the value of the non-verbality of dance. Metaphorically this comes to throwing the baby out with the bathwater; and extending the metaphor, it could be added that the baby cannot enjoy, sensuously enjoy, the bath since there is no bath any longer. The

-----

55. Adshead and White researched for the GFR, Layson was on the committee of inquiry

56. GFR, 1980:69, 1137

57. cf Swanwick, 1983, cf I.2.5

danger for dance as a distinct academic discipline lies in its being treated as<sup>58</sup>:

"a limited commodity practised by a few members of society for the 'entertainment' or 'enlightenment' of the majority."

Dance, to grade as an academic subject, has had to rid itself of the values that first brought it on the curriculum. Have these values been abandoned? Are they obsolete? Has dance become deflected from its values in the process of status evolution? Dance being an "unknowable truth" and language being a "verifiable truth"<sup>59</sup> the first seems to have been sacrificed for the benefit of the latter, in the tradition of human history of at least the last millennia where verbalisation has represented the universally accepted coding of experiences.<sup>60</sup>

#### 7.7.4 Beyond the 1980s: Towards New Theories?

The historical development of dance from a holistically justified activity to a specialist subject of study has been in great part brought about by people and groups in their search for status and their wish to be accepted on equal terms. But, contends Spender<sup>61</sup>:

"Men have decided what education will be and women who seek only equal entry to that system simply seek equal rights to the education of men which is designed to serve men. For women, equality will consist of equal control of education, and this is a very different matter indeed."

---

58. Blacking, 1982b:2

59. Blacking, 6/4/1984

60. cf Furth 1972:16

61. Spender 1982:39



Status and respectability have been sought via academic professionalism and within the definitions of academic abstract/theoretical knowledge. It may well be that this academic status had to be reached before dance practitioners could recognize that it was not the magical wand they had expected it to be, that co-optation and pragmatism have their price. But it may also be that this 'march through the institutions' has been a necessary development which provides the platform from which more autonomous claims can be made. But so far, although the dominant theories and ideologies of education have been followed and adopted, the status of dance has not increased accordingly. I submit that this is so because dance in education is considered, and therefore is, a female activity.

With the introduction of a national curriculum<sup>62</sup> the conflicts between different groups who wish to establish their own definitions of what counts as knowledge<sup>63</sup> are likely to grow. Each group will want at least to keep their share of timetable allocation, resources etc. Pressures for accepting academic justifications from the 'big guns' are likely to increase.

Docility and respect of dance towards the 'big guns' of education have not contributed to a considerable status improvement of dance nor e.g. to a position of coding knowledge of the curriculum. On the contrary, they have created severe shortcomings and inadequacies for the marginals for whom dance might be a solution. The very careful philosophical arguments of the dance-as-art lobby remain irrelevant for marginal groups. They have implied a relative neglect of educational research, in particular sociological and classroom research which might highlight the needs of those marginal or marginalized groups.

-----

62. cf Baker Education Bill, 1987/1988

63. cf Hammersley/Hargreaves, A, 1983:5



The strategy of docility might therefore have to be reassessed, the received wisdom might have to be rejected. In their place, for dance, I suggest that it might be worthwhile starting from practice. Practice in dance, as the examination of dance in British schools has shown, has been female practice, female practice of enjoyment, of skills, of sensuality and pleasure, of collectivity, of resistance, of narcissism, and of subversion, but also co-optation...the list could be extended. In this century, dance in British schools has always been a female activity. Dance practitioners have not been self-confident enough to make the case for dance as a female activity. Dance is female cultural practice<sup>64</sup> and to endorse it as such might be a powerful, although radical alternative<sup>65</sup>.

Dominant ideologies are not completely pervasive or monolithic, especially in a pluralistic society.<sup>66</sup> There must be ways of operating with an alternative, or oppositional, or emergent ideology within the dominant ideology. At present an emergent ideology of gender could build claims for dance in education on the equal rights amendment, thus making use of an accepted, dominant discourse, but subverting it, or re-constructing it.<sup>67</sup> Such emergent, or oppositional ideology operating within the dominant one could be, metaphorically speaking, 'roving around'<sup>68</sup>: roving around, 'traversing', trying out, rejecting, finding out about and finding dance with enthusiasm, inclination and above all with

-----  
64. it can also be a male activity, but this is not the subject here

65. cf Williams cit passim in Wolff, 1981:53

66. cf Wolff, 1981:53

67. The task of showing the discrimination of girls in terms of allocation of resources, space, teacher attention and curriculum content would not be very difficult; cf III. PGCE case-studies

68. cf Thuermer.Rohr, 1987

pleasure and sensuality. Subjective, personal dance experiences taken as valid realities, - as opposed to monolithic reality - and as articulating the world and as being articulated upon the world. This could contribute to restoring dignity<sup>69</sup> for those sections of the school population (girls and women and other oppressed, marginalized groups) for whom dance could provide a solution. It would also lead away from the fallacy of individualism<sup>70</sup> since dance is - mostly - a group activity and since the individual realities could be recognized as similar to many other individual realities, thus unveiling the political nature of 'reality'.

If justifications are deemed necessary, to make the case on gender rather than on educational ideologies and dance concepts might be a viable strategy to provide for more dance. It would not necessarily increase the status of dance within the overall curriculum. But would that matter provided dance was on the curriculum? It would allow dance practitioners to practice their dance, their educational ideologies, to formulate or come up with their theories. A non-monolithic diversity and variety would or could ensue: cultural practice not as merely expressing the world, but articulating it, articulated upon it.<sup>71</sup>

Some of the mechanisms of male control have been identified. Women do therefore not have to accept any longer that they and their activities are inadequate or inferior. The onus of explanation and justification has shifted.<sup>72</sup> Dance practitioners might insist now on their right to set out their own standards, to describe their activities in a way consistent with their experience, instead of conforming to the image male concepts of dance

-----

69. cf Hargreaves 1982;1984

70. Hargreaves,1982

71. cf Hall,in Hall et al, 1981:30

72. cf Spender,1982:38

and male ideologies and concepts of education have created for (female) dance practitioners. Dance practitioners can argue now that their experience must become part of the complex and comprehensive understanding of the world - because it is valid.



## Chapter 8

THE POSTGRADUATE CERTIFICATE OF  
EDUCATION COURSE: BACKGROUND TO THE CASE-STUDIES

As stated in the introduction to Part III, I have chosen to concentrate on the observed PGCE course because I wished to study material through intensive familiarisation. I felt that this PGCE promised to throw light on issues and problems of dance in education raised in the introduction. Another reason for concentrating on the PGCE course was its form and duration. I felt that the structure of a one year course might provide a model worth examining for its adaptability for Swiss education and training.

Each of the following three case-studies concentrates on one student of the PGCE dance and drama course. The personalities of the students, their dance and education background, their technical skills, their teaching practice (TP) schools, and their TP teachers were all so varied and different that they promised to yield a very rich and wide range of insights into issues, problems and dilemmas in a very concentrated small 'world'. I hope to achieve from these case-studies empirical evidence about dance in British education from a normative position. This position is normative in that it 'believes in dance' and in that it acknowledges and values dance as a female practical activity in education. By looking at instances of dance in education I hope to throw light on what really goes on in dance as a female, practical and marginal activity in education to substantiate material which, when analyzed, can serve to orient further practice and theories towards improvement and change, towards emancipation of dance in education. My interest

was focused on students as future teachers and possible 'agents of change'.

## 8.1 NOTES ON METHOD

The theoretical framework for case-studies has been outlined in II.5. and the practical application has been outlined in III.6. A description of applied qualitative research techniques can be found in Appendices 8 and 9.

I wish to emphasize here only the points of procedure particular to the PGCE case-studies.<sup>1</sup>

### 8.1.1 Rapport

It was a lucky coincidence that I first knew about this course from students starting the PGCE course since my interest concentrated on students. The contact was felt to be on a peers' level, from dance student to research student. The relationship was very close to the one outlined in II.5.1.3. based on feminist methodology. The nature of the relationship was fed by the length of the course and the concurrent data collecting with the effect of intensive familiarisation.<sup>2</sup>

Participant and non-participant observation<sup>3</sup> and interviewing<sup>4</sup> were the main techniques used for collecting data.

### 8.1.2 Collected Material

I have used both published and unpublished material.<sup>5</sup> Material like essays, syllabi etc.were liberally offered

-----

1. cf also III.8.2.2.

2. cf Illuminative Evaluation, II.5.1.2.

3. cf II.5.3.1.;cf Appendix 8

4. cf II.5.3.2.; Appendix 8

5. cf III.7.1.



to me by the students. I also made use of verbally expressed opinions in improvised situations.

Additional material used in the case-studies are course subscription leaflets and papers, distributed to the PGCE dance students on the course and during teaching practice at their schools, informal talks and interviews with lecturers and tutors, teaching practice dance teachers, heads of dance/drama/PE departments of TP comprehensive schools.

As my focus was on the students I did not conduct official, structured interviews with the lecturers and tutors. I taped the students' interviews, after negotiation, and with their consent, of course. The first series of interviews was fairly structured, the second series fairly unstructured. The transcripts of the interview organisation and the used interviews are included in Appendices 1 -7.

## 8.2 THE POSTGRADUATE CERTIFICATE OF EDUCATION COURSE: BACKGROUND TO THE CASE-STUDIES

### 8.2.1 The Programme

The new PGCE course was designed for graduates from any degree-awarding institution with degrees in drama or performing arts, but it was also open to other graduates with particular interest in movement, dance or the theatre arts. The first priority mentioned on the course programme was to

"help develop practical approaches towards work with young people... children of all ages and abilities... Approaches to dance education were to be critically assessed... theories of dance teaching studied to enable the prospective teachers to have a thorough understanding of the nature and value of their work in movement and dance".

Opportunities to keep up one's own level of dance were mentioned.<sup>1</sup> As to the education component, the programme mentioned foundation, education and curriculum courses. The leaflet advertized Drama/English and Drama/Dance. My status as a researcher was manifold. During the first term of the course I established informal contacts, getting into the field and being around. In the second half of the first term I conducted interviews with the three dance option students and had informal conversations with the two lecturers responsible for the dance option.<sup>2</sup> From informal contacts at the institution the students knew me a little. Once a week I also taught an open class of modern jazz which the three students joined and attended regularly. Therefore, to observe a

---

1. Quotations from the advertising leaflet are not included in the Appendix for reasons of anonymization

2. for interviews, cf Appendix 8

position of 'neutrality' would have been inauthentic.<sup>3</sup> The title page of the leaflet showed a dancer jumping. This seemed to suggest the important place of dance on the course.

#### 8.2.2 My Role as a Researcher on the PGCE Course

To negotiate access I contacted the course tutor, Daisy, informally first and then saw her in her office where we negotiated access. I was granted free access (interviewing, participant/non-participant observation, videotaping), with the possible prospect of providing monitoring for this pilot scheme and in return for some choreographic work from me for the play at the end of the year. Daisy employed me to teach a weekly modern jazz class to the drama and dance students during the second term. Teaching as well as participant/non-participant observing before teaching practice involved me fully in the course. I really gained an in-sight, a sight 'from within'.<sup>4</sup>

During the students' teaching practice (TP) I visited their schools and observed their dance lessons. Before and after the lessons we had many discussions, talks, chats. The contacts were extended to meals in restaurants and invitations to their homes. My visiting their schools and lessons became an important feed-back and link for them since the dance tutor, Rose, fell ill during their second teaching practice and could not supervise. At least there was someone who knew their situation, their course, their problems. Due to these external conditions I became the person they felt they could talk and relate to about their teaching practice.<sup>5</sup>

— Additional organisational problems made this second term even more stressful for the students than teaching

-----

3. cf III.8.1.; cf II.5.1.3.

4. cf II.5.

5. cf II.5.1.3.



practice normally is.

Towards the end of the third term I was able to conduct further in-depth interviews with only two of the three 'case-study dance option students'. Time was extremely scarce because of students' essays, examinations, job applications etc. The interview with the third student could not take place during the course but only a few weeks after completion and examinations. At the time of this interview the student was already in the middle of preparing for her new post. Somehow, the importance of the PGCE course had already regressed. The interview was marked by a greater distance than the other two. I therefore decided not to use the second in-depth interview of this third student to maintain the time unit of the course.

This third term was marked by the preparations and rehearsals for the end-of-course-play. The main contact with the students was actual dance. According to the negotiations of access I choreographed some sequences for the play. This meant for me a greater involvement on the dance and drama option and the additional role of teacher/advisor/choreographer. At the same time it allowed me to have a rapport with the students through the practical activity of dancing and choreographing.- My task was to teach and drill the students to performing standard on equal par with their acting standards which were fairly good. Only a few of the dance group had previously performed dance. This meant very disciplined, demanding rehearsals. We all joined forces to put on a good show. This collaboration also contributed to my research really being conducted 'from within'. The 'view from within' hinging upon conscious partiality achieved through partial identification with the research participants<sup>6</sup> widened the consciousness of both participants and researcher. It was an authentic, intersubjective relationship. My conscious partiality

-----

6. cf II.5.1.3.

with the students made me vulnerable with regard to Daisy who seemed to identify me as somebody under her control, especially towards the opening night. There were tensions of power and control. My choreographic work was not acknowledged in the programme but subsumed under the drama work and name of Daisy.

Summing up, my roles on the PGCE course were those of observer, participant, teacher, choreographer, adviser, mediator, sounding board...and researcher. The situation allowed in some instances collaborative data collection<sup>7</sup>. This particular development or process allowed me gradually to become aware of specific questions. Thus knowledge was produced that induced changes: A process of awareness took place, for both researcher and research participants, acknowledged by all 'students' involved.-

Nevertheless I maintain that my 'identification' with the research participants was 'limited'<sup>8</sup>. I was at all times aware of the differences of age, experience, situation, language and culture between them and myself and of the different tasks we had set ourselves.-

The co-operation from lecturers and students was in almost all cases extraordinary (there were a few exceptions). The students tended to be more overtly friendly and less cautious or discreet than the tutors and dance teachers. I am deeply indebted to them for their help, commitment, and trust.

### 8.2.3 The Setting

The practical sessions took place in the gymnasium-cum-dance-studio (with a mirror and barres). A concern to everybody female was the lack of an alarm or functioning telephone for security. Often the gym was

-----  
7. cf II.5.

8. cf Mies, II.5.1.3.

dirty, there were no lockers in the changing room, the showers often did not work, musical instruments had to be dragged along numerous corridors and floors, or were locked up. Organisation at times was chaotic. It did happen that Daisy cancelled dance sessions (without warning Rose or students) in favour of drama, with the effect that the dance students felt second rate.-

The organisation of the teaching practice was lacking. Rose felt that the "students had been let down" in this respect. The small number of students on the dance option made it awkward to try out dance games or group dances.

In summary, this pilot PGCE had to cope with some handicap. The dance option provision with one day of teaching practice preparation and two weekly technique classes was modest. The facilities were sufficient but badly organized.



### 8.3 THE RESEARCH PARTICIPANTS

The core sample is a one-year Postgraduate Certificate in Education Course in Dance and Drama, option dance. The course was a pilot scheme with a small number of students on the dance option. In order to safeguard and protect the participants' identity (students and tutors) it may suffice to indicate that this course took place at a university institution in a large city in England in the early 1980s. The core research participants happened to be all female. They were lecturers on the PGCE course, PGCE dance students and their teaching practice teachers. Secondary school pupils' dance was observed in relation to the teaching practice of the PGCE dance students. The pupils' concepts of dance as such was not part of the research.

#### 8.3.1 The Tutors

##### 8.3.1.1 Daisy, the Course Tutor

She was the drama lecturer. She professed a child-centered approach in that the teacher should start

"from where the kids are at and then open out from there, extend their experience"

into other areas. She felt that the 'self-expressive idea' was "limited" because the teacher could "not impose in order to bring out further experience". The 'self-expressive' approach of teaching in her view did not stretch the pupils. She placed dance and drama within the arts. Arts to her had to do with more irrational, imaginative and emotional aspects. She held the view that in arts there was a process of

"transformation of in-takes, of impressions,  
not just a churning-up".

For children this meant to

"represent the world to yourself so that you  
can understand it yourself".

In educational terms her position was progressivist.<sup>1</sup> As  
to dance she felt that

"it should be for everyone".

yet she was critical of modern educational dance<sup>2</sup>  
because she felt that there was no improvement in skills,  
no progression possible especially for older children.  
Her reading list for both dance and drama included  
Langer's *Feeling and Form*, Nadel and Nadel's *The Dance  
Experience*, Laban's *Modern Educational Dance* and Ross's  
*The Creative Arts*.<sup>3</sup> In seminars these "key books" were  
to be presented and discussed by individual students.

In her view, TP in the first term was a survival  
exercise for the students ("how do I get through a  
lesson?"). In the second term, TP should have a more  
reflective component ("what is it all about?") and was  
to deepen the students' approach to teaching dance.

#### 8.3.1.2 Rose, the Dance Tutor

Her work was firmly-based on and rooted in modern  
educational dance/Laban. In the weeks before TP one  
morning a week was spent on practical work in the  
gymnasium/dance studio, one afternoon on theoretical

---

1. cf Educational Ideologies, I.3.

2. For modern educational dance, cf III.7.2.

3. cf III.7.

approaches to teaching dance either in the gym or a room. The course was intended as preparation for the students' teaching practice(TP).

In Rose's practical sessions, various warming-ups (e.g. body parts) and stimuli (visual, verbal, musical) were tried out. The method was always the same, structured approach. The lecturer set the task verbally, then the students first tried out, "invented" individually, then in a small group.

#### Rose's Lessons: Some Instances

For visual stimuli as a way into 'shapes' the students had brought pictures. The first one was a harvest. Lecturer: "Develop a small motive from it." Then: "Teach the motive to each other." Another picture showed a discus-thrower. Rose asked them to

"take the position and see how it feels!"

Then:

"More dance-wise now!"

whereupon the students started spinning, rotating, in a hectic way. Dance-wise to them seemed to mean 'faster' intensity increased by speed... Rose acknowledged their efforts and asked them to relax but did neither explain nor qualify what she meant by "dance-wise".

The stimulus 'discus-thrower' served as an example of work action<sup>4</sup>, of concrete life situations. This idea of work action then was organized into a group theme: a parade of various action movements. Rose hinted also at the possibility of 'the parade' as a warm-up.

Another picture showed women along a rope digging.

-----

4. cf Laban



This was used to explore the rhythm of the group, the feeling of the movement and the space pattern of a line.

A last picture showed a person in a kneeling position. A few students started assuming the position, but one challenged the 'mood' expressed by the others and the exact pose. She felt that the position was sad and that there was nothing to move to. The others thought that the mood was 'content'. Rose's comment was that static pictures demanded of the teacher extra material and explanation and that clearly expressed moods in pictures gave the pupils

"a clearer feel of what is required".

As an example of combined stimuli, the students were asked to first walk a floor pattern, with the didactical advice of starting work simply, then to take these floor patterns into the air, creating shapes. The next step was to choose a colour with its corresponding mood. She suggested purple for regal, blue for liquid or sky, green for growth, spring. The last step was to combine both stimuli:

"How would you alter your floor pattern if you added the colour blue?"

She suggested task extension by combining two moods (stimulated by colours, e.g. blue and red = purple) with the shape/floor pattern.

These few examples are enough evidence of Rose's modern educational dance approach with its specific vocabulary (effort, motive, patterns, shape, explore, etc), structured movement analysis and its aim of developing the personal growth of the child. Rose suggested for small children a highly structured approach; for older ones the task to achieve was to develop motives.

The concept/input of her approach started at an

abstract, theoretical level (floor pattern, explore the waltz step, develop a motive) to be transformed into practice. It appeared to imply translation exercises<sup>5</sup>, the translations occurring from one non-verbal medium (painting/photograph) to another (movement/dance). The last example of the photographs also made visible the implicit aim of modern educational dance: The pupils were to develop, qua movement, affectively. The approach was professedly child-centered<sup>6</sup> in that the pupils could at first come forward with what they saw/perceived but implicitly, they were taught transmitted affective 'knowledge',<sup>7</sup> their feelings being educated: Education through dance.

Towards the second TP, Rose handed out a paper on how to keep the "Teaching Practice File". Under 3) - daily lesson plan - it read:

"Aim: State clearly the objectives of the lesson. What is to be done and how./  
Introduction: Warm up and enlivening of the body./ Development of a Dance Sequence with appropriate movement training. New vocabulary..."

Going through planning a lesson with the students, Rose added to the warm up:

"...should be the preparation for what follows.. is often not vigorous enough, it should include mastery of skills and heighten the bodyawareness through technical skills, it should have a dance-like quality, not a keep-fit quality.."

As to the movement development, she stated that creative

-----

5. as exemplified in the visual stimuli examples

6. cf Rose: "...motives from children's ideas into groups..."

7. for the discussion of modern educational dance cf III.7.

dance first needed stimuli and advised the students to work in consolidated phrases of work on weight, time, space and flow (Laban's categories). As to the third point mentioned, the dance sequence, she was in favour of dance sequences if they built up memory and provided the satisfaction of completing a piece.

Rose asked during a theory session:

"What kind of dance can be termed educational?—  
What are the qualities specific to dance – why  
rather dance than other arts?....  
Intellectually, physically, emotionally?"

She did not give straight answers to her questions but explained that the reason why 'modern educational dance' had now become just 'dance': the best dance was the widest form of dance. Ballet and folk were

"limited in that they offered rigid  
structures. But any person can profit from  
modern educational dance independent of their  
shape etc."

She exhorted her students to aim for creative experience and to

"make it imaginative."

### Discussion

As already stated Rose's approach to dance in education was firmly Laban-based, with all the corresponding sets of values and assumptions. What was striking to me when re-reading my notes was the absence of the "why?" , the total absence of analyzing the implications and assumptions. It was important to state on the lesson plans e.g. the objectives, like "the waltz step", but what was hoped to be achieved by it or why it was thought important to teach that step at that particular point or time to this particular group was not asked. Equally,



some kind of dance was assumed to be educational, some not. But it was not made clear what 'educational' nor what dance was to mean in the context. It was equally implicitly assumed that dance was to be placed within the arts, and that dance contributed to intellectual, physical and emotional/affective development. By stating these qualifiers, Rose predetermined the answers: any thought that the development could be in another field (or that there was no development) was inconceivable. Although she explicitly advocated the widest form of dance for education her implicit concept was "closed"<sup>8</sup>.

It must be underlined though that her main task was to feed the students enough material to keep them going during teaching practice and that she had precious little time just to do that. But the issue of implicit assumptions and implicit ideologies on a teacher training course ought to be raised.— How valid is unquestioned didactic practice? This issue and relationships between theory and practice will be discussed in the case-studies.

#### 8.3.1.3 Lily, the Modern Dance Lecturer

Lily taught one session weekly to the drama and dance students. When she first met me she was unhappy about my observing because she feared that I might just copy her exercises. After I explained more in detail, her comment was:

"OK - dance needs prestige!"

The aim of these sessions, according to Daisy, was to acquaint the students with contemporary dance styles (Graham, Cunningham, Humphrey). These sessions were like ordinary dance classes in the private sector: teacher centered, the students facing the mirror, with the

-----

8. cf Mansfield, I.2.5.

average problems of students not following correctly, being in pain but trying (too) hard, the teacher being the virtuous-competent-sympathetic expert. Messages of Lily's were:

"Tire yourself as far as you can!"

"You have much more physicality now than when you started in September."

"Don't lose your confidence" (to a man)

"You want to do something to your body...go past that point - if you don't you're just kidding yourself!"

These modern dance sessions were rooted in the dance as art concept. The task was to form the tool, the body, to make it skilled so that later it would be able to do what it was asked to perform. The educational model was based on the traditional model of transmission of cultural knowledge.<sup>9</sup>

#### 8.3.1.4 The Researcher as the Lecturer: Modern Jazz Technique

I taught a weekly class of Modern Jazz from the second term on to complement the Contemporary class. I tried to familiarize the students with some typical features of jazz (syncopation, isolations, the broken front, intensity, emotionality, gravity, sharpness etc). Keeping in mind their teaching experience where they would have to cope with all sorts of children my main message to them was:

"Carry on, make mistakes but carry on! Try to have fun even if you think you are making a mistake! Try to enjoy what you are doing."

-----

9. cf I.3.; cf I.2.5.

I was quite demanding on that point remembering how important "performance" can be, in the classroom as well as on stage...especially for newcomers. My sessions were teacher-centered and conforming to the transmission model of learning/knowledge although I tried to break this by improvised contributions from the students. I also tried to convey to them qualities of jazz dance rather than set exercises in the hope that they could use these features and adapt them to the needs of their pupils<sup>10</sup> if they wished, in other words I tried to balance their personal needs with those of their teaching practice.

### 8.3.2 The Students

I am going to present case-studies which each concentrate on one of the three PGCE dance option students. For anonymisation I have of course changed their names, like the ones of the lecturers.-

PGCE case-study 1 will concentrate on the student Roberta and will explore problems of gender and related issues. Case-study 2 will concentrate on the student Gillian and will explore the issue of theory-informed practice and on dance education practice informed by concepts of dance skills. Case-study 3 will concentrate on the student Celine. Issues explored in this third PGCE case-study will be competence, performance and authority in relation to educational ideologies and concepts of dance.

#### 8.3.2.1 Issues of Case-Study 1

In the Introduction, chapter 1, I have stated that the issues of the case-studies have emerged or matured in the

-----

10. In at least one case, Roberta's, I have seen my 'dance material' being adapted and used during TP. I am glad that it has been useful.



work process and by re-reading the data. The issue of gender that will be explored and examined in the first case-study has emerged quite early on. Although I was interested but not solely focused on the issue of gender from the start - a first early case-study on adolescent girls and dance had been inspired by a dance performance put on by a girls' comprehensive school - I thought that Roberta's TP might provide me with interesting instances of boundary problems between dance and mime. I knew from her interview and from her verbal, spontaneous comments that the boys at her mixed comprehensive TP school did cause her problems. When I went to her mixed school I realized immediately that discipline problems with the boys during dance were the overriding ones. The boys' disruptive behaviour hardly allowed Roberta to develop her lessons. Their behaviour linked up with what I have found in the investigation of dance as a female activity and its justifications for inclusion on the curriculum.<sup>11</sup> The issue of gender was evidently one that I wished to explore in this mixed comprehensive setting. Gender therefore will be the central focus of case-study 1.

Related to the overriding issue of gender will be the issue of the utility of a dance-as-art syllabus discussed and approved on the course at the institution for the kind of setting Roberta had to teach in. And last but not least, related to the issue of gender will also be Roberta's personal development and "construction"<sup>12</sup> of dance and dance education: how did she see and make sense of her experience of TP and the whole PGCE course?

#### 8.3.2.2 Issues of Case-Study 2

The central focus of case-study 2 will be the relationship between theory and practice. Issues between

---

11. cf III.7.

12. cf Lyons, S, 1985

teacher technical competence and lesson content, and style, and the issue of examinations will be related to the central focus.

The theory-practice focus had already shown as a tip-of-the-iceberg problem in the first case-study when it became obvious to me that Rose's implicit ideology of education and Roberta's adoption of it did not really provide solutions for Roberta to cope with the mixed setting. The relationship between theory and practice had to be explored in the particular setting of the PGCE TPs.

Gillian's interview and in particular her essay, however, drew my attention to her theory which she said would inform her practice. I was intrigued by both interview and essay and therefore set out to explore this issue. I felt that the issue of Gillian's professed lack of technical competence might have an impact on her educational work. The construction of her dance self-image, i.e. her personal 'theory' might inform her educational practice. Open-ended teaching as an implication of Gillian's own feeling of technical incompetence suggested itself for exploration.

A third issue explored in Gillian's case-study will concern mock CSE examinations.— Gillian's TP school was the only one of the three PGCE TPs I concentrated on to prepare dance pupils for imminent examinations. The fact that these mock examinations were team-taught was a lucky coincidence. It provided me with the possibility of access. It allowed comparison of Gillian's theory-practice with that of her TP teacher. The exploration of the mock-examinations will take up the issue of examinations of the investigations into the history of dance in education.<sup>13</sup> — The issue of dance examinations is the more relevant given the fact that the

-----

13. cf III.7.6.



Baker Education Bill<sup>14</sup> will make examinations an even more important feature of the British educational system.

#### 8.3.2.3 Issues of Case-Study 3

In case-study 3 I will explore issues of competence, performance and authority, as emerging from the hierarchic relation between lecturer and student, between Rose and Celine. In their relationship implicit values, concepts and ideologies, and explicit teaching styles were obviously clashing. Their problematic relationship could not be reduced to just personal reasons. Celine was the only student on the course to have a degree in dance/performing arts. The lecturer's background was more education-oriented. I suspected that this difference might be a source of dilemmas. I decided to go a little deeper and try to find explanations - or more problems.

I have written the three PGCE case-studies in the sequence of their numbering. I hope that the inner logic of thematic development and related issues will become visible.- I shall attempt in III.12 to summarize the issues explored in the three case-studies as well as the findings of III.7. in relation to my aims stated in the introduction to Part III, in relation to each other and in relation to myself as the researching individual.

---

14. 1987/1988



## Chapter 9

PGCE CASE-STUDY 1: ROBERTA AND THE ISSUE OF GENDER

This case-study purposes to explore and to illuminate instances and issues that occurred during Roberta's teaching practice. But first I wish to give an account of views expressed in her first interview<sup>1</sup> in order to provide a background to what happened in her teaching practice (TP).

9.1 ROBERTA'S BACKGROUND

Roberta, mid-twenties, "working-class background with middle-class aspirations", had a BA in zoology. She did not want to teach zoology. On the grounds of her interest in movement (ballet as a child, gymnastics, later mime with some performing experience ) she was accepted on the PGCE drama/dance which she chose because of her "interest in people". Dance evoked in her images of contemporary dance whereas ballet was "frilly". She enjoyed vigorous, athletic movement, space, the discipline of modern dance. Her 'knowledge of dance' was not extensive (no books on dance, hardly any live performances, few dance styles experienced, a vague idea of Laban).

She had started her first teaching practice. By teaching dance she hoped to pass on the feeling of being happy in her body. She wanted the children to develop

-----

1. Appendix 3

some sense of "rhythm and aesthetics". She justified dance in education for its pure movement aspects, its beauty and as means of expression. Her intended method was "hopefully non-authoritarian" but fairly structured and disciplined. She hoped to work in groups "because of the social and communication". As to my question of technique, she thought technique difficult at that age whereas what she knew of 'Laban' she thought useful. Asked about her expectations of the PGCE she answered "not a lot", being quite pragmatic in that one just had to learn to teach in schools. She found Rose's ideas and input useful but regretted not having been taken to observe in schools before teaching practice because the theoretical basis, "the type of curriculum justification", "this idea of kinaesthetic development" "went straight out of the window" when she watched her first lessons. She was exhausted after teaching her first few lessons in mixed groups to the point of tears. Her time-table showed 20 lessons on four successive days of which she had to teach 15. Her teaching practice teacher (TPt) was pregnant. Her TP was in a fairly rough, mixed, comprehensive. First, she continued some work of her TPt, then tried out ideas of the Rose and developed them but was quite shocked at the difficulties children had with very simple movement tasks. She felt she had achieved something when she got the whole class to do something. She considered her dance technique sufficient for her task. She anticipated more problems in the mixed forms because of discipline problems with the boys. She questioned the value of "forcing children to do a subject" that carried such a "stigma for boys dancing" and she found herself "fighting a losing battle". She found it difficult to balance the lesson, keeping the boys busy without leaving the girls out. The other PE teachers at the school advised her on disciplinary measures but could not really help. She associated the discipline problems also with the more formal structure of dance lessons. She found it contradictory to ask the pupils to be creative in a formal, structured lesson. She also related the



discipline problems to the position of dance in schools. What was needed, according to her, (also to help dance teachers) was "respect": "The respect for dance in schools is slack".

She felt that no help came from the course tutor(Daisy) and that books e.g on lesson plans were of no help either: "...it all came up to yourself and your imagination". She realized that Laban analysis could not be used directly but had to be put into context. She needed ideas from persons, not books, from Rose, her TPt, other students to "feed" to her pupils.- She found the lack of organisation, administration and discipline at the institution irritating and resented wasting her time on the weekly day at the institution. She also resented the fact that Daisy had not acted when she saw Roberta's TP work load, that nobody so far had looked at her lesson plans which cost her so much precious time and that the lessons were not discussed sufficiently and in depth during TP. She felt disappointed and frustrated: " ..the whole thing has fallen flat."

Some problems emerging for me from this interview could be summarized as follows:

- \* - Dance needed more respect in schools
- \* - The theory of the course and books were felt inadequate to cope with school reality and TP
- \* - The TP conditions had not been checked carefully: administrative negligences, the undefined amount of lessons, the lack of skilled support at the school were criticized
- \* - The supervision and link/help from the institution was felt insufficient, the liaison with the school inadequate
- \* - The lack of introduction to school reality by ways of observing, getting to know
- \* - The gender problem was the most urgent one because of discipline

The gender and discipline problems were related to that



of "ideas": what to teach became a function of maintaining discipline. She needed ideas (input) for music, themes, material, story-lines etc. But she did not question her dance-technical skills and knowledge which she considered sufficient.

Roberta did not relate the discipline problems to questions of method; she accepted the disciplined structure of a dance lesson the way she had been trained nor did she question why or what kind of dance should be taught either to boys or girls. She did feel that dance should be optional but at the same time realized that the 3rd years co-operated because they had had to go through the first two compulsory years. Her educational concept is non-authoritarian, pupil-centered ("get them to work on their ideas") to a certain degree. Her concept of dance is based within the arts and coloured by ideas of physical strength (athletic movement) and well-being.

## 9.2 ROBERTA'S TEACHING PRACTICE: THE ISSUE OF GENDER

I now wish to highlight and draw on instances of Roberta's TP which I observed.

I visited her school seven times during the second term, spent about 15 hours there and observed 10 lessons of 50 minutes. Instead of describing the atmosphere in my words, I quote Roberta<sup>1</sup>:

"...chewing gum, hair tight back, no earrings, correct kit, I couldn't handle that as well. Registers, locking up.. At the end of the lesson you send them out back to the changing room, then you have to pack your gear, go back up, lock the padlock of the gym behind you, when you get up there, they are all standing there on the concrete floor until you have got there with the key to open the changing room doors, so when you have got two consecutive lessons it's so hectic..."

### 9.2.1 Lesson Example: Don't Do a Game, Miss

Thursday afternoon- the procedures had happened in the inverted sense from the description above - first lesson after lunch was time-tabled PE. For half a term, the second years do dance. The class was halved, six boys and three girls were present. Roberta had to exhort the boys to come before she could start the warm up with a bouncing exercise, followed by a mime step on place that created the illusion of walking. One foot remained fixed on the floor, the other one touches in front and at the back. The girls picked up the step quite easily while the boys muddled through it. One boy asked:

"How do you do it?"

-----

1. from her interview

keen to learn. Yet after another demonstration by the teacher he was still unable to copy the movement. - The next exercise was a sideways crossing step with a simultaneous armswing. As this step presented difficulties, the teacher accompanied her demonstration rhythmically with the words "swing, swing, over". the girls again did the step correctly and repeatedly. Only one of the six boys present was able to follow with the help of the teacher. The others started fooling around, calling for the teacher's attention. The last exercise of the warm up was a pivoting movement. The one boy who tried exclaimed:

"I can't do that!"

So far, the girls had executed all the tasks dutifully and in silence. They created no problem for the teacher and were left to their tasks. - The boys' concentration and good will had gone - the exercise did not appeal to them - Roberta made them sit down in order to stop them fooling around. She then told them the theme of the lesson. "a fair" and asked them their ideas on this theme. The boys shouted the girls down very noisily and came forward with their ideas and associations, like "knives" and "cars". Roberta, to set them off on their work, taught them basic circling travelling steps, typical of fair-grounds. One boy was asked to show some jumps. While he was trying out the other boys were running around. Roberta tried to discipline them by asking them to either join or get out, but with no effect. One boy who was explicitly sent away, straightforwardly refused to go and sat defiantly on a vaulting-horse from where he could look down on Roberta and the other pupils. Roberta resumed talking to the others and divided them into small groups with the task to explore the movements of a fair caterpillar. The boys imitating their 'leader' were sitting around noisily. The girls started timidly, trying out some movements. But Roberta had given up trying to make the boys dance.



She distributed sashes to the boys for competitive games of their choice. The girls, seeing that, sat down bored, one climbed up a rope. The boys did not even play although they had got what they had wanted. After a short row they sat down as well. Roberta now changed her attention to the girls. Three minutes before the end of the lesson, she repeated with the girls a Greek dance they had learnt the previous week and told the boys to get changed. At the end of the lesson a girl said walking to the door:

"Miss, don't do a game next week."

That was the only verbal comment from a girl during the entire lesson of which a whole three minutes had been devoted to the girls at the end!

#### 9.2.2 Discussion: Games! - Games? - No!

What happened during this lesson? Why was it so painful to observe for me, to witness it? What was it to the people involved, the girls, the boys and the student teacher? What was it to Rose who observed the lesson as well?

Rose's comment to Roberta was that with such a class one had to be bossy:

"Waste their time if they waste yours."

She said that first, Roberta ought to get the pupils' attention. The warm up should be vigorous, lively but simple and the set task short and simple so that "the boys can do it" and suggested a simple set dance. She said the set task was too difficult, the boys could not concentrate and were put off easily. She added:

"Poor girls don't get any attention."

Her comment was meant as a help- but was it? Her advice was individualistic in that the individual, i.e. Roberta, could and had to 'master' the situation, that the lesson had got out of hand because of bad management. This individualistic style linked up with her educational progressivist romanticist ideology<sup>2</sup>: it was just a matter of the appropriate teaching method to get the boys to develop "positively", i.e. to learn and appreciate dance and dancing. Her advice was consistent with a great many teacher training programmes and survival kits of teaching tips<sup>3</sup> which might actually prevent the trainee(Roberta) acquiring the conceptual tools to view knowledge as problematic and to analyse their experience in that light.

Her advice in fact was also sexist<sup>4</sup> in that she generalized from the experience of one section of this class, the boys, to create an explanation of the organisation of the class as a whole and therefore justified the distribution of advantages which arose from the gender division in this particular class. The girls had "behaved", had been up to the set task, but Rose's advice did not honour this nor correspond to her educational concept<sup>5</sup> but suggested measures which would punish the girls i.e. wasting their time as well and lowering the level of the set task, in other words, not stretching the girls, thus preventing "growth" and "development" of the girls.<sup>6</sup> This was quite astonishing given her expressed sympathy for the girls' situation.

During the preparational TP courses at the institution the reference to boys and what might interest them were

-----

2. cf I.3.3.

3. cf Skilbeck,1984b:240; for a discussion of Skilbeck cf I.3.4.

4. cf Roberts,H,1981:15

5. cf III.8.

6. cf I.3.3.

numerous. Themes such as Sirtaki, ropes, foot-ball match poem, work actions, Norwegian swing step, climbing etc were suggested as "good for boys", but not once was there a reference to a theme as "good for girls". Rose's comment and advice were meant as a help for Roberta to survive in this particular situation.

Rose's theory must be considered as problematic, especially in the context of co-education or mixed classes, because it seems to come down to "school/dance for boys".<sup>7</sup>

Learning from anthropology and sociology<sup>8</sup>, gender has been shown to be an important but often omitted or hidden factor. - The gender question was obviously crucial in this example of a mixed dance class.- I wish to draw on two authors for the notion of 'gender' and my use of it.

Mahony<sup>9</sup> refers to 'gender' as those characteristics of behaviour or personality said to be true, or appropriate to, a person's biological sex or the 'norms of masculinity and femininity'.

Millet<sup>10</sup> describes gender identity as

"...the sum total of parents', peers' and the culture's notions of what is appropriate to each gender by way of temperament, character, interests, status, worth, gesture, and expression..."

Taking into account Mary Douglas' dictum of the human body as a symbolic medium used to express particular

---

7. cf Mahony, P, 1985

8. cf I.2.2; I.2.4.

9. Mahony, P, 1985:55

10. Millet, K, 1971:53



patterns of social relations<sup>11</sup> Roberta's dance lesson can be analyzed in terms of gender identity expressed through bodily behaviour.<sup>12</sup>

### 9.2.3 Boys' Gender Identity or the Hidden Curriculum

What made the boys misbehave, what made them 'deviant' in that dance class? Why did they opt out? Obviously, what they were asked to do did not conform to their gender identity. The boys could not reconcile their male identification with an activity considered cissy for boys. One boy said in a group discussion about dance in school:

"Everything we do is so ... 'show-up'!"

To show-up does not agree with the boys' concept of masculinity into which they have been socialized. Showing-up has to do with expressing, showing oneself open. Gender stereotyping attributes the expressive to the female/mother role, the instrumental to the male/father role<sup>13</sup>. Roberta in her essay states:

"...in dance ...there is no distance between their real selves and the subject they are exploring."

This lack of distance between the self and the world, this lack of an instrument and its control leads to embarrassment for boys.<sup>14</sup> In that dance lesson, the boys

-----

11. cf I.2.2.

12. cf Poole,R, in Benthall,Polhemus eds,1975:101: "When the body is deployed as a sign it is as meaningful and as translatable as any correctly formed logocentric proposition.."

13. cf Wynn cit in Open University 14-15/1977:27

14. cf Gross,Stone in Argyle,ed,1973:360f argue that whatever disturbs control over self and the situation is

could not manipulate or control things. They were asked to be creative, to find ways of expressing the theme "caterpillars". This theme reflected Roberta's anxiety to present a theme that might be dramatic enough to attract the boys, a procedure that also reported by HMI on dance in secondary schools<sup>15</sup>:

"Words, stories and dramatic ideas were used more frequently with mixed groups and with boys' classes."

Notwithstanding this compliance by the teacher to boys' interest, the boys' socialization<sup>16</sup> and gender stereotyping drove them to be directive, technically competent, successful, aggressively "masculine" and to suppress overt emotion<sup>17</sup>, in other words not to be expressive. -

Boys are used to motor behaviour at the service of practical intentions, like in sports with a competitive element. Aesthetic, artistic, expressive qualities were not relevant to these boys.<sup>18</sup> What they were asked to do did not correspond to their life styles as adolescent males<sup>19</sup>; the kind of dance they thought they were expected to produce was too far away from their gender identity; they could not be motivated by the set task. These dance movements might have revealed their incompetence, lack of dominance and control over their bodies.. It is likely that they were even a bit proud of not being able to perform the dance steps of the warm up so that they were as unlike the girls as possible, thus

-----  
incapacitating and embarrassing

15. DES,1983:10

16. on socialization,cf Bernstein,1973:198

17. cf Chetwynd,Hartnett,1980:20

18. cf Willis, in Benthall,Polhemus eds,1975:247

19. on lifestyles,cf Hebdige,D, 1979



taking girls as the negative reference group.<sup>20</sup> As a solution the boys in this dance class opted out to engage in male stereotyped behaviour, namely aggressive, instrumental ball game and fighting. In that sense their opting out and misbehaviour was adequate to their gender identity. Dance being defined as female (and cissy) their deviance concerning this female activity lead them safely to a positive gender identity: to be negative to a negative/deficit activity assured the boys of their membership to the male-as-the-norm.<sup>21</sup> Since the boys could not or did not wish to 'just' express themselves, and had no instrument/object to control, they opted for a behaviour that at least guaranteed domination and control of the space<sup>22</sup> the girls and the female teacher's attention. The teacher's wish to prevent such behaviour by pacifying the boys made her choose themes which she assumed the boys would enjoy: vendetta, slave market, burglary, angular machine movements.<sup>23</sup> Roberta was fully aware of this<sup>24</sup>:

"I found it very difficult to balance a lesson so that the boys were kept interested and involved and working and the girls weren't left out. I tended to do a lot of tribal things, hunting, fights vigorous to keep the boys busy..."

"...the (2nd year) boys were 'set against' it (dance) from the very beginning: only when the material was heavily biased towards mime (and often incorporating some element of violence) would they begin to move. The consequent discipline problems were enormous: a great deal of my time and energy had to be directed at containing the boys and trying to win their interest. This resulted in a basic neglect of

---

20. cf Stanworth, M, 1981:43

21. cf Acker, 1980

22. cf Mahony, P "boys' monopoly of space", 1985:24

23. cf Delamont, 1976:64

24. cit from 1st interview and essay



the girls' needs, a factor I was constantly aware of and frustrated by."

In another observed lesson, the theme of vendetta caught the boys interest. But as Roberta, instead of letting them play around, taught them a set dance routine to it, their concentration did not last very long. They (those who tried) could not do it without copying from Roberta or the girls in front of them. The slave market theme, introduced by Roberta with posters of slaves in chains rowing, slave traders and slave drivers using their whips, bored the boys because of the slow music (messa luba) inviting slow movements. One boy suggested:

"Can we do comedy? This slave thing is boring!"

another wanted to do Greek dancing. These comments of boys during the observed dance lessons reflected Willis'<sup>25</sup> findings on motorbike boys' musical tastes:

"In a masculine, aggressive, extrovert world, relying above all on movement and confidence, the qualities appreciated in music were bounce, movement and exuberant confidence...Slower, more introspective qualities in music were either passed over or registered as 'boring'."

These two quotations contain the keyword to another strategy boys used for control of the class-room: boredom. According to Mandler, boredom results from a confirmation of expectations with high probability<sup>26</sup> In other words, the boys' expectations of dance in school were confirmed, with the resulting boredom being displayed and with ensuing deviance or withdrawal. Roberta had to constantly fight over PE kit, bare feet, sitting out etc of boys. Withdrawal and boredom

-----

25. Willis, in Benthall, Polhemus, eds, 1975:246

26. Mandler, G, 1975:245

displayed by boys during dance lessons could be equated with what Eggleston<sup>27</sup> calls "the negative pupil role":

"...the components are sharply different- those of boredom, frustration, a desire to impede if not to make the teacher's curricular role impossible. ...well before reaching the minimum statutory leaving age they have realized that, for them, the consequences of participating in the curriculum offered to them carry only the prospect of continuing subservience, deference and low status and commitment to a life of being on the 'receiving end'."

In this particular case, participating in the curriculum, i.e. dance, for the boys bore the additional subservience to gender hierarchies and meant a further step down the status ladder. In order to regain or retain their dignity and their power, the boys withdrew into deviant behaviour or 'underachievement' thus gaining control over the lesson. They thus asserted themselves and by doing so, satisfied their adolescent need for power and high status. To work to the teacher's satisfaction and the officially expected dance-in-schools standards the boys would have to deviate from the dominant anti-female values of their peer groups as well as from those of the general surrounding climate.<sup>28</sup> their deviance as affirmation of the norm and as conforming to the dominant male ideology.<sup>29</sup>

Gender was certainly an essential aspect for explaining the boys' misbehaviour. But monolithic explanations,

---

27. Eggleston, J, 1977:103; cf I.3.4.

28. e.g. the one at the school; cf Roberta's answer as to the needs of future dance teachers: "Dance needs to be accepted as part of the curriculum that has some respect"

29. since I am not familiar with the boys' background, streaming etc I do not go into the question of peer groups and subcultures.



like monolithic concepts<sup>30</sup> are not sufficient. One instance of the observed dance classes springs to mind where the gender explanation would not be sufficient. After an obvious failure to get the boys interested and motivated for the slave theme, Roberta sat them down to discuss discipline and their "lack of concentration" with them. A boy said that "cleaning windows", a lesson by the TPt Roberta had observed, had been fun:

"Cleaning windows...we enjoyed it!"

And Roberta agreed:

"You were serious, you could do it."

Work actions seemed to be accepted were part of 'normal' life, not out of the everyday. If that was 'dance' then they were willing to co-operate. Roberta related that work action to mime and argued that mime was related to concrete contexts and every-day reality whereas dance was "outside ordinary life" and that children knew that in dance they were "pretending". "Cleaning windows" was something the boys could relate to, they had observed it as a (male) professional activity. By pretending cleaning windows they could try out adult roles<sup>31</sup> and connect skills (i.e. cleaning windows) with occupational prototypes of the day. I think that it is this aspect rather than that of not-pretending which made "cleaning windows" appealing to the boys. If this is so, then this boy's statement could be indicative of where dance in education should try to go if it is to attract boys and make it a meaningful experience to them. By the same token the boy's statement might hint at the reasons why the other themes tried out by Roberta during her TP

-----

30. cf I.2.

31. on adolescence cf Erikson 1963, Lawton 1973, Hebdige op.cit.



failed.

The pedagogy prescribed by Rose to Roberta for her TP was alien to the boys (and girls). The boys had no sense of time, place or purpose regarding the 'educational' themes. Nor possibly Roberta. Her stress on discipline and structure (in her interviews, in her essay as well as in her contributions to the course at the institution as well as in our informal talks and encounters) seems to suggest that she was at least not very much at ease with the kind of invisible pedagogy with its implicit hierarchy and criteria practiced by Rose. To quote from her essay:

"...it is precisely because of the children's unfamiliarity with the medium in dance, that the lesson needs to be so structured. Only with such support can they feel secure and overcome any feelings of inadequacy and embarrassment."

To quote from her interviews:

"I would still work in a fairly structured way, have my ideas, put some of them forward, start with a basic warm up...disciplined to get them moving..."

and:

"Well, I still think the lesson has to be fairly structured..."

The control she seemed to be seeking was more of the instrumental order<sup>32</sup> teaching them set dances (Greek dance, Pink Panther routine, Vendetta routine). In general she fared better as to discipline when she taught set dances or made the students copy her steps which she

-----

32. cf I.3.3.; cf Bernstein 1977:37ff

invented as she went along<sup>33</sup>. This method was more in line with what she felt about dance: being happy in her body dancing. And it seemed to be more in line with the boys because of its visible criteria and hierarchy.

Eggleston<sup>34</sup>, paraphrasing Bernstein, states that if the culture of the teacher is to become part of the consciousness of the child then the culture of the child must be in the consciousness of the teacher. In the case of the PGCE, the culture of the pupils was not (sufficiently) in the consciousness of Rose nor could it be in the consciousness of Roberta<sup>35</sup>. Nor was the culture of the student in the consciousness of the lecturer. The hierarchy between Rose and Roberta implied that the culture of the teacher had to become part of the consciousness of the student – even if Rose's 'invisible pedagogy' concept indirectly may have contributed to and called forth the boys' disruptive and male stereotyped behaviour which Roberta as the student, Roberta, then had to contain and control.

#### 9.2.4 Girls' Gender Identity or the Hidden Curriculum

If the boys learnt (via the hidden curriculum) in that dance class that disruptive behaviour leads to teacher attention and classroom control and assertion of power – what did the girls learn?

During the described lesson they behaved( and were treated) according to the female stereotype, i.e. expressive, docile, manipulative and non-combatant<sup>36</sup>. They were good and quick at picking up the demonstrated

-----

33. a feature of the modern jazz classes at the institution: this shows how material of the course can be incorporated

34. Eggleston, 1977:19

35. because she had not been introduced to dance in schools before her TP

36. cf Chetwynd, Hartnett, 1978:20

steps and exercises. But they were not praised nor encouraged by Roberta for doing so: it was expected of them to behave and to do what they were told. Roberta was absorbed with disciplining the boys. All her attention was directed towards the boys. The girls were not singled out by Roberta neither for their achievement nor their good behaviour. Or if they did get some appraisal they got the same for better work. In one class I observed small groups showed their version of escape of the burglars to the music of the Sting. The task was to make the escape funny. The first group, boys, ran in a circle, imitating a motorbike pursuit, shooting and kicking. It was not very funny nor was the movement vocabulary very inventive. The boys did not make use of the music at all, to them the story line was more important. Roberta's evaluation was:

"very good...full of action..and very violent...good beginning!"

The second group showing their work were two girls. They started by showing the conflict of the two burglars having to decide what to do by arm movements and signs, then escaping in a car in a straight line, using the whole gym, putting as much distance between themselves and the house they had burgled. In the end they buried their haul. Roberta's comment:

"Great - I liked the idea of burying the treasure"

And turning towards me, she whispered:

"Even to get the girls to perform in front of the boys is an achievement"

It certainly was, given the boys display of lack of interest (they were sitting on apparatus, distancing themselves), and merited the more to be praised. Although the girls' version was more complex (they



observed the rhythm of the music while also sticking to the set story line) and elaborate (they used different levels, different space patterns), the appraisal they got only contained two qualifiers whereas the boys got four.

It has been found that in general girls tend to undervalue their achievements.<sup>37</sup> So, missing out on praise for achievement in a subject where success is possible must be hard. It must undermine self-esteem and will not very motivate for further ardent contributions. That was maybe a reason why Roberta felt that 2nd year girls did not like dance<sup>38</sup>. Not being singled out for attention by a teacher makes girls assume that the teacher holds them in low esteem<sup>39</sup> which is a form of devaluation. Roberta did not know their names whereas the names of some boys (those who misbehaved) were familiar to her. The girls were always addressed as a collective, not as individuals. Stanworth<sup>40</sup> contends:

"Teachers' slowness at identifying girls has strong implications for the comfort and involvement of female pupils for...pupils take it as a sign of approval if teachers know their names right away."

The described dance class was very likely to the girls yet another evidence of the boys' higher value (since they got all the teacher's attention) and conversely, their own lesser value and marginality. Its outcome contributed to and was produced by gender stereotyping. To quote Stanworth<sup>41</sup> once more:

---

37. cf Kant, L, in Skilbeck, 1984b:66

38. in her essay

39. cf Stanworth, 1981:37

40. Stanworth, M, 1981:24

41. ibid:47

"Classroom interaction - the way in which pupils and teachers relate to each other - does not merely transmit beliefs about the superiority of one sex over the other, but actively serves to give such a belief a concrete foundation in personal experience."

The dance lesson, so well intended by Rose who had provided the idea and Roberta who tried to put it into practice, taught the girls that they were inferior, worthy of less attention, space and praise. Experiences of this kind encourage according to Chandler, "depressed acceptance". Chandler<sup>42</sup> states:

"...the commonplace withdrawal from commitment and descent into triviality which characterises so much of the behaviour of the less articulate girl."

As the example of the burglar escape has revealed the girls were more articulate as to movement and non-verbal communication. But verbally, they were indeed inarticulate and silent. The boys did not leave them any chance. In the lesson of the fair ground, when Roberta asked about ideas concerning the fair. The boys shouted their ideas so loudly that any suggestion by a girl was inaudible. The boys behaviour made them inarticulate. This has important implications. In a lesson that set out to develop expressive movement qualities, in other words, to further pupils' creativity, girls were hindered at the very beginning of the creative process: interacting with the environment and having ideas. Peiser<sup>43</sup> states that creativity is only communicated if the individual evaluation and the anticipated reaction of the environment are positive. This means that in the case of the girls the environment was not positive, boys

---

42. 1980:86/87

43. Peiser, S, 1976:42ff



taking girls as a negative reference group<sup>44</sup> and monopolising linguistic space.<sup>45</sup> So, if girls were not completely discouraged right at the beginning by the boys, they had to put up some further energy to digest the set back and start afresh trying to execute the set task. Being silenced, becoming inarticulate then again led to Roberta not knowing their names: a vicious circle. All this may have contributed to the girls internalizing their experience of inferiority and marginalisation. When Roberta gave up and allowed the boys to do games the girls just sat down in boredom and withdrawal. Their boredom stemmed from the confirmation of expectations with high probability<sup>46</sup>, the confirmation namely that although they tried to be "good pupils" even if they were not so keen they had lost out. They had conformed to "good pupil role" by paying attention to the teacher, by working hard, by being polite, responsive, desirous of pleasing the teacher<sup>47</sup> with the only result of the boys getting the upper hand and the teacher's attention, once more. They learned in this dance lesson, again, their subordinate place. One could argue that the bias towards boys' themes allowed the girls to experience and explore themes otherwise not available to them.

The 2nd year girls did indeed perform 'boys'' movements like stabbing, shooting as a set task, but their movements did not show real involvement<sup>48</sup>, nor real identification with those movements.<sup>49</sup> It could be that the reason for the relative luke-warm stabbing movements of the girls was the girls' fear of unfemininity, of

---

44. cf Stanworth, cit above

45. cf Mahony, M, 1981:28

46. cf Mandler, above

47. cf Eggleston, 1977:102

48. cf Roberta's varying comment on the burglars' escape

49. whether this is good or bad is not the discussion here



going against their (internalized) gender stereotyping.<sup>50</sup> For the girls, the dance lesson proved counterproductive to the intended objectives of furthering interactive, interpersonal, communicative aspects of a progressivist, emancipatory education. The dance lesson reinforced gender stereotypes rather than reducing them. They knew the implicit hierarchy and the implicit criteria: gender had already taught them – and well.<sup>51</sup>

The subordination of the girls to the boys could be said to reflect the subordination of the woman teacher Roberta and the woman lecturer Rose to dominant male ideologies of educational contents and methods: all females involved shared a low status.

#### 9.2.5 Conclusion from observed mixed dance classes

In her essay which Roberta wrote towards the end of the course Roberta advocated segregation for the 2nd years because of the discipline problems she had encountered. (1st years were still just about manageable where discipline was concerned, but also heavily biased towards boys.) I quote:

"My main concern, apart from preventing the embarrassment of boys (girls also are acutely embarrassed sometimes), is to teach what is appropriate for the children. Since mixed dance classes of this age badly neglect the needs of girls, I would suggest that this provides a good case for the segregation of the sexes in years 2,3 and possibly 4. This would also mean that more time could be given to the breaking down of the male stereotypes which tend to predominate in mixed classes."

---

50. cf Byrne, E, 1978:45

51. further investigations into gender as a divisor instead/as well as class are suggested here concerning 'invisible pedagogy'/Bernstein/cf I.3.3.

Roberta's suggestion seems to be advocated by girls who claim that in mixed sets the boys monopolize the teacher's attention.<sup>52</sup>

The important report on *Dance Education and Training in Britain*<sup>53</sup> takes the opposite view and advocates positive action for boys' dance education on the grounds that exclusion of the boys from the areas of knowledge and experience of dance is a deprivation, especially in terms of personal and social development<sup>54</sup>. It suggests positive discrimination in the form of separate dance classes for boys prior to mixed classes so that the boys can "gain confidence in their movement ability..<sup>55</sup>. It also suggests the introduction of a comprehensive dance training in mixed classes from infant school through to higher education<sup>56</sup> to help reduce "the alienation boys feel from what often becomes a female oriented activity"<sup>57</sup>.

In the long term such a policy would undoubtedly improve the low prestige of dance by attracting more males, students and teachers to whom male pupils could relate to more easily. Stanworth<sup>58</sup> contends:

"..boys and girls feel more at ease with teachers of their own sex."

The HMI report mentioned above regrets that few boys have the chance to dance since hardly any single sex

---

52. cf Mortimore, J&P, *Achievements in schools*, ILEA RS 86:12

53. Gulbenkian Foundation Report, 1980

54. GFR 1980:57, /114

55. *ibid*, /128

56. *ibid*, /128

57. *ibid*

58. cf Stanworth, M, 1981:31



boys' schools have dance on their curriculum<sup>59</sup> and extremely few mixed schools offer dance for boys.<sup>60</sup> One reason for this lack of dance on the curriculum of a great many schools is the lack of male teachers involved in teaching dance.<sup>61</sup> Roberta's TP teacher was also in favour of male dance teachers, for the simple reason that female teachers still carry less prestige among male pupils and that a subject taught mainly by female teachers suffers low prestige because of this<sup>62</sup>:

"..there is among boys the strong consensus that male teachers are best, and female teachers, worst."

And since in Western society what is male is the norm, dance would move from the periphery to a more central position<sup>63</sup>, towards the place male activities usually occupy, if more males were involved. Yet it seems unlikely to me that a marginal school subject can bring about a major change in values and attitudes since "schools cannot teach what society does not know"<sup>64</sup>. It is more likely that if social attitudes do change, these changes will reverberate down into schools.<sup>65</sup>

Since my concern here is the micro level, the situation

---

59. less than 1% of boys' schools offer dance, DES, 1983:13

60. less than 6% of mixed schools offer dance to boys, DES, 1983:13

61. DES, 1983:13: "The number...is minute"

62. Stanworth, 1981:30

63. cf Cope, I.2.5.

64. Spender, D, 1982, chapt 1

65. McRobbie, A, 1984:143 notes that very recently, dance has become more popular among men under the influence of Afro-Caribbean culture and with the increase in dance technology (i.e. pop videos, walkmen etc), in other words, that change and innovation are occurring on the macro level; cf I.4, sociology



of dance in school, and in particular mixed classes, I want to examine the implications of the GFR suggestion about positive discrimination for boys in dance and then compare it with Roberta's suggestion of segregation.

What would the implications be for mixed dance classes? - Even if boys accepted dance as "normal" like maths, history or PE, their gender identity would overrule, i.e. boys would take the centre and girls would be relegated to the sidelines. Dance would be a further subject contributing to "Schools for Boys"<sup>66</sup>.

Boys would profit doubly: they would profit from a) a new area opened and available to them in the sense suggested by the GFR and b) they would experience yet another centre-stage position in a "conquered" subject where they could act as the "experts" (thanks to special training and to positive discrimination). Since boys easily occupy space, positive discrimination for boys in dance - and its central aspect of space - would provide them with yet another advantage over the girls in mixed classes. Boys tend to overestimate their achievements and rankings.<sup>67</sup> Whereas at present when dance is considered female the boys dominate by deviant behaviour, boys would dominate for reasons of ranking and "feeling at home" in dance as a male subject. The negative effects on girls would remain the same. In both cases the girls seem "to learn to lose"<sup>68</sup>. Both the actual situation evidenced in the observed dance classes and the GFR suggestion continue to undermine the principles of equality and to reinforce sex-bias and sex-stereotyping. To make a subject more 'male' in order to give it a higher status is just to entrench the low status of 'female' and of activities considered female.

---

66. cf Mahony 1981

67. cf Stanworth, cit.above

68. Spender, D, 1980

In the medium and short term, the GFR suggestion is neither to the advantage of girls nor boys because of teachers' attitudes which are also gender stereotyped<sup>69</sup> and cannot be changed so quickly. In the observed mixed dance classes, boys' themes dominated so that boys could not learn what to the GFR would be valuable to boys (i.e. expressive qualities). The GFR plea to attract boys to dance tends to teachers conforming even more to male stereotyping and to reproducing the norms, as was the case in the choice of themes in the observed classes. If dance were to contribute to boys' emancipation teachers would first have to be aware of and de-construct their own gender stereotyping so that the teachers' culture could become part of the pupils' consciousness.

On the grounds of the quoted literature, mixed dance classes and prior special training for boys contribute to a continued marginalisation and subordination of girls in mixed classes. Girls, in this light, need positive discrimination far more than boys and it seems almost cynical of the GFR to ask for even more space, time, attention and resources for boys.

Roberta's suggestion of segregation of dance classes grew out of her experience, was based on practice and seems well supported by the quoted literature on gender. Although it must be kept in mind that the gender divisions have structural roots that cannot be dissolved simply by a few changes to schooling<sup>70</sup> single-sex settings/segregation seem to offer a possibility to ensure that educational aims and objectives are not achieved at the expense of girls. Analogous to girls' higher achievement and greater personal motivation in single sex schools<sup>71</sup> segregation could benefit girls. If segregation were introduced for dance, segregation could

-----

69. cf Blackstone, T, in Mitchell, Oakley, 1976:215

70. cf Deem, R, 1984:90

71. cf Byrne, 1978; Mahony, 1985



also benefit boys in that they could experience and experiment in areas considered important by the GFR.

Segregation could also contribute to reduce gender pressures felt during puberty and adolescence.<sup>72,73</sup> Yet segregation could contain a risk of gender trap for boys if there were to be an overindulgence of "masculinity" by choice of masculine themes or styles. For girls, the gender trap could contain the risk of overindulgence in "femininity" with all its paraphernalia of 'beauty', 'feeling' and 'gentleness'. Segregation could enable the girls to develop more self-esteem, confidence and a sense of achievement only if the pedagogy of the dance lessons were of a restructuring or reconstituting<sup>74</sup> kind, i.e. if the traditional patterns of gender, of femininity and masculinity were disrupted.<sup>75</sup> Rose's progressivist romanticist ideology of education cannot take into account gender as a structural problem. Only dance syllabi, curriculum aims and objectives stressing emancipation, disruption of traditional gender values in direction of equality could counteract the risk of gender trap. The gender trap would not be as likely in segregated dance classes as might be the case for dance as a female activity for girls exclusively.<sup>76</sup>

In the following I am going to present a syllabus that was discussed on the course at the institution. It was a

-----

72. Sexuality has not been discussed because in the observed classes sexuality was not divorced from gender and sexual harassment was minimal, probably because the boys had chosen to act bored and withdrawn/distant.

73. for adolescence as a male construct cf Hudson, B, in Carter et al, 1984:35

74. cf I.3.4.

75. cf also Nava, M, in Carter et al., 1984:20ff

76. The reproach of advocating ghettoisation by advocating segregation just tries to hide the fact that dance in mixed classes, at present, is 'ghettoized' or marginalized anyway and not respected in schools.



syllabus elaborated by dance students of another institution and brought in by Rose for stimulation and reflection about dance in schools. The syllabus tried to orient future dance in schools, it had not yet been implemented. Was this a syllabus Roberta could have taken inspiration from for her mixed class problems?

### 9.3 A DANCE SYLLABUS FOR THE FUTURE?

The syllabus looked at dance as an art form within "the aesthetic discipline". The students wanted to emancipate themselves from the Laban approach because they found it limiting just to concentrate on dance as "an activity, as the participant's role" and tried to widen the field of dance in schools by looking at dance as a "province of art":

"How much more meaningful will this vital aspect of dance education be when it is viewed and seen in a variety of forms and contexts rather than purely through the eyes of 'modern educational dance' as we know it today....However, it is essential that the initial training in dance is a bodily one and when the appropriate feeling is achieved artistic presentation can then be considered and pupils challenged further."

The syllabus suggested for the 1st years to concentrate on body awareness. For the 2nd years, it suggested to develop more critical awareness, comparison, appreciation and interpretation of music. For 3rd years it suggested motif development and appreciation of dance in a theatrical context.<sup>1</sup>

Rose found this syllabus broader than the Laban-based one of Roberta's school. She also commented on the dance 0-level as very demanding because one<sup>2</sup> had

"to aim high to have it accepted by the academic authorities."

-----

1. I am not going to discuss here the full syllabus nor the dance-as-art concept which has been discussed in I.2.5.

2. cf PGCE case-study 1, Mock-exams

She appreciated this syllabus because it gave "the philosophy behind". A discussion arose as to whether "enjoyment" should also be put into a syllabus. Rose's comment to this suggestion was:

"This is so self-evident that you don't have to write it down."

The students found that enjoyment had much to do with the teacher's role. If the teacher managed to activate energy, enthusiasm would ensue. It all depended on the commitment of the teacher. If the teacher held back, the lesson would be a failure.

Could this dance-as-art syllabus orient Roberta's practice? The answer must be no. Roberta's problems were that the (male) pupils had not reached the stage of body-awareness because they did not want to. This dance-as-art syllabus addressed the problem of gender, of adolescence, of sociology of the body as little as Roberta's school syllabus. The syllabus, although broader in Rose's view, contributed nothing to solve Roberta's problems. Nor did the "philosophy of the arts/aesthetics behind" solve any of Roberta's problems of discipline or withdrawal<sup>3</sup>.

It was striking to me that the students brought up the topic of enjoyment in relation to this syllabus. This syllabus was informed or inspired by the then new tendency of academisation of dance<sup>4</sup>. Somehow, the students conceived enjoyment as distinct from knowing about dance<sup>5</sup>, as distinct from appreciation and analysis, which were important features of this syllabus. Enjoyment was felt as belonging to personal involvement,

-----  
3. cf "Poof's ballet" in I.2.5.

4. cf III.7.

5. as distinct from 'knowing dance': first hand, direct experience



dancing actively. This view was expressed by Roberta in the first interview and been called 'being happy in one's body'. The question arises now: Why was Roberta so frustrated and unhappy about dance in schools? She had committed herself, she had activated a lot of energy in herself, she had worked very hard, tried to involve everybody to make the dance classes enjoyable and yet that complete feeling of failure at the end...enjoyment was thought to be so self-evident and yet it had not happened. Why? Roberta might offer an explanation in her end-of year interview<sup>6</sup>.

-----

6. cf Appendix 4

#### 9.4 END-OF-PGCE INTERVIEW WITH ROBERTA

Asked about what she had learnt from the course and how it had influenced her self image, Roberta's answer was very firm

"...I have come to the conclusion that I am not a dancer and that I am frustrated."

She was very disappointed that the course had not kept the initial promise of keeping up dance at the students' level and that she had therefore not been able to improve her own dance skills and knowledge. In contrast with her views in the first interview, she now judged one's own dance level as paramount, not for artistic reasons but for self-esteem:

"I think the most important thing is to keep up dance at your own level...to have a daily class because it is also much tied in with self-confidence and self-esteem. Without that you can't go into schools to teach. Well, you can but you can crawl through it like I did.."

Roberta had "grabbed" all the material, all the themes available, had followed the school syllabus, had followed Rose's suggestions, had complied with what she thought was asked of her – and her TP had still been one continuing struggle and battle. The solution now to her seemed to be a higher technical standard, to feel competent. Her belief in her own technical competence had been shaken by a demonstration of dance CSE pupils at the institution. She found these girls better trained than she was herself. And her self-esteem had been shaken by her TP. At the outset so confident, very willing to do her best and have a go, Roberta now was very depressed and in low spirits. Her depression and discouragement contrasted very strongly with her first interview and with her view on dance which she still

held: dance then to her meant being happy in one's body, and now she expressed it in the words "vitality", "happiness". Again she mentioned "styles" of lively, participatory dancing. The verb forms Roberta used were in the present participle expressing activity, like "doing Folk dances". "Folk dancing", "children dancing". Her concept was very similar to the one of Blacking<sup>1</sup>: Dancing as 'praxis', as involvement, as communication: dancing as acting upon the world<sup>2</sup>. Roberta's concept of dance had to do with fun, pleasure and with people dancing and communicating, in a non-verbal 'discourse', their (sub)culture:

"...to get that feeling of muscles moving and to allow them to be creative and enjoy themselves and not to have to use their brains in the sense that it being a chore...hmm, because it's a pleasure in life or it can be."

By "chore" she alluded to the Laban-based work, which she found very dry, where children were given a verbal concept, like: "...here is a drum, here is a short, sharp effort movement" which they had to "use their brains" to understand and then transform into non-verbal, i.e. dance 'discourse', "a chore". The word "dancer" then, for Roberta, meant to be involved in the dancing in a phenomenological sense, doing it, and enjoying it. She regretted that during TP she could not work the way she would have liked:

"...one of my first approaches would be to go in and say "bring in some music you want to dance to which - you can't do that on TP - and let them dance to pop music for 8 to 10 weeks until they'd discover how boring it was and then introduce them to different ways...I think there is a very prevalent attitude at the

-----

1. cf I.2.2.: "...Their sensuous meaning to the human bodies that become involved in their sequence of non-verbal action"

2. cf Hall, St., 1981



moment that dance in schools means contemporary dance only, contemporary style only that you see in the theatre, well that is highly skilled technically and you can hardly expect children to dance like that, they are much happier doing fun things, and then show actual dances and using..hmm things like scarves and bells, rhythm..."

The approach Roberta suggested here was the child-centered approach<sup>3</sup> taking into account and accepting children's subculture. Her criticism of contemporary dance in schools had probably to do with forcing the children to do something she thought they would not like (and her fear of not being up to the task). Here again she was looking for dances where everybody was involved in the Folk tradition. Again: praxis/practice, active doing, dancing, without verbal task setting, cerebral input. The dance lesson she described as her most successful was one<sup>4</sup> where she taught the girls a Greek dance. The boys could join in on the condition that they tied a scarf round their wrists if they wanted to participate. Which they did. Roberta attributed the boys' joining in to the music accelerating and to the girls enjoying it visibly. This success was not due to a boys' theme or "little stories". Roberta had been fed up with the boys and decided to concentrate on the girls and teach them this dance. Roberta was certain that the lesson was successful because they obviously enjoyed it. She had managed to "make them want to do it", even the boys with their "social..indoctrination training...that dance is for girls". She had managed to make her culture - culture in an active sense - part of the consciousness of the pupils. She had conveyed to the pupils what she felt about dance and how she felt in her body when dancing. She had found a way to make the pupils "latch on" on a

-----

3. for functionalist or child-centered approach cf III.10.

4. which I unfortunately had not observed

few occasions. But her overall TP was such a struggle and battle that she was not motivated to teach dance. Her "way" did not correspond to the educational ideals of Rose, there was a clash of concepts and personal styles. To Rose, having the pupils dance for weeks to pop music was just not educational. The children had to "explore" new qualities, new concepts, extend their movement vocabulary etc in a way defined by the teacher. They were set a task which became a "chore" to them. One of the deeper reasons for dance in school being so 'educational' and little sensuous or even overtly sexual might be, as suggested by Macdonald<sup>5</sup> a question of power assertion. The quoted perfect participle of 'factlike' indicates that that body of knowledge is 'perfectum' - dead. Roberta's need and wish for vitality and praxis/practice went against school control and power. Rose's modern educational dance and the highly skilled (technique oriented) contemporary dance mentioned by Roberta conformed better to "factlike bodies of knowledge" and were thus better controllable. This was also evident from Rose's comment of O-level dance as satisfying academic criteria<sup>6</sup>. Roberta's successful dance class full of vitality threatened the hegemony of the verbal/intellectual and was therefore defined as non-educational<sup>7</sup>. In the case of Roberta, dance was taught as a co-optation to what was considered desirable educationally (factlike bodies of knowledge) and still treated as a diversion, as Roberta's answer showed:

"Dance needs to be accepted as part of the curriculum that has some respect."

'Education' had the cake and ate it, whereas dance gained neither cake nor weight. And Roberta lost her

-----

5. cf Macdonald, G, cit. III.7.

6. cf III.9.3.

7. cf Gramsci, chapter on education



self-esteem and her belief in herself as a dance teacher.

At the end of the PGCE Roberta attributed her feeling of failure and frustration to her technical incompetence, but also to her lack of educational training and competence. Partly she blamed herself for hoping to achieve competence in one year:

"...you can't expect in a postgraduate year to be taught the basics of a subject."

But she still thought she might have "made it" provided the institution had provided the dance classes promised in the leaflet. Dance to her was something alive, something needing to be kept alive, unlike academic knowledge:

"...it is physical. it's not like an academic thing where you can take it in and store it, you have to keep practicing it to be a practitioner..."

and<sup>8</sup>:

"I think I could have made it given a different course but then you see I don't think that she (Daisy) should have taken me on this course."

She felt that her preparation and training in educational terms had been inadequate:

"You've got to have the support of your tutor...and more theory, more actual discussions and dissections of lessons and what goes on in lessons and why you're doing it..I mean there was none of that..."

-----

8. She felt cheated in a sense because she had not been told before that she was extremely unlikely to be eligible for a dance job without a PE diploma or a drama job without a degree in English. At the time of the interview she was without any job prospect.



and:

"...you're supposed to be a practitioner and an expert when you go into school, so without...I mean, although the theoretical background doesn't necessarily come in overtly into a lesson. You should in yourself know what you are about and you can't do that without some theory..."

Her mentioning discussions of actual lessons and videos as means of learning seemed to indicate that by theory she meant theoretical analysis of practice, theory derived from and informed by practice. She was quite dismissive about the theoretical lectures offered at the institution before TP:

"...having attended lectures in the first term quite regularly and coming out thinking oh, I didn't learn anything, I just gave up going to them."

The theory offered in these lectures did not seem to inform nor help Roberta for her TP. That was why she stressed the uselessness of theory and books in the first interview. Her change of opinion concerning theory was quite marked in the second interview. Theory now seemed to her a means of clarifying "what you are about", a means to make sense of and inform your practice and of defining your identity.

Roberta's concept derived from these quotations was reversed from Rose's approach and concept of the institution: Roberta first lived dance and then tried to make sense of it whereas the course set-up and Rose's concept were ideological/theoretical: first came the theory which then would be put into practice. Roberta was not quite able to name her uneasiness and discontent and to label it. Roberta's pedagogy is akin to that of

the new sociology of education ideology<sup>9</sup> with its phenomenological standpoint and open-endedness. But her knowledge was not strong enough (nor had it been validated by some expert )to encourage Roberta to de-construct the dominant discourse of dance in education and thereby to offer resistance. Roberta did make a plea for what Mansfield<sup>10</sup> calls "an open concept" of dance:

"You can't really be pure about what dance is in schools"

or, in her essay:

"..dance can not be given a precise definition"

In fact, she did hint at a theory, that of the dialectics of doing and knowing for a better praxis/practice and for more realistic theories<sup>11</sup> of dance in education. Her essay was an attempt at formulating questions in view of a 'theory' informed by practice for dance. She drew on drama and on play for her statement:

"Much of today's modern educational dance in schools is concerned with giving children a 'movement vocabulary'-- of showing them the possibilities of movemnt as a means of expression, and as such can not be said to enter into the realm of pure play. When children are taught a particular dance sequence from a particular dance style, can they be said to be creating and expressing their<sub>12</sub> own meaning? The second kind of dance<sup>12</sup> rarely occurs in schools."

Roberta knew intuitively that she had touched upon

-----

9. cf New Sociology of Education, I.3.1.1.

10. cf I.2.5.

11. cf Mies,M, II.5.

12. which expresses a particular emotion like anger,joy

something vital for dance in education, for education in general, that of the first-hand, lived experience, of play/pleasure being anterior to rules and skills<sup>13</sup>. But being a student of dance in education, and a novice at that, her experience did not weigh very much. Her personal experience was judged according to established standards, those of the dominant discourse of dance in education which it did not satisfy. She had therefore to follow the set framework. Roberta internalized those values to the extent that she felt incompetent and therefore not even applied for dance teaching jobs.

Roberta's need for theory certainly was exacerbated by the little supervision she got during the course. Rose visited her three times in twelve weeks<sup>14</sup>. It was also exacerbated by the lack of methodology on the course programme<sup>15</sup>.

#### 9.4.1 Concluding Summary

In summary, Roberta's personal concept of dance did not change during the PGCE, was in fact corroborated by some successful lessons during TP. Her main problems were related to educational ideals and the problem of gender, which was not dealt with in depth during the course at all. Some problems stemmed from the lack of provision and organisation on this pilot scheme PGCE.

---

13. cf Blacking, I.2.2.

14. this was also due to Rose's illness

15. Rose deplored that lack as well



## Chapter 10

PGCE CASE-STUDY 2: GILLIAN - PRACTICE FROM THEORY?

In this case-study I wish to explore and illuminate instances and issues that occurred during the teaching practice(TP) of Gillian, relate them to Gillian's essay on theory and practice of dance in education and then discuss how they relate. Further issues in this case-study are single-sex education, peer groups, open-ended teaching and dance examinations.- But first I wish to describe Gillian's background. The description is mainly based on Gillian's interview.<sup>1</sup>

10.1 GILLIAN'S BACKGROUND

Gillian, mid-twenties, middle-class background, one parent in the teaching profession, had a BA in drama, a postgraduate course in archive studies and had worked with a theatre company. She came on the PGCE because she knew she had teaching skills and also because she felt that drama and dance needed to be taken into schools more. She felt that dance and drama were so closely related that they should be integrated more. In her view dance pertained to the arts and having to do with expression, self-expression, and she was therefore against dance as part of the PE department. Her practical 'knowledge' of dance was limited to a few classes of contemporary dance. She had a fair notion of dance styles like Graham and ballet. She was interested

-----

1. cf Appendix 5

in folk dancing. She went to dance performances and was quite familiar with the British dance scene. Ballet to her was rather too constrained, whereas contemporary dance appealed to her for its "gut" and because she could relate to it intellectually and emotionally. In Jazz she appreciated its humour, rhythm and fun. She had read books on dance. Her 'knowledge' of and involvement in dance was more appreciation-oriented than actual dancing.

She thought that dance in education was a means to channelling children's imagination, creativity, communication and expressing themselves with their body. - A good dance teacher, in Gillian's view, was technically competent and able to involve children imaginatively, to extract a lot of ideas and create an atmosphere of mutual respect. In order to achieve this a dance teacher needed good facilities and support from the school. Gillian was in favour of examinations in dance because it lacked and needed status but she advocated continual assessment rather than final examinations.

Gillian's TP school was a large girls' comprehensive with a fairly mixed intake of social class and nationalities. Like Roberta, she had started her TP at the time of the interview. Like Roberta. Gillian was frustrated about her time-table, but for the opposite reason: she was only allowed to teach one lesson of dance weekly because the TP teacher and PE head felt that Gillian had not sufficient knowledge of 'Laban'. So, Gillian observed a lot. Her TPt was classically trained and sat in on all of Gillian's lessons "for safety reasons and comment" (unlike Roberta whose TPt rarely sat in). Gillian structured her lessons according to the dance tutor's (Rose) suggestions. Her actual lessons were extremely short, 20 minutes, because of awkward facilities. Her warm ups had to be very short and had the function of introducing the one theme Gillian had chosen for the whole 1st TP for her 1st year class: criminals escaping. Her opinion of Rose was very



positive. Gillian appreciated that Rose had "geared" them to actually go into TP (unlike Daisy) because she was aware of what students had to face. Gillian said that Rose's approach was not clear to her and that she did not altogether sympathize with it.<sup>1</sup> Nevertheless Gillian was thankful for the practical nature of Rose's course and her hints, advice and suggestions because she experienced, like Roberta, that "theory goes to pot" when "you're in there". "Theoretical concepts and ideology" had no relation with what happened "in there" for Gillian. She experienced what Rose had predicted for all students on their first TP: it was all blurred out there... It was a devastating experience for her to go into her school, to be recognized as the student by the pupils and the staff, to have to find out how the school operated. Like Roberta Gillian was exhausted and depressed at the time of the interview. she had not broken into tears in class like Roberta. but coming home after school. Rose's praise and comprehensive comment on the observed lessons were appreciated the more. Gillian welcomed the opportunity to discuss and develop her lesson plans with Rose.

Gillian felt that she learnt a lot about herself in her TP. She overcame her fears and felt so secure that she wanted to tackle the task of teaching the older girls in the second TP. At the beginning she had felt technically incompetent. Her self-confidence grew because she was quite successful with the 1st years. She attributed this success to her choice of "trendy" music for her very first lesson. Her TP teacher normally used classical music so the girls really loved the difference and co-operated very well. Gillian thought that some of her lessons were good when the girls were productive and enjoyed it. Gillian then felt real pleasure and "a great

-----

1. In order not to preempt I did not probe her on what she thought Rose's approach was. I hoped that Gillian would, later on, talk about her approach in her own terms.



sense of relation".

Gillian was aware of a change in her teaching style and approach during her 1st TP. At first, because of her background, she talked a lot, explained verbally. She attributed this to her insecurity. Becoming more confident she talked less. Instead she used groups of pupils to show what she meant. The structure of the lessons became less set, less pre-planned. Gillian could allow more flexibility and was therefore able to integrate pupils' ideas and suggestions. Gillian had anticipated racial tensions but found the degree not worrying. Yet she observed differences in the dance styles and movement behaviour among the various groups. She was least complementary of white girls whom she thought rather vain. Observing her TPT's dance classes Gillian became sceptical of the TPT's work. She wanted to find out how the TPT would justify her teaching but was aware of the hierarchy. She feared that the TPT might guess that Gillian was critical of her work, approach and educational ideology.

Asked what she would suggest the PGCE should provide in future she queried the insufficient dance tutoring provided. One morning a week was not nearly enough. She also wished several tutors in order to get introduced to several methods, styles, techniques. She criticised the lack of exchange, discussion and evaluation of taught lessons on the Friday afternoon sessions and also Rose's absence on these occasions.<sup>2</sup> The fact that they had been insufficiently prepared and thrown in at the deep end, was quite appalling to her. She wished for further PGCEs a gradual build-up rather than a block of theory and a block of practice.

Some of the problems and issues brought up by Gillian in this interview could be itemized:

-----

2. Rose was only paid for Thursday mornings and partly afternoons. The students knew this and regretted the fact that the dance provision was so small.

- \* The theory of the course was unrelated to the practice
- \* The choice of the TP school was problematic
- \* Clashes between implicit ideologies of Rose and TP teacher
- \* Dance as a non-verbal medium: verbal versus non-verbal
- \* Problems of hierarchies of persons, subjects, styles of dance
- \* Problems of peer groups
- \* Problems of mixed racial backgrounds
- \* Problems of facilities
- \* Problems of streaming, examinations: dance for whom?

Problems of theory and practice of dance and dance education were related to hierarchies and values. Gillian had a lot of sparkling fresh ideas but felt technically unable to demonstrate and show. Her feeling of lack of dance competence was exacerbated by the omnipresence of her technically trained TP teacher. In return, Gillian started to question her TP teacher as to justifications and methods. Gillian used the lesson structure learnt and explored at the institution. This structure was familiar to her from drama. Gillian's concept of dance was within the arts, with key concepts of expression, self-expression and creativity. Gillian's concept of dance in education could be placed within the romanticist progressivist educational ideology based on psychological views of child development.



## 10.2 GILLIAN'S TEACHING PRACTICE: THEORY AND PRACTICE

I visited Gillian in her school seven times and spent altogether 17 1/2 hours there with her. In her essay, Gillian described the dance facilities and atmosphere of her TP school thus:

"Dance comes under the auspices of the P.E. department and is allocated the old hall which is totally unsuitable since not only do dinner preparations severely interfere with sessions, but it is a thoroughway during lessons with C.S.E.groups. The worst aspect must be the mushy peas, orange juice and other sticky substances which cover the hall floor each day after the morning tuck-shop and school dinner, cleaning also cuts down the lesson-time as the porters re-stack the many chairs, and goose-pimpled girls wait dejectedly."

### 10.2.1 Lesson Example: "Ritual Dance?" - "Snaky!"

Going into Gillian's school on a Wednesday after lunch I found out that Gillian's description was hardly an exaggeration, the metallic noise of the re-stacking of the chairs easily drowned the shouts, yells, laughter and comments of the 26 2nd year girls (top stream) who came to the old hall in dance wear. She told the girls to listen to the new music while taking the register to save time. The music was by Santana. Gillian asked the girls what the character of the music was. She summed it up as "snaky" to keep in mind for individual movement and as "beat" to keep in mind for the group. The warm up was not related to the music. Gillian made them be a small parcel, then rise up and stretch to the beat of the tambourine. Then she told the girls to hide the body parts she would call out: "Hide hands!" etc. At the call "hide bottoms" the girls burst out laughing. They obviously enjoyed this warm up.- The next task was to show "shapes". Gillian wanted three different shapes: a twisted shape, a spread and a tall-narrow shape. The



girls had to walk across the floor to the tambourine marking the beat and add the different shapes when Gillian called them out.. Then they were divided into groups where the three shapes had to be combined. Gillian called this task a "ritual dance". But the girls hardly paid notice to the theme; they had already started splitting into groups and trying out. Gillian had asked them to form groups of six, but that proved too great a number so she told them to get into smaller groups. Gillian walked round the different groups, talked to the girls, observed. Her concentration was visible, the girls worked concentratedly as well. Gillian's voice did not carry very well so she had trouble making herself heard. The chats, talk, voices of the girls drowned hers. But she did manage to sit them down in a big circle. The groups were asked to show their work. Gillian asked the girls watching to find out if the group used the music well. And turned her question into a statement: "how well they used the music". Gillian asked whether they had any comment to make. A girl said that the first group's work was all on the same level. After the second group had shown their work, Gillian asked if there had been any moments of stillness. After the next group, Gillian's comment was: "Did you notice the growing, the lovely winding..." Gillian then asked if it would be possible to make one dance with the whole class with these three shapes. The girls discussed the question. There was no pressure to come to a conclusion, to a decision. To end the lesson Gillian asked the girls if they would like to do their dance once more. They answered by a clear, keen "yes!" The Tpt went to one particular group to give them advice, which to me felt more like interference. It was the end of the lesson, the girls could not take into account her comment.

#### 10.2.2 Discussion: Snaky - yes! Ritual - no!

Rose who observed the lesson was very positive about this lesson; so was the Tpt. Why was this lesson successful? On what criteria was it evaluated and

assessed as successful? -

The lesson contained some elements of stimulating humour. The lesson was structured, a framework for the improvisation was provided by the steady beat of the music, a stimulus for the improvisation was the "snaky" quality of the music. Gillian was fairly firm, she imposed herself by clear task setting: "I want to see these three shapes", she set the task of travelling so that the whole space was used, the girls actually moved around, they created movements individually, they worked in groups where they had to 'communicate' and negotiate space, timing, levels non-verbally. During the 'performance' of the groups the girls watched very carefully, they had experienced similar movements and could therefore appreciate, could feel, were involved actively in, the presented work. They participated in that they formed a circle round the girls performing<sup>1</sup>. Their observation and appreciation was in a certain way a re-creation. By watching they were involved in the process of re-dancing because they had the direct knowledge, the first-hand experience<sup>2</sup> of their own dancing. The activity of watching the different groups could be termed "subject-reflexive"<sup>3</sup>: their watching was an on-going comparison and identification with their own work. Gillian wrote in her essay:

...they discover the many permutations of form that are possible and how differing content, emphasis, audience composition, context and ability affect the choice of form."

This was not the kind of spectator knowledge of the concept of dance as (high) art discussed earlier<sup>4</sup>. Since

---

1. alike Bejart's Bolero

2. cf Kramer-Lauff, 1978

3. cf Ross, M, 1978:123

4. cf I.2.5.



not just the 'best' groups were asked to show but the pupils could announce themselves there was an atmosphere of "solidarity within the community"<sup>5</sup> akin to the one of folk dancing<sup>6</sup>. The sense of community was heightened by the suggestion of making one dance with the whole class. Gillian's questions and comments contributed to keep the concentration up so that the class participated fully until the end.

All these factors and elements account for the reason why the lesson was considered successful by Rose. But I wish to go into issues and problems itemized above that struck me while observing the lesson. One of these issues is the link or relation between theory/ideology and practice/praxis.

In her essay, Gillian demanded of herself to be able to formulate the theory her practice as a teacher was based on. In other words, Gillian started off from a theoretical concept; her procedure could be termed ideological<sup>7</sup>. Following Bruner, she defined her concept of learning

"as means of arranging knowns and unknowns in equations so that unknowns are made knowable. I regard both drama and dance as performance arts...and I intend to illustrate my conviction that once their form and inherent structures (modes of discourse) are identified, it is possible for the appropriate teaching methods to be developed and employed."

Her professed approach was deductive, linear and systematic in that methods and pedagogy were deduced logically from the theory.

-----

5. cf Hargreaves, D, 1982:156

6. in e.g. Flamenco within the community

7. in contrast with Roberta's whose approach for dance in education was through the medium of her own, bodily experience



The task for pupils wishing to 'discourse' in dance then was to recognise that

"the performance art has an inherent structure, an alphabet of skills and facts which, when combined, produce a vocabulary and that, in turn, this vocabulary can be articulated into sequences, paragraphs - a language capable of conceptual and emotive discourse."

Gillian wrote that during her TP she found it essential for pupils to acquire the skills and technique that make possible

"the active use of the forms which the majority of pupils had come to understand at an unconscious level."

In other words, she wanted the pupils to assimilate in their personal bodies, to experience personally and make their own what unconsciously they already knew from the 'social body'<sup>8</sup>. The method for bringing this about was the arousal of interest in what there was to be learnt<sup>9</sup> which she achieved in this particular lesson by the element of humour at the beginning. She considered the acquisition of skills and technique like a formal apparatus imperative to "artistically expressive forms". But she was aware that technique had to be introduced gradually and imaginatively, "with the exploration of a theme" in order to avoid disinterest or frustration:

"Through the gradual acquisition of technique they can develop the capacity to effectively tap the full potential of the form for imaginative discourse."

---

8. cf Douglas, I.2.2.

9. an idea again based on Bruner

Technique, like words, was the tool to shape the outer form as an expression of the inner feeling. Gillian's concept of dance was that of the inner and outer, of inner feeling and expressed form:

"Drama and dance provide opportunity for imaginative pressure under which an unconscious emotional knowing is transformed into a created form. In this form it is possible for the child to recognise on a conscious and intellectual level what he (sic) already knows through experience."

Gillian's concept was influenced by Langer<sup>10</sup> whom she quoted.

I do not wish to discuss in general Langer's concept, but I wish to take Gillian's theoretical construct and apply it to her described lesson since she herself understood theory as guiding and informing practice. I want to raise the issue – and question it – of making into 'knowns' what previously were 'unknowns'. What were the unknowns? What did the pupils come to understand at an unconscious level through experience which then became conscious in this dance lesson? – Gillian had first analysed the music, she had defined verbally the quality of the music (a non-verbal medium). Then she had asked the pupils to hide body parts, in other words she had made them form shapes. Were these shapes unknown shapes made known? It seems doubtful. The girls did not see the shapes, they did maybe feel the shapes, but they were aware of hiding body parts (that was why they giggled), and not that they were making shapes. They concentrated on the body parts being hidden, not on the abstract concept 'shape'. What would Gillian have achieved if she really had got the girls to realise that they were making shapes? – Nothing new, I am afraid, because the girls knew very well what shapes were. If they had not known they would not have understood the next task – but they

-----

10. Langer, S, Feeling and Form, 1953



did!

The 'input' of the next task was verbal/conceptual again: the girls were to make shapes of a specific form, i.e. spread, twisted, narrow-tall. In order to perform this task the girls had to have previously acquired the concepts of 'shape', of 'spread', 'twisted' and 'narrow-tall', of 'travelling' in the dance context. Their understanding had to be at a very conscious level indeed (and not at an unconscious one at all) to make sense of the task. It was because they were proficient in the cognitive discourse of English/language that they were able to set to work. This class was a top-stream class. Top-stream pupils by definition had to be good at conceptualising and verbalising. They had conceptualised 'shape' prior to 'expressing' it via the tool of bodily technique of dance. The dialectics were inversed in respect to what Gillian's theory set out to achieve<sup>11</sup> What the girls really did was translate or transform from their verbal conscious knowledge into the non-verbal medium of dance by means of movements that came to 'their minds'. The movements were triggered off by the verbal stimulus. Did the 'unknowns' lie in the non-verbal medium of dance? To do that, according to the theory, the girls would have had to 'know' some technique prior to being able to give form to what they had to express. Was such a technique acquired by the warm up of 'hiding body parts'? Hiding body parts might have involved e.g. twisting movements, but certainly no spreading movements. I argue therefore that the girls did not necessarily acquire the technique claimed necessary during this lesson, before expressing the concepts of 'spread shape' etc. but that they could draw on the concept and express freely, spontaneously what to them meant 'a twisted shape'. The task gave them an opportunity to define or interpret or clarify their

-----

11. It is quite possible that this lesson might have worked less well with low achievers, given the fairly abstract task-setting.



verbal concept. But they did not need to do either of those possibilities. They could do anything and get away with it. They were familiar with the concept. They were not stretched.

This argument seems quite long and sophist. But it was essential to examine if the theory was really useful to the teaching and learning of dance or if students used jargon derived from the 'educational big guns' like Bruner to satisfy tutors (or themselves).

What in terms of learning did the theme of 'ritual dance' provoke or evoke? Naming the theme occurred after the girls had divided into groups and set to work. They were into it before the theme could have influenced their dance. The context for a ritual had not been created, the task 'shapes' being by no means sufficient to create a ritual. What the pupils really did: they responded to the music, to a non-verbal medium. The task of 'shapes' allowed them to explore and to respond to the music within a framework. The task was a pretext that allowed them to enjoy themselves, to enjoy their sensuous movements, to be sexual in a safe context<sup>12</sup>. The task provided a kind of restricted area within which the girls felt safe to experiment and dance, a feature discussed by Gillian in her theory essay:

"I am an advocate of ...structured improvisation...since 'freedom of expression' is paradoxically seldom achieved without imposing restrictions to ensure the acquisition of the relevant skills."

I want to argue that in the case of the lesson discussed, the verbal tasks were the restrictions that ensured freedom of expression of what the music evoked. The relevant skills acquired had obviously much more to do

-----  
12. cf McRobbie, in Carter et al, 1984:145; cf I.2.3.; I.2.4.

with being sexy, articulating femininity<sup>13</sup> than with the arid skills of various 'shapes'.

Gillian acknowledged and conceded implicitly in her remark of " how well they used the music" that she herself had abandoned the verbal theme of 'ritual dance' as she saw that the girls related to the music instead of to the verbal theme.

Was it a good lesson? On what criteria? I agreed then with Rose (and I still think) it was a good lesson – but not for the reasons exposed in the essay as the underlying theory informing practice. It was a good lesson to me mainly because of the atmosphere of shared experience, shared dancing and shared watching. The girls got positive response and praise, the girls watching were set questions which helped them see their own work in a different light and under a different aspect. The lesson was successful not because of the theoretical assumptions and concepts (shared by Gillian, Rose and/or the TPT), or because the girls were trained conceptually (i.e. their top-stream training). It 'worked' because the girls instantaneously reacted to the music without being told to do so explicitly. The piece *Black Magic Woman* by Santana is a very compelling piece of music with its mixture of strong beat, breaks and sensuous pulling melody. The girls seemed to respond to that. The music invited them to be sensuous under cover of arid concepts like "shape", and did they grasp the available occasion rarely offered in schools! – Would the girls have responded as freely to the music as they did under cover of an arid task? From the observation it seemed clear that they did respond to the music, some had started before they could even hear the verbal task.

Why did Gillian, the teacher, choose the task of shapes instead of asking the girls to express their feelings and

-----

13. cf Hudson, B, *Femininity and Adolescence*, in Carter et al, 1984



improvise to the music straightaway? Gillian was embarrassed about her seeming lack of dance competence. She felt that she 'had not got it'; she felt that her body was too weak, that that was the reason why she did not look forward to jazz at the institution. Jazz was not her kettle of fish. She was not free enough to dance sensuously, in a jazzy way, as suggested by *Black Magic Woman*. It seems a fair speculation to say that Gillian used an arid verbal concept as a cover and protection. She knew she was intellectual and kept to it. Happily for her, Rose was similar to her in that respect.

Gillian's stated theory, in itself very coherent, logical and convincing, turned out not to deal fully with practice, with reality. There was a gap or even a clash between what she stated (her theory of practice) and what she did (her theory in use). Her concept was a construct that complied with the dominant 'discourse' in dance education: dance as expressive art and self-expression, education encouraging active assimilation by exploration and discovery of what the teachers define as worth discovering.- These aspects of progressivist romanticist ideology of education were 'on Gillian's programme'. Gillian knew and had defined what the pupils were to discover: they were to discover what a twisted shape, a spread shape etc were. In that sense her pedagogy could be labelled transmission pedagogy. The girls had to learn the knowledge previously defined by Gillian as the learning objective. She had decided that the knowledge "shapes" was 'educational' and therefore worth transmitting to the girls by creating a learning environment (i.e. discovery method) favourable to this learning task. The child-centered approach was more a method of teaching to transmit the concept than a real question of content. But, as argues Goodson<sup>14</sup>

"..what is decided at the preactive stage of curriculum planning is commonly contradicted

---

14. Goodson, I, in Whitty, Young, eds, 1976:129



and subverted at the interactive stage."

The girls indeed subverted the theme of 'ritual dance' by using the set task as the outer frame for their sensuous interpretation of the music. The lesson was a success also because it allowed this subversion or deviation tacitly. The fact that Gillian 'switched' on to the music meant that her pedagogic focus shifted from a decision divorced from the girls to the interactive situation where the girls were involved<sup>15</sup> By subverting the transmission task (ritual dance) the girls managed to create a situation which, when planned by the teacher, is referred to by Eisner<sup>16</sup> as "expressive outcomes":

"Expressive outcomes are the consequences of curriculum activities that are intentionally planned to provide a fertile field for personal purposing and experience."

And Gillian was flexible, sufficiently imaginative, open and quick enough to allow such "personal purposing and experience". - I would argue that the girls learnt to combine sensuous inviting movements with restricted-closed ones to music. This was certainly not what Gillian had planned nor what Rose hoped the girls would 'develop'.

The difference between what Gillian stated (her theory of practice) and what she did (her theory in use) in this instance illuminated and were an example of creation of meaning in contrast to 'objective truth' being sought in the examination of dance practitioners' experience and practice.<sup>17</sup>

But why had Gillian thought of 'shapes' and 'ritual

---

15. cf Goodson, I, ibid:133

16. Eisner, E.W, 1979:103

17. cf II.5., research methodology

dance' as worth 'transmitting' to the girls in the first place? This question begs me to analyse the lesson content and subject matter and leads me indirectly to the problem of competence.

### 10.2.3 Gillian's Dance Technical Competence

Gillian said in her interview that from her background she tended to be verbal. To get something across non-verbally was more difficult, especially when she felt insecure. Gillian felt safe in the verbal medium.

At the institution, Gillian was introduced to modern educational dance inspired by Laban's movement analysis. Rose's course was structured along the different kinds of stimuli, e.g. verbal stimuli, visual stimuli. Rose was not a trained dancer herself. She had a B.Ed from a college of education, not a university. Typical of the training in former colleges of education was its concentration on pedagogy as opposed to subject competence<sup>18</sup>. To Rose, dance was a means to education: education through dance. She therefore considered experiencing shapes etc important<sup>19</sup>. Her vocabulary was entirely Laban-inspired<sup>20</sup>. Gillian in turn picked up the modern educational dance concept and vocabulary on the course at the institution. 'Ritual' was discussed in respect to music choice (like rhythm), 'shapes' was a theme filling a whole Thursday morning. Gillian wanted the girls to experiment with open and closed movements<sup>21</sup>. When Gillian chose 'shapes' for her lesson, she reproduced unquestioningly what she had been taught. She could identify with Rose and her work because she, Gillian, herself was not a trained dancer, something she

-----

18. cf Hargreaves, D, 1982:192ff

19. cf On modern educational dance, III.7.2.-3.

20. cf also PGCE case-study 3, III.11.

21. cf her essay



was acutely aware of during the whole course and especially during TP. She thought she was not qualified enough to be on the dance option. Remarks of hers like:

"I am terrified, you know better what I show than I"

during a warm up she taught to the other students on the course. Or:

"I guess my body is too weak, I give the impression of not enough strength...I am motivated but...I guess I'm not enjoying it because I can see what it should be and can't do it..."

When asked if she would come to the technique class. What she said about children in the interview could be interpreted as a hidden statement about herself:

"Without learning they find it an embarrassment to use their whole body...a crippling factor if people don't learn to express themselves with the whole body."

In a contemporary class I observed I saw her wince as she forced herself to do a Graham floor exercise for which she did not have the necessary technical basis and which she could not possibly do correctly. She tried very hard but was critical of her technical competence. A blow to her physical self-image was inflicted on her by her TP school who refused her more than 1 weekly dance lesson on the grounds that Gillian was not technically trained and therefore not competent.<sup>22</sup> This situation made her so

-----

22. This informal statement by Gillian made in the PGCE changing room contradicts her statement in the essay where she gave the reason as not having x-numbers of years of Laban-experience. This contradiction stemmed from the pressure she was under for good marks for her essay. She feared that if she really wrote about her TP as negatively as she felt Daisy would downgrade her essay. Cf Duelli-Klein on 'relative truths' and the



unhappy that she exclaimed just before her 2nd TP:

"I'll never teach dance - I don't enjoy it!"<sup>23</sup>

or, more depressed:

"I can't see myself as a dance teacher."

All these quotations seem to indicate that Gillian had all the better reason to reproduce Rose's pedagogical, non-technically oriented dance concept considering her own, resented lack of technical competence. Gillian reproduced Rose's dance educational concept, because it was the only system available to her but was at the same time critically aware of it. She would talk about "next week's 'theme'" tongue in cheek. Gillian had to opt for Rose's concept also for reasons of providing herself with a clearly defined personal image viv-a-vis her TP teacher. Her TP teacher had worked as a professional/commercial dancer and had, as a mature student, obtained a B.Ed. Gillian thought of her TPt as technically very competent and worried about her observing during team-teaching (tt) in case it showed how technically badly trained Gillian was. In the interview Gillian introduced her TP teacher as follows:

"A young girl who was only in her 2nd year in the school...a trained dancer, classical....very intimidated by the head of PE, she is in a difficult position."

Although Gillian worried about her technique and TP teacher's critical eye she was quite condescending about her TPt's teaching:

-----  
complexities of a person's reality, Feminist methodology,  
II.5.1.3.

23. again in contradiction with her essay, cf again  
II.5.1.3.

"The problem can only be that you are technically over-aware...can be restricting factor...from watching the teachers at this school...this teacher has classical ballet training, gives them only classical music, alienates the pupils, expects too much in the sense of being able to count the music, things she has taken for granted because she has been nurtured on them."

Towards the end of her 2nd TP Gillian was quite upset that her TPt only wanted Gillian's imaginative ideas for tt but refused to give Gillian any other function. She did not even want Gillian to go round the different groups during tt. The more her TPt stressed the importance of technical competence the more Gillian worked in a markedly different way, in Rose's way, to distance herself from her TPt whom she did not consider educationally sound<sup>24</sup> and whom she did not really respect:

"...they needed a more clearly defined structure for security, since they were used to being 'choreographed on' by their regular teacher."

- a teaching approach that found Gillian's disapproval<sup>25</sup>:

"With dance it was tempting to introduce a short taught sequence when ideas were short..."

... a sweet tiny revenge of a TP student at the bottom of the hierarchy...but also indirectly a comment about herself: Gillian would not teach even a short sequence for fear of showing her technical incompetence. This feeling of lack of technical competence made her afraid of teaching the big girls. - It was interesting to see how Gillian faced the task. The more she was successful with her dance classes the more she felt confident about

-----

24. cf interview

25. cf her essay



teaching the big girls. Before the 2nd TP she arranged to teach older years as well and was extremely unhappy when her TPt cancelled that arrangement and allowed her only two weekly dance classes for her second TP.

Similar to Roberta, Gillian saw technical competence as an asset and necessary for self-confidence. But unlike Roberta Gillian was successful with the teaching approach she had introduced at the institution so that her concern about technique and technical competence diminished. Unlike Roberta, Gillian could turn her lack of technique into educational adequacy by means of theoretical justifications and theories.

The last part of Gillian's described lesson was about watching, showing and appreciating the groups' dances. In her interview, when asked about what she understood by dance her first answer related to other people's concepts (movement versus dance). When probed which dance forms she was interested in most - 'dance forms' being chosen for its vagueness - she interpreted it as a question concerning styles and performances (Dance as performing arts). It was therefore not surprising that an important part of her lesson was devoted to 'dance appreciation' and analysis. -

I am going to focus on that part of Gillian's lesson now.

#### 10.2.4 Dance as Practice: Showing and Watching

Gillian's lesson was successful for various reasons, but certainly for this last part. It may have fostered aesthetic appreciation<sup>26</sup>. But what the lesson certainly achieved was what Hargreaves calls "dignity sustained by

-----  
26. The girls mentioned 'level' which was an indication that they had been trained in Laban-movement-analysis style 'dance appreciation'



collective strength"<sup>27</sup>. If watching the groups' work had only produced knowledge for knowledge's sake, i.e. to be knowledgeable in dance and dance appreciation and speak the jargon, then watching would only have meant for the girls that they should discover, clarify and comprehend knowledge pre-defined by the teacher (or curriculum) as desirable and 'meaningful'. Participation and co-operation were the necessary ingredients towards creating solidarity for emancipation. The subversion into open-endedness combined with Gillian's shift provided the girls with a sense of dignity and pride in their dancing, i.e. their expression.

Reminding myself of my purpose I ask myself what I can learn from this lesson so far? From looking closely at class-room situations like the one described I find that the 'big guns' of dance education and educational theory do not come close to reality and that better and more realistic theories are needed in the dialectics of doing and knowing.

So far I have examined questions of method, competence, content and concepts. A further important aspect as to why this dance class was successful may be gender. Gender had been shown to be an essential problem in PGCE case-study 1., III.9., which was located in a mixed school. The examination of problems related to gender in a single-sex school might contribute to qualifying - or accentuating - findings of PGCE case-study 1. Gender is the next issue I am interested in and which I want to explore.

#### 10.2.5 Girls in a Single-Sex-Comprehensive

Gillian made a point in the interview that caught my attention. Having Roberta's discipline problems in mind I asked Gillian if she had any. I quote her answer:

-----

27. Hargreaves, D., 1982:19f; cf I.3.4.3.1.

"Other classes...their insolence...it has a lot to do with their streaming, in a comprehensive, the intelligent girls the higher up they are in intelligence, the more they seem to accept rightly or wrongly the restrictions, and, in a way, the best work, in some instances, comes from the low ability class where there is so much imagination they don't restrict their personal response to things. But, hand in hand with that goes great discipline problems....they should mix the classes up far more than they do.."

I only observed one top-stream class (the one already described) so I was badly placed to compare. It seemed in a sense logical. Intelligent girls learn the norms and rules faster<sup>28</sup>. And one social rule of Western society, in particular England, is not to 'show' oneself, to negate one's body<sup>29</sup>. Gillian found that the low ability groups were more imaginative, less inhibited physically. This may have been the case because they were less affected by the strict, "rule-governed systems"<sup>30</sup> of the logos-dominated verbal discourse. Positive discrimination in dance for the top-ability streams seems quite a striking and surprising argument against the Newsom report view which has suggested<sup>31</sup> dance as a worthwhile activity for girls' low-ability groups.

Evidence from recent research seems to indicate that girls rate scholastic success higher in single-sex schools<sup>32</sup> compared to mixed schools where dating, popularity, physical attractiveness and clothes are stressed among adolescent girls<sup>33</sup>

-----

28. Miller,A, Das Drama des begabten Kindes, 1981

29. cf I.2.2.; I.2.4.

30. cf Arnheim,R,1967:32

31. cf III.7.

32. cf Shaw,J,cit.by Deem,R,ed,1984:XIV

33. cf Weitz,Sh,1977:87



The next section is also about achievement, but about achievements assessed by examinations.

#### 10.2.6 Mock Exams: Mocking Whom?

Before I am going to describe elements of a mock CSE mode 3 dance examination lesson I observed I first describe the TP teacher's and school's points of view.

##### 10.2.6.1 Mock-Exams: Background Information

At Gillian's TP school dance was optional from 4th year to 6th year. It was a CSE dance examination subject. The TPt explained to me that in her view, mode 2 CSE dance implied a "higher level" whereas mode 3 took into account the "disappointing technical abilities" of the children. Mode 3 allowed the children to choreograph and express their own feelings whereby they revealed their dance abilities. Mode 3 was adaptable to the needs of the individual school and teacher.<sup>34</sup> The TPt told me that her school's CSE stressed creativity and sensitivity to movement, accompanied by appreciation and critical appraisal.<sup>35</sup> Her approach was

"to train the girls to develop technically enabling them to present the work they want to show,...to widen their vocabulary of dance."

To me these sketched-out aims sounded Laban-oriented though the TPt said that she felt "uncertain" about Laban's movement analysis because to trained people (like her) it was an "artificial imposition":

"If you are trained in dance you naturally know this (movement analysis). If you haven't

---

34. For a theoretical discussion of examinations, in particular mode 3 CSE dance, cf III.7.

35. Unfortunately TP teacher did not let me have a copy; she said that the Head of dance had not okayed it.



trained then Laban is a good guide to draw from."

She thought that both approaches were viable: the approach to bring out mood by movement (dance technique), and the approach to bring out movement by mood (modern educational or 'creative' dance).

Keeping this background in mind I now turn to observations made during a 5th year mock dance exams lesson taken by the TPt and Gillian.

#### 10.2.6.2 Mock Exams

The introduction of dance examinations had been justified in terms of the examinations providing an opportunity to excel and gain recognition for those with ability and interest in the subject<sup>36</sup>. The term 'ability' was not limited to purely technical aspects, and what the HMI discussion paper on dance in secondary school<sup>37</sup> stated in its conclusions, namely that

"Pupils, recognising their own physical achievements or limitations, can discover in dance capacities for expression not necessarily dependent on a high level of technical skill. From this type of discovery comes a confidence and a capacity for self-criticism."

could be seen as valid for CSE mode 3 examinations. Mode 3 was initially seen as providing possibilities for replacing the traditional conception of the curriculum<sup>38</sup>, i.e. the academic, humanist one with its defence of selected, traditional, elitist values, standards, and its dominance of the written. Mode 3 gave relative autonomy to the teacher. It was set up by the teacher and

-----

36. cf White, J, Dance examinations, III.7.6,

37. DES 1983:14

38. cf Whitty, in Barton&Meighan 1978:136

examined by the teacher and a moderator.

As to CSE mode 3 dance examinations, the HMI<sup>39</sup> reported in 1983:

"The CSE Mode 3 syllabus made considerable demands<sup>40</sup> on pupils both in practical and written work. The weighting given to the practical component varies. Practical work is assessed throughout the two-year course and there is marked similarity in the choice of important areas to be judged - movement ability and skill, creativity, sensitivity of response, the ability to clarify and structure dance and to share awareness of others in group situations. The work culminates in the presentation of a prepared solos, and small and large group dances for the final assessment. In addition pupils have to show their technical competence and creative ability by responding spontaneously to challenges set by either the teacher or the moderator....The extent of the demands for written work varies..."

In Gillian's TP school, according to the TPt, the CSE mode 3 dance examinations were set out for the pupils to choreograph and express their own feelings so as to allow assessment and evaluation of their dance abilities, the importance of creativity for the CSE examination being stressed. One of the TPt's objectives for teaching CSE dance was also to foster constructive criticism in the girls.

At the break before the mock exams lesson Gillian and I were standing next to the record-player while the TPt was distributing task sheets for the girls who did not present their solos. Gillian was making the point to me that dance for the 1st years concerned body awareness, and should be fun whereas 4th years should already be at

-----

39. DES, 1983:12

40. This recalls the problem of a low-status subjects trying to be accepted by the gate-keepers, i.e. the problem of having to prove its respectability by making the subject academically acceptable; cf White, J on O-level dance, III.7.6.



the stage of conscious body awareness. When the TPt sat down behind a table, very business-like, Gillian sat down next to her. I tried to keep a low profile, sitting at the corner of the table. I saw that Gillian had copied from the TPt a grid for marking. This grid consisted of 5 components of equal value: -choice of theme, -interpretation, -composition, -mastery and -presentation.

The girls who were not presenting their solo were sitting on the floor at the side, watching. There was much running and coming and going on at the opposite side which served as a way through<sup>41</sup>. This certainly impaired the girls' concentration during their solos.

The procedure was as follows: The girl presenting her solo would announce the title of the dance and the music, then perform her solo. Titles such as "Is it love you're after?", "Lady" were chosen by the girls. After dancing her solo the girl would then be asked to stand or sit opposite the examiners at the table to be questioned. This last part of the mock exam consisted in what Blacking<sup>42</sup> calls 'forcing dancers to communicate and explain in a medium other than dance', i.e. the girls preparing a CSE dance solo were requested to express themselves verbally about their dance. The pupils were expected not only to dance and to communicate non-verbally but also to be 'knowledgeable about' their solo.

One girl, after her quite nice though not profound dance called "Maybe next time" was asked by the TPt:

"Did you develop motifs of movement?"

The girl seemed to chew the word motif; she did not seem

-----

41. cf Gillian's description of the facilities

42. cf I.2.2.



to like it. Was it a strange word to her? After some hesitation she returned the question:

"Motif?"

The TPt gave an example of a motif, explained, upon which the girl said, somehow impatiently:

"No - I just did it!"

Further questions from the TPt included:

"Which lyrics did you relate to best? - How did you go about the dance?"

The girl was obviously not very talkative. The questions did not appeal to her or made not much sense. - the TPt, covering her marks, asked me about my assessment of the solo. I politely declined any assessment on the grounds that I was there as a mere observer.

What was the nature of the TPt's questions for the girl to respond so poorly? Was she just "thick"? Or did these questions convey something hidden, something the girl reacted to by hardly responding? And did the TPt's questions correspond to her views concerning dance CSEs expressed in our talk? What did her questions imply? - And last but not least: What did these mock exams achieve? Who profited from them?

It was striking to me that the professionally trained the TPt did not question the girl on movements and that she did not set off from the experience of watching the solo nor were her questions related to the dancing, the process. They were related to the created dance, the product. She did not start from the girl's experience. She did not really communicate having shared the dance with the girl. She did not give a critical appraisal of the dance nor her appreciation of it. But her questions were in no way constructive. They concerned lyrics,

motif, method.

The questions of the TPt were teacher-centered. The teacher was the knower. The pupil was expected to reproduce (if she had not forgotten, as in this case) what the teacher had put in the pupil's head. The rules and structures, the usage, were defined as meaningful by the teacher to the pupil. The pupil had to echo what the teacher had defined as meaningful. The learning process was one-sided, from teacher to pupil. There was no real communication on equal footing, the mock exam question was a reproduction of the one-sided flow of information.

The TPt's approach regarding the mock exam questions could be typified as a structural approach.<sup>43</sup> The TPt's questions concerned knowledge of rules and of structures of dance. She examined the pupil's dance competence by reference to dance usage and its rules, its 'grammar'. She reverted the CSE mode 3 "symbol"<sup>44</sup> back to the traditional conception of examinations,<sup>45</sup> back to curriculum and examinations as "facts"<sup>46</sup>.

The instance of the TPt asking 'objective' questions was an instance of what is described by Hargreaves<sup>47</sup>:

"Lip-service continued to be paid to other kinds of abilities, such as artistic-aesthetic, affective-emotional, physical-manual and personal-social; but it could be little more than lip-service because they had a secondary

-----

43. I am following Salimbene, S, in Forum, Vol. XXI, Jan, 1983, No 1:4, in analogy of languages, although I am aware that dance is not congruent with a language. The distinction between structural and functional approach seems useful here, though.

44. cf Whitty, Mode 3 as a symbol, 1985:122

45. cf Classical humanist ideology of education, I.3.2

46. cf "curriculum as practice" versus "curriculum as fact", Young, M, cit passim in Whitty, in Barton/Meighan 1978:136

47. Hargreaves, D, 1982:55f



position in the curriculum...the intellectual-cognitive is evidently most adequately assessed...Again, the hidden-curriculum message to pupils is clear: only knowledge, skills and abilities that can be readily measured...are to be treated as really valuable."

The message of this mock exam to the girl must have been that since she did not 'master' a particular body of formally learned knowledge involving art/dance, i.e. dance educational jargon, she was not intelligent. Hargreaves contends<sup>48</sup>:

"The more profound and more disturbing message is that the very concept of ability becomes closely tied to the intellectual-cognitive domain. 'Intelligence' becomes defined as the ability to master the cognitive-intellectual aspects of school subjects."

Presupposing Gillian's marking as valid, the girl earned her best component mark for interpretation. In other words, her creative ability was appreciated to be high. The girl with her dance "Maybe next time" - in hindsight may be a visionary title? - had shown interest, ability and creativity. But she still did not gain full recognition. She did have dance ability, e.g. for interpretation. Mastery of movement was an equal component of the final mark. In this observed instance technique (mastery) and analytical verbal discourse were what counted.

The hidden but confirmed message was that to be able to create a dance expressing a theme, or a feeling, was not appreciated by the teacher as sufficient, was not valuable within the hierarchy of the school. The purpose of CSE mode 3 dance examinations, i.e. to provide an opportunity to excel for pupils unable to excel academically, was subverted.

-----

48. Hargreaves, D, 1982:60



Why was the TPt anxious to stress the cognitive, "intellectual" aspect of dance?— In our talk the teacher had said that mode 2 had a "higher level". she had also mentioned the low level of technical skills of the CSE students. Taking into consideration the need for status<sup>49</sup> of dance in general and at the school in particular, the TPt's behaviour was in line with teachers of low status subjects<sup>50</sup> To have examinations in dance meant to her (she taught dance exclusively) to have pupils with 4 lessons weekly on the exam option, to gain status by having examinations in the first place and by 'intellectualizing' and 'academizing' dance and the examinations. To this professionally trained dance teacher who "knew" dance, Laban movement analysis provided the (arid) theorizing that promised higher status qua examinations. Her conflict may also have been that she tried to be 'modern dance educational', i.e. analytical, in order to avoid being 'professional'. The HMI report contends<sup>51</sup>:

"Those trained specifically in dance may have a different perspective of the subject content but they do not necessarily put this in the educational context."

What had been striking to me at first view — the dance practitioner asking structuralist approach questions — revealed itself as implicitly very coherent at close scrutiny. The professionally trained the TPt experienced dance as (high) art. Technique was important to her. Her concept of dance was elitist, as is the ideology of the humanist educational ideology with the concurrent elitist examinations. The mock exams seemed mainly to serve her needs and those of her low-status subject. In order to avoid any misunderstandings I do not assume that

-----

49. cf Gillian's interview

50. cf Goodson, 1983

51. DES, 1983:13

all examinations are unsound. The point I do want to bring to the fore is that the TPt's implicit views and approach were in contrast to her explicit views expressed in our talk. Her theory on CSE mode 3 examinations did not correspond to her practice.

I now want to describe and discuss Gillian's approach concerning the mock exam questions and examine whether she copied the TPt's examination approach or whether her approach was contingent with her professed theory.

Gillian whose marks I could see (4 for theme, 5 for interpretation, 4 for composition, 3,5 for mastery and 4 for presentation) asked questions in relation to her marking. One set of questions related to the weak points, i.e. mastery:

"Do you feel happy with your jumps? - Why did you mainly use movements on the floor?"

These questions were answered by the girl, they were specific. They were asked in a way and a language the girl could respond to. No, she did not feel happy about her jumps because she felt a bit clumsy and she used a lot of movements on the floor because of the word "failure". The other set of Gillian's questions related to the strong points of the dance, i.e. interpretation:

"Did you first have the music or the theme?"

The girl had started at "failure" and worked from there to "next time".

Gillian's questions corresponded much more to the CSE examination description of the DES paper than the TPt's. She wanted to clarify movements. She started her questions from the girl's dancing (process), she started from the girl's praxis/practice. Her questions, methodologically speaking, were child-centered. The girl could relate to these questions. In contrast to the TPt



who tried to extract from the pupil the *how?* of the dance, Gillian's questions concentrated on the *what?*. Her approach could be called functionalist<sup>52</sup>. She set off at the communicative use of the dance for the girl. What did the girl need in order to communicate her idea or concept of "failure"? The girl's dance competence was used for effective communication during her performance. Asking questions about the strong points Gillian nurtured the girl's self-esteem. The girl was not made dependent on the 'knower' but was the one who knew what she wanted to express. The questions allowed a sharing, and communication on a nearly equal footing.

Was Gillian just a very good teacher *in spe*, the 'born teacher'? Being weary of monolithic explanations, I suggest that, apart from her teaching talent and her drama experience, Gillian could identify more easily with the pupil. she was more in the consciousness of the pupil than the Tpt because she felt like a pupil/student of dance herself, lacking dance (technical) competence.

By asking that kind of question Gillian was faithful to the professed progressivist romanticist ideology of education based on discovery learning and teacher role as guide. In the instance of her questions the mock exam filled the function of feed-back, for the teacher as well as the pupil.

In conclusion, this instance of the mock CSE mode 3 dance examinations has illuminated problems of dance as a non-verbal medium within a verbally oriented examination system. Problems of teacher training and awareness have been highlighted. The conclusion in this respect is that teachers teach what they have been taught<sup>53</sup> even if they are teaching in a school with a different educational ideology and a different examination syllabus. In this particular instance of "maybe next time" the pupil

-----  
52. cf Salimbene, S, cit.above

53. cf Salimbene, S, Forum, cit above:7



involved did not profit as obviously from having examinations at all as the teacher and the subject, given the hierarchical structure of schools and 'meaningful' knowledge. The mock exams seemed to be mocking the pupils, if anybody.

### 10.3 CONCLUSION: THEORY AND PRACTICE

This case-study has attempted to illuminate issues that combined educational theory and educational practice, both at the tertiary and the secondary level of maintained sector education. Discovery learning professed in the progressivist romanticist ideology of education has been shown to fall short of educational practice needs and of the needs of the pupils, in this case all girls. There has been evidence of differences between professed theory and actual practices, and of hidden, unaired clashes of educational ideologies between the TPt and student, and between the TPt and Rose.

Concerning the PGCE course, the course did not provide the sort of theory needed to teach dance, e.g. sociology of dance, and to make sense of the teaching experience. The student taught what she had been taught – and was lucky. She taught what she had learnt in drama combined with the little knowledge she had acquired on the PGCE course. As to dance practice her technical incompetence hindered her subjectively and personally but not educationally, whereas the TPt's technical dance competence hindered her educational competence in the professed progressivist romanticist ideology.

The next chapter will be looking at a third student, her TP and TP school, and focus on technical and educational competence, and on hierarchies in education and training.

## Chapter 11

PGCE CASE-STUDY 3: CELINE - PROBLEMS OF COMPETENCE.  
PERFORMANCE AND AUTHORITY

In this third PGCE case-study I wish to explore and illuminate instances and issues that occurred during Celine's teaching practice (TP) and relate them to problems and issues concerning hidden (implicit) and overt (explicit) values of competence, in regard to the student Celine and the dance tutor Rose.

The introductory interview with Celine had to take place in two parts because of schedules and time pressure. The second part took place after Celine had finished her first TP. Views expressed already took into account her experience as a student dance teacher.

Before describing two of Celine's TP-lessons I first intend to draw on my data to find out about her concepts of dance and dance in education.

### 11.1 CELINE'S BACKGROUND

Celine, mid-twenties, had a BA honours in Performing Arts. She had taken ballet classes and "other techniques" from the age of six onwards. Her personal experience of dance was the most extensive of the three PGCE case-study students. She was on the PGCE course because BA honours work with kids had awakened her interest in teaching and because she was interested in psychology and philosophy. She had chosen dance and drama because these were her BA honours subjects she thought she was most



knowledgeable in. When asked about her expectations of the course she answered swiftly that she had to (and wanted to) be impressed. As to her personal understanding and liking of dance, Celine qualified the various dance styles and techniques: classical dance was royal, strict. "rigorous training with beautiful results":

"I love it, it dominates my natural dance style...soft, gentle, romantic.."

Jazz, tap and ethnic were rhythmic and impressive, whereas she was critical of creative dance. Tap and jazz were her favourites. She mentioned contemporary only in passing.

When once discussing a particular modern dance performance we both had seen she said:

"Contemporary dancers are not artists, they are technicians...They are just interested in themselves, they don't give to the audience, it's not art how they perform...nice choreographies but sloppily performed."

She seemed to appreciate ballet because classical dancers "gave to the audience" whereas contemporary dancers were concerned with themselves, concentrated not on the audience but on the dancing as something implicitly worthwhile.

Celine placed dance within the performing arts. Her curriculum option essay was on the educational value of the performing arts. To dance meant to perform or work towards a performance, with the idea of an audience to look at the dance and the dancers. Her argument for dance as an art form ran as follows: Art is, like life, an experience, and it is only through the actual experience that the true meaning in art can be truly

understood.<sup>1</sup> In other words, to understand dance one must practise dance. Celine was convinced that only knowledge 'from the inside' provided the right experience and understanding. That was why she advocated learning one particular dance style thoroughly. From this thorough knowledge of one style only could spring appreciation and understanding of any other dance style, be it "educational or Gigaku". To underpin these statements in the essay she referred to professional dancers confirming that view. To be a dancer was equivalent with knowing one's technique, with being proficient at and skilled in a particular technique and style. She advocated "specialised physical movement training" which she equated with "acute kinesthetic consciousness", dance being<sup>2</sup>

"..the most ideal (physical movement training), as the body is the instrument of dance, and an end in itself..."

But the body was not only the end in itself but also the tool. Celine wrote of the body and its physicality "as a result of emotion": dance as the outer, physical expression of emotion.<sup>3</sup>

Celine's concept of dance was the concept of dance as high art and aesthetics.<sup>4</sup>

In educational terms, Celine's dance concept pertained to the humanist ideology and its correlating values of instruction, skills, conformity, obedience and discipline.<sup>5</sup>, its transmission pedagogy. A dance style

-----

1. In her essay on educational value of the performing arts

2. In her essay

3. cf I.2.5.;cf Langer,S.,cit.III.10.2.

4. cf also Aspin, ibid

5. cf Classical humanist ideology of education, I.3.2.

was to be reproduced by means of technical exercises: reproduction of dance and dance styles became reproduction of culture.<sup>6</sup>

As to the educational value of dance, Celine professed a populist view:

"Really and truly we are all artists of sorts."

Dance, as pertaining to the arts was hoped to play a fundamental contribution to culture and education:

"Making the arts once again, a fundamental part of both culture, and education, will enhance not only our personal potential, but our academic one also."

The arts and dance were seen to be subservient to personal and academic achievement. Celine justified dance in education in terms of self-awareness, growth, therapeutic effects, experiential knowledge, social interaction, self-discipline, collaboration and balancing the academically biased curriculum. According to Celine dance developed sides in the human being that were neglected in the present school system. She felt that dance could benefit the academically less able children and provide for them a subject to "shine" and to be successful in. That's why she thought dance had a place particularly in comprehensive schools.- Celine saw in dance a kind of panacea. Her justifications were a reiteration and a mixture of justifications of the various dance educational concepts.<sup>7</sup>

Celine thought that children ought to learn to dance first, ought to be introduced to various styles and a wide movement vocabulary before being asked to analyze their dancing:

-----

6. cf Bourdieu, P., Passeron, J.-Cl., 1977

7. cf III.7.



"..you ought to learn to dance first, at least up to 4th year, and then, when they have a wide idea of dance and a wide movement vocabulary of movements, styles and techniques, then you can start analyzing...the general idea about dance education is to make them think about what they are doing but I think you have to make them think in a creative way first before you can make them think in an analytical way."

She claimed that a good dance teacher had above all to know the techniques s/he taught. Children liked to see a dance teacher who was better than they technically, who 'could do it'. Celine advocated a general dance style in schools that appealed to the majority of pupils. She mentioned body awareness, awareness of space, relationships to partners, to shapes etc. She thought that a good dance lesson ought not to be too specialized, with general conditioning, general exercise, "interesting ways of working" and to enjoyment. Asked about how to introduce dance in schools her idea was to connect it to other areas the children were already 'aware of, e.g. poetry, and take them to see dance companies". Although she said that everybody was an artist of sorts (populist or progressive, romanticist ideology of education) to dance was to practice a style (though general) but implying technique. To take children to dance performances and to read them poetry as a way in were further indications of Celine's understanding of dance as an art form, and with standards of excellence.

Celine was in favour of assessment because she thought it gave the dance pupils an extra qualification. Continual assessment for practical subjects was seen to provide information about child development and achievement.

In theory, her build-up of a lesson was chronological. She would state her aims and objectives, give a warm up relating to the training session where certain exercises were developed and then set them pieces of work to make them think and use their bodies, with a climax and a relaxing period.

She found that dance in schools was a far more structured subject than drama, therefore especially suitable for the non-academically minded pupils. Drama presupposed imagination whereas dance appealed to these mixed ability groups because they were more into doing things, practical..." She was concerned about the place of dance in schools, in particular the lack of respect from other departments and thought that therefore an even greater faith in a teacher's subject was needed "to get it over to the kids."

Discipline was the one problem concerning TP she came forward with when prodded.

In summary Celine's dance background and concept of dance are within the arts, in particular the performing arts. Her implicit educational ideas corresponded to the classical humanist ideology, her explicit ones rather more to the arts as educational panacea typical of the exponents of modern educational dance and the progressivist romantic ideology of education.

In the following I am going to present Celine's TP school and describe and discuss two lessons I observed there.



## 11.2 CELINE'S TEACHING PRACTICE - PERFORMANCE, COMPETENCE AND AUTHORITY

### 11.2.1 Celine's Teaching Practice and TP School

Her TP was in a medium size progressive girls' comprehensive with great concern for 'pastoral care', many clubs and activities to provide for the "many troubled children, 40% subnormal, mixed ability groups"<sup>1</sup>, but with fairly strict rules, regulations and control which made it difficult for Celine to balance lessons, PE kit, chewing gum...and PE teachers.

I went to Celine's TP school seven times, watched 14 hours of Celine's second TP and spent many hours talking to TPT, dance teachers and staff.- Celine's lessons were double periods taking place in four different facilities one of which was the assembly hall adjacent to the kitchen from where emanated seductively sweet baking odours at ten in the morning, or to where a man carried some bleeding meat...during a dance class. The various facilities were often very cold so that in the middle of a class the girls complained of being cold and a second warm up had to be inserted.- There was a lot of bustle, giggling, shouting on the stairs during the breaks, but the atmosphere was very friendly and non-aggressive, unlike the mixed-school of the first PGCE case-study. Asking my way to the different dance facilities I always got helpful friendly answers or was even guided there by pupils. The teacher's changing room where a lot of casual exchanges with Celine took place was very tiny and somehow invited confidences from Celine but also encouraged her to demand full identification and support

-----

1. Celine's main method principles essay



with her situation from me<sup>2</sup>. Conscious partiality<sup>3</sup> was too easily turned into complete identification by Celine and had to be re-negotiated constantly.

In this TP school, dance was part of PE, within the PE department and taught by PE teachers with a specialist study in dance. The dance syllabus recommended an indirect method of teaching dance based on Laban's analysis. There was also a mode 3 CSE Dance, a CEE under way. But the new dance O-level was rejected by the head of the department as unacceptable because of Laban notation being too difficult. The CSE examination syllabus was also Laban oriented.

I knew from the interviews that Celine had tried to fit her lessons into that 'modern educational dance' framework but that she had found it hard and an extreme strain because she found it so "structured and disciplined". At first she had thought that she "had to be 'dance-eductional' as opposed to real dance, by which she meant that educational dance asked pupils to analyze everything before they knew what they were doing, whereas real dance to her meant doing, executing, dancing, performing. She was ill at ease and thought 'modern educational dance' too analytical and not suitable for low ability groups. She felt restricted by the PE teachers and their expectations, but then decided to teach her own style to suit herself, the children and the school. She would devise her exercises from the sequence she would teach after the exercises. She justified that by arguing that in order to educate the pupils the teachers should widen their horizon and their movement vocabulary by teaching them sequences.

One of the main stresses during her first TP mentioned by Celine were the teachers, their observing her teaching in their classes. She felt that the teachers were petty,

-----

2. e.g. "On whose side are you?!"

3. cf II.5.1.3.

jealous and possessive over their lessons and not very helpful although she did stress that her TPt was sympathetic and supportive. According to Celine she had learnt a lot about herself during the first TP, and about being with black children<sup>4</sup>. Celine kept referring to 'children' and 'kids' although her TP was in a girls' school. In the interview she had expressed her preference for mixed classes because

"girls are far too hysterical."

The fact that she liked the kids did not prevent her dreading the second TP but she admitted that one of the rewards of teaching dance was

"..to see the kids smile and enjoy the dance."

#### 11.2.2 First Lesson Example: "Roll - Skip - Sway..."

The first lesson I went to observe during Celine's second TP to a 2nd year mixed abilities class surprised me. After the register she did a 15 minute warm up to music very similar to a commercial jazz beginners' class: stretches, bounces, shoulders, hips, tendus en croix and turns. She did the warm up in front of them, shouting explanations and exhortations over the music. After the warm up she set the girls the task of putting together a sequence using any four movements chosen from her list:

"stretch-roll-flicker, skip-turn-jump-run,  
rise-jump-turn-roll, rise-sway-sink."

After three minutes she played the music that went with the expected sequence while she laid out the pictures they already knew from the previous week. The music by Vangelis evoked associations like "wings", "trains", "sea"

-----

4. Celine thought that black children moved "more positively" than white ones.



in the girls. The task was to compose a sequence with that material, in pairs, "any movement, order, composition, direction, level you like". A girl asked: "Is that (poster) to picture a starting position or just an idea?" All the black girls started work, trying out, while one white group was standing around. But Celine did not set that group to work, she sat down and watched the girls experimenting. After approximately ten minutes, she asked the first half of the groups to show their work and admonished "the performers" to show clear starting and finishing positions. The audience was told to try and identify the movements "we had done before". After the short presentation Celine commented:

"Good girls, that was lovely!"

After the second half's presentation the comment shrank to "Good girls!" The lesson ended with the girls spreading out, stretching and doing the theatrical bow - to the 'audience'? to the teacher?

Knowing her dance background and her technical knowledge I had somehow expected a lesson where that background would be very obvious. This expectation had been nourished by Celine's statement in the interview that she had chosen her own style of teaching dance. Yet the main part of this lesson was based on Laban's analysis, and did not contain a set routine. - Did this lesson exemplify Celine's own criteria of a lesson, its aims, method and structure? - Trying to make sense of this lesson I realized that I felt a similar uneasiness and discomfort to the one about Celine's interviews. Somehow 'it did not stick', it felt awkward. I tried to analyze what my material yielded, to track down what caused this uneasiness.

What had this lesson consisted of? The first quarter of an hour consisted of technique, was educationally speaking a transmission of knowledge, and



teacher-oriented<sup>5</sup>. The following task did not relate to the technical exercises of the warm up. The task setting and the first stimulus were verbal, the other stimuli visual and audible. Educationally, the task corresponded to a progressive/exploring approach, methodologically to a more child-centered approach. The presentation of the girls' work was to the audience, again a frontal approach, similar to dance as a theatre art form. The ending of the lesson was as in a classical dance class: the bow - la reverence, of the French royal court, a ceremonial greeting, acknowledging hierarchy.<sup>6</sup>

### 11.2.3 Discussion: Incongruities or Mixing Categories?

I discovered that both the interviews as well as the observed lesson contained contradictions and incongruities. Why and where did these incongruities arise? What were their possible explanations? Their real roots? - Both the interviews and the lesson in question were a mixing of categories, concepts and ideologies. Aware of the 'danger of purity'<sup>7</sup> and keeping in mind that everybody mixes categories I tried to establish a list of several of these incongruities in order to find out what to me felt so odd about them.

- \* Teachers were petty and possessive over their classes,  
/ teachers did not always sit in on her lessons
- \* The dance style had to be general to suit the majority  
/her exercises were specialized "brushes" and "plies".
- \* She did not stand any nonsense, she wanted discipline

-----

5. cf I.3.

6. From an anthropological point of view the bow can be interpreted as a ritual. The revival of group rituals in schools is advocated by Hargreaves, D., 1982, to enhance the feeling of collectivity. Yet the frontal classical bow stresses hierarchies rather than collectivity and does therefore not seem to contribute to what Hargreaves advocates.

7. cf Douglas, M., Purity and Danger 1966

- /she found educational dance a strain because it was so structured and disciplined.
- \* The pupils ought to learn a wide movement vocabulary by ways of set routines/the teacher ought to make them think in a creative way
  - \* The children were not cerebral. were into practical things  
/introduce dance via highly condensed language: poetry
  - \* Celine did not like the suppression of energy, of noise which were just "stamped on" at the school  
/school was not hard for the pupils compared to life outside school
  - \* All her material came from her own dance background  
/the only actual help she got was from Rose
  - \* The only actual help was from Rose  
/TPt was very supportive, sympathetic, "constructive things.."
  - \* Celine loved the "kids" (all girls)  
/she preferred mixed classes because "girls are hysterical"
  - \* Dance was suitable for less academically talented children because it was so structured  
/educational dance was too structured and disciplined

It seemed not so much a mixing of categories into a melting pot and 'brewing' a new, personal concept in the sense of a restructuring or reconstituting perspective<sup>8</sup> but a double-track of conflicting or contradicting ideologies and concepts. A populist ideology of arts for all contradicts an elitist one of high arts for the knowledgeable few; a teacher and transmission oriented pedagogy contradicts a child- and discovery-oriented one.

Was Celine aware of these contradictions? - I suspect she somehow felt these incongruities as well but could not name them. The issues involved were competence and its accompanying value hierarchies, authority and with authority power and control. The following statement by Celine reveals that these issues were linked and

-----

8. cf I.3.4.



interconnected:

"I do love this class, they are so great, so keen! Rose came to watch this class. She liked it. It was jazzy, much more than this one, with Laban words...less strenuous, I take it easier.- I would like to see Rose teach her stuff to these kids!...Gillian gets on my nerves, they shouldn't have taken her on."

This quotation indicated several of the issues stated above and of their clashes:

- 1 \* The class was great, they tried to be competent
- 2 \* Celine felt competent teaching a jazzy lesson
- 3 \* Rose, seemed to like and appreciate her lesson and Celine's competence because Celine adapted or seemed to subscribe to the terminology of the hegemonic 'modern educational dance'
- 4 \* Rose's own pedagogical competence was questioned
- 5 \* A co-student's technical competence was judged as completely insufficient and by that Celine's own definition of competence jeopardized.

Before discussing these points I wish to clarify the terms of competence and performance.

#### 11.2.3.1 Competence and Performance

Competence has to do with 'being adequate', 'qualified', fit. To be competent can take the meaning of being properly qualified. In educational literature, competence can be associated with legitimate rational authority, to possess competence equals to be an authority<sup>9</sup>. But the term competence has found its way into educational literature via sociolinguistics, especially Chomsky's, who distinguished between competence and performance, competence referring to

-----

9. cf Moore, T, Lawton, D, in Lawton, D, et al., 1978:268ff; cf also Hemming, J, in Skilbeck, M, ed, 1984b:305ff



someone's tacit understanding of the rule system, performance relating to the essentially social use to which the rule system is put.<sup>10</sup> In Bernstein's words<sup>11</sup>:

"Competence refers to the Ideal, performance refers to the Fall."

Going back to the established list of incongruities with these clarifications in mind, the examples could be specified as follows.

#### 11.2.3.2 Celine's view of Competence and Performance

In 1 \*, the class's practical competence grew from manipulating and copying steps and components ,i.e. movement vocabulary.

In 2 \*, Celine enjoyed her competence in the sense of being an authority, of being properly qualified to teach a jazzy lesson.

In 3 \*, Celine's competence was acknowledged because Celine had superficially accepted Rose's authority by using her terminology. Rose felt confirmed in her authority.

In 4 \*, Celine questioned Rose's competence (in the Chomskian sense) and in the sense of performance, i.e. social context-bound: The Ideal and the Fall.

In 5 \*, a co-student's performance was ostracized on grounds of competence in the Chomskyan sense.

From Celine's point of view and her implicit closed dance concept and educational ideology she felt surrounded and assessed by people she judged incompetent. Her view of the PE dance teachers at the TP

-----

10. cf Bernstein, 1973:196

11. ibid

school was quite harsh<sup>12</sup>. She resented the fact that she depended on and was assessed by (i.e. under the power and control of) Rose, a tutor who to her was not an authority, was neither a trained dancer nor educationally able to cope with subcultures in deprived areas. Rose to her was therefore incompetent. This appreciation showed e.g. in smiles and grimaces during the practical sessions at the institution when Rose was demonstrating some movement ideas.<sup>13</sup> She resented and *secretly* rebelled against being restricted and limited by (what appeared to her as) Rose's narrow-mindedness exemplified for Celine in Rose's lesson-plans:

"Preston-Dunlop is theory, it isn't lively dance. Rose sticks to Preston-Dunlop lesson plans, each lesson must be introduction - movement material - movement development - dance - conclusion!"

To her, lesson plans, structured in Rose's way, were incompatible with lively dance, with dancing. She thought Rose's criticisms "finicky" whereas she took her own competence (and performance) for granted, she had received the seal of approval in form of her degree.

Celine's statement illuminating dilemmas and problems of authority, competence and performance concerned a lesson I had not observed and could not comment on. But I want to describe a lesson I observed where Rose as well as PE dance teachers were present in the hope of bringing to the fore indications useful for a more sensitive understanding of these issues.

-----

12. cf her quotations III.11.1.

13. cf Celine's comment on one occasion: "Rose looks worst!"

#### 11.2.4 Second Lesson Example: James Bond! or: Which Cultural Reproduction?

It was a morning double period (after mid-term) to a 1st year low ability class who were, according to Celine, keen on dance. Celine knew that Rose would be coming. While Celine was getting changed Rose said to me in the staff room:

"Celine does not accept criticism."

The lesson took place in the dirty assembly hall, full of chairs which had to be tidied away first.- After the register, Celine repeated the 5-minute warm up of the previous week (stretches, bounces, some knee exercises) with the girls. She was standing in front, her back to the girls so that they could copy. As there were no mirrors she had to turn her head to see what they were doing which made her do the exercises somehow twisted. Her demonstrations were fairly relaxed, they exuded neither enthusiasm nor strength.

After the warm up she made the girls repeat the James Bond routine they had worked on the last two weeks before mid-term. The beginning was a taught sequence, the end a fight sequence the girls had created in pairs. The girls remembered well. This repetition was appreciated as a memory training by the dance teacher who mentioned that at this school there was little homework and thus hardly any "remembering tasks", a fact she seemed to regret and criticize. This class remembered the James Bond sequence much better than the other 1st year class I had observed.- Rose said that "James Bond" was an idea she had suggested during the first term at the institution.

Celine made the girls go through the fighting sequence and asked them to clarify their movements. She explained and gave examples of fighting movements. The precise task was to find out how they could attack their opponent



in 8 counts. Rose observed to me that the girls were losing enthusiasm, the whole thing was getting "a bit mechanical" because Celine only stressed and corrected technique. Rose felt that Celine did not develop the theme emotionally, dramatically, that she should ask the girls how it felt to be beaten and that because Celine did not ask that kind of question, the movement quality did not improve. All of a sudden a girl cried out, she had been hit quite badly. Celine reminded them that it was a dance fight, not a real one and that the fight had to be slow, to the music. After 15 minutes repeating and rehearsing the first demonstration group earned friendly applause and giggling from the other girls. For the second group Celine counted out loud the sequence of the fighting. Then the whole class was asked to do the dance. They danced it quite well rhythmically. Celine was leaning against the radiator in a fairly relaxed pose. She took the class up on a minor mistake which she could have helped avoid by shouting out instructions. Her criticism was instructional:

"Stretch hands, feet, everything, listen to the music and count!"

These exhortations were repetitions, or, in Bourdieu's terms<sup>14</sup> reproductions of the training and the exhortations typical of educational transmission of traditional dance technique and training. They also reflected Celine's own expectations of wanting or needing to be stretched by a teacher.<sup>15</sup>

During the second run-through, Celine was sitting on the table, her body was relaxed, she seemed bored, uninvolved. She made the girls repeat the walks of the

---

14. cf I.3.

15. as expressed in her interview

sequence, asked them to demonstrate<sup>16</sup> these walks, then the whole sequence again, then one half of the class watched the demonstration of the other half. Celine then asked the audience what the dancing group had done well. There were no clear answers. The comment to the 2nd group's demonstration was "nice rhythm". Celine asked the class to nominate the four best pairs for demonstration and asked the others to find out what in these pairs' dances made them special. The comments were mumbled, inaudible where I was sitting. Celine finished the lesson with the girls spread out, stretching and bowing.- Walking to the staff room Rose said to me:

"She thinks she is above it all...padding up...she gets away with her personality, the kids don't dare to say they are bored."

In the staff room two dance teachers joined in. Their criticism of Celine was that she did not accept criticism, that she did not show any enthusiasm and that her lessons were too repetitive. Rose remarked to Celine that her lesson plan did not state any aim for this lesson. Celine replied by evading a straight answer and alluded to a "sort of aim". To Rose's criticism that the kids did the dance in a mechanical way and did not seem too keen on it Celine replied that the girls had asked to perform the dance at assembly after mid-term and that they had therefore had to rehearse it well. Rose did not discuss the matter any further, she just handed Celine the headings and guidelines for the 6000 word essay on method before she set off. Celine commented on Rose afterwards:

She is marvellous...with these headings it will be easy to write down the essay."

-----  
16. The HMI report questions the value of demonstrating dances which have not been adequately mastered,  
DES,1983:10



In the cafe Celine read Rose's report to me. Especially the comments "padding out time/no start nor ending/lack of movement development" seemed to annoy her. She said:

"I can do much more...I am above it...I developed steps in the first week on James Bond. That's not what I am up to. what I am interested in!"

She then talked about her plans for the future which included some fitness club of her own, and a post as a youth club leader. Teaching "educational dance" certainly did not figure on her list.

The last two quotations show that Celine appreciated Rose as a helpful person who made her life easier, but she challenged Rose's authority. Following Moore/Lawton<sup>17</sup> any teaching-learning situation involves authority in terms of the competence gap. But what teaching is about according to them is to reduce this competence gap between the teacher and her pupils. In the case of Celine, the student assumed that she had long bridged this gap, that she was above it. She seemed to feel that she had acquired all Rose knew and had to offer. She, Celine, had something more, above it, in stock: dance as art, as performing art, something Rose could not do. To her, "movement development" meant improved steps, meant improved technique, meant better mastery of the movement, meant dance *qua* education.- To Rose, movement development meant emotional development, and via emotional development achievement of movement development, meant education *qua* movement/dance.

Celine taught her pupils dances like a charleston, a can-can, a clown-type dance etc. In her essay she justified this by stating that these dances provided a common ground of movement vocabulary and that the girls enjoyed it. It was Celine's conviction that these dances

-----

17. in Lawton, et al., 1978:268ff



also provided the girls with some utilitarian knowledge in terms of job opportunities<sup>18</sup>.

Yet, what did those involved, the girls, learn in that James Bond dance lesson? Were they really bored, as suggested by Rose?— They copied the teacher's technical warm-up movements. Technique as from *Techne*: to weave, to shape, to fabricate. They were instructed to 'fabricate' their bodies, to shape them, to control them<sup>19</sup> to make them function. The skills to learn pertained to body mechanics and body functioning — and to protestant work ethic: 'Demand something of yourself, of your body, stretch it to its limits, and then you look like a dancer'. One of Celine's comments:

"You don't look like dancers, you look like ragged dolls!"

to her pupils insinuated the ideal of the disciplined professional dancer who "gave to the audience". The technique they were taught did not enable them to use their bodies imaginatively for their fight sequence, nor to use them passionately<sup>20</sup> since there had been no spark, no enthusiasm, no passion in the demonstration. Their movements became mechanical. They learnt to memorize, to count the music, i.e. to structure their dances to the music, they were taught what the proper usage or practice<sup>21</sup> or competence (in the adapted

-----  
18. The utilitarian or vocational trend in education in the eighties is evident; cf the Baker Educational Bill 1987, cf The Guardian 6/10/87

19. cf Douglas, M, the correlation of symbols of bodily control and social restraints, and formality, 1970:64ff, cf I.2.2.

20. When watching private sector dance classes it is striking how well people are trained technically and how hard they work their bodies, but how little 'dance', how little 'poetry' there is when they are supposed to dance.

21. cf I.3.

Chomskian sense) would be. They were addressed as an anonymous mass, "girls"<sup>22</sup>. As to boredom, if they were, they put up with it. Nothing new in being taught to conform. The ideal permeated was to be as correct, as conforming as possible<sup>23</sup>. For them the meaning of the dance arose from de-coding its structure. They could enjoy that mastery.<sup>24</sup>

In contrast, Rose's idea of how to involve the girls emotionally and dramatically was to ask - or remind them? - how it felt to be beaten. From Celine's comment on the girls' hard life outside school this idea was a very pragmatic and realistic starting point for the girls to develop movements from, to find an expression and a means of communication for their experiences. In other words, Rose wanted them to encode instead of decode. Rose had in view performance, use, praxis, as opposed to usage, competence, practice.

This little incident of the James Bond fight illustrated the two contradicting educational ideologies and concepts of dance of Rose and Celine. Celine's instruction-based learning insisted on the mastery of cultural tools, i.e. the knowledge of communicative system dance with the understanding of dance as a conventionalized, arbitrary communication system. Rose's discovery-based learning insisted on creative responses and was thus individualizing, perceptual knowledge generating holistic meanings as a function of environmental contexts. The difference of approach could be approximated to the linguistic one between (Celine's implicit) structuralist and (Rose's explicit) functionalist approach<sup>25</sup>.

-----

22. cf PGCE case-study 1 on gender

23. cf female stereotypes, III.9.

24. For comparison: aerobics as the epitome of that technology of the body of the eighties

25. cf Stenhouse 1977; Weimer, Palermo, 1974



Celine saw the teacher as an instructor or transmitter, a control agent and certainly also as a definer of knowledge:

"The teacher is the subject."

Yet she felt that the degree to which the children depended on the teacher was frightening. But at the same time she maintained that children got uncomfortable if they were too free. This view of the teacher's role may explain the detachment Celine showed during her classes, not to say her lack of involvement, dedication and enthusiasm: She 'knew', she had acquired and was in possession of the knowledge the pupils were struggling to 'master'. She could therefore relax.

#### 11.2.5 The Problem of Boredom: Personal Growth for Student Teachers?

Another, more convincing reason for her very 'laid-back' behaviour could be that she was thoroughly bored.- In this context it seems important now to add some more background information: At the beginning of the second term Daisy suggested to Celine that she should consider leaving the course because of her frequent absences. Celine had had health problems before Christmas and was under medication. Celine was very upset about this suggestion and decided to continue. But she was absent nearly half of the time, especially for the practical sessions with Rose. There were rumours that both Rose and Daisy might fail Celine for her lack of commitment on the course and for truancy. In other words she underachieved in the eyes of the tutors. Celine was bored and frustrated on the course. She was proud of her dance background (cf her material for teaching coming from her dance background). In her view she should have been the best dance student because she had the best dance background. But she saw that her knowledge of techniques and styles and performing of



dance were neither appreciated nor extended nor considered relevant. She was not the success she had anticipated being. This was a blow to her ego. For these obvious reasons she therefore did not enjoy the course, even the co-students got on her nerves.

In a way Celine's role on the course was similar to what the ILEA report<sup>26</sup> refers to as "underachievement": the gap between potential and actual achievement, familiarly expressed by "could do better"<sup>27</sup> or as the marked and general discrepancy between potential and performance. The report links underachievement and truancy and sees truancy not merely as a symptom of underachievement but as a cause of it.<sup>28</sup> Absentees state boredom, lack of enjoyment, school getting on their nerves and lack of success as the most important reasons for truancy.<sup>29</sup> Although the report is on secondary pupils the facts and statements mentioned seem to describe Celine's situation. -

In the first part of interview Celine had stressed the necessity for dance teachers to have the widest possible experience and to know their technique, which seem very reasonable aspects of teachers' profile. Why did her wide dance experience impede her success on the course rather than impel it? Why was she not able to realize her potential?

One main explanation, apart from personality clashes and laziness, must be the lack of critical awareness, or de-construction of personal implicit constructs of concepts and ideologies on the course on both sides, tutor and students. If the 'dance culture' of the tutor were to become part of the consciousness of the student, then

-----

26. ILEA report 1984:1

27. cf Celine about herself, above

28. ILEA report 1984:22

29. ibid:21-22

the 'dance culture' of the student ought to be in the consciousness of the tutor<sup>30</sup> Rose attributed e.g. the "lack of flow" of Celine's dance lessons superficially to her arrogance, to her conviction of being "above it". Celine was not, or not fully, aware of the double track of her dance concept. And if she had been she might have felt it too dangerous not to conform overtly to the person in power, to Rose.<sup>31</sup>

#### 11.2.6 Conclusions

In conclusion, both Rose and Celine pursued a closed concept of dance.<sup>32</sup> Learning from PGCE case-study 3, a way forward is needed to avoid such unproductive clashes of ideologies and concepts and such waste of talent, time and resources. Dance is too poor and too marginal to allow itself such waste and to train people who are then discouraged to teach dance in schools. The potential of professionally trained students should not go to waste.- If dance is to fulfill its emancipatory promise, it must first and above all apply to its students. Students' learning, development and growth<sup>33</sup> in this case-study were impeded by implicit, unacknowledged, monolithic, closed concepts. In order to emancipate students in dance their concepts would first need to be de-constructed, critically examined. But it would be the task of the tutor to "be in the consciousness of the students"<sup>34</sup> i.e. to have at least the knowledge and competence of the students to really be an authority. In this case-study much damage and waste could have been

-----

30. this is a paraphrase of a quotation from Eggleston, based on Bernstein, cf III.9.

31. For the discussion of definition of 'valid' knowledge and its gatekeepers cf Young, M, 1971

32. cf Mansfield, I.2.5.

33. on student development cf Wilson, J, D, 1981:61ff

34. cf Bernstein, above

avoided if the dance tutor had recognized and addressed the student's dance concept and educational ideology.<sup>35</sup> But better still if the student's (technical) dance knowledge would also have been the "dance culture" of the tutor so that it could have been acknowledged and incorporated into the educational ideals of all the participants: building bridges between technique and poetry and between a structuralist and a functionalist approach, or, "reconstituting" the values of various ideologies and concepts<sup>36</sup>. This case-study seems to be evidence for the view held by Celine's TP teacher that there is great need for a more eclectic, non-monolithic approach of dance in education more suitable for schools, dance and those involved, the dance practitioners.

-----  
 35. To do justice to Rose: she fell very ill during the 2nd TP and could therefore not involve herself fully. Cf also the organisational limitations of the course, III.8.

36. cf I.3.4.



## Chapter 12

PART III: SUMMARY FROM THE EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATIONS  
AND CASE-STUDIES

Part III of my thesis has set off from the practice and experience of dance practitioners in education. I have attempted to draw on the material gathered and my observations, in other words to 'theorize'<sup>1</sup>. My theorizing has first concerned the educational reality, and I have attempted to substantiate incidents and instances of this reality from which to highlight issues and problems. My theorizing has also been concerned with finding material towards emancipation from oppressing theories and concepts and towards preliminary construction of alternative, non-monolithic theories informed by practice.

In III.6. I have stated aims which I now wish to put in relation to the empirical investigations and case-studies. The nature of my empirical work does not lead to nor does it want to produce one solution or one coherent theory. The findings, answers or questions, are relative to the people in their socio-cultural setting, and to me as a person with my biases, history and world views. Nevertheless I wish to express my conviction that particular instances and issues and individual problematics can be expressions or manifestations of social relations and thus link many relative 'truths' into categories of similarities.<sup>2</sup>

-----

1. cf Introduction, chapter 1

2. cf II.5.1.3.

## 12.1 AIMS: ANY FINDINGS?

Under this heading I wish to summarize the empirical investigations and case-studies in relation to the aims stated in the introduction to Part III.<sup>1</sup>

I feel that I have gained important insights into the experience of dance practitioners in British/English education of the maintained sector. I have familiarized myself with a wide range of teacher training courses for dance, with several secondary comprehensive schools offering dance and with adult evening courses in Southern England. Issues that almost always came up were those of low status, of dance as an exclusively female activity on the curriculum, of suitable dance contents - topics and forms - for boys, and efforts to attract boys, of unsatisfactory facilities, of formulating syllabi satisfying the gate-keepers (CNAA/universities), of technical standards and of justifications even within the institutions.

I have explored dance in education in various settings before concentrating on historical investigations and on one particular course for more in-depth study.

I have come to an understanding of the enormous complexity of problems and difficulties of dance as a socio-cultural activity on the curriculum, marginalized as a female activity and of the fact that there are no easy answers nor solutions.

As to the possible introduction of dance into Swiss schools and training institutions, dance and educational theories would have to be based on the experience and practice of those involved: concepts of dance and ideologies of education have fallen short of accounting

-----

1. cf III.6.

for instances occurring in practice. Issues have been highlighted that have so far not been sufficiently addressed by the dominant discourses or 'big guns'. The stated aims have been formulated from a perspective of practice. The various findings - in forms of some answers and more questions - have been found by starting from practice. Part IV, chapter 13, will be concerned with theories emerging from the observed, explored and examined practice. The next section relates III.7. and the PGCE case-studies.



## 12.2 EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATIONS AND CASE-STUDIES IN RELATION TO EACH OTHER

The examination of dance education history from the 1950s to the 1980s has shown dance as a female activity on the curriculum following the main dominant discourses of education and attempting to gain status and power by assenting to the dominant values and procedures e.g. of examinations, of academization of dance knowledge, by co-opting pragmatically. The PGCE case-studies have on one hand confirmed the enormous problems of status and power of dance in education, and its lack of control to code knowledge. But they have also revealed that the pragmatic adoption of the dominant discourse does not necessarily provide dance with sufficient answers specific to its being a female activity on the curriculum, nor to specific needs of dance practitioners, teachers and pupils alike.

Similarities having emerged from the individual experiences especially of the PGCE students can be summarized as follows - the sequence of listed points is arbitrary:

- \* - Criteria for a successful lesson were the degree of enjoyment, involvement and participation displayed by the (male) pupils
- \* - Criteria for a disastrous lesson were lack of pupil participation and involvement, break down of discipline
- \* - Dance practitioners (lecturers, teachers, students) felt that dance was marginal in schools, even on the PGCE course
- \* - Dance needed more respect and prestige from staff, authorities, (male) pupils, society at large
- \* - Dance facilities were felt to be completely inadequate in many schools and also on the PGCE course
- \* - Financial rewards and career prospects for dance teachers were thought insufficient

- \* - Teaching dance was very demanding and exhausting
- \* - Technical dance competence was considered the panacea to pull through during TP by the PGCE students. Dance technique was thought to provide teaching competence
- \* - Dance had to be educational (but what the interpretation of 'educational' was, differed)
- \* - Dance was taught exclusively by females to a vast majority of females
- \* - Learning by doing: the PGCE students agreed to having learnt a lot during TP
- \* - The theory lectures on the PGCE course were thought useless
- \* - The need for theories emerging from their practical teaching was expressed, e.g. analyzing, de-constructing a lesson in order to find new, practice-informed theories in order to come to grips with school reality
- \* - The need to respect the children with their needs, their wishes, their likings
- \* - Structure was felt to be an important feature of a dance lesson
- \* - Some form of examining was thought necessary. The best form of examining was thought to be a form close to continuous, internal assessment
- \* - Student guidance and supervision during TP was considered inadequate

I wish to underscore the importance of the apparent divorce in the experience also of the PGCE students between 'educational theory' on the course and 'teaching methods' as survival kit to get through TP. My empirical investigations have led me to agree with Graves<sup>1</sup> that:

"The students were and are essentially concerned with keeping order in the classroom, teaching their own subject...and developing basic intellectual skills in an effective and enjoyable manner. They overtly or covertly subscribe to the instrumental aims of teacher education..."

-----

1. Graves, 1985:9



The PGCE students were not all advanced enough in dance to focus on professional teaching preparation. There was very little time and finance on the course to catch up on dance.

Among the PGCE students Roberta, Gillian and Celine there were also dissimilarities. Their concepts of dance differed, their experience of dance and teaching dance differed greatly, their explicit and implicit educational ideologies varied. But as persons, as dance practitioners on the course and during TP, they behaved logically in their actions, within their cosmologies. The problem lay in allowing them to be or become aware of their respective cosmologies. - This leads me to the individuals and their case-studies.

#### 12.2.1 Roberta

Roberta's approach to the course and her TP was pragmatic: she tried to make 'it' work by involving herself, by working hard, by applying what she had been taught. She knew her limitations but was convinced that good will and effort would pay. But at the end of the course she had come to the conclusion that she was not a dancer, felt thereby not qualified to teach dance especially to older pupils, and was frustrated. She had not acquired the necessary self-esteem - by means of improved dance technique, i.e. dance competence - to face older pupils. Her TP had been a disaster, extremely over-loaded, extremely strenuous, extremely tough.

My case-study of Roberta focused on the central issue of gender. I suggest that her need for improved self-esteem through better technique might have provided some help. But I doubt that it would have been the panacea. Summarizing the various instances of boys' disruptive behaviour in her lessons and of boys' sex-stereotyping in general I tend to think that improved teacher dance technique cannot provide the answer to



boys' views of dance. It would be the fallacy of the 'romance of technology' to assume it could. I submit that theories of gender specific adolescence, of sexuality, of gender stereotyping might have provided Roberta with some useful tools to grapple with her problems. They would also have provided her with the insight that her failure to convince the boys of the value of dance and her failure to give the girls the attention they deserved - to name but a few of Roberta's problems - were inherent in the socio-cultural framework within which she had to operate.

They are not likely to have solved the problems. But they might at least have reduced Roberta's strain, frustration and discouragement. At best, they might have contributed to shaping the lessons more in accordance with the needs of the pupils.- The theories she got acquainted with on the course, e.g. the dance-as-art syllabus and the concept of dance within the progressive ideology of education were inadequate to deal with the problems she was confronted with. Roberta felt that she wanted to transmit her joy of dancing to the pupils. But the theoretical framework of dance having to be 'educational' prevented her nearly till the end of her TP from doing just that. This is tragic in the sense that Roberta was so frustrated and discouraged that she did not even apply for jobs.

#### 12.2.2 Gillian

Gillian's approach can be said to have been idealistic in that she tried to put into practice her theoretical framework of education. Gillian's case-study has concentrated on the issue of theory-informed practice. Her professed lack of technical competence made her fear the older girls. Because of her lack of technical competence and lack of confidence in her body she first relied on the strategy of the verbal. Little by little she liberated herself from this fear, in part probably due to the - to Gillian -negative model of her TP teacher

who was heavily technique-biased. Gillian shared Rose's cosmology. Her implicit and explicit theories, her values and her dance competence did not clash with Rose's. On the contrary, Gillian felt validated in Rose's eyes in contrast to her TPt. I submit that although Gillian's professed theories were not those she actually put into practice, as the case-study has revealed, those theories helped her because they were shared with Rose. Gillian knew that she was in Rose's "consciousness".<sup>2</sup> Although Gillian's technical competence was considerably lower than Roberta's she was more self-confident: she felt supported, acknowledged and valued by Rose. This gave her the freedom to try out, to experiment. She observed, she experimented, and she came forth with a creative unconventional theory, namely that top stream girls needed dance most, more than low achievers for whom dance was seen to be a solution by educationalists like Bantock.<sup>3</sup>

The case-study of Gillian has highlighted for me the fact that, besides being equipped with useful theories and technical competence, it is essential for a student to be trusted and appreciated in order to develop her/his potential fully. This insight recalls and highlights the importance of Hargreaves' concept of and plea for dignity for pupils and students.<sup>4</sup>

Gillian was sure that she was not going to teach dance, she did not feel sufficiently happy in her body, she said. Gillian taught drama at college level after finishing the PGCE course with very good results.

---

2. cf Bernstein/Eggleston, cit. above

3. cf I.3.2.

4. cf I.3.4.



### 12.2.3 Celine

Celine's approach can be said to have been utilitarian in that her actions were measured in proportion to their usefulness. Because she could not identify with Rose's concept of dance nor with her educational ideology nor with her dance competence, Celine withdrew and contributed just as much as needed to get through the course. The explored issues of competence, performance and authority in relation to implicit value assumptions have been the central focus of Celine's case-study. One of the main problems I have been able to identify in this case-study was the lack of explicit values, opinions and world views. Celine was quite proud of her technical competence. This led her to feel superior and to rely on her technical expertise which narrowed instead of widened her teaching style. Her idea was that the greater one's experience and knowledge of dance techniques and styles the more one had to draw on for better teaching. Her views on dance knowledge were strongly moulded by her dance training within the concept of dance-as-high-art. She took for granted what she had been nurtured on. This clashed with Rose's views. Celine felt that she did not get the acknowledgement she deserved. She withdrew, she got bored, she underachieved in the eyes of Rose. Celine's dignity was hurt.

I am wondering what the outcome of the TPs would have been if Celine had been in Gillian's school with Gillian's technically oriented TPt. Would Celine have been encouraged by the teaching style of this TPt? Would she have found an ally who would have helped her espouse openly her concept of dance and thus bring into the open the conflict of ideologies between Rose and herself? Asking these questions I allude to the whimsicality of failure and success as in the cases of Celine and Roberta. Their allocation to the respective TP schools in a certain way predetermined their degree of success or failure. Each type of experience is different, but each



type of experience marks the experiencing person. In the case of Celine, as in Roberta's, the TP provided her with such experience that she decided not to teach dance in the maintained sector.

TPs can be seen as the link where theory and practice do or should join. Therefore the choice of the TP school should be careful and take into account the specific needs of the students. As it was in the case of Gillian, Bernstein's belief that if the culture of the tutor/teacher/lecturer is to become part of the consciousness of the student/pupil/child then the culture of the student/pupil/child must be in the consciousness of the tutor/teacher/lecturer.<sup>5</sup> To train students as mere agents of education is to neglect their individual potentials. - Where the three students followed their personal strengths<sup>6</sup>, where they lived their "constructions of dance"<sup>7</sup> and thereby managed to get their 'message' across to their pupils, they felt - and were - successful. Where they subordinated to the expected teaching methods which were not part of their consciousness and culture, they were not successful. The neglect of pedagogy in teacher training on the observed course may have contributed to the negative result: none of the three observed students has taken up teaching dance in the maintained sector - a regrettable waste of talent, time, hope and resources.

#### 12.2.4 The Researcher

Can I summarize the empirical investigations and case-studies in relation to me as an individual? - I try to rely on my personal experience in the attempt to

-----

5. cf I.3.;Eggleston cit.Bernstein, 1977:19

6. For Roberta, this meant feeling happy in one's body dancing. For Gillian this meant inspiring the pupils creatively. For Celine this meant transmitting set dances.

7. cf Lyons,S,1985

summarize where the empirical work has led me.

The empirical investigations of the dance education history have provided the framework within which to place the particular instances of the PGCE case-studies. The omission of the gender perspective in the dance education history has made me more aware of problems that might arise for dance as a female activity in education. As it happened, all the research participants were female. The gender viewpoint became an important 'category of similarity'. In one sense I am disillusioned that even the apparently best justifications hardly contribute to an improvement of status. But in another sense this is a liberating finding: it liberates me from the need to find justifications. Justifications do not help a lot, anyway...

The issue of the examinations is a difficult one. Pragmatism, i.e. the co-optation in the acceptance of externally assessed, academic, written examinations, may lead to a certain prestige within a collection type curriculum based on transmission knowledge of the classical-humanist ideology of education. But at the same time, these examinations alienate a large proportion of the school population for whom dance might be a solution.

Another difficult issue for me personally is the one of technical competence. I have been trained, like Celine, in dance technique pertaining to the concept of dance-as-high-art. It is difficult to wean myself away from the concept I have been nurtured on. Before the empirical I work I was convinced that a high level of technique is absolutely necessary. Now I am less convinced of that necessity. But this is difficult to admit because it raises fears of what to do with my technique.

The presentation of three case-studies from the same course has allowed triangulation. Triangulation has not been used in order to emphasize reliability of data but



to provide multiple perspectives of the same social setting, the same course. Triangulation has enabled me to understand the place of technique in different settings. Linking the variable place of dance technique to the various ideologies of education I can appreciate more clearly what kind of technique I want to look for in an emancipatory perspective.

A finding of the case-study which has pleased me personally has been that jazz dance, my particular speciality, has been thought to be attainable, pleasurable and useful, something the children seem to enjoy. Part I has provided me with insights into why jazz dance, notwithstanding these seemingly positive features, is still frowned upon: jazz dance is very hard to reduce to a factlike body of knowledge, it gets lost in the process.

A finding of the case-studies which has not pleased me has been the gap between my theory and my practice in relation to views expressed by the PGCE students. In theory I have advocated and I still advocate non-monolithic truths and concepts. In practice I have sometimes found it hard to accept what seemed to me contradictory or illogical statements. And I have had to call myself to order.

In summary, I have found that especially from a gender perspective what has been taught is not unproblematic. I would like to suggest scrutiny of content, quality and implementation to help orient dance in education towards change and emancipation.

The following -and final - Part IV is concerned with theories as emerging from the practice explored.



PART IV: BEYOND

DANCE IN EDUCATION FROM A GENDER VIEWPOINT

## Chapter 13

FROM THEORY TO PRACTICE TO THEORIES: IMPLICATIONS  
FOR THE FUTURE OF DANCE IN EDUCATION FROM A GENDER  
VIEWPOINT

13.1 INTRODUCTION

In the introduction to this thesis I have placed my research within the context of my personal experience, which is the experience of a woman dance practitioner. Throughout the thesis I have tried to declare my world view and my bias. I have sought to extend the perspective of gender to a new focus, that of dance in British education.

Parts I and II have been in search of theory, 'traversing' the state of the debates. - In chapter 2 I have tried to come to grips with dance from various socio-cultural perspectives, I have attempted to locate dance in its socio-cultural and historical setting in order to provide myself with tools to make sense of my experience of dance and as a dance practitioner.

In chapter 3 I have 'traversed' educational ideologies relevant to dance in British education and to my needs in regard to educational possibilities for Swiss schooling.

Chapter 4 has attempted to amalgamate or reject findings from the two previous chapters. The criteria for conclusions were gender-oriented and were made in the light of their usefulness to orient female dance practitioners in education.

The survey of theories of qualitative research

methodology and case-study of Part II, chapter 5, has provided the bridge, or extended 'prelude', to Part III and its empirical investigations and case-studies. Whilst the stance of Parts I and II have been critical-analytical, the stance of Part III has been more reflexive: starting from the empirical evidence of dance practitioners' practice I have tried to highlight emerging issues reflexively. My position has been normative in that I value dance as a female activity on the curriculum.

Chapter 6 has introduced Part III. It can be interpreted as the bridgehead to practice and empirical evidence. Chapters 7 to 11 have been based largely on observation and interview data and material provided by those involved in my research. Writing up the case-studies has been an intensive and intense experience and part of my research, especially when I have been able to combine e.g. data from an essay with my knowledge of the person in question. I have allowed my intuition to lead me to 'unravel' material.

The empirical investigations of dance education history in chapter 7 have illuminated dominant concepts and justifications between the 1950s and the 1980s. The shift from modern educational dance with its psychological and progressivist ideological underpinnings to academization within dance-as-art with its philosophical objectivistic underpinnings has emphasized propositional knowledge of dance. This is evident from the establishment of public, externally assessed examinations in dance. I have interpreted this shift as pragmatic behaviour of those in subordinate positions, i.e. women teachers of a marginal subject, anxious to improve the status of their subject and their own.

Having acquainted myself with the historical development of dance in British education I have then concentrated on a small-scale in-depth study of one PGCE course and have dedicated one case-study to students involved in my research. Chapter 8 has provided the



background to the course. Chapter 9 has concentrated on the student Roberta. The issue that has emerged and has been illuminated is gender, which has been shown to be a crucial one in education in general, in mixed schools in particular.

Chapter 10 has concentrated on the student Gillian. The focus in this chapter has been on the relationship between theory and practice. This issue reflects at the classroom level the structure of this thesis and could therefore be said to link micro- and macro level.

Chapter 11, focusing on Celine, has tried to illuminate problems that can arise from clashes between teacher and taught, or between tutor and student. The case-study has brought to the fore difficulties that arise because of implicit value assumptions, implicit ideologies of education and implicit dance concepts.

Chapter 12 has concluded from the empirical investigations and case-studies.

I wish to acknowledge in retrospect that I owe a lot to the commitment, trust, help and interest of those who consented to be part of the research. I have concentrated on a view from within, and on students' experience. The response I have got may have been coloured by hidden factors, such as my being an overseas researcher, or English being my second foreign language. As to the effect it has had on those who contributed, I believe - I have not been able to extend my research to discussing this with them in detail because of time and geographical distance - that my work has served them as a mirror, as a sounding board. My asking questions, discussing, suggesting etc must have stimulated them to analyze, de- or re-construct, observe and question their practice and their theories. Some evidence from their interviews and conversations confirms me in this belief. I believe that my research has been a 'giving and

taking'.<sup>1</sup>

My goal has been to substantiate material towards emancipation and change for dance on the curriculum and for those involved, female dance practitioners in education. My interest in setting up dance teacher training in Switzerland has led me to focus on and to gather from the British set-up material that can inform me about the experience, theories and practices of dance students, of those undergoing teacher training.

---

1. cf II.5.1.3.

### 13.2 BEYOND: WHAT ARE THE OPTIONS?

From the empirical investigations and case-studies of dance in education I have found that what has been thought educational is problematic.<sup>1</sup> Not only have the ideologies of education been shown to be problematic in their informing practice, but the theories themselves have been shown to be problematic in regard to gender. In the dominant concept of modern educational dance the educational justification has been universalistic and holistic: dance as the panacea. In the concept of dance-as-art and its extension to dance academisation the educational value of dance has been seen in its specialized, academised knowledge. In the PGCE case-studies the students' theories of the educational value of dance reflected the dominant academic dance discourse, i.e. dance-as-art.<sup>2</sup>

And what is the future? What is to count as dance in education? What is to be thought educational beyond the 1980s? In order to orient towards the future I feel that I wish to look at the present which has been informed by the past. I want to look at the practical reality.

#### 13.2.1 Stating the Visible

Dance education reports and literature<sup>3</sup> acknowledging the fact that dance in education is almost exclusively female are congruent with my own findings, both from

-----  
1. As alluded in the Introduction, even the term education itself is problematic because it starts from the assumption that the pupil is to be rescued and liberated from a negative, is to be led away from something negative towards something positive.

2. cf Graves, 1985, in III.12

3. cf DES, 1983; Gulbenkian Foundation Report 1980; Meakin/Sanderson, 1983; Lyons 1985



personal experience and empirical investigations. But to my knowledge, this fact has not been made an issue in research. I have broken new ground in stating the visible, starting from personal experience as a woman dance practitioner, and thus making it an issue: The question of what is thought to be educational in dance must be informed by the visible, plain reality that dance on the curriculum is a female activity.

Another visible fact is the marginality and the marginalization of dance on the curriculum, which reflects the marginality and marginalization of dance in Western, or British, society.<sup>4</sup>

A third visible fact is the low prestige of dance and its powerlessness or impotence in defining dance 'knowledge' as high status knowledge.

These three facts are visible and are important in the make up of dance in education in the present socio-cultural situation. Any theories that omit or cannot account for one of these facts must be non-starters. The status anxiety of the dance-as-art and dance academization lobbies must have contributed to the neglect or even suppression of a fact, gender, unlikely to provide access to male domains of power and control. The status anxiety has led to dance being reduced to a "factlike body"<sup>5</sup> of propositional knowledge which is being refined.<sup>6</sup> It is my contention that co-optation to dominant views of propositional knowledge especially of the classical-humanist ideology of education cannot dissipate status anxiety, precisely because the (low) status is largely determined by dance being defined as a

---

4. cf I.2.; III.7.; III.8.

5. cf Macdonald, G, III.7.,

6. cf ongoing research e.g. published in Dance Research, the organ of British dance scholars

female activity.<sup>7</sup> I also contend that it is much more crucial to acknowledge the gender aspect of dance in education and to make it an important issue: starting from practice, from reality, gender can carry the potential to orient the formulation of new theories necessary for emancipatory practices.<sup>8</sup>

It is not knowledge that is lacking. There is plenty of propositional knowledge of dance, and there is a vast amount, a reservoir of practical dance knowledge in education. More detailed knowledge e.g. of our "meagre"<sup>9</sup> dance heritage will not bring about real status, since a re-definition of high status knowledge has not been achieved, or, in other terms, male-defined knowledge is still hegemonic.<sup>10,11</sup> But what does seem to be lacking is orientation knowledge. Which leads me to ethics.

#### 13.2.2 Ethical Dimensions

I have maintained throughout my thesis that dance is a socio-cultural phenomenon and activity and that education must not be artificially separated from its socio-cultural and historical context and that schools cannot teach what society does not (want to) know.<sup>12</sup> In Holmes'<sup>13</sup> terms:

-----

7. cf I.2.4.

8. cf Mies, cit in I.3.

9. Laban, cit in III.7.2.

10. cf I.3., cf III.7.7

11. In fact, the "meagre" dance heritage might be a chance for the marginal and marginalized groups of the school population in that its weight is not too encumbering and can therefore be cast off more easily.

12. Cf Spender, 1982

13. Holmes, B, 1979:10



"...school problems can only be understood in relation to other forms of social culture...the educational question is largely an ethical question and...things 'outside school matter even more than the things inside the schools, and govern and interpret the things inside'."

If the educational question is largely an ethical question, then the further question arises as to what kind of ethical positions can inform the educational question, in particular the educational question from a gender viewpoint.

I wish to suggest that the "defensive" ethics<sup>14</sup> informed by ecology and/or feminism<sup>15</sup> can provide guidelines for new moral norms necessary for survival. Post-material values can (and must) replace present materialistic value assumptions. Moral behaviour in complex situations will have to be informed by social responsibility. New defensive ethics would include the moral task of rebelling against circumstances hostile to the life of the individual and the human community. Values of this new ethic will be participation, solidarity, and ecological behaviour according to need, not greed. Social behaviour will have to be practised in complex networks and patterns of human relations.

Orientation will not come from answering the question: what is *feasible*? but from: what is *desirable*? The first question is the question of the romance of technology. According to Benthall<sup>16</sup> the most radical challenge to the industrialized and technocratic ethos with its materialistic values would be the recoil to the body and the direct affirmation of the body through the

---

14. e.g. advocated by Zimmerli, 18/6/84, cit passim Engelhardt, 1977

15. cf Thuermer-Rohr, 1987

16. Benthall, 1976:73



transgression of Western taboos.<sup>17</sup> But in order to bring about change, this affirmation of the body must not remain a personal, even private, act. It must become a social or political act.

Informed by orientations from 'new defensive ethics' I am going back to the particular field of dance education.

### 13.2.3 Towards an Ethic of Dance in Education

As to education, defensive ethics are in line with Hargreaves' criticism of the "fallacy of individualism"<sup>18</sup> in schools and education and with a reconstructivist approach in general. Thus a "recoil to the body" for dance in education can (and should) be interpreted as a social recoil, not only an individual one. Dance and the function it fulfills in social culture can then reflect in education and vice versa.

### 13.2.4 Orientations for Dance as a Female Activity in Education

What kind of orientations for the future of dance as a female activity in education can flow from new defensive ethics?

Evidence from 'traversing' the literature of dance (I.2.) and education (I.3.) has revealed male hegemony and the neglect of the categories of gender and the body.

I contend that one possible option for the future of dance in education and the women concerned is to reject male definitions hostile to women and to start attempting to create new parameters, their own. - But how can women dance practitioners discover their creative potential and

-----

17. cf I.2.1-4.

18. cf I.3.4.2.

their productive potential so that they can reject their traditional negative roles and functions of non-creators, non-producers, objects, and negative reference groups<sup>19</sup>? I suggest that one possible strategy towards emancipation for women dance practitioners may be radical subjectivity as contained in and expressed in the question: what is desirable? What is desirable to them?

This then is one option for women dance practitioners - to go back to the drawing board so to speak, their own drawing board, and design their own picture, set their own standards, validate their own experiences, to find out about their own interests and images of dance and dancing, and to have the knowledge they generate accepted as generally valid.- This does not necessarily mean to reject existing dance culture or dance concepts. But it does imply de-constructing them, or incorporating them in order to create or reconstruct something new that can account for that half of the population which has been excluded in public dominant discourse so far: women.

This may sound like an invitation to Utopia. The contrary is the case. It means to assume responsibility - instead of deferring authority to some body, academic or other - by perspicaciously analyzing, questioning, feeling, reflecting on the experience and articulation of dance and dancing towards the formulation of new theories that include women. It means to say no to expected, or enforced, docility and deference.

My plea or suggested option is action-oriented, participant-oriented. By taking into account the situative conditions of the participants it is congruent with a reconstructivist approach.<sup>20</sup> But it extends the reconstructivist ideology of education from those being taught to those teaching: teachers and pupils become learners towards their autonomy. I claim that if women

-----

19. cf Spender, 1982

20. cf I.3.4



dance practitioners start rejecting male definitions this will also have liberating effects for men, since delegating the irrational to women<sup>21</sup> prevents them from becoming fully integrated persons – and dance practitioners. It might be that male teachers then make the case for dance for boys – to which they are very much welcome.

The strategy of radical subjectivity implies eclecticism and thus provides space for the various concepts, constructions and theories of the individual dance practitioners. Monolithic concepts have been shown to be problematic. Radical subjectivity contributes to diversity and allows 'meaningful' practice by the individual dance practitioner and teacher who mediates dance.

#### 13.2.5 Beyond: Research and Dance

Evidence from the empirical investigations and case-studies has been that important issues and categories need addressing and examining. The issues of gender, of the nature of relationships, of personal cosmologies, of pedagogy, of sexuality and the body, of female 'adolescence', of students' construction of theories, to name some important ones, need to be brought up in relation to the theories worked in Part I. Further research which reworks theory in the light of these issues is suggested. But more specifically, I wish to suggest further research in regard to female dance practitioners. I have focused on women students' experience. Further research could focus on girls'/female pupils' experience and on the personal experience and practice of women teachers and lecturers.

I hope that this kind of research will contribute little steps to making dance in education beyond the 1980s 'just dance', an autonomous socio-cultural

-----

21. cf Walkerdine, 1985; Mitscherlich, 1985; Irigaray, 1987



activity that does not need any qualifications as X, Y, or Z, and that articulates the world and is articulated upon it by dance practitioners - female or male.

I am aware that schools seem to be inherently ill-suited to emancipatory efforts and that my vision of dance in schools will not be put into practice tomorrow. Still, I am looking forward to relinquishing my strenuous position of 'attitude' in order to 'just dance'.

## Appendix A

## Interviews

A.1 PGCE – Background Interview/ Grid

- \* – Name, age, sex, background
- \* – School qualifications, degree, place
- \* – Latest occupation
- \* – Dance: what does dance mean to you?
- \* – When did you start dancing? Where? What kind?
- \* – 'Dance career'? Classes? Styles? Frequency?
- \* – Social dancing? What kind? Where? Why?
- \* – Dance performances? (As a spectator) What kind? When? Impression? Give examples...
- \* – Dance literature?
- \* – Dance on TV?
- \* – How much money spent for dance? Budget...
- \* – Styles and techniques of dance: enumerate, appreciate Which ones are you familiar with?
- \* – PGCE: why? Why dance and drama? Reasons? Expectations?
- \* – Previous teaching experience? Age Group?
- \* – Preferential age/sex group to teach
- \* – Views on pupils benefit from dance?
- \* – Your aims as to dance education (state sector)
- \* – Justifications of dance in schools?
- \* – Outline personal needs as a future dance teacher

- \* - Anticipated problems?
- \* - How would you introduce dance in a school?
- \* - Views on dance assessment
- \* - Teaching a particular technique/style in schools? -  
if no, why?  
which one, if yes, why?
- \* - Characterize a good dance teacher
- \* - Characterize a good dance class
- \* - First lesson plan/content/structure/aims...
- \* - Preparatory work for first lesson
- \* - Personal comment/questions/remarks



A.2 PGCE - Interview 2/Grid

- \* - End of PGCE: personal development/  
development as a teacher?
- \* - Dance technical development/Contribution of course to  
dancing and teaching dance
- \* - Views on/suggestions for future PGCE or other courses  
for dance in education
- \* - Teaching Practice: views/suggestions
- \* - Place/function/role/content of dance in secondary  
schools related to gender/age/school type
- \* - Your most successful dance lesson during TP:  
why successful?  
Your most disastrous dance lesson during TP:  
why disastrous?
- \* - Characterize the most current dance  
styles/techniques
- \* - Preparation/input/sources/inspiration for dance  
in teaching situation

A.3 First Interview with Roberta

Names:           Rose : Dance Tutor  
                   Daisy: Course Tutor  
                   TPt : Teaching Practice dance teacher

S: Can you tell me shortly what your background is?

Rob: I have a degree in zoology. Dance: when I was six I was taken to ballet by my mother, in school I did gymnastics, later mime.

S: Why did you chose to do this PGCE? Drama and dance..

Rob: ..I...always interested in people. I don't want to teach my subject. Mime..I enjoy it, it's a lot of bodywork, quite strenuous, it's the discipline...I found out about drama, dance was offered as an option...I am much happier working with my body than sitting behind a desk.

S: What is dance to you?

Rob: My immediate image of dance is the LCDT.

S: ... a stage performance?

Rob: ..yes..my background is working-class with middle-class aspirations, but I wasn't taken to theatre a lot...

S: ...any preferred style?

Rob: I like modern..ballet is a bit frilly..

S: In that context, what is your preferred technique?

Rob: What is LCDT?..is that ...??

S: Graham

Rob: Graham..I like strong up-movements rather than the floor...with a lot of travelling, space, I like the discipline of it, I have never been to Jazz...tap, I'd like to have a go at that.

S: How many hours weekly training do you..

Rob: ..7 hours, but not all of it is real training. I like to be stretched...the athletic bit is important to me, plus six hours mime...

S: What about performing?

Rob: yes, mime.

S: Have you read any books on dance? Any literature?

Rob: No. TV, anything about dance.

S: What about discos?

Rob: I like dancing at parties, heavy rock and reggae, dance on my own..

S: Any link to teaching dance?

Rob: I am happy in my body, ...pass that on to other people..

S: And what kind of justifications ....for you?

Rob: ..the same as PE, the pure movement aspect, but also it's an art, it's beautiful to watch, a phantastic means of expression ...

S: And your personal benefit?

Rob: I hope the satisfaction of seeing the kids getting the same out of it.

S: What about technique?

Rob: Thinking in terms of technique at that age is difficult.. The Laban analysis is useful...effort qualities, I don't have a clear idea of that...what I picked up about Laban was mainly from books, eg Preston-Dunlop, dance in education about different qualities of movement, how they are categorized.

S: What would you call your teaching method..your concept?

Rob: ..hopefully non-authoritarian, not the heavy kind I have seen.. I would still work in a fairly structured way, have my ideas, put some of them forward, start with a basic warm up,..disciplined to get them moving, get them to ...work on their ideas, still within their structure, teacher input, stimulation...I like the idea of group work because of the social and communication, but also individual work.

S: How would you structure a lesson?

Rob: a 50 minute lesson? 10 minutes for register etc, then 10 minutes at least for a rigorous warm up connected in some way with the theme, 30 mins work towards a composition of some kind, movement with music.

S: ...any material?

Rob: Tapes, drums etc, some visual stimuli, pictures...

S: What are the kind of, if any, expectations from the PGCE?



Rob: Not a lot!- You have to learn to teach in the school.. Rose was useful, she pumped in a lot of ideas but we didn't go to watch any dance in schools... so we didn't have any idea of what it was like...the theoretical basis doesn't really help you in the practical situation, not the type of curriculum justification..this idea of kinaesthetic development ...when I saw my first few lessons...that went straight out of the window!

S: Teaching dance.. are you anticipating any problems?

Rob: Problems of mixed groups, 1st,2nd years. I have already seen that it is difficult to structure a lesson so that you don't forget the girls...you spend so much time and energy sorting the boys out...

S: How would you then define the needs of dance teachers in school?

Rob: Dance needs to be accepted as part of the curriculum that has some respect. The respect for dance in schools is slack...  
Basic practical help in choosing material, ideas, music.

S: What about your personal standard of technique ...is that important for... to be a good dance teacher?

Rob: yes...I want to add that I am happy to be given the chance of doing this course although I am a zoologist. I feel perfectly capable of doing it although I am not quote "a dancer". Daisy was interested in people with varied background...

S: Let's now talk about your teaching practice (TP)- how do you feel after your first TP?

Rob: Exhausted,...so difficult to teach mixed classes in dance..(?)..questioning the value of forcing children to do a subject..  
..1st and 2nd years, a small group of 3rd year girls, ..a social priority school, bad area, kids on the rough side

S: You mean the kids don't enjoy dance?

Rob: Dance as part of the PE dept, 1st years once a week, 1 term, the 2nd years in half tutor groups, 15 kids, one and a half term once a week...little continuity, ..in PE kit, bare feet, they hate bare feet. The whole procedure to get them down to the gym, lock everything, wait bare feet on the concrete floor outside the gym, padlock, they tend to go wild because they are cold, 1-2 mainly boys..disruptive, you have a real battle to make them listen, the acoustics of the room don't help. A warm up to really warm them up, the lesson is 50 minutes, by the time you have all that done, register.. you have so little time left.. Doing anything that really stimulated them, using words or poetry or pictures meant getting them all together, sitting them down in a cold room, destroys the effect of your warm up..



S: ..the outer circumstances more than the actual subject?..

Rob: I have only seen one or two lessons..that to me the children appeared to have enjoyed it. The rest of the time it's a running battle of threats, because they just don't want to do it. What extra are they getting from it? Their imagination gets stimulated in drama, a lot of the physical qualities in gymnastics etc, within the PE..music ..limited anyway. If the kids have got a sense of rhythm, they've got one..if they haven't it takes them a long time to develop one, they are much more likely to do so when they want to..so why do it at all??..on the other hand, the 3rd year group..enthusiastic got a lot out of. They wouldn't have reached that if they hadn't gone through the first two years..The stigma attached to boys doing dance is so strong in our society - you're just fighting a losing battle.

S: Had the children any dance experience from the previous school?

Rob: Some did... some were very self-conscious, especially the boys, reaching puberty, some are so small, some are great big muscular boys, who are just not prepared to move in the way you want them to.. I found it very difficult to balance a lesson so that the boys were kept interested and involved and working and the girls weren't left out. I tended to do a lot of tribal things, hunting, fights vigorous to keep the boys busy and even then...'this is boring, Miss, I don't want to do this'..it was an awful lesson, a total disaster, I couldn't cope with the change of mood from one week to the next.

S: What was the 'input' of the other dance teachers there?

Rob: ..3 teachers in the PE department, the dance specialist was a trained PE teacher but had taken dance courses over the years..their comments were mainly tips on class control, eg have your music absolutely ready, if not, it disturbs the whole flow, where to stand, when to speak to the whole class, when to individuals, all those things rather than the content...After a couple of bad lessons I had a cold, was in tears, I said I couldn't cope, the time-table was too heavy, TPT is pregnant, from Monday to Thursday 20 lessons, really 15 lessons to teach, with lesson plans and all!

S: ..Your lesson plans...is there any change..?

Rob: First..more..find a piece of music, see what you can do with it . Now..see what you want to do and find a piece of music. Warm up now much more from the top of my head, something relating to what follows, I can better judge the mood of the kids. After the warm up nothing particularly technical, eg word stimulus, eg list of body part expressions or a poem or miming work action. The other half of the class watch or guess or take the count of the music, use drums, drums...useful for control wallop....

S: Any routines?



- Rob: A simple routine as the hunters going out to hunt, then little climax routine, tribal dance, basic sequence in a circle, that was the idea of DT but I developed from it. First I continued TPt's work: closing and opening and taking it further : egg, bird, breaking out of a shell and flying...that really worked, using poems as a stimulus ...depends so much on the class. I knew that class would respond well.
- S: Has discipline to do with the size of class? with mixed class?
- Rob: With the size of the space they are in and mixed and not wanting to do it. In dance because the structure is much more formal, although you are asking them to be creative, to a certain extent the lesson is still fairly structured. So when you discipline them, it creates such a bad atmosphere that you can't expect them to create.
- S: Create..creativity...
- Rob: the kids are more creative in drama! I was surprised: how simple a task I gave them they still could not do it, or wouldn't. They couldn't make the connection with stepping and body parts. TPt said I had not given them enough movement experience on stepping to be able to make that connection, I was just shocked that these 2nd years couldn't do such a simple task...they seemed to need a lot more of pushing than in drama.
- S: Can you give me two extremes, the best and the worst?..
- Rob: After a 1st year class total chaos..they knew I was a student and were laying it on, I just couldn't cope with them, a cold, a sore throat,..awful. On the flying(?)..1st years I wrote a poem, they just behaved perfectly, seemed to enjoy it. Before the TP ..no observation of dance classes. I had no idea what went on in dance classes in schools. I took this option because it was offered at the institution at the last minute as an alternative to English... The TP was stimulating and challenging, you felt you had achieved something when you got the whole class to do something...but it seemed such a battle!
- S: Were you better prepared at the institution for drama or dance?
- Rob: 50-50..in drama we observed more, I had more of an idea what drama was about, in dance , Rose was fairly helpful, lesson plans of other students.. you taught us a few routines. But as to keep dance at your own level- it was hopeless!
- S: So your own dance training was adequate? TP problems were not dance technique related?
- Rob: No.. I fell a lack of background in music, but as far as movement experience goes, although I am not a dancer, I



felt quite able to cope. We had less time at the institution for dance than for drama. Wednesdays' recreational dance was completely different, not useful for teaching.

S: You find teaching dance in schools completely different from taking dance lessons for yourself. What about Fridays?

Rob: Total waste of time..Daisy's room coffee, chats, but no real exchange of ideas. Planning a lesson: no book can help.. It all was down to yourself and your imagination. The Laban book (Preston-Dunlop) recommended to us was totally useless because kids at that age anyway, you're just talking nonsense to them if you're trying to say 'this is a light sustained movement' ..it's OK for your own analysis of it, but then you've got to put it into context. So the only kind of way I could work was to have an idea, eg tribal.. and think of the kind of movements done in a village, handing the maize, planting, hunting, feed all these words in all the time and get them to do it.

S: When you are saying that it depends all on yourself - does that mean the more background you have in dance the easier it would be?

Rob: Yes. The ideas I used, all came from either TPt or Rose ...to actually think them up. So next week I am going to grab the others for ideas..

S: Daisy?

Rob: ..hadn't occurred to me ..rather Rose.

S: Judging from your experience what future improvements to a PGCE..

Rob: Most irritating here, the lack of discipline amongst the group.Tutors, student late. Dance: more to give students to get on with it ... the whole thing has fallen flat. TP - shattering! a lot more useful things could be done on Fridays- Checking time-tables: all students should have the same amount.. Daisy should have spotted that mine was unfair! The institution should require at least one free period a day in TP. the whole position of a student in a school is difficult enough to cope with..

S: What about supervision of your TP?

Rob: Rose came to 2 dance classes in the first week, Daisy to 1 drama session.

S: Occasion to discuss the lesson?

Rob: Yes, a few minutes..

S: So, a future course should be better structured, better organized?

Rob: Yes, more observing what goes on in schools before going in. I spent all this energy on writing up lesson notes and nobody has even looked at them! Looking at them at the end doesn't help at all..

S: I feel you are frustrated and disappointed... ?

Rob: Yes.....

S: Any material from the library?

Rob: No, stuff at home, from friends..

S: Did you get any encouragement?

Rob: Not from the institution, the teachers at times, when Rose came she was quite helpful.

S: ...from the kids?

Rob: I think they liked me...maybe I was not as strict as their normal teacher, chewing gum, hair tight back, no earrings, correct kit, I couldn't handle all of that as well. Registers, locking up.. At the end of the lesson you send them out back to the changing rooms, then you have to pack your gear, go back up, lock the padlock of the gym behind you, when you get up there they are all standing there on the concrete floor until you have got there with the key to open the changing room doors so when you have got two consecutive lessons it's so hectic...So much of the teaching is knowing the kids, having a relation with them. To know their names helps a lot....

S: ....?... thank you very much!



#### A.4 Second Interview with Roberta

Abbreviations: TP :Teaching Practice  
                   Daisy :Course Tutor  
                   Rose :Dance Tutor  
                   TPt :Teaching Practice dance teacher  
                   PGCE :Postgraduate certificate of education

S: Rob, you have now finished the PGCE in dance and drama - can you talk about your personal improvement, professional improvement and appreciation of dance?

Rob: Hmm... not a lot..In some ways I don't think the course has got off the ground either in drama or dance..I was hoping on the dance side that I would actually improve in technique, but there were no real classes laid on and .. Rose was fine as far as she went she was very helpful during TP but that was about it...

S: What about your personal dance improvement?

Rob: Hmm a little bit, I found it very difficult to get motivated on this course because everything seemed to be so lax, people didn't turn up on time...

S: Any difference between 1st, second and 3rd term? Or about the same?

Rob: Well, TP dominated in the 1st and 2nd term, we went in for five weeks before our first TP and that was fairly hectic but it was also new that you didn't get that much out of it. Then TP came along...the 3rd term just fell apart, nothing happened except for the production and the video session.

S: ...the video workshop after the course?

Rob: Yes...

S: Have you now a different view of yourself now you've done a year of dance? Has it affected the image you have of yourself?

Rob: I...think that I have come to the conclusion that I am not a dancer and that I am frustrated.

S: ..because the course as you said didn't really get off?

Rob: I was very grateful of the opportunity but hmm, I've just come to the conclusion that I am too old (laughter) and that ...I think I could have made it given a different course but then you see I don't think that she



should have taken me on this course. I mean you can't expect in a postgraduate year to be taught the basics of a subject in a way, which I suppose I was looking for.

S: She took you on because of mime? Maybe she hoped this side would cover ...

Rob: It's totally different, I mean they are very closely linked but...I've taken technique classes and physically I could probably get to.. but as to dance for movement, for putting movement together making a dance..I'm still no better off, no nearer.

S: Do you think so? This is not my impression from your teaching practice...well..another question: you said you are not nearer to putting steps together - would that refer to being a teacher or dancer?

Rob: I think I can cope with teaching younger children...

S: putting dance steps together for them?

Rob: yeah, ...but I would feel very inadequate with older groups, well 4th,5th,6th years. We had that session with V. when she came to demonstrate with her pupils, she was excellent, but most of those kids in that class were of a higher standard than me, so I am not that inclined to apply for jobs... If I got in on the right department, and built things up and attended extra curricular courses throughout teaching but it all seems such a long hard slope...

S: Summing up.. you think the course did not fulfil your expectations as to dance training? - What about dance appreciation?

Rob: Well, it hasn't helped that either...apart from me knowing what goes on in schools. I could always appreciate dance, the theoretical side of it was non-existent, I only came to any conclusions through my own efforts on...I mean there was just no theory to that dance course!

S: Weren't there any planned courses..

Rob: Not really,.. in the final term, if Rose had been around ...she wanted us to each choreograph a piece and she wanted us to talk about syllabus constructions and the place of dance in the curriculum, but ahh, ..nothing materialized

S: ...so you had only two terms basically..

Rob: Well, one and a half.. Rose disappeared half way through the second TP ...

S: How many times did she come and see you?

Rob: ...three.. nobody's ever looked at my file, Rose never looked at my file, Daisy never looked at my file - I just wondered what the point of keeping one was apart from my own. I mean I would have kept a file because I like to be

organized but...

S: .. you could have kept one for me!...

Rob: (half-laughing) yes,yes

S: ...hmm teacher training for dance education...you talked about your own experience on this pilot course, now if this course goes on - what should or what could be on the curriculum for teachers' training? Important features?

Rob: I think the most important thing is to keep up dance at your own level...to have a daily class because it is also much tied in with self-confidence and self-esteem. Without that you can't go into schools to teach. Well, you can, but you can crawl through it like I did...You've got to have the support of your tutor and other people, which I didn't really get because the group was so small ...and more theory ,more actual discussions and dissections of lessons and what goes on in lessons and why you're doing it, I mean there was none of that .. I mean I've constructed lessons just off the top of my head with some guidance from Rose, but when I actually analyze them I end up asking myself was it even dance?

S: ...hmm,yes, that comes out in your essay, you know, when you write:what is dance? But: theory of dance, theory of ...teaching...theory of history of dance- what kind of theory for dance teachers' training?

Rob: yes..yes, I think it should be...because you can't ... you're supposed to be a practitioner and an expert when you go into school,so without...I mean, although the theoretical background doesn't necessarily come in overtly into a lesson. You should in yourself know what you are about and you can't do that without some theory... hmm history of dance I would have liked just for my own personal interest point of view because it is an opportunity, it's a year I've had that has been an opportunity to actually get more to grips with things...but there was just no - help. I could read a book now as well as I could on the course..there were no ... there would be no...it was proposed that we should read things...everybody was given a book for a seminar but it was just never materialized...it was also packed..she wanted to do it during teaching practice...fairly heavy theoretical books to read during TP and then give the seminars on Friday...nobody was prepared to do it - it just fell apart...

S: Books like ..what?

Rob: The Nadel, The Dance Experience and Feeling and Form,..it's taken me six weeks to get hold of that book, I wanted to use it for my essay, it arrived in the library the other day ..so, I mean there were no books, absolutely no material in the dance side.

S: I mentioned dance appreciation earlier. Do you think it



should be an important feature of dance teachers' training course?

Rob: I really think that comes from the individual...presumably you wouldn't be on the course if you didn't have some appreciation and understanding of it.

S: ...I'm a bit nasty - which would be more important - to either have theory of dance, like..Rose, or is it more important to have dance, to be a dancer to go into schools? Which one?

Rob: Dance, I would say dance, I mean the syllabus at my school was very Laban-based and for me it was very dry, very technical, it wasn't dance, I mean, my impression, my image of dance is children dancing, doing Greek dances, doing Folk dances and then getting on to perhaps more creative dance but the kind of lesson where you go, bang, here is a symbol, move, here, this is a drum, here is a short, sharp effort movement, or this is a freebound(?)..whatever, I think it is more..it is more important to be a dancer.

S: You said 'technical', the syllabus is technical, 'technical' wouldn't then mean..like a technical exercise, point your feet, pull your knee up..sort of...

Rob: In terms of analysis? In terms of what kind of movement it is..

S: You mean, on this syllabus, first a word would come and then the children would do a movement which they relate to the word...like..

Rob: yeah, the vocabulary first and then understand what it is about when they are old enough to understand.

S: What would be your teaching approach, then?  
You said: children dance - how do you get them that far?

Rob: Well, I still think the lesson has to be fairly structured...I think I'd concentrate a bit more on styles of dance, teaching them actual dances and giving them more free choices to what they did with a piece of music .. I mean even if it was boring for me I think one of my first approaches would be go in and say "bring in some music you want to dance to which -you can't do that on teaching practice - and let them dance to pop music for 8 to 10 weeks until they'd discover how boring it was and then introduce them to different ways....I think there is a very prevalent attitude at the moment that dance in schools means contemporary dance only, contemporary style only that you see in the theatre, well that is highly skilled technically and you can hardly expect children to dance like that, they are much happier doing fun things, and then show actual dances and using .. hmm... things like scarves and bells,rythm,..

S: If you had to define dance by another word what would it be? What other word would characterize dance for you in schools?



Rob: ...Vitality? and Happiness. I mean, I really had difficulties with that idea of forcing these kids to do things. The fact that they were in a lesson and constrained to do it, it's like..it breaks the first principle of play in that it's a voluntary...

S: Do you think it should not be a compulsory subject, a free subject..?

Rob: It's very difficult because without giving them the choice, the basic how do they ever know it.. if you say it's not compulsory you deprive them so you have to get a happy balance where it's on the curriculum but you have to make them want to do it ..and that is very difficult to do especially with boys because of the social ...indoctrination or training or whatever they've had that dance is for girls...I think the limits between things like dance and mime should be easily crossed ...I mean looking back, that lesson with Ron where he finally joined in with the burglars - a lot of people would say that wasn't dance that was just miming to music but there were times where they used the rhythm of the music, and to actually get them up and use a medium other than their voices was something! I think that's what pure practitioners would say wasn't dance, but somebody like N. at the PE dept could see what I had achieved just by getting those boys to move...and so I don't think.. You can't really be pure about what dance is in schools ...

S: ..it is important for me... to understand that for you vitality, fun.. are key words... - what function would you say has or could have dance in schools? - you said that you would expose them to different styles of dance, but how would you actually achieve that? Would you try to teach them different kinds of technique ...

Rob: Hmm..I'd try and..get them to know their bodies and to use their bodies with whatever - I can only pass on what I know which isn't a lot but just the feeling of being able to use their bodies and getting pleasure from that, I mean I know, and...when I don't do exercises for 2.3 weeks I feel so lousy in myself that just to get that feeling of muscles moving and stretching and you need some of that to be able do a Greek dance or Folk dancing, you don't need a lot of that because those dances only involve skipping and... which comes naturally to them.-  
The function of dance in a school  
... it's as much a release from the desk-bound atmosphere and to allow them to be creative and enjoy themselves and not have to use their brains in the sense that it being a chore...hmm,because it's a pleasure in life or it can be.-

S: Can you give me an example of a successful lesson?

Rob: Well, I tended to estimate my success by whether I managed to involve the boys or not. Quite a few of the first year lessons were successful or alright, I think the kids enjoyed them and I think they learned something about their



bodies ...there's 2 lessons that stick out, one was the one where Ron who was very reluctant came into the lesson fully clothed, wasn't prepared to participate at all and I just gave them the basic story line of burglars stealing from a house, which involved creeping around the house and climbing into the house and then stealing.. to the Pink Panther theme and I used masks to get them involved and I think that was successful because they enjoyed doing it. there was no cajoling, they did it because they wanted to do it. The other lesson which was hmm the Greek style dance which ...this particular lesson I had been so fed-up with the boys always dominating the class that I decided to ignore them, which technically I shouldn't have done because they were climbing up apparatus and I'd have been legally wrong for doing that but there three girls in that class and I just decided to ignore the boys and concentrate on the girls so I put the music on and started teaching the girls and by the end of the lesson there were two boys still sat out because I .. as soon as I introduced scarves they were interested and I made two conditions: the 1st condition was that they tied the scarf around their right wrists the second condition that once they tied on they were in, they had to participate...and they accepted it, and if they wanted to sit out they took the scarf off and they sat out ...and the fact that it was voluntary ..meant that they joined in..as they saw that the girls were enjoying it and the music got faster and faster which I think was very attractive to them and it was quite technically challenging to them. In fact I generally found out that the girls were more competent in what I asked them to do than the boys and when the boys could see that I was actually praising the girls for being competent they were interested, they wanted to know. and..so that to me was a successful lesson but that could only work with that particular type of lesson this style teaching a particular dance, I mean if I had been exploring ..efforts..and floor-patterns (laughing) then it would not have worked ..

S: It's a shame the tape doesn't show the smile in your eyes when you're saying 'exploring' - what was your most disastrous lesson?

Rob: -the worst? It was with the first two groups where I had a very bad cold and a sore throat, very tired, and I started the lesson by saying "I've got a sore throat and I don't intend to shout and I expected fairly responsible behaviour, I certainly didn't get it - they just ran amock.

S: Well that was the vitality you claim for dance, wasn't it?! What was their behaviour in the following class?

Rob: They were fine after a while they... I mean I didn't really know them and they didn't know me and ..on the whole I enjoyed working with the first years because again , the boys at that stage hadn't reached the obstreperous dance-is-for-girls bit although they were beginning



to...although they enjoyed it they would never admit it..strange..

S: You said you used masks for the boys ..?

Rob: That helped them join in ..a lot to do with one of the characteristics of play which is why drama is successful ..it takes them out of the ordinary world, they need something to which to latch on to...physically so that they don't feel awkward and embarrassed so it's not them running, creeping around the gym, they can imagine themselves in the role.

S: Do you think girls need that less than boys?

Rob: Not really... I think they can be equally embarrassed in front of..maybe in an all-girls class perhaps they would need it less, but in a mixed situation I think they need it..

S: What in the teachers' training should be emphasized - we spoke about your TP you gave an example of a good/bad lesson - what should be emphasized?

Rob: There wasn't enough on the spot help, there was no discussion of particular lessons, it would have been useful to have videos, I mean it's painful -I hate it- but I think you can learn a lot from it..the tutor who comes in 3 times in 12 weeks really has no conception of your problems.  
You are dependent to a large extent on the teacher in the school - so, there should be far more liaison with the teachers in the schools. They should be invited to come and talk to groups, to give them more responsibility and make them feel more worthwhile - they feel very second rate and yet these tutors stroll in 3 times in 12 weeks ..like little gods and there should be more room for opinions. Rose's opinion clashed with mine at least once...

S: what was the issue?

Rob: It was a double lesson with the third years and I planned a term's work which involved changing a topic halfway through a double period,i.e.spending a lesson finishing off something and starting something new because it is a long time,2 50 minute periods...I finished off some work on percussion in the 1st period and in the 2nd period I switched to them the Greek thing. She didn't like that at all, she said I should spend the whole double lesson on percussion but I had already spent the double before on percussion, they were getting bored with it, so she didn't know the set-up..she disagreed, a matter of opinion on structuring a lesson

S: Would a solution be several dance tutors instead of one?

Rob: Not really, it needs to be consistent.

S: And video more helpful than books?



- Rob: Because you see yourself, you see your good points and your bad points, the way you spaced it, your voice, you can get a true picture of how much time you are spending on what because it is quite easy to come out of a lesson with a distorted view ..there should be more discussions with tutors with other people on the course, Gillian, Celine and I discussed a lot but I don't know what the others' lessons were like, we didn't have that much pooling of ideas which would have helped.
- S: Was that a lack of organisation or personal..
- Rob: Lack of organisation
- S: A suggestion: first TP lessons are videotaped and in the 2nd term as part of the course discussed in detail? Learning by practice..
- Rob: yes,yes...mhm
- S: Where did you get your ideas from?
- Rob: A lot of them came from Rose, one of the other criticisms is that before we went into school to teach we never visited a school to watch so I had absolutely no conception of what dance in schools was like, the level it was at..what kind of things you need to stimulate the kids so in the 1st TP everything depended heavily on Rose's ideas, music..but slowly you got to know what worked and what didn't and ..I tried to work within the syllabus, eg, body shapes, I came up with mobiles - I just had the idea...
- S: Did any dance lessons on the course help you for ideas for your lessons?
- Rob: Yes, things like Rose's secret squirrel and the percussssion was quite helpful but a lot came from me searching for music..the way Rose worked..I did it the opposite way round..I tended to look for music and see what I could do to it...hmm can't remember...
- S: What about dance technique classes?
- Rob: Your Jazz classes...that was a style I didn't know anything about, they were structured ..it did help, very useful with contemporary kids we're always trying to push old-fashioned things as far as they are concerned so to actually go in and say this is a style of dance and it's not just bopping in a disco, it's different, it's a technique you can learn so I think there should be far more styles. We should have had Folk dancing sessions different national dances, the emphasis was very much on little stories..
- S: In the preparation to TP?

Rob: Yes, like going to the beach, all that stuff..

S: At the end of this PGCE I would like to ask you about the different styles: classical ballet?

Rob: Uhh, very technical, point-work, very rigid, stylized, I like it more than I did. I used to hate it, I can appreciate it more now, but I don't think it has much place in school apart from the appreciation, why not.. it's too technical.. plus the fact it has all those social connotations, boys, like being raving fairies (laughter)..

S: Contemporary?

Rob: Contemporary to me is much more vital, it is a style, it is, I suppose, in its own way fairly rigid. To me it is much more flexible, I enjoy the patterns, ...the meaning is much more to do with the dance. In classical, there is an overt story line. In contemporary it is much more enigmatic, I enjoy that, you can make of it what you want.

S: You say enigmatic - would it be wrong if I said: 'abstract'?

Rob: Yes...

S: Jazz dance?

Rob: Jazz dance is...I see it as being more fun, more attainable  
I think to be a good Jazz dancer, you have to have a strong technique but you can get away without having such a strong technique and still enjoy it and still see an end-result which is visually acceptable...with contemporary I couldn't put a dance together and look at myself and think yes that's good, whereas with Jazz I could actually enjoy seeing myself move although I didn't have that much technique...Tap..I don't really know...

S: Ethnic?

Rob: ...mainly Indian style dances which I have seen, Greek which I haven't seen but which I purport to teach (laughter) hmm Folk dances..

S: Creative dance? (S imitating Rob) Blink, blink..

Rob: (Laughing)..creative dance: now children, melt like candles  
...open up like a flower...no comment...very wishy-washy undefined area

S: I'm sorry, I forgot one question, can I add it now at the end? - During the course you had certain classes. Which ones contributed to developing your own skills or enjoyment..on the PGCE?

Rob: Rose's were useful as far as what happens in schools..



Technically there wasn't very much. Contemporary classes... I don't have a memory of them, they were so brief...they petered out during TP again they were fairly technique-oriented which was OK but not enough, once a week, to give you a build-up.. Daisy's ..in the first term we had recreational dance on Wednesday afternoons, anybody from the institution could come in and they were pretty appalling, Daisy took them and I honestly don't think she has much of a clue, she was asking me to do things, demonstrating things which were technically very difficult like head on straight knees, coming up from that with a straight back, table position, well, unless you are well trained you can't do that without doing yourself damage... they were like keep-fit classes, there was no real dance in them ... your classes which were fine, great, we enjoyed them and were the most consistent but if it hadn't been for the happy accident of you arriving on the scene and me going down to the foyer...we would never have met ..ludicrous...really, my main memory of the dance course would be you...I enjoyed that mainly as it got towards the production, I mean for all that I am not that happy with the place in the production, at least it was something we could actually latch on to and go out and do...

S: We worked quite hard and I think you all got the idea of what it means to work for a dance production -

Rob: I know that, mime is very similar, is minutely choerographed and you rehearse intensively for months before you go on show...

S: If you add up all the lessons, Historical dance 2,3 times, contemporary ?

Rob: say 6 times, Daisy's movement class about 5 times, and then Jazz, we had more Jazz than anything else because you happened to be there...about 8 lessons, and then for the rehearsals..

S: Obviously, one could say you are on a teaching training course, not a dance course...

Rob: The thing with dance is..it is physical, it's not like an academic thing where you can take it in and store it, you have to keep practicing it to be a practitioner, you can't just...that's where I disagree with Daisy,..there should be a daily class and she said no... she said that people who come on the course should be disciplined enough to keep up their own physical exercise she doesn't seem to understand any of the psychological qualities of what it means to do a class. One of the things I was most looking forward to was after having worked for four years to have the opportunity to take time out to do something, in a disciplined way and it never happened...it says in the leaflet that students would be given an opportunity to keep up their dance at their own level - it states that in black and white - I can show you the leaflet and it just never



materialized.

S: You sound very down...the fact that you haven't got a job ...

Rob: There is no advice about what you are letting yourself in for. ...I shouldn't have been that naive as to ... I should have realized that most drama jobs go with English and most dance in schools is within PE departments. But I didn't know that.

S: You were not told the implications? -you were just too happy you got on a course? A grant..

Rob: And the institution has the reputation...I was fairly lazy when it came to going into lectures, I don't think the system of learning by lectures is particularly good.

S: So learning by what?

Rob: I don't know..more seminars. --actually looking at the course content, education side, I thought it was quite a good set-up but having attended lectures in the first term quite regularly and coming out thinking oh, I didn't learn anything, I just gave up going to them. Some people went through that whole course without ever going to one! A week before the exams you panic a bit, you read a bit, spew up on paper a bit and get through!

S: Now you have got the degree don't play it down...

Rob: One of the most embarrassing moments was at that conference where she (Daisy) asked three of us to give out leaflets and she actually stood up and stated that this course was for professional dancers! ..Well, I am glad to have had the opportunity but having taken me on they should have provided more for me and Gill. But if you can't provide that in a one year teacher training course you don't take on people like me, in which case you are missing out on a lot. I do think that people like me and Gillian have a lot to offer ...

S: But you say it's better to be a good dancer to go into schools...whereas you might be good teachers with a certain lack of technique...

Rob: I think there is a place for an intensive dance teacher training course which covers all aspects which is hmm ..the theory of teaching, the theory of dance but it must, it must have the practical - if I had had a year's intensive classes I could be fairly good technically ...and it is very expensive and costly to do that in dance studios, the time as well - she's got the facilities, the money...it's ideal! Even someone who had all that dance training before needs to be pushed, to keep up dance at your own level..once you lose the feeling for it it becomes academic, a chore... even the sessions with Rose seemed to slouch along because we could not do some of the things because we didn't

have the physical...what it took to do it...  
here is the leaflet's picture...jumping, contemporary,...

S: You think there is place for an intensive dance teacher's training course..

Rob: Yes, there has to be

S: The people on the course?

Rob: People like me with some attitude, who want to do it but so far hadn't an opportunity to...

S: You got into Jazz quite ...amazingly..  
....anything on your mind?...In your essay you write about play - is dance a more remote form of play, drama closer to reality? ..

Rob: The place of both of them in the curriculum.. I think there is a lot... they are both creative and expressive hmm, but the links were never explored, she (Daisy) kept saying "they are so closely linked" but the links were never really discussed. This essay...she said it was good, but why write this essay now as an assessment? That should have been written in the first term and everybody'd read up their essay and discuss in depth(?)... You hand in a piece of work and you never see it again, no comment, no discussion, what's the use of having ideas if you can't...

S: No constructive dicussion...that's the same for every course..

Rob: Also in zoology...no discussion..

S: The fact that you did have to write an essay on dance - did that clarify your ideas?

Rob: Yes, ..it was the only theory that there was.

S: Which books...

Rob: mainly drama-based books and the things on play, homo ludens..

S: Could I have a look at those books?...Would you like to add anything? No?....OK...Thanks!



A.5 Interview with Gillian

Names:           Rose   :Dance Tutor  
                   Daisy :Course Tutor  
                   TPt    :Teaching Practice dance teacher  
                   tt     :team-teaching

S: Can you fill me in on your background, the essentials...?

Gil: A-levels English and history, BA in drama, postgraduate course on archive and collection studies, 1 year as a drama resources advisor...work with a theatre company doing school projects in the North, admin.work, boring.. came onto the PGCE in the hope of drama and museum option/visual display-education.

S: Can you tell me what you understand by dance?

Gil: I am not sure, dance teachers talk about movement, movement teachers about dance...the two words seem interchangeable.  
 Dance is more than movement, movement ...a gesture,e.g. walking down the street. Dance implies something that is more lyrical, has been planned and formalised, that comes from an imaginative idea that's then expressed in a particular form.

S: And your dance background?

Gil: At school? Very limited...on the drama course 3 hours modern, it was basic but gave us some hope. Now at the PGCE...

S: What about your social dancing, discos?

Gil: Yes, I enjoy it, I am interested in folk dancing, the step patterns, group dancing..

S: And what about dance performances?

Gil: Yes, e.g. LCDT, Ludus, Chris Donovan, young choreographers

S: Which dance forms interest you most?

Gil: Chris Bannerman, Footsteps, footprints in the sand, it had a depth to it, it was aesthetically pleasing, and had intellectual depth.

S: Reading about dance?

Gil: The odd biography, Graham, Nijinski, magazines, dance reviews. as to criticism... the language used hasn't found



its place yet. And TV.

S: Which styles and techniques are you familiar with?

Gil: Graham, the idea of contraction...a slim knowledge of classical ballet

S: Classical ballet?

Gil: Arms and legs, nothing that comes from the guts, makes the body seem effortless..grace..dignity..stylised moves..constrained..

S: Contemporary?

Gil: Far more aggressive, middle part of the body, the gut, central... more motivation in the movement..a more emotional reaction when I watch it, I can relate on an intellectual and emotional level...angular, less concerned with appearing dignified...effort..

S: Jazz?

Gil: Beat, rhythmical, fun, more humour, takes itself less seriously, more accessible to a wide range of people. Jazz dance, the disco dance and folk are nearer to the people. furthest is classical ballet.

S: Tap?

Gil: Movies, Fred Astaire, the Hoofers on TV...black!

S: Ethnic?

Gil: Ritual, e.g.rain dances, repetitive, percussive sounds, circular, orgiastic, more sexual..

S: Creative dance?

Gil: Is it a separate category? Ideally, it should be concerned with all those different forms, and all those forms should take in creativity.

S: Why are you on this PGCE?

Gil: For a variety of reasons...partly...training for a job... feeling that I have the ability to teach, the subject areas I am interested in need taking into schools far more than they are, a way to carry on with the performing arts...other than as a performer...

S: ..and why the dance option?

Gil: Drama and dance are so closely related, should be, music is important...I am for integrating them more than they are, dance should not be in the PE department.

S: What did you expect from this course?

- Gil: I had expected it would equip me with a teaching method, with an ideology, with methods, aims and concepts of why you teach... the different systems that operate in this country for teaching..
- S: What is your favourite age group?
- Gil: Primary school..I don't know..a variety. It keeps you fresh. Requires varied approaches, skills etc.
- S: Are you teaching single sex classes?
- Gil: my experience is only with girls. The problem with boys: embarrassed, cissy, puberty...I think you should not segregate them. But what should happen: it must start earlier on so that boys and girls get used to move together..
- S: What would you say is the benefit of dance lessons for pupils?
- Gil: It's learning to use a particular language, another communication skill.  
Everybody does have imagination, some sort of creativity, dance is the way of channelling that. Most children hve access to paint brush, clay, they should have the chance to use their body. Without learning they find it an embarrassment to use their whole body...a crippling factor if people don't learn to express themselves with the whole body.
- S: What do you hope to achieve by teaching dance then?
- Gil: I try to avoid the text book answers like body awareness, kinaesthetic, creativity, all that jargon.....
- S: Would you - and how - justify dance on the curriculum?
- Gil: I wouldn't justify any subject unless everybody else does justify their subject, French etc. For dance the same argument as for music, art... to do with an artistic expression, self-expression, leading a child to speak about themselves.
- S: How would you describe your needs as a teacher in schools?
- Gil: ...very practical... a good working space - not a room for school-dinners - how the hell can they be creative after they walked through cold concrete corridors..!
- S: What parameters would you set for the introduction of dance in schools?
- Gil: Hmm -what syllabus?...  
The facilites must be available first.  
the school must be supportive so that the dance teacher is not working against the odds...a good relationship with the other arts ...Dance should be a compulsory subject on the curriculum up to the 3rd year, optional from 4th to 6th



year... an examination syllabus, although I don't know how the O-level syllabus will work.

S: So you think that dance in schools should be assessed?

Gil: Unfortunately, because of the school system, at the moment, if they are not assessed they are relegated to subjects that don't really have much weight. In order to get status in a subject we are reduced to employing an examination system.  
But if assessment, then continual assessment rather than one final examination with a solo piece..

S: Do you think that any particular dance style is more suitable for schools than another?

Gil: No, I think as much variety as possible.

S: How would you characterize a good dance teacher?

Gil: ...I guess the ability to extract a lot of ideas and commitment from the children, how important it is to question them about what they think...I find myself telling them what I want rather than saying what do you think how you could move to this, what does it make you think of? How does it make you feel when you listen to it? I tend to put things rather as a statement than a question...a good teacher has the ability to encourage a most apathetic listless group of adolescent girls to actually want to get up and move! To have that control factor, the ability to keep their concentration, keep them involved against the odds...a lot comes from the respect for children...

S: Does the technical competence of the teacher make her/him a good teacher?

Gil: It has to be important, you must be technically competent. The problem can also be that you are technically over-aware ...can be a restricting factor...from watching the teachers at this school...this teacher has classical ballet training, gives them only classical music, alienates the pupils, expects too much in the sense of being able to count the music, things she has taken for granted because she has been nurtured on them.

S: What is a good dance class to you?

Gil: ..children that are imaginatively involved, that the class are trusting of the teacher...mutual trust and respect, that they are enjoying it, that they are co-operative with one another

Technical problem - the tape had stopped. While I tried to make it work again, Gillian talked about her teaching practice. I added from memory the following passage



immediately after the end of the interview.

From memory: Gillian's 5 weeks' teaching dance were unsatisfactory because Gillian had only 1 dance lesson a week, because they did not consider her a trained in 'Laban-technique' for x-number of years. Gillian taught 12 lessons, observed a lot, gave ideas, saw how they controlled the girls. Her school was a large comprehensive of approx. 1500 pupils, 100 staff, mixed background, trendy middle-class, Greek-Cypriote, West Indian. Asian...racial tension was less than Gillian had expected, but the language problems, religion showed in dance. The Greek girls were pro Greek dance, one had to accommodate that and acknowledge it - it was their way of giving themselves an identity... Discipline problems are quite apparent, rows, a lot of confrontation, a lot of petty rules which then were disobeyed by the girls, e.g. school uniforms, especially for the 17 and 18 year olds, chewing gum...the staff smoke - such a contradiction, this double standard that the girls couldn't do that. ...They put so much stress on silence in the class, small areas of personal behaviour, when it came to the really important rules the girls did not differentiate. The girls rebelled against the small things, they also rebelled against the things that really mattered.  
- Tape working again

S: Are there any particular rules concerning dance?

Gil: The rules and routines concerning dance are justified, e.g. take your jewellery off..

S: Compulsory dance kit?

Gil: No, but it is suggested..sort of "it would be good if", plus the information where to get tights. It was a mixture, some girls were into their appearance...

S: Who was your TPT?

Gil: A young girl who was only in her 2nd year in the school... a trained dancer, classical, very easy to talk with, but very intimidated by the head of PE, she is in a difficult position...sat in on all my lessons for safety reasons and comment.

S: ...helpful comments?

Gil: Yes, e.g. make them sit down first before you talk to them as a group, because I am small, also it is a good control factor. She would give me suggestions where a lesson was weak... she would give me suggestions as to how re-model it, how to approach it...very practical..

S: How did you structure your lessons?

Gil: I didn't do a very long warm up because for mainly practical reasons, it took them 10 minutes to get changed and come over, 10 minutes at the other end of the lesson to get them changed, which left me 20-minute-lessons! So, 5-6 minutes for the warm up, but before: the register, sick-notes, get them shake out different bits, get them to flop down and uncurl. Often I concentrated on a particular thing, e.g. feet, all very slap-dash, very quick, and I would have them travelling, with the drum, specific ways to move, body parts leading or...then sit them all down again, put on the music, say 'that's the music I would like us to dance to' and then suggest a theme but (?)..length of the lesson, so only one basic theme for the whole 6 weeks. As to justification for this: I had subsections because the music I used had several clearly different changes of mood and rhythm in it, a Wings record, . I used the idea of a band of criminals on the run from prison. As the song suggests, They started off in a prison listless, confined, so it was a slow, sustained movement (tongue in cheek), then it was breaking out, percussive, strong, the 3rd and 4th lessons were building up the section where they escape from prison and are on the run: travelling steps. I taught them a short set dance to see how that worked...I kept it very simple (laughter) because I realised how difficult it is to get the simplest thing across a gang of children.

S: How many children ...in a class?

Gil: 33 - a lot!

S: Can you see a development in the way you taught at the beginning - and now?

Gil: The way I approach things has changed quite considerably, I talk far less, I say it far more simply and directly. I use demonstration far more. In the 1st lesson I would have described it verbally, whereas by the 4th, I would sit them down and then pick a group, stand them up and go through it with that group so that the others could see what I meant because obviously they learn far more by showing than the actual talking it through. Because of my whole background I tend to describe rather than to show. talking too much... it was insecurity. But I gradually drew more on them, they gave me more ideas, I was...because I got more confident I didn't go in with such a set plan I had to stick to, I went in more flexibly and allowed things to come from them far more...



S: Was your teaching style much different from their usual teacher's?

Gil: Quite a bit...they really liked what I did with them, that's not necessarily a merit of mine...and caught on very quickly to what I wanted, towards the latter lessons, when I was getting better with them I never had any problems with not wanting to do the work or poor behaviour, I got them on my side from the very first, because I chose a modern piece of music. They were only young, 11, the music to them was really trendy, really hip, and they thought they were doing something their older brothers and sisters thought terribly 'with it' and I got full cooperation because of that. Up to that they had Tschaikovsky and various... classical music they could not associate with at all.

S: How do you feel about your teaching practice?

Gil: I feel I have survived, I've learnt so much...mainly about me that I am prepared to go into the next one more positively...I was very scared...In dance, I had spent a lot of time team-teaching(tt) with the older girls, I now want to teach the older girls. Their TPt would structure the lesson, choose the content, the music, split them into groups and my job was to filter round, take individual groups and work with them. I enjoyed that but had no overall responsibility for decisions to make.

S: You mentioned mixed racial backgrounds - did you notice different movement styles or qualities?

Gil: The black girls...more humour in their dance! Far more cheeky, very imaginative, they often have problems in their stance, in their posture, bottoms are often out...

S: Asian girls?

Gil: Quite good on step work, step patterns..White English: often very stiff, legs in particular, to get them to bend at the knee...! They like pretty movements. I tried to choose work that was quite strong, physical, gutsy because they tend to be a bit twee, airy-fairy, they rather like themselves, Western girls, rather vain.

S: Did - and in what way - the theory at the institution, before TP help you?

Gil: we didn't have 5 weeks of dance lessons because in the 1st week nothing happened in terms of theory, I thought really under-equipped to go out. It was exasperating! It was very inadequate. The dance part has been better run and structured than drama. The dance person brought in different ideas for lessons and extracted...she made us devise a lesson, read it, criticised it, she made us each take a lesson. We worked all types of warm ups and how to demonstrate it. what the warm ups are doing, facing the class, do it with the other foot, arm, simple things...she geared us far more to actually going



into TP. We hadn't really talked about the theory at all... when you go in there, the theory goes to pot...the woman that takes us in dance...I don't altogether understand her approach and I don't altogether sympathize with it, but she was aware of what we had got to face.

S: What would help a next PGCE group to go along more easily?

Gil: If you have 50% dance you should have 50% tuition in dance! One Thursday morning is not nearly enough! And have more than one tutor involved so that you get a variety of approaches and techniques and a more structured time-table and what ...(?) of what you hope to achieve so you all know what you're aiming for.

S: Did the Fridays at the institution provide you with new ideas?

Gil: Not really, Daisy talks so much that we don't get to talk to each other - not only the consoling aspect, but an actual exchange of what worked and why and what didn't. You desperately need it! For all, it was exhausting, depressing, it was a terrible experience in many senses...you just go home and burst into tears the 1st weeks. We weren't really given to do what was necessary on Fridays, we didn't see the dance tutor on a Friday, she is only paid for Thursday mornings...(?)...she visited my school, I had a brief chat with her, it's just not enough. It's not her fault, it's the institution's. On Fridays there was no opportunity for the dance students to talk about dance. there should be more integration in terms of discussion... Rose was very helpful, wrote a comprehensive critique of the observed lesson and gave it to me afterwards, she was praising me so I didn't feel devastated, she was also asking me how I would go on from where I had got to, how I could develop the ideas and themes...I might disagree, but it still was enlightening, it's still useful to have somebody there as a springboard.

S: What kind of dance theory would you have found useful? Or rather ethnological theory to cope with the variety of pupils?

Gil: I'd have liked an understanding of the different ethnic dance forms, e.g. Greek dance for a start, I'd have liked to incorporate that into a lesson, but I needed myself to be equipped and I wasn't so I didn't feel secure enough to use it..

S: Do you agree with the method of being thrown in at the deep end?

Gil: It's absolutely appalling! Day-release, a combination of theory and practice would be...you can get in stuffed with theoretical concepts and ideologies...when you get there, it has no relation with what happens, you've got to have the two...

S: ..e.g. 3 days at the institution, 2 at the school?



Gil: Yes, ideally! Gradually build it up...rather than a block.

S: Will your next TP be in the same place?

Gil: In a way, I'd like the variety, but it's such a devastating thing to go into a school, on a basis of being a student - the girls very quickly realize you are a student - there is so much to it, just the formalities, how it operates, the personalities on the staff, the negotiation that has to take place, the language to use, the sound system...just getting to know how to operate...go through all that again in a new school...the time is so short. I can go back now and concentrate far more on the lessons than last time...this time I have 4 dance lessons that I am teaching, which is still small, 1 with the 6th years, 1 with the 4th - they are very aggressive, lots of problems, the 3rd years have only 6 weeks so she wants to establish a relationship with them because they are perhaps going to take it as an option. That makes you question why they have accepted a dance student..

S: ...the staff?

Gil: You have to tread very carefully...unknown territory...you have to accept that they are the professionals and you are the student. You can't be very critical of what they are doing because you are not supposed to know as much as they do...to get them to justify why and what they are doing in a way that they are not actually aware that you are doing that...it gets very subtle because...I have to find out. I am getting very sceptical about what she (TPt) is doing, difficult to find out why she works in such a way without her suspecting that I am doubtful of it.

S: ...administration?

Gil: No, she was very helpful in offering resources, material, records, makes yourself-sufficient, but in a way, at least offers...She didn't have much time for me, she would talk to me after the lesson but do other things at the same time... very frustrating. But when you see the kind of pressure they are under, reports, give behaviour grade, all sorts of grading...they are pushed, so...

S: Did you enjoy the teaching?

Gil: I do the dance teaching, mainly because I was in this peculiar situation of only teaching one lesson, so I was looking forward to that one lesson...Some lessons, the girls were very productive. the girls enjoyed it, that gave me a great sense of relation, real pleasure... the time factor...how can you progress, develop anything thorough in such a short time?

S: Any discipline problems?

Gil: Not with this class, very boisterous, coming in in cart-wheels, jump on the stage, you have to say 'down', but if you do tell them to do something, they accept it. Other classes...their insolence...it has a lot to do with their streaming, in a comprehensive, the intelligent girls the higher up they are in intelligence, the more they seem to accept rightly or wrongly the restrictions, and, in a way, the best work, in some instances, comes from from the low ability class where there is so much imagination they don't restrict their personal response to things. But, hand in hand with that goes great discipline problems. - You need a balance- they should mix the classes up far more than they do, none at all. And yet they do, it's convenient, it's administratively and organisationally desirable, but not in terms of teaching dance...

S: Gillian, thank you very much.



A.6 First Interview with Celine

Names:           Daisy: Course Tutor  
                   Rose : Dance Tutor  
                   TP    : Teaching Practice  
                   TPt   : Teaching Practice dance teacher

S: Celine - what does the word dance evoke in you?

Cel:...very complex...a quick definition: movement with feeling  
 as opposed to straight movement.

S: What is your dance background?

Cel:As a 6-7 year old: children's ballet, then modern, tap,  
 Greek dance, a friend introduced me to it, so I went as  
 well. All sorts of techniques, at my college (BA hons  
 Performing Arts), choreo, directing, producing.  
 Training...free and cheap dance classes..

S: Do you go to discos?

Cel:I enjoy jiving around

S: Social dancing?

Cel:In discos, yes, rock and Jazz, not so much  
 funk, it's trendy...

S: Have you been to dance performances?

Cel:Recently...Chris Donovan, London youth contemporary...  
 I am not impressed by LCDT, but very impressed by ethnic  
 dance, amateur groups (Rosemary Butcher) don't impress me...  
 too self-indulgent, I believe that if you are going to  
 perform anything it's got to be shared with the audience and  
 not just done purely for yourself.

S: What about reading on dance?

Cel:Papers, dance in education stuff, TV dance month, BBC 2,  
 trashy TV shows...

S: Which techniques are you familiar with?

Cel:Ballet, Graham, Cunningham, IDTA jazz and modern, Greek,  
 tap, jazz, disco

S: Classical?

Cel:...royal, very strict, rigorous training, with beautiful

results, a specific style limiting for learning other styles

S: Contemporary?

Cel:...as a root from classical, freer styles...

S: Jazz?

Cel:Jazz is my favourite, very lively, rhythmic, sensuous, very bright, bouncy..

S: Tap?

Cel:...a strenuous technique, rhythmical, impressive

S: Ethnic?

Cel:...impressive, rhythmical, powerful

S: Creative dance?

Cel:I am critical because...it can be interesting but it can be totally boring...-my favourites are jazz and tap

S: Can you explain to me why you are doing this PGCE?

Cel:Because of my hon.s.project I got interested in working with kids on a learning basis...rewarding...the psychology... ..the philosophy...

S: Why did you choose dance and drama?

Cel:These are the subjects I know most about.

S: What are your expectations of the course?

Cel: I set out to learn... and I have to be impressed...

S: So you intend to use the PGCE qualification to teach dance?

Cel:In some establishment...

S: Teaching dance to whom? Single-sex or mixed groups?

Cel:I prefer mixed classes, girls are far too hysterical...

S: And what would be the benefits for pupils?

Cel:I don't know how they benefit it...they seem to enjoy it... relaxation, change from their academic work, the benefit to less academically minded children, the chance for them to shine. Dance develops sides in the human being that is not developed in our present school system.

S: And what would the achievements be?

Cel:...widen their horizon...



- S: Following ...from benefits and achievements - how would you justify dance in education?
- Cel: It's easier to justify it in comprehensives with mixed ability groups because of the importance of levelling out the successful areas for children, the physical side helps develop the intellectual one.
- S: Could you outline your needs as a dance teacher in a school?
- Cel: First the need for facilities: there is a lack of studios. Tolerance for the lack of consideration from the other departments. A great faith in your subject to get it over to the kids and a great liking for them.
- S: If any, what problems can you anticipate?
- Cel: Lack of discipline!
- S: If you were asked to introduce dance in schools - what parameters would you set?
- Cel: I would try to connect it to areas they are aware of, e.g. poetry, and take them to see dance companies.
- S: Do you think dance should be assessed?
- Cel: Yes, if the methods of qualification by assessment and them being assessed in other subjects - yes... necessary, it gives them an extra qualification, e.g. a CSE. Continual assessment is probably very valuable for practical subjects, assessing their development and achievement.
- S: Do you think there is, and if yes, which one, a particular style/technique that is more appropriate for teaching dance in schools than another?
- Cel: ...a general style...in schools there is a cross-section of the public. Introducing dance to an entire society it has to appeal to the majority... an overall body awareness, of space, relationships to partners, their own bodies, to shapes...to music,...of interpretation and improvisation...
- S: What would be the characteristics of a good dance teacher?
- Cel: They should know the technique they are teaching! To be able to do it is important. Kids like to see someone who is better than they are.
- S: And what would be the main characteristics of a good lesson?
- Cel: ...not too specialised a dance class, keeping the exercises general, general conditioning, enjoyment, interesting ways of working..
- S: What is your lesson plan for your first lesson?



Cel: Aims and objectives, a warm up relating to...a training session where you develop a certain exercise, set them pieces of work to make them think and use their body, with a climax, showing their routine, and a relaxing period...

S: Any - what kind of - preparatory work?

Cel: Observing classes, researching the appropriate stimulating music...I spent a good few hours for the first lesson plan!

S: How do you structure your lessons?

Cel: A 10-minute warm up. a 10-minute training session...last minutes learning the routine and showing the finished result.

S: Any material?

Cel: ...a continuation of their previous week's lesson...levels, low, high, medium, travelling at different levels, directions and rhythms, made them count an example. -The warm up: rubbing their bodies, clapping, partners, rubbing back to back.... -  
I find it an extreme strain to teach dance in education because it's so structured and disciplined...

The second part of the interview had to take place three weeks later because of time schedules.

Cel: In the first term I had 6 weeks 10 hours a week TP within the PE department, with four teachers...different styles and attitudes.

I first was very very inhibited, I thought I had to be 'dance-educational' as opposed to real dance: you have to analyse everything before you know what you are doing - tends to be a bit tedious .. Laban.

I think you ought to learn to dance first, at least up to 4th year, and then, when they have a wide idea of dance and a wide movement vocabulary of movements, styles and techniques, then you can start analysing, but to ask a kid to analyse a movement at 12 years old I think is ridiculous... the general idea about dance education is to make them think about what they are doing but I think you have to make them think in a creative way first before you can make them think in an analytical way.

S: Would you call that thinking then? Thinking in a creative way? Or be creative?

Cel: yeah, they have to think in sections, rhythms, being inventive, in teams. You have to have a concept of what dance is however poor you are, before you can analyze it. We've got to give them that idea first before we expect them to start dissecting levels, dynamics etc  
....40% subnormal at XX, all girls, mostly black, mixed

abilities...- no room for idealism, if you can get the class to do something you are OK...discipline, noise-level are priorities.

S: What were your lesson preparations then?

Cel:...lesson plans for each lesson. The first lesson was horrendous. Eventually I got round to teaching my own style.

I had to break everything down, could not be inventive because of PE teachers... discipline - I don't stand any nonsense. They soon got used to that.

S: Can you see a process, a progress, from the first lesson to the last one of your TP?

Cel:Yes, in the shape of the lesson, I started off with a warm up then a few basic training exercises and finished off with a sequence I taught them part of and they finished off in partners. Balancing that, regarding time was a bit different at first. School rules...PE kit, chewing gum...

S: was the development towards adapting more to the rules and regulations of the school?...But you also imposed your style of teaching and discipline onto the class..

Cel:I had to find a working method that suited me and the children and the school.- All my material came from my own dance background, not the course. The actual setting out of a lesson plan I was taught here.

S: Could you describe some of your warm ups?

Cel:Simple, eg shaking out hands, slapping your thighs, swings. I gave them in the beginning strengthening exercises like plies, brushes and stretches, floor work. Eventually I got it round to whatever sequence I developed for them to finish off the lesson with. I taped parts of that, eg shoulder shakes, I'd give them shoulder shakes at the beginning of the lesson. Eventually my training exercises came from my sequences.

S: Did you prepare a sequence for each class?

Cel:A different one for the first years, one for the 2nd years.

S: Do you think that the children gained some new movement material from the sequences?

Cel:Yes, I did teach them some things, they used things I had given them when they had to work something out for themselves eg slapping thighs, novel things...stuck in their mind, they definitely picked things up.

S: Sequences to music?- Did the fact that you had a great many black children influence the choice of music?

Cel:Yes, I tended not to use soul, they move to it naturally,



my theory is: if you are supposed to be educating them then you have to widen their horizon, their movement vocabulary in every direction. Soul...I use it because obviously it's going to win them round to your favour.

S: What music did you use?

Cel: A march, jazz, DH Hardman, I'd never heard of him before a girl brought the records in, Shaft.

S: No contemporary classical music? Too far from their music?

Cel: ...fairly popular music...-

S: How do you feel about this TP?

Cel: I gained a lot, I learnt a lot about myself, about structuring a lesson which is useful for anything you do... I learnt a lot about being with black people generally, I loved the kids, good to work with.

S: And the school?

Cel: I don't like the suppression, all that energy, the noise, it's obviously a barrier, but it's not redirected into any other area, it's just stamped on. In all practicalities and reality the teachers are just human beings, just a day to day thing, I don't think there is much damage done to the kids, because let's face it, they have a much tougher life outside school, there's a lot of violence, the school is quite a doddle to them.- Teachers are petty, here (at the institution) you got told to be careful because teachers get jealous of you taking a lesson better than they do, teachers get possessive over their lessons...teachers' sloppy behaviour ....I had to take the register because there is a lot of truancy in the school. At the end of every lesson you have to make remarks on an incentive sheet...daily report on every pupil. At the end of every lesson the teacher gives marks out of three for conduct and attendance, for the overall class. The children can also be on personal, individual report if badly behaved, for a week...it's a good idea in this particular school because you can note the kids on report behave a lot better and it's not as suppressive as detention, it's more private: handing the teacher a sheet of paper to sign is not quite so obvious...

S: What and how was the contact with the institution during TP?

Cel: Friday mornings session with the Daisy, afternoon drama session, discussing our problems with each other, sharing ideas. Important to get that day away from the school and knowing that other people are just as bad or worse than you are... and hate it just as much. Swap material.

S: Any help from the teachers at your school?



Cel: Not really, I worked along all the other dance teachers in the department...not always a teacher sitting in, observing the class. TPt was very sympathetic, supportive, very constructive things.

S: Did the weeks before TP at the institution help? What do you think would your teaching success depend on?

Cel: Most of the success stands to personality, the only actual help I got was from the dance department, at the institution, from Rose.

Dance is a more structured subject, drama is very much up to the imagination. These kids are not cerebral, who are much more into doing things, practical, it's much more harder (sic) to see them develop in drama than in dance.

S: Any suggestions for the course at the institution?

Cel: Advising handbooks for drama, more practical advice, more structured practical advice, not just improvised, it didn't stick...

S: You basically agree with being thrown in at the deep end?

Cel: Yes, even less time at the institution would do...the only way to learn is to do it yourself.

S: And then come back and learn the theory, relate it to your experience?

Cel: Yes...that was the nasty shock, in the first five weeks we were theorizing and terribly ideal, and you know it as you discuss it, it's got to be very realistic, down to the minute attitude when you are in a teaching situation... Going straight in is the only way to learn to teach. I know, very middle class students going into TP in very middle class schools? What have they to gain? I maintain: a very wide experience makes a good teacher.

S: What about teaching girls?

Cel: White kids don't move as positively as black kids, more spontaneous, they are very encouraging to work with for dance - the white kids enjoyed it as well, they had absolute admiration for the good kids, some of those black girls were marvellous, obviously. Dance is very strong in that school, is accepted, there was enthusiasm in most classes, white kids did enjoy it - it's very rewarding to teach dance to those kids.

S: ...mutual influence?

Cel: ...at the moment I hate the thought of going back to that school, but I do love the kids....I'm dreading the next TP!

S: ...hmm...towards what or where did the greatest amount of your energy go?

Cel:I'm lazy, hate to do those lesson plans, I love it once I have done it - travelling, the teachers, the stress, you are teaching in someone else's class, you can't really do your own thing, you are a student, people come to watch you all the time, you are not sure what the kids think of you...stress.. I'm sure it's a lot easier just to teach...

S: And your greatest pleasure during TP?

Cel:See the kids smile and enjoy the dance!

S: If you do not sound enthusiastic about teaching dance in schools it is because of all that burocratic business, the adults then, it seems to me...?

Cel:yeah...

A.7 Second Interview with Celine

S: Celine, where did the PGCE take you, personally and professionally?

Cel: Professionally, I have extended my views, I think it is taught badly, wrongly, very poorly in schools, there is a lot of room for improvement. I'd like to see a whole new, much better balanced curriculum, arts and academic subjects. Personally, outside the course... my own approach to dance is very much the same, not as narrow-minded, though... I don't write off people as quickly if they don't fit in my ideas of dance....more receptive.

S: Which dance lessons on the PGCE did you attend?

Cel: The dance lessons folded after TP, no dance lessons as such, except for your jazz classes...if anything it was a relief not to have those theory lessons. There was a lot of tension between the tutor and the students.

S: But the practical lessons?

Cel: ...just one officially on the course...jazz

S: And personal development in relation to dancing yourself?

Cel: Jazz is fabulous, it's my favourite, Historical dance - interesting, it reminds me of how apt folk dance is for very young children...similar to children's games, rhythms, social and fun. Holding hands, skipping.  
...Jazz movements, even positions for dance in 2ndary schools, shoulders, hips.

S: Did you take some of these movements straight away from the course into the classroom?

Cel: Adapt them slightly, yes.

S: Were the practical sessions sources of dance ideas for the teaching situation?

Cel: In the last term there was no TP.

S: What should/could be on a dance teachers' training course?

Cel: The practical side was lacking incredibly, far too much intellectualizing, not doing, a lot more different styles and materials used. Everything was limited to the narrow experience of the teachers at the beginning of the course, not very adventurous. Laban...the sphere Rose moves in, and their interpretations, Laban's. The didactics were very



- useful, her teaching gave me lots of ideas, but not deep enough, a bit twee, not dealing with reality and real kids.
- S: Did you try her ideas out?
- Cel: Yes, but I adapted them heavily.
- S: You were in a single-sex school - did you have any problems?
- Cel: My problems: not realizing to what extent I was going to have to be the teacher and reprimand.
- S: What are your ideas about the length of a TP?
- Cel: Ours were long enough! - I have enjoyed the structure of the course. I am lazy, it's sufficient for me, I can be a good teacher through this course, but I don't think it is sufficient for the majority of people. A really good teacher training would sort out the really good people, would be a 2-year course in a school, eg day release technical syllabus. There should be some recognition, even stipulation, of experiences in other fields.
- S: Which other fields?
- Cel: The arts...
- S: Dance pertains to the arts?
- Cel: Yes, absolutely!
- S: Then, logically, dance teachers should have a high standard of dancing, even of performing?
- Cel: Yes. And theoretical: psychological understanding of the body, study of the spine, accidents etc, medical first aid (epileptics), study of aesthetics, of the arts of human movement.- Nothing was covered.
- S: What kind of approach would be suitable for dance teachers' training, then? Should the input be verbal? In movements? In teaching styles?
- Cel: I think physical movement is the basis of dance. It is the medium of dance. The more physical experience they have, the greater understanding they'll have of their own bodies. Recognition of movement in other people, being able to consciously relate to those movements, the greater their awareness of their bodies, the more they'll feel happy trying out new things. They'll learn a vocabulary of movements and find a reason for doing things. The process of teaching will become far more logical if they have the physical experience. Once they have the physical experience they'll learn a verbal vocabulary that relates to the physical movement. Then you can introduce even more verbalizing. I think to ask a class to react to a poem is

ludicrous unless they are used to working with words. If they have the physical awareness they can play around, which is an important aspect of discovery learning...if they can see the feeling behind words, they can perhaps relate the words from one form of art to another.

S: In a sense translate from one art to another?— Dance as an expression of feeling? Where does Merce Cunningham's view come in, then?<sup>22</sup>

Cel: All arts are therapeutic. Dance is therapeutic in its physical activity, both a result of feeling and a course of feeling, reciprocal process, thrill from the aesthetic sense, thrill from the movement, it's exciting, the defeating of gravity, of the natural forces...

S: Following that, what would be the function of dance in 2ary schools?

Cel: Dance functions on two levels..superficial: it gives kids the opportunity to study another subject, which will enhance their career - opening up other fields, interest in the theatre and the arts, dance keeps them fit, it works their posture... how to move, dance expands them intellectually and physically...On a deeper level dance is an art form, a vital element to redress the balance of the present academic pressures.

S: ...therapeutic - in the sense of any education being therapeutic?

Cel: Yes. Dance is child-centered, each child has to do something with their own body to be part of that class. In English eg the instrument is the book in front of you, it's easy to sit back without being part of it.

S: Hmm...If - what kind of technique is essential for good dance teaching in 2ary schools?

Cel: A basis of contemporary technique, a simple version of Graham the basic medium of dance, the body being the instrument.  
I place a lot of importance on the creative element of dancing.

S: How would you try to awake and foster creativity in children through dance?

Cel: I use stimuli, visual, and music it's easiest to interpret and therefore to copy...

S: Creativity what for?

Cel: Because it's a sense of achievement to create, the sense of

-----

22. Cel and I had discussed at length a Cunningham performance we had seen together.



achievement makes you feel good, and a person...the sensation of doing something creative in dance comes across strongly, you use more than your five senses, you use your kinaesthetic sense as well. Your entire being is involved...

S: What was your most successful lesson?

Cel: Starting off with pictures and with music, having worked with them about 14 weeks, I gave them a starting position which they got from a picture, a sequence of movements they could use in any other order and a piece of music to which they worked in groups of five. They came up with some amazing pieces of work, they did some simultaneous actions. One group did the watershape dancing. Those shapes on the floor, they all came up together, their creativity and their sense of dancing as opposed to just doing movements to music had developed incredibly... so different from before when they were told what to explore, what to try, which was too limited for them.

S: How did you go about setting the task?

Cel: First the pictures, some did not even have to use the position on the picture, they could just use it as a story behind, an idea for a dance. I then gave them a music, a sequence of 6 movements, like jumps, run, flick, drop, rise, sway, try each of the movements out, different movements for each of the words, and they could use them in any interpretations they liked, they worked out a little sequence on the floor.

S: In what was this lesson different from their other lessons? Sounds very much like a lesson out of Preston-Dunlop...

Cel: In one class I observed, every little sequence was predetermined for them, eg dance as a told story.

S: What is your approach to Laban now?

Cel: A bit foggy, I like his explanation of movement, his study, an open mind. That is the basic problem in schools: Laban explored as a means to further ... and not as a means of learning to dance, so much as a means to learn about dance. In schools they are trying to teach Laban-style, there isn't a Laban dance-style. It's not a technique, it's a theory about dance. What I tried to do was teach them a sequence and then later turned round saying let's look at what we we have been doing, do you remember this movement? - They did! Weeks later they did the movement even better. In dance you pick up a lot of things unconsciously, that are hard to define and teach as such.

S: If you have a lot of sources and dance knowledge available to yourself then you can give the Laban stimuli and then take it further?



Cel: Children should learn to dance first, ie that felt good throwing my leg up in the air, then they can start: flick, flick, dab, dab...

S: Your TPt's critique of Laban is that a Laban method dance lesson does not stretch the kids - you can't push them..

Cel: If I give them the main basic vocabulary to work from, once they'd learnt that, they'd see click in their brain a certain idea of ways movements developed and dances developed, and then they'd think for themselves: I could explore that movement...unconsciously, they pick up through learning routine after routine, they can see things can develop. Then they can expand - they are 20 in a class, for ideas, but just one teacher.

S: Which was your most disastrous dance lesson?

Cel: When I was really tired, not on the ball...

S: If you are tired the whole lesson falls to pieces? In languages you could resort to a book...

Cel:...

S: ?....

S: What is classical ballet to you?

Cel: I love it, it dominates my natural dance style, it's good to know, soft, gentle, romantic...Jazz I love - another facet of my personality, quite aggressive, as in the type of energy put into movement... Contemporary, Graham..I enjoy the theory, the philosophy behind it, the internalisation and strength, sexual, coming from the pelvis, powerful, to me jazz is less erotic than contemporary but more sensuous, more flirtatious. I like to do a Graham class, it's very emotional, you get into tears because you can't do it, frustrating...A good class to me depends on the teacher, good ballet, good jazz, good contemporary. If I am in tune with the way the teacher thinks then I can really enjoy it and work. Creative dance ..I yet have to find a teacher that can stretch me...the danger of self-indulgent narrow movement ...wishy-washy..

S: What about historical dance?

Cel: fascinating, fun, boring!

S: And disco?

Cel: A basic need!

S: Celine, thank you very much.

## Appendix B

METHODOLOGY APPLIEDB.1 Applied Research Techniques

This appendix broadly repeats the structure of the theoretical research methodology and techniques of 1.5.3.

Observation: Participant and Non-Participant

Observation was an essential element of my collecting data. I observed dance courses and classes both as a participant and as a non-participant observer.

By participant observation I mean taking part actively, as a dance student and dance teacher. In this case taking notes occurred after class and as immediately as possible, sometimes though deferred for a thirst-quenching visit to the cafeteria combined with further informal chats with the group or individuals.

By non-participant observation I mean sitting in on a class or course as a mere observer, taking notes as the class progresses. Most of my observation took place in gyms used as dance space (a few with mirrors), but some also in ordinary classrooms. Non-participant observation in a gym has a special quality: as the participants move around in any direction see me taking notes, glances meet - I am not neatly hidden away at the back of the class. The contrast between observer and observed is even more marked in non-participant observation of dance because dancing necessarily involves 'showing' oneself: to be observed in dance is to expose oneself, to make oneself vulnerable, which contrasts with the observer's immobility. To bridge



this contrast I attempted to make myself available and vulnerable by sometimes 'fooling around' or, in quite a few cases, by offering free dance classes of mine in return.

Trying to establish trust and confidence was especially important in courses where the number of participants was small and the participants therefore more exposed. I was a participant observer only in tertiary education courses. I did not join in dance classes in secondary schools (neither as a teacher nor as a student) because my main interest in going to secondary schools was the teaching practice (TP) of a student teacher from a tertiary course I was observing.

### Interviews

I conducted different sets of interviews on a small scale. Some were focused and structured, others open and fairly unstructured.

I only led fairly structured and focused interviews where I knew that I would have the occasion to later extend to more informal ones. In these cases the more structured interviews were rather at the beginning to provide me with general information, an overview of the participants' views and an insight into the situation/course<sup>23</sup>. I did not apply a set grid for all the interviews. I found that the settings, situations and courses in which I conducted the interviews varied so much that I would have felt uneasy to squeeze them into one grid. I believe that in general I attempted the kind of interviewing advocated by Oakley<sup>24</sup>. Reading and re-reading my interviews, I have found weaknesses and mistakes such as interrupting or not probing sufficiently. But with hindsight this criticism is easy to make.- On the other hand I am confident that I was quite successful in my attempt to establish rapport and allow reciprocity.

-----

23. cf Simons,H,cf I.5.3.2

24. cf I.5.3.2.



For the more structured interviews I set up a tape-recorder if the participants allowed this. Transcripts of interviews used for the PGCE case-studies figure in the Appendices 3-7.

The open or unstructured interviewing sometimes took the form of in-depth conversations which happened in the most improvised situations (e.g. on train journeys, in changing-rooms, during lifts in the car, in snack bars ) where quite often it was impractical to take notes. As in the case of participant observation, I tried to write up as faithfully and immediately as possible.

### Group Discussions

Small group discussions often tended to take the form of conversation similar to unfocused interviews whereas discussions with large groups were slightly more structured. This was necessary because of time limitations e.g in a college when one lesson was allowed for discussion with the whole class. When I conducted large group discussions I tried to write down the participants' contributions in key words then and there, trying to complement the notes afterwards. But this was difficult and I am not satisfied with the result. In another instance, I used a tape-recorder during a group discussion which had unfortunately to take place in a cafeteria. I tried to transcribe the tape but overlying voices and often heavy background noise made this taped group discussion quite unusable. Misinterpretations of this kind of data are too likely.

### Questionnaires

I drafted and used only one questionnaire to complement a group discussion for those unable to take part in the discussion because of train time-tables or other commitments (the discussion took place after an evening class). My draft questionnaire is certainly technically inadequate and open to criticism but some of the information gained from it might be valuable for further research. The questionnaire

concerned dance as a leisure activity. Since I have decided not to discuss this topic I do not include the questionnaire concerning dance as a leisure activity.

#### Documents/Material as Background Information

Besides official published material like books, programmes, magazine and newspaper articles I have also made use of unpublished material. Often, personal contacts were very helpful in referring me to such text or such source and unpublished material like interim reports, essays, syllabi, curriculum material and unpublished theses if I was given permission to use them. The local Dance Teacher Association was particularly helpful in this respect<sup>25</sup>, whilst a computer search for documents and related material hardly yielded any material.-

#### Video

Another important material used was video. I had followed a two year directing course at an evening institution to learn the technique of videoing. Consequently I videoed a few teaching practice lessons and also an interview. But for technical reasons I have decided against using this kind of material in the case studies. Its presentation and correct analysis would pose too many technical complications.

But the video material has nevertheless served an important purpose in that it has been helpful to the student teachers. My videoing their lessons was the only audio-visual teaching aid they had. They found this sort of teaching material extremely illuminating and suggested its use in further training courses.

Further sources of information were dance clothes, appearance in general, body carriage and facial expressions.

---

25. I mention this here as an example of "shared membership of the same minority group" Oakley,A, cf 1.5.1.3.

Negotiating Access

Since contact with institutions and dance practitioners in education was not established via official university channels, since I had to establish all contacts personally, the persons were usually quite open and welcoming. I took good care explaining my situation, and the purpose and nature of the research when negotiating access. I also attempted to create a democratic relationship, and to "give and take".<sup>26</sup> In two cases I wrote a letter of introduction prior to my telephoning.

---

26. cf Observation, above



## B.2 Collected Data

This appendix describes the various data I collected between November 1980 and July 1982. For reasons of anonymization<sup>27</sup> I do not name the various persons, institutions places and dates. I have grouped the data according to their nature into the following groups:

- \* - Teacher training institutions/Students
- \* - Teacher training institutions/Lecturers
- \* - Institutions for Adult Evening Classes
- \* - Teachers of Adult Evening Classes
- \* - Dance as part of a Manpower Service Commission scheme
- \* - Dance for the Young
- \* - Alia

### Students in Teacher Training Institutions

Apart from the PGCE course which is the focus of my case-studies, I visited three training institutions for a day each. I observed technique -, composition -, theory - and performance - lessons, interviewed students and had a general 'look round'. All the institutions trained B.Ed students. I met students on PE-, Performing Arts- or Dance B.Ed courses. The students who were willing to be interviewed and whom I could get into personal contact with were all female. (Only one of the three institutions had male students on the dance option.) The interviews and talks lasted from twenty minutes to two hours. I did not tape these interviews/talks but took notes because taking notes seemed less official and less imposing, especially when I was allowed to sit in on a course by the lecturer or

-----

27. cf II.5. research methodology

the students spontaneously. In some cases I spoke to a whole class during a lesson with the teacher present. In some other cases I spoke to a class outside the lesson context, in yet another case I used the break between dance sessions to speak informally to the students while the lecturer was getting ready for her next class. In one case the institution had arranged for me to meet three selected students who were with me for a whole morning and whom I also interviewed. In another case the institution arranged for me to meet students who wished to discuss dance educational issues with me after a day's hard dance work - I was surprised and impressed by the number who turned up! - I had contact with 1st, 2nd and 3rd year students.

#### Lecturers in Teacher Training Institutions

I include in this group the teachers of the visited institutions mentioned above and teachers I had contact with outside their teaching institutions but in context with dance in education. Depending on the teacher I taped the interviews or took notes. I taped nine hours of interviewing, and took notes of approximately six hours of talking/interviewing. The taped interviews were with heads of dance departments and/or institutions and had all been negotiated and previously arranged, whereas the talks sometimes occurred without planning. The interviews were centered around general issues of dance and dance in education. The talks tended to focus on more specific issues, e.g. on a particular dance style. Some of the teachers were trained professional dancers, some were PE teachers with additional dance training.

#### Adult Evening Institutions

This group concerned structured courses of at least one term. The students did not need any qualifications to attend these courses. I collected data on two adult evening courses, both during one term.

One course was entitled "Jazz dance and dance composition". The course had been entered and was awaiting



upgrading to part-time diploma course while I was a non-participant observer. I observed during a term of nine weeks, two evenings a week, totalling 18 evenings or 40 1/2 hours of class. The course was teacher-centered and instructional. It took place in a beautiful large studio with a piano and windows and mirrors. The music used was taped pop/jazz/funk. The students were taught jazz technique and style. The dance composition class was slightly more student centered; the main input came from the teacher. The jazz style taught was a style I had learnt and taught myself. I was very familiar with its exercises so that I could concentrate on observing teacher - and student behaviour and interaction, timing of demonstration, explanation, exhortations and the like.

The majority of the students were women. The course was in a deprived area and provided training opportunity at low cost. It attracted young people some of whom hoped later to train professionally but also professional people who were dance beginners. The technical ability level was very mixed. The average age was approximatively mid-twenties. I had casual talks with the students before and after class. With their consent I videoed one lesson. They enjoyed and appreciated watching and discussing the video. I also conducted a taped group discussion towards the end of the term. For those who could not join the discussion I devised a questionnaire which they could mail to me or hand in the following week. I received 11 questionnaires.

The other course I observed during one term was at a more central place. It was a Laban-based technique course entitled "Laban Dance". The course was also mixed, but also with quite a female majority. The cost of the course was very low. The course attracted people who had a more analytical approach to dance and who had already some experience of other evening dance courses. A few of the students were complete dance beginners. The average age was also approximately mid-twenties.

I was a participant observer on the course. I attended the course because I was interested to experience how



Laban's movement analysis was transformed into an actual 'Laban-technique' class.- The weekly lessons lasted 90 minutes and took place in a small studio without mirrors. The lessons were frontal, instructional and teacher centered to taped music of various styles and periods. The lessons consisted of two parts, technique/exercises and a routine.

Because of the small room it was not possible to videotape a lesson. I had to be satisfied with an audiotape which I could transcribe for analysis.

#### Teachers of Adult Evening Courses

Because of the duration of both courses I got to know the two concerned teachers fairly well. Both were female, and dedicated. One had a Performing Arts degree, but both were or had been professional dancers. The Laban teacher was quite a few years older and dedicated to liberate dance from its 'mindless-activity' reputation. The other teacher was convinced that jazz dance provided an excellent training and an appealing way into dance. She tried to gain higher status for jazz dance by attempting to have her course upgraded to a part-time diploma course.

I did not conduct formal or semi-formal interviews with them - there was no quiet or time. Both teachers were extremely busy and had to rush from one course in one institution to another one. I was glad that they did not mind my questions during car rides, in the dressing rooms, in the corridors on their way to get the technical equipment etc. My data collection with them was quite informal.

Three other teachers of evening dance classes were videoed. A discussion between a classical ballet and Graham teacher and a jazz dance teacher was videoed and then transcribed.

#### A Manpower Service Commission Project

These collected data concerned a dance course as part of a Manpower project for underachieving black adolescent girls. The main focus of the project was on social and basic

vocational skills.- I had been asked to teach dance on this course because of my contacts with Westindian social workers. I accepted on condition that I could teach this course in the role of the teacher as a researcher. The dance course was one morning a week for half a term. Its aim was to improve their dance technical skills, starting off from basic Calypso and Reggae steps leading to greater variations of dance movements as social skills.

### Dance for the Young

Under this heading I have grouped the various data I collected in relation to dance performances for the young. They include matinees for schools of dance companies like Ballet Rambert or the London Contemporary Dance Theatre, and dance performances of comprehensive schools with a dance department. The data include notes, leaflets and other material distributed to the children.

### Alia

This group includes data from random professional dance classes of the private sector, talks with dance animators, talks with a CSE mode 3 moderator, notes of a CSE mode 3 dance examination I was allowed to observe, dance conferences, dance performances, a discussion with a CSE mode 3 dance teacher (who was not one of the three PGCE TP teachers) on adolescent girls' peer groups, personal comments of dance students of leisure dance classes.



Appendix C

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Acker,S, Women, the other academics, British Journal of Education, Vol.1, No 1, 1980
- Acker,S, Women and Education, Draft paper,1981
- Adelman,C,Walker,R, Developing pictures and other frames, in Chanan,Delamont,eds, NFER 1975
- Adelman,C, On first hearing, in Adelman,ed, 1978
- Adelman,C, ed, Uttering, muttering, Collecting, using and reporting talk for social and educational research, 1978
- Adelman,C,Jenkins,D,Kemmis,St, Rethinking case-study: notes from the second Cambridge conference, in Simons,ed, University of East Anglia, Norwich, 1980
- Adelman,C, Neither stranger nor friend: politics of field research in one's own institution, lecture, London University Institute of Education, 19/5/82
- Adelman,C, Project on the expectations of higher education, institutional case-study No 3, Inside a college of higher education, Brunel University, 1984
- Adelman,C,Alexander,R,J, The self-evaluating institution: practice and principles in the management of educational change, Methuen, London, 1982
- Adshead,J, Dance as a discipline, PhD, University of Leeds, Dept. of PE, 1980
- Adshead,J, The study of dance, Dance Books,London,1981
- Adshead,J, Dance in higher education, the Study of Dance: Structures and Issues, Conference, Leeds, 18/9/81
- Adsheadm,J, The validation of courses in higher education, problems for dance studies, Conference, Leeds, 19/9/1981
- Adshead,J.et al., A chart of skills and concepts for dance, in Journal of Aesthetic Education, vol.16, No 3, Fall 1982



- Adhead,J,Layson,J, Dance history, Dance Books, London, 1983
- Aebli,H, Grundformen des Lehrens, Klett, Stuttgart, 1976
- Allan,P,Jolley,M,eds, The curriculum in nursing education, Croom Helm, Beckenham, 1987
- Allcock,R,Bland,W, Dance in education, a practical handbook, Dance Books, London,1980
- Anderson,H,H,ed, Creativity and its cultivation, Harper, New York, 1959
- Arbeitskreis fr Tanz,ed, tanzdidaktische Konzeptionen, Koenigswinter, 20-23/11/75, ATB
- Ardener,S,ed, Defining females, the nature of women in society, Wiley&Son, New York, 1978
- Argyle,M,ed, Social encounters: Readings in social interaction, Aldine, Chicago, 1973
- Armitage,M,ed, Martha Graham, the early years, 1937/ Da Capo Paperback, New York, 1978
- Arnheim,R, Towards a psychology of art, Faber&Faber, London, 1967
- Arnheim,R, Art and visual perception, University of California Press, Berkley, 1954/1974
- Aspin,D, The concept of the aesthetic and education, in Aesthetic Education, Simpson,A,ed, Conference Report, 12-15/9/78
- Aspin,D, The Place of music in the curriculum: a justification, in:Journal of Aesthetic Education, spring 1982
- Assessment of Performance Unit (APU), Aesthetic development, London, 9/83
- Atkinson,P, The problem of grey hair, in Adelman,ed, 1978
- BaldwinF,Whitehead,M, that way and this, Poetry for creative dance, Chatto&Windus, london,1972
- Banes,S, Terpsichore in sneakers, Houghton Mifflin, Boston, 1980
- Banks,O, School and society,in Barton, Meighan,eds, 1978
- Bann,St, Abstract art - a language, in The Tate gallery, 1980
- Bantock,G,H, Quality and equality in curricular provision, Appendix, in Skilbeck&Harris, Open University, 1976
- Barnes,D,Toss,F, Talk in small learning groups, analysis at the level of communication, in Adelman,ed, 1978

- Barron,F, Arts in the making, Seminar Press, New York/London, 1972
- Bartal,L,Ne'eman,N, Movement, awareness and creativity, Souvenir Press, London, 1975
- Barton,L,Meighan,R,eds, Sociological interpretations of schooling and classrooms: a re-appraisal, Nafferton, Driffield, 1978
- Baumann,Z, Culture as praxis, Routledge Kegan Paul, London, 1973
- Barton,L,Meighan,R,Walker,S,eds, Schooling, ideology and the curriculum, Falmer Press, Lewes, 1980
- Beardsmore,R,W, Learning from a novel, in Philosophy and the Arts, Macmillan, London, 1973
- Beattie,A, Is modern dance a liberation of the body? ICA, London,1972
- Beattie,A, Alternative models in the theory and practice of health education, Plenary Paper, University of Exeter, March 1980
- Beattie,A, Health education and the science teacher: invitation to a debate, Education &Health, January 1984
- de Beauvoir,S, Le deuxieme sexe, Gallimard, 1949
- Becher,R,A, Research into practice, in Dockrell,Hamilton,eds, 1980
- Beiswanger,G, Physical education and the emergence of the modern dance, Journal of Health, PE and Recreation, VII, No7,9/1936
- Benthall,J,Polhemus,T,eds, The body as a medium of expression, Allen Lane, London, 1975
- Benthall,J, The body electric, patterns of Western industrial culture, Thames&Hudson, London, 1976
- Bernstein,B, Open schools - open society, New Society, 14/9/1967
- Bernstein,B, Class, codes and control, Vol.1: Theoretical studies towards a sociology of language, Paladin, St.Albans, 1973
- Bernstein,B, Class, codes and control, Vol.3: Towards a theory of educational transmissions, Routledge Kegan Paul, 2nd ed.1977
- Bernstein,B, Class and pedagogies: visible and invisible, in Dockrell/Hamilton, eds, 1980



Best,D, Philosophy and human movement,  
Allen&Unwin, London, 1978

Best,D, The arts, objectivity and education, in Simpson,A, ed,  
Aesthetic Education and the problem of assessment and  
evaluation, conference report, 11-14/9/79

Best,D, Free expression, or the teaching of techniques?  
British Journal of Educational Studies, Vol.XXVII,No 3,  
10/1979

Best,D, Education of feeling, Conference on Aesthetic  
education, Southlands College, London, 9/9/1980

Best,D, Arts in a multicultural context,  
Study of Dance Conference, University of Surrey,  
10/4/84

Blackburn,R,ed, Ideology and the social sciences, Fontana,  
London, 1972

Blacking,J, How musical is man?, University of Washington  
Press, Seattle/London, 1973

Blacking,J, The anthropology of the body, Academic Press,  
London, 1977

Blacking,J,The case for and against the arts in higher  
education, draft paper, for Arts seminar, Keble College,  
Oxford, 1982b

Blacking,J, Movement and meaning: dance in social  
anthropological perspective,in  
Dance Research, Spring 1983,1/1

Blacking,J, The right to speak about dance/ Dance  
anthropology: theory, methods and practice, 3rd Study of  
Dance Conference, University of Surrey, 6/4/1984

Blacking,J, Movement, dance, music, and the Venda girls'  
initiation cycle, in Spencer,P,ed, 1985

Blacking,J, A false trail for the arts? Multicultural music  
education and the denial of individual creativity, in  
Ross,M,ed, 1985

Blackstone,T, The education of girls today, in  
Mitchell,J,Oakley,A, eds, 1976

Bourdieu,P, Systems of education and systems of thought,  
in Young,M,ed, 1971

Bourdieu,P, Intellectual field and creative project, in  
Young,M,ed, 1971

Bourdieu,P, Outline of a theory of practice, Cambridge  
University Press, 1977/1982

Bourdieu,P,Passeron,J-C1, Reproduction in education, society



and culture, Sage Publications, London, 1977

Bowles,G,Duelli-Klein,R, eds, Theories of women's studies, University of California, Berkeley, 1980

Bowles,G,Duelli-Klein,R, eds, Theories of women's studies II, University of California, Berkely, 1981

Brake,M, Sociology of youth culture and subculture, Routledge&Kegan Paul, London, 1980

Briginshaw,V, Dance artists in education projects, Dancing Times, 7/1980

Briginshaw,V, The dance artist in education: roles, issues, rationale, Conference, Leeds, 18/9/1981

Briggs,M, Movement education, Macdonald&Evans, London, 1974

Brinson,P, Scholastic task of a sociology of dance, Dance research, 1/1 and 1/2, 1983

Brinson,P, Scholastic tasks of a sociology of dance, 1sr British dance scholars conference, London, 2-4/4/82

Brinson,P, Community ventures in Lewisham, 3rd Study of Dance Conference, Guilford, 9/4/1984

Bromberg,C,S, Dance as commodity, in Dance Scope, Vol 15, No 3

Brooke,J,D,Whiting,H,T,A, Human movement - a field of study, Lepus, London, 1973

Brown,R, Rules and laws in sociology, Routledge&Kegan Paul, London, 1973

Brunner,I, Tanz und Tanzunterricht im Rahmen einer aesthetischen Erziehung, in Arbeitskreis fuer Tanz im Bundesgebiet, 1975

Butters,St, The logic of enquiry of participant observation, in Hall/Jefferson, 1975

Byrne,E,M, Women and education, Tavistock Publications Ltd, London 1978

Carter,E,Chappel,Hudson,McRobbie,Nava,Walkeridine,Wood, Gender and generation, MacMillan, London, 1984

Chanan,G,Delamont,S,eds, Frontiers of classroom research, National Foundation for education Research, 1975

Chandler,E, Education of adolescent girls, George Allen Unwin, London, 1980

Chapman,J,A, The nature of creativity and its place in the teaching of modern dance in education, PE dept, Leeds,

unpubl, 1972

Chetwynd,J,Hartnett,O,eds, The sex role system, Routledge& Kegan Paul,London, 1978

Cixous,H, Weiblichkeit in der Schrift, Merve, Berlin, 1980

Codman,K, the mental template in dance, CORD research annual XI, New York, 1978

Cohen,S,J, the modern dance, seven statements of belief, Wesleyan University Press, Middletown, Connect, 1965

Cohen,S,J, Present problems of dance aesthetics, 1st British dance scholars conference, London, 4/4/82

Collins,C, Practical modern educational dance, Macdonald&Evans, London, 1969

Cope,E, "Performances", dynamics of a dance group, Lepus Books, London 1976

Cratty,B,J, Physical expressin of intelligence, Prentice-Hall, New Jersey, 1972

Curl,G, Philosophic foundations, in Laban Art of Movement Guild Magazine, 1966,I, - 1969,VI

Curl,G, Critical communication and aesthetic education, MA, Dept.of Philosophy, Institute of Education, London Unversity, 1980

Crisp,C1, The nature of dance scholarship: the critic's task, in Dance Research,1/1, Spring, 1983

Dale,R,R, Mixed or single-sex school? Vol.3: Attainment, attitudes and overview, RKP, London, 1974

Dale,R,Esland,G,Fergusson,R,MacDonald,M, Education and the state, vol.2: politics, patriarchy and practice, Falmer, the Open University Press, 1981

Dance in secondary education, a discussion paper prepared by a committee of HM Inspectorate, DES, 1983

Dance Research, The Journal of the Society for Dance Research, London, Vol.1,No.1: Spring 1983

Dance Research Journal, 13/1, Fall 1980

Davies,B, Social control and education, Methuen, London, 1976

Davies,M,P, An investigation into movement related to some aspects of cognitive development in young children, PhD, Institute of Education, London University, 1976

Deem,R, Women ans schooling, RKP, London, 1978



- Deem,R, Schooling for women's work, RKP, 1980
- Deem,R, Co-education reconsidered, Open University Press, Milton Keynes, 1984
- Delamont,S, Interaction in the classroom, Methuen, London, 1976
- Delamont,S, Sociology and the classroom, in Barton,Meighan, eds, 1978
- Delamont,S, Sex roles and the school, Methuen, london, 1980
- DES: cf Dance in secondary schools
- Dockrell,W.B,Hamilton,D,eds, Rethinking educational research, Hodder&Stoughton, London, 1980
- Donaldson,M, Children's minds, Fontana, Croom Helm, London, 1978
- Douglas,M, Purity and danger, Routledge Kegan Paul, London, 1966
- Douglas,M, Natural Symbols, Cresset Press, London, 1970
- Douglas,M, Do dogs laugh?, in Polhemus,ed, 1978
- Dove,C, the teaching of modern educational dance in secondary schools within the PE curriculum, MA, Dept of PE, University of Leeds, 1974
- Duelli-Klein,R, How to do what we want to do: thoughts about feminist methodology, in Bowles,G,Duelli-Klein,R, eds, 1980
- Dyson,A,ed, Art education: heritage and prospect, Bedford Way Papers No 14, University of London Institute of Education, London, 1983
- Easthope,G, curricula are social processes, in Barton,Meighan,Walker,eds, 1980
- Eco,U, Zeichen (semiotics), Suhkamp, Frankfurt, 1977
- Eggleston,J, The sociology of the school curriculum, Routledge&Kegan Paul, London, 1977
- Eisner,E,W, The educational imagination, Macmillan, New York, 1979
- Eisner,E,W, Mind as cultural achievement, in Simpson,A,ed, Aesthetic education, Conference report, 11-14/9/1979
- Elias,N, The civilizing process, Blackwell, Oxford, 1978 (Orig: Ueber den Prozess der Zivilisation, Falken, Basel, 1939)
- Ellfeldt,L, Dance - from magic to art, Brown, Dubuque,



Iowa, 1976

Elliott,J, The Safari solopsists, in SAFARI,1974

Eraut,M,Good,Smith, the analysis of curriculum materials,  
University of Sussex, Education Area, Occasional paper 2

Erikson,E,H, Childhood and society, Norton, New York,  
2nd ed.1963

Esland,G,M, Teaching and learning as the organization of  
knowledge, in Young,M, ed, 1971

Fischer\_Homberger,E, Krankheit Frau, Huber, Bern, 1979

Fisher,S, Body images, in Polhemus, ed, 1978

Foster,J, The influences of Rudolf Laban, Lepus Books,  
London, 1977

Foster,R, Knowing in my bones, Adam&Black, London,1978

Freire,P, Pedagogy of the oppressed, Harmondsworth,  
Penguin, 1972

French.M, Beyond power. On women, men and morals, Summit  
books, New york, 1985

Frich,E, The Matt Mattox book of jazz dance, Sterling,  
New York,1983

Frith,S, Sociology of rock, Consable, London, 1978

Froehlich,A, Handlungsorientierte Medienerziehung,  
Dissertation, Zuerich, 1980

Fuller-Snyder,A, Dance in a ritual context: a dance-  
ethnologist's point of view, 3rd Study of Dance Conference,  
University of Surrey, 6/4/1984

Furth,H,G, Denkprozesse ohne Sprache, Schwann,  
Duesseldorf,1972/Thinking without language,  
Collier-Macmillan, London, 1966

Gammage,Ph, The currriculum and its participants:  
Perspectives of interaction, in Skilbeck,ed,1984b

Gintis,H,Bowles, Contradiction and reproduction in  
educational theory, in Barton,Meighan,Walker,eds, 1980

Giurchescu,A, European pespectives on structural analysis,  
3rd Study of Dance Conference, University of Surrey,  
6/4/1984

Glaser,H, Stahl,K,H, Buergerrecht Kultur, Ullstein,  
Frankfurt 1983

Glasstone,R, Changes of emphasis and mechanics in the  
teaching of ballet technique, Dance Research,

Vol.1, No.1, 1983

- Goettner-Abendroth, H. in Zytglogge Zytig, Nr93, Bern, Nov.84
- Goodman, N. Languages of art, Oxford university press, London, 1969
- Goodson, I. Towards an alternative pedagogy, in Whitty, Young, eds, 1976
- Goodson, I. School subjects and curriculum change, Croom Helm, London, 1983
- Gorbet, M. An investigation into the nature of jazz dance, BAPA, Middlesex Polytechnic, trent Park, 1981
- Gorz, A. Abschied vom Proletariat, Europaeische Verlagsanstalt, Frankfurt am Main, 1980
- Graves, N. Teacher education in adversity, Bedford Way Papers, London University Institute of Education, London, 1985
- Gregory, E. Human making and the fires of earth, in Summoning the familiar, Pegasus Foundation, Dallas, 1983
- Gross, E, Stone, G, P. Embarrassment and the analysis of role requirements in Argyle, M, ed, Social encounters: Readings in social interaction, Aldine Publ.Comp, Chicago, Illinois, 1973
- The Guardian, Education Guardian, 'Allied Powers', 6/10/87
- Guildford, Traits of Creativity, in Anderson, 1959
- Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation, Dance education and training in Britain, Report, Oyez Press, London, 1980
- Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation, The arts in schools, Oyez Press, London, 1982
- Hall, St, Jefferson, T, Resistance through ritual, Hutchinson University Library, London, 1975
- Hall, C, R. Imagery for movement, in Journal of Human Movement Studies, Kimpton, Vol.6, No.3, 9/1980
- Hall, St, Hobson, D, Lowe, A, Willis, P, eds, Culture, media, language, Hutchinson, London, 1980/ 1981
- Halsey, A, H. Origins and destinations, in New Society, 4/9/1980
- Hamby, C. Dancing - towards aesthetic experience and beyond, MA, Dept. of PE, Leeds University, 1976, unpubl.
- Hamilton, D, Jenkins, D, King, C, Macdonald, B, Parlett, M, Beyond the numbers game, Macmillan, Basingstoke/London, 1977
- Hamilton, D. Educatioal research and the shadows of Francis



- Galton and Ronald Fisher, in Dockrell,ed, 1980
- Hammersley,M,Atkinson,P, Ethnography. Principles and practice, Tavistock Publications, London, 1983
- Hammersley,M, Hargreaves,A, Curriculum practice, Falmer, London, 1983
- Hanes,B,et al, Sex role perceptions during adolescence, Journal of Educational Psychology, Vol.71, No.1, 2/1979
- Hanna,J,L, To dance is human, in Blacking 1977
- Hannon,V, Ending sex-stereotyping in schools, Equal Opportunities Commission, Manchester, revised ed.1981
- Hargreaves,A, The significance of classroom coping strategies, in Barton,Meighan,eds, 1978
- Hargreaves,D, Whatever happened to symbolic interactionism?, in Barton, Meighan, eds, 1978
- Hargreaves,D,H, The challenge for the comprehensive school, Routledge&Kegan Paul, London 1982
- Hargreaves,D,H, The teaching of art and the art of teachig: towards an alternative view of learning, in Hammersley/Hargreaves,A,eds,1983
- Harris,A, Practical work in art education, in Dyson,A,ed, 1983
- Hawkes,T, Structuralism and semiotics, Methuen, London, 1977
- Hazzard-Gordon,K, Afro-american core culture social dance: an examination of four aspects of meaning, in Dance Research Journal, 15/2, spring 1983
- H'Doubler,M, The dance and its place in education, Harcourt,Brace, New York, 1925
- H'Doubler,M, dance. A creative art experience, Crafts, NewYork, 1940
- Hebdige,D, Subculture: the meaning of style,New Accents/Methuen,London, 1979
- Hemming,J, Curriculum for what?, in Skilbeck,M, ed, 1984b
- Heron,L,ed, Truth,dare and promise - girls growing up in the 50s, Virago, London, 1985
- Hide,E, Philosophical and ethical curriculum issues, in Allan,P,Jolley M, eds, 1987
- Hirst,P,H, Knowledge and the curriculum, Rouledge&Kegan Paul, London, 1975
- HM Inspectorate, Dance in secondary schools, Department of Education and Science 1983



- Holmes,B, Ivory towers, the glass bead game and open societies, University of London Institute of Education, London, 1979
- Holt,J, Instead of education, Pelican Books, 1976
- Hopkins,A, the school debate, Pelican Books, 1978
- Horst,L,Russell,C, Modern dance forms in relation to the other modern arts, republication by Dance Horizons, New York, 1977
- Hudson,B, Femininity and adolescence in Carter,E, et al., Gender and generation,1984
- Humphrey,D, The art of making dances, 1959, Gove Press, New York, 1980
- Hutchinson-Guest,A, In question: the body, Dance Research, Vol.1, No.1, spring 1983
- ILDTA/Inner London Dance Teacher Association, Teaching strategies for dance, seminar, 7-8/11/1981
- ILEA, Improving Secondary Schools, (chair: Hargreaves,D) GLC, Swindon Press, 1984
- Irigaray,L, Zur Geschlechterdifferenz, Wiener Frauenverlag, Wien, 1987
- Jablonko,A, An analysis of dance and daily life: the Maring of New Guinea, in The Laban Centenary Symposium, 1979
- Jenks,J, The management of health knowledge in schools: a case-study of teacher perspectives, M.Sc, University of London Chelsea College, 1978
- Jobbins,V, Baroque dance: theory and practice, MA, Laban Centre for Movement and Dance at University of London Goldsmiths' College, 1983
- Jones,G,St, History: the poverty of empiricism, in Blackburn,R,ed, 1972
- Jones,R,M, fantasy and feeling in education, Penguin, 1972
- Jordan,D, The dance as education, Oxford University Press, 1938
- Jordan,D, Movement and dance, in London University Institute of Education,ed, 1963
- Jordan,D, Examinations? in Laban Art of Movement Guild Magazine 41/1968
- Kaeppler,A, Dance ethnology: linguistic analogies in the study of dance, 3rd Study of Dance conference, University of Surrey, April 1984

- Kant,L, The education of girls and women, in Skilbeck,M,ed, London, 1984b
- Keddie,N, Classroom knowledge, In Young,M,ed,1971
- Klein,D,R, The dynamics of women's studies: An exploratory study of its international ideas and practices in higher education, PhD, London University Institute of Education, 1986
- King,Br, Will education discover dance? Dancemagazine, February 1978
- King,R, Problems of conducting and writing up ethnographic accounts, lecture, Curriculum dept, London University Institute of Education, 16/6/1982
- Kramer-Lauff.D, Curriculumdeterminanten fuer eine kommunikativ handlungsorientierte Tanzerziehung, in ATB, 1975
- Kramer-Lauff,D, Tanzdidaktik - Modell kommunikativen Handelns, Hoffmann, Schondorf, 1978
- Kraus,R,Chapman,S, History of the dance in art and education, Prentice Hall, Englewood Cliffs, 2nd ed.1981
- Laban,R, Modern educational dance, Macdonald&Evans, London, 3rd ed.1975
- Laban Art of Movement Guild Working Party, Proposed syllabus for G.C.E. in dance, LAMGMagazine 54/1973
- The Laban Centenary Symposium cf Slater,A,ed.
- Laing,R,D, Science and experience, a 'last lecture', Dartington Hall, Totnes, 16/5/1982
- Lange,R, The nature of dance, Macdonalds &Evans, London, 1975
- Lange,R, Anthropology and dance scholarship, in Dance Research, Spring 1983,1/1
- Langer,S, Feeling and form, Charles Scribner's Sons, New York, 1953
- Lawn,M,Barton,L, Rethinking curriculum studies: A radical approach, Croom Helm, London, 1981
- Lawton,D, Social change, educational theory and curriculum planning, University of London Press, London, 1973
- Lawton,D, Education and social justice, Sage, London, 1977
- Lawton,D, et al, Theory and practice of curriculum studies, Routledge&Kegan Paul, London, 1978
- Lawton,D, The end of the 'secret garden'?, University of London Institute of Education, London, 1979



- Lawton,D, Metaphors of the curriculum, lecture, London University Institute of Education, 29/10/1981
- Lawton,D, The tightening grip, London University Institute of Education, London, 1984
- Lawton,D, Curriculum and culture, in Skilbeck,ed, 1984b
- Layson,J, The contribution of modern dance to education, M.Ed., University of Manchester, 1970, unpubl.
- Layson,J, Aesthetics and human movement, in Brooke,Whiting, eds, 1973
- Layson,J, Postgraduate stud of dance, 1st Study of Dance Conference, Leeds, 2079/1981
- Layson,J, Isadora Duncan - a preliminary analysis of her work, Dance research, 1/1, spring 1983
- Leese,S,Packer,M, Dance in schools, Heinemann Educational, London, 1980
- Letch,R, New directions in curriculum policy, local and national, in Skilbeck,ed,1984b
- Levi-Strauss,C, Le totemisme aujourd'hui, Presses universitaires de France, Paris, 1962
- London Educational Review, Teacher education - a background to the James report, Editorial, University of London Institute of Education, 1/1, spring 1972
- London Educational Review, From theory to practice, University of London Institute of Education,4/2, autumn 1975
- London University Institute of Education, The arts and current tendencies in education, Evans, 1963
- Lord,M, A characterization of dance teacher behaviors in technique and choreography classes, in Dance Research Journal, 14/1&2, 1981/2
- Lyons,S, Dance in education: a constructivist analysis, PhD, University of Surrey, 1985
- MacDonald,B, Evaluation and control of education, in Ford SAFARI project, Norwich, 1974
- MacDonald,M,Dale,R, Knowledge, ideology and the curriculum, Open University, E 202, block III, units 14-15, Milton Keynes, 1977
- MacDonald,M, The curriculum and cultural reproduction, Open University, Course E 202: Culture, class and the curriculum, Unit 18-20, Milton Keynes, 1977
- MacDonald,M, Schooling and the reproduction of class and gender, in Barton, Meighan, Walker,eds, 1980



- Mahoney,B, Labanotation in the jazz dance class, in Lange,R, Dance Studies, Vol.1, Jersey, 1976
- Mahony,P, Schools for the boys?, Hutchinson, London, 1985
- Mandler,G, Mind and emotion, John Wiley and Sons, New York, 1975
- Manley,M,E,Wilson,V,E, Anxiety, creativity and dance performance, Dance Research Journal, 12/2, 1980
- Mansfield,R,J,G, An historical documentation of literature concerned with the justification of dance in education, published in Britain since 1970, MA,Leeds University, 1976a
- Mansfield,R,J,G, Towards an open concept of dance in education, MA, Leeds University, 1976b
- Maree,L, Dance teaching in schools in a multi-cultural society, in Arts education in a multi-cultural society, Commission for racial equality, London, Nov.1981
- Maree,L, Dance as a theatre art, dance in the community, 3rd Study of dance Conference, University of Surrey, 9/4/1984
- Margolis,J, Philosophy looks at the arts. Contemporary readings in aesthetics, Charles Scribner's Sons, New York, 1962
- Martin,J, Intercultural work in dance and drama, 3rd Study of Dance Conference, University of Surrey, 8/4/1984
- Mazrui,A, The robes of rebellion: sex, dress and politics in Africa, in Polhemus, ed, 1978
- Mazo,J,H, Prime movers. The makes of modern dance in America, A&Ch.Black, London, 1977
- McDonagh,D, The complete guide to modern dance, Doubleday, New York, 1976
- McGowan,V, Assessing practical mode III CSE dance, in 2D, spring 1982
- McGregor,L Development in drama teaching, Open Books, 1976
- McKittrick,D, Dance. Schooling in middle years, Macmillan, London, 1972
- McRobbie,A, Dance and social fantasy,in Carter,E et al, Gender and Generation, Macmillan, London, 1984
- Meakin,D,Sanderson,P, Dance in English seondary schools, Journal of Aesthetic Education, Vol.17, No 1, University of Illinois, spring 1983
- Meeson,Ph, Aestheticism and responsibility in art education,

in Ross,M,ed, 1985

Mettler,B, The art of body movement, New Hampshire, 1946,  
revised 1973

Mettler,B, Creative dance - art or therapy? Tucson, Arizona,  
January 1973

Meighan,R, Consultation and Educational ideologies: some  
issues raised by research into children's judgements of  
teaching performance, in Barton,Meighan, eds, 1978

Mies,M, Towards a methodology of women's study,  
ISS Occasional Papers, No.77, Institute of Social Studies,  
The Hague, 11/1979

De Mille,A, Dance to the piper,Little, Brown and Company,  
Boston, 1951

Miller,A, Das Drama des begabten Kindes, Suhrkamp, Frankfurt  
am Main, 1981

Millet,K, Sexual Politics, Avon, New York, 1971

Milne,Sh, Dance as aesthetic education - a preliminary  
enquiry, unpubl.paper, PE dept, University of Leeds, 1980

Mitchell,J,Oakley,A,eds, The rights and wrongs of women,  
Penguin, London, 1976

Mitchinson,P, Dance examinations - private sector,  
1st Study of Dance Conference, Leeds, 19/9/1981

Mitscherlich,M, Die friedfertige Frau, S.Fischer,  
Frankfurt, 1985

Moore,T,Lawton,D, Authority and participation, in  
Lawton,D,et al., 1978

Morgan,D.H.J., Men, masculinity and sociological enquiry, in  
Roberts,H, ed, 1981

Morris,M, Creation in dance and life, Peter Owen, London, 1972

Morris,S, Dance, in Ross,M, 1978

Mortimore,J&P, Achievements in schools, ILEA research  
statistics, 86

Mortimore,P,Mortimore,J, Secondary school examinations,  
Bedford Way Papers Nr.18, London University  
Institute of Education, 1984/1986

Munn,N,D, Walbiri iconography, Symbol,Myth and ritual Series,  
Cornell University Press, Ithaca/London, 1973

Muschg,A, Gefaengnis als Kunstrahmen, TAM,31, Zuerich, 1984

Musgrove,F, School and the social order, Wiley, New York,



1980

Myers,M, Body therapies and the modern dancer, Dance Magazine, New York, Feb.-July 1980

Nadel,M,H,Nadel,C,G,eds, The dance experience, Praeger, New York, 1970

Nava,M,Youth service provision, social order and the question of girls,in Carter,E, et al., 1984

New Dance Magazine, Quarterly, No 32, Spring 1985, London

New Dance Magazine, Quarterly, London, April-June 1987

Neusuess, Chr: Die Kopfgeburten der Arbeiterbewegung, Rasch&Roehring, Hamburg, 1985

Nisbet,J, Educational Research: The state of the art, in Dockrell,Hamilton,eds,1980

Noble,T, Dance and the problem of the body: a sociological analysis, MA, Laban Centre for Movement and Dance, at London University Goldsmiths' College, 1984

North,M, Personality assessment through movement, MacDonal&Evans, London, 1972

North,R, What's in a dance? Ballet Rambert, Sadlers Wells, London, 9/3/1982

Oakley,A, Interviewing women: a contradiction in terms, in Roberts,H,ed, 1981

Open University, Schooling and Society Course Team, Culture, class and the curriculum, course E 202, Milton Keynes, 1977

Ornstein,R, Die Psychologie des Bewusstseins, Fischer, Frankfurt, 1976

Oxford Companion to Art 1970

Parlett,M, Illuminative Evaluation - a soft systems methodology, lecture, London University Institute of Education,23/6/82

Parlett,M, Illuminative Evaluation, draft paper, 1982a,

Paxton,St, Contact improvisation, Theatre Papers, No.5, Dartington College of Arts, Devon, 1982

Peiser,S, Kreativitaetsforschung, Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, Darmstadt, 1976

Percival,J, Modern ballet, Herbert Press, London, 1980

Piaget,J, Theorien und Methoden der modernen Erziehung, Molden, Wien/Zuerich, 1972



- Polhemus,T,ed, Social Aspects of the Human Body, Penguin, Harmondsworth, 1978
- Poole,R, Objective sign and subjective meaning, in Benthall,Polhemus,eds,1975
- Preiser,S, Kreativitaetsforschung, Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, Darmstadt, 1976
- Preston-Dunlop,V, A handbook for dance in education, Macdonald&Evans, Plymouth, 2nd edition 1980
- Preston-Dunlop,V, Choreutic concepts and practice, Dance Research, London, 1/1, spring 1983
- Pring,R, Knowledge and schooling, Open Books, London, 1976
- Pring,R, Curriculum content: principles of selection, in Lawton et al, 1978
- Quirey,B, The crucial gap, Dance Research, 1/1, London, spring 1983
- Ralph,R, Restauring dance to Parnassus: the scholarly challenge of eighteenth century dance, 1st British Dance Scholars conference, 2-4/4/82
- Raven,J, The evaluation and improvement of provision for general education, in Skilbeck,ed, 19084c
- Redfern,H.B, Concepts in modern educational dance, Kimpton, London, 1973
- Redfern,B, Dance, art and aesthetics, Dance Books, London, 1983
- Reid,I, Past and present trends in the sociology of education - a plea for a return to educational sociology, in Barton,Meighan,eds, 1978
- Reid,L,A, Movement and meaning, in LAMGMagazine, No.45, 1970
- Reinharz,Sh, Experiential analysis: A contribution to feminist research methodology, in Bowles,Duelli-Klein,eds, 1981
- Reynolds,D,Sullivan,M, Towards a new socialist sociology of education, in Barton,Meighan,Walker,eds, 1980
- Rich,A, On lies, secrets, and silence, Virago, London, 1980
- Roberts,B, Naturalistic research into subcultures and deviance, in Hall/Jefferson,eds, 1975
- Roberts,H, ed, Doing feminist research, Routledge&Kegan Paul, London, 1980
- Ross,M, Arts and the Adolescent, Schools Council Working

## Paper 54, Evans/Methuen

- Ross,M, The creative arts, Heinemann, London, 1978
- Ross,M, The aesthetic imperative, Pergamon, Oxford, 1981
- Ross,M,ed, The aesthetic in education, Pergamon, Oxford, 1985
- Ross,M, The smock-coated researcher, in Ross,ed,1985
- Rust,F, Dance in society, Routledge&Kegan Paul, London, 1969
- Rutter,M, Fifteen Thousand Hours, reviewed in New Society, 4/9/1980
- Sabatine,J, Jazz dance: the American hybrid, in Giordano,G,ed, Anthology of American jazz dance, 1971
- Sachs,C: World history of the dance, Norton, New York, 1937
- SAFARI, Innovation, evaluation, research and the problem of control, some interim papers, Centre for Applied Research in Education, University of East Anglia, Norwich, 1974
- Salimbene,S, From structurally based to functionally based approaches to language teaching, in Forum, Vol.XXI, Jan.1983, No 1
- Schatzman,L,Strauss,A,L, Field research strategies for a natural sociology, Prentice Hall, Englewood Cliffs, 1973
- Schoop,T,Mitchell,P, Won't you join the dance? Mayfield Publication, California, 1974
- Senior,N, dance at Harehills middle school, in 2D, Vol.1, No.2, spring 1982
- Sergy,F, Dance and feminism, in Spare Rib, December 1983
- Sharpe,P, The influence of aspects of movement education on the cognitive development of the infant school children, MPhil, London University Institute of Education, 1977
- Sharpe,S, Just like a girl, Penguin, 1977
- Sheets-Johnstone,M, Phenomenology of dance, Dance Books, London, 2nd ed 1979
- Sherbon,E, On the count of one: Modern dance methods, Mayfield Publishing, California, 1968/1976
- Shetsova,M, Theatre and the new cultural policy of France's socialist government, Theatre Papers No 7, Dartington College of Arts, Devon, 1982
- Shivas,A,I, The nature of dance and dance education, MA, Dept of philosophy of education, London University Institute of



Education, 1983

Shreeves, R, Children dancing, Ward Lock Educational, 1981

Siegel, M, B, Watching the dance go by, Houghton Mifflin, Boston, 1977

Siegel, M, B, The shapes of change, Houghton Mifflin, Boston, 1979

Simons, H, Conversation Piece, the practice of interviewing, in Adelman, 1978

Simons, H, ed, Towards a science of the singular, Centre for Applied Research in Education, Occasional Publication no.10, University of East Anglia, Norwich, 1980

Simpson, A, ed, Aesthetic education and the problem of assessment and evaluation, Conference report, Manchester Polytechnic Didsbury School of Education, 11-14/9/1979

Simpson, A, Utilitarianism, the arts and education, in Ross, M, ed, 1985

Skilbeck, M, Harris, A, Culture, ideology and knowledge, Open University, Milton Keynes, 1976

Skilbeck, M, A core curriculum for the common school, University of London Institute of Education, London, 1982

Skilbeck, M, School-based curriculum development, Harper&Row, London, 1984a

Skilbeck, M, ed, Readings in school-based curriculum development, Harper&Row, London, 1984b

Skilbeck, M, ed, Evaluating the curriculum in the eighties, Hodder&Stoughton, London, 1984c

Slater, A, ed, The Laban centenary symposium, The Laban Centre for Movement and Dance, at University of London Goldsmiths' College, 1979

Slaughter, R, Futures study in the curriculum, in Skilbeck, M, ed, 1984b

Smith, J, Dance composition, Lepus, London, 1976

Spencer, P, ed, Society and the dance, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1985

Spender, D, ed, Women's studies international quarterly, Vol.1, No.4, 1978

Spender, D, Learning to lose, Women's Press, London, 1980

Spender, D, Invisible Women, Chameleon Books, London, 1982

Stake, R, Legacies and eulogies, in SAFARI, 1974



Stake,R, Program evaluation, particularly responsive evaluation, in Dockrell,Hamilton,eds, 1980

Stanley,L,Wise,S, Back into 'the personal', in Bowles,G, Duelli-Klein,R,eds, Theories of women's studies, University of California, Berkely, 1981

Stanworth,M, Gender and schooling, Women's Reseach and Resources Centre Publications, London, 1981

Stearns,M&J, Jazz dance: The story of American vernacular dance, Schirmer, New York, 1979

Steedman,C,Urwin,C,Walkerline,V, eds, Language,gender and childhood, Roulledge&Kegan Paul, London, 1985

Stenhouse,L, An introduction to curriculum research and development, Heinemann, London, 1975

Stoke,E, Dance education -a further challenge to the ollder grmmar school child and the specialised student, in LAMGMagazine, No.1, 1967

Strathern,A, A line of boys: Melpa dance as a symbol of maturation, in Spencer, 1985

Stubbs,M, Linguistic data in educational research, in Adelman,ed,1978

Stubbs,M, Collecting conversational data, notes on sociolinguistic methodology, in Adelman,C1,ed, 1978

Sullerot,E,ed,Le fait feminin, Librairie Artheme Fayard, 1978

Swanwick,K, The arts in education: dreaming or wide awake?, bedford Way Papers, University of London Institute of Education, London, 1983

Paplin,D,Th,ed, New directions in dance, pergamon, 1979

Tate Gallery,ed, Towards a new art, London, 1980

Terry,W, The dance in America, Harper Colophon Books, Harper&Row, New York, 1973

Terry,W, How to look at dance, Morrow, New York, 1982

Theweleit,K, Maennerfantasien, Band 2, rororo, 1980

Thornton,S, A movement perspective of Rudolf Laban, Macdonald&Evans, London, 1971

Thuermer-Rohr,Chr, Vagabundinnen, Orlanda Frauenverlag, Berlin, 1987

Tolley,J, Burt,R,Strut your Funky Stuff, in New Dance,No 26, Autumn 1983

Tribe,D,M, ed, Aesthetic education, conference report, Derby Lonsdale College of Higher Education, Derby, 12-15/9/78

Trower,P,Bryant,B,Argyle,M,eds, Social skills and mental health, Methuen, London, 1978

Ullmann,L, Dance education - education through dance, Slater,A,ed, The Laban Centenary Symposium, The Laban Centre for Movement and Dance at University of London Goldsmith's College, London,1979

Vulliamy,G, Culture clash and school music: A sociological analysis, in Barton,Meighan,eds, 1978

Waites,B,Bennett,T, Popular culture: Past and present, Open University, Croom Helm, London, 1982

Walker,R, Class room research, in SAFARI, 1974

Walker,R, The conduct of educational case studies: Ethics, theory and procedures, In Dockrell,Hamilton, eds, 1980

Walkerdine,V, On the regulation of speaking and silence, in Steedman,Urwin,Walkerdine 1985

Walkerdine,V, Dreams from an ordinary childhood, in Heron,ed, 1985

Wall,W.D, Constructive education for adolescents, Harrap, London, 1977

Wartenberg,Th,E, Is dance elitist? in:Fancher,Myers, eds: Philosophical Essays on Dance, Dance Horizons, C:American Dance Festival Inc, 1981

Watson Coleman,F,M, Dance and imagination, MA, Dept. of Philosophy of Education, London University Institute of Education, 1984

Weigel,S, Der schielende Blick, in Stephan,I,Weigel,S,eds, Die verborgene Frau, Argument-Sonderband 96, Berlin, 1983

Weimer,W,B,Palermo,D,S,eds, Cognition and the symbolic process, Wiley&Sons, New York, 1974

Weitz,Sh, Sex roles, Oxford University Press, New York, 1977

Wentink,A,M, Balletomania, Dolphin Books, Doubleday, New York, 1980

Westbury,I, Schooling as an agency of education, in Dockrell,Hamilton,eds, 1980

White,J,W, Dance as an examination subject, part fulfilment of MA, Dept of PE, University of Leeds, March 1977

White,J,W, An examination of systems of movement notation,



- MA, Dept. of PE, University of Leeds, August 1977
- White,J,W, GCE O-level mode II. The syllabus content, examination and rationale, ILDTA, London, 22/11/1980
- White,J,W, Dance examinations - state sector, 1st Study of Dance Conference, Leeds. 19/9/1981
- White,J,W, Examinations in Dance, in British Journal of Physical Education, 16/5, Sept/Oct.1985
- Whitehead,M, Muska Mosston: Teaching styles, at ILDTA conference, teaching Strategies for Dance, 7-8/11/1981
- Whiteside,T, The sociology of educational innovation, Methuen, London, 1978
- Whiting,T,A,ed, Readings in sports psychology, Lepus, London, 1975
- Whitty,G,Young,M, Explorations in the politics of school knowledge, Nafferton, Driffield, 1976
- Whitty,G, School examinations and the politics of school knowledge, in Barton,Meighan, eds, 1978
- Whitty,G, Sociology and school knowledge, Methuen, London, 1985
- Whyld,J,ed, Sexism in the secondary curriculum, Harper&Row, London, 1983
- Williams,C, Low achievers, in Skilbeck,ed, 1984b
- Williams,D, What are people doing when they dance? Momentum, 1976,1/2
- Willis,P,E, The expressive style of a motor-bike culture, in Benthall,Polhemus,eds, 1975
- Willis,P, Notes on method, in Hall et al, 1981
- Wilson,J,D, Student learning in higher education, Croom Helm, London, 1981
- Winearls,J, Modern dance. The Jooss - Leeder method, A&Ch.Black, London 1958/1973
- Witkin,R,W, The intelligence of feeling, Heinemann, London, 1974
- Wolff,J, The relevance of sociology to aesthetic education, Aesthetic Education Conference, Southlands College, London, 10/9/1980
- Wolff,J, The Social Production of Art, Methuen, London, 1981
- Wolff,J, Questioning the curriculum: arts, education and ideology, in Ross,M, ed, 1985



- Woods,P,Hammersley,M,eds, The school experience, Croom Helm, London, 1977
- Young,M,F,D, ed, Knowledge and Control, Collier Macmillan. London, 1971
- Young,M,F,D: An Approach to the Study of curricula as socially Organized Knowledge, in Young,M,F,D,ed, 1971  
and in: Open University, 14-15, MacDonald,M,ed,1977, Appendix
- Young,M,Whitty,G, Society,state and schooling. Readings on the possibilities for radical education,  
Falmer, Brighton, 1977
- Zimmerli,W, Defensive Ethik, DRS II, 18/6/1984
- Zuercher,Z, Die sanften Wikinger, Zytglogge, Bern, 1981